Qaṣd Al-Sabīl ilā Maʿrifat Al-Jalīl

The Direct Path To Knowing the Majestic

Authored by

Al-Sayyid al-'Allamah al-Mujtahid

Muhammad bin Abd Allah Awad

(***May Allah preserve him and prolong his life***)

مكتبة أهل البيت (ع)

Ahl Al-Bait Library (A.s.)

Written, researched, and edited by

Ahl Al-Bayt Library (A.S.)

Yemen - Saada - T (531580\713842989)

Third edition - 1443 AH

All rights reserved to Ahl al-Bayt Library (A.S.)

بِسۡمِ ٱللَّهِ ٱلرَّحۡمَٰنِ ٱلرَّحِيمِ

In the name of Allah, the Most Gracious,the Most Merciful

Foreword of the Ahl al-Bayt Library (A.S.)

All praise is due to Allah, Lord of the worlds. May blessings and peace be upon our master Muḥammad and upon his pure, immaculate Household. To proceed:

In response to the saying of Allah, Most Sublime:

"O you who have believed, respond to Allah and to the Messenger when he calls you to that which gives you life." **[al-Anfāl:24]**

and His saying:

"And let there be [arising] from you a nation inviting to [all that is] good, enjoining what is right and forbidding what is wrong; and those will be the successful." **[Āl ʿImrān:104]**

and His saying: *"Say, [O Muḥammad], I do not ask you for it any payment except goodwill through kinship."* **[al-Shūrā:23]**

and His saying:*"Indeed, Allah intends only to remove from you impurity, O People of the Household, and to purify you with [extensive] purification."* **[al-Aḥzāb:33]**

and His saying:*"Your ally is none but Allah and [therefore] His Messenger and those who have believed—those who establish prayer and give zakāh, and they bow [in worship]."* **[al-Mā'idah:55]**

—and in response to the words of the Messenger of Allah (*May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace*): "*I am leaving among you that which, if you hold fast to it, you will never go astray after me: the Book of Allah and my progeny, my Household. The Subtle, the All-Aware informed me that they will never separate until they return to me at the Basin [of Paradise]*." And his saying (*May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace*): "*The example of my Household among you is like the Ark of Noah: whoever embarks upon it is saved, and whoever stays back from it drowns and perishes*." And his saying (*May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace*): "*My Household are a security for the people of the earth, just as the stars are a security for the people of the sky*." And his saying (*May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace*): "*Whoever is pleased to live my life, die my death, and dwell in the Garden of Eden which my Lord has promised me, let him take ʿAlī as guardian, and [after me] his progeny; let him be loyal to his loyal one; and let him take my Household as his example, for they are my progeny; they were created from my clay and endowed with my understanding and my knowledge*"—and the Messenger of Allah (*May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace*) made clear that they are ʿAlī, Fāṭimah, al-

Ḥasan, al-Ḥusayn, and their descendants—when He covered them with *Kisa* (a cloak) and [the Prophet] said: "*O Allah, these are my Household, so remove from them impurity and purify them with a thorough purification*."

In response to all of the above, the Ahl al-Bayt (ʿa) Library was established. In this critical juncture of history—when the madhhab of the Ahl al-Bayt (ʿa), represented by the Zaydī school, is subjected to fierce attacks—we deemed it necessary to contribute to disseminating the creed of the purified Household by publishing what their immaculate Imams (*peace be upon them*) and their righteous followers left behind. This proceeds from our trust and conviction that the doctrines borne by the Ahl al-Bayt (*peace be upon them*) are Allah's intent in His earth, His upright religion, and His straight path. They speak for themselves by their harmony with sound human nature and with what has come in the Book of Allah, Mighty and Majestic, and the Sunnah of His Prophet (*May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace*).

In obedience to Allah's commands, and out of compassion for the community of their forefather [the Messenger of Allah], the Ahl al-Bayt consecrated and firmly established these doctrines with their pure, blessed blood—throughout ages and in every land. Whoever reflects on history finds that they sacrificed what is most precious to defend and affirm them, rising against destructive beliefs and calling to tawḥīd and justice—to the oneness of Allah, Mighty and Exalted, to declaring His transcendence, to believing in the truth of His promise and His threat, and to accepting His chosen ones among His creation.

And because their madhhab is Allah's religion and His law, and the intent and the heritage of the Messenger of Allah (*May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace*), it remains until Allah inherits the earth and whoever is upon it—just as a confirmation of the Prophet's saying (*May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace*): "*The Subtle, the All-Aware informed me that the two [the Book of Allah and the Household of the Prophet] will never separate until they return to me at the Basin*."

Our father, the Proof-Imam Majd al-Dīn ibn Muḥammad al-Muʾayyadī (ʿa), said: "Know that Allah—majestic is His majesty—has not approved for His servants except a strong religion, a straight path, a single way, an even road. Sufficient is His saying:

'And, [moreover], this is My path, which is straight, so follow it; and do not follow [other] ways, for you will be separated from His way. This has He instructed you that you may become righteous.' **[al-Anʿām:153]**

And you have known that the religion of Allah is not to follow desires: *'But if the truth had followed their inclinations, the heavens and the earth and whoever is in them would have been ruined…'* **[al-Muʾminūn:71]**

'So what is there after truth except error?' **[Yūnus:32]**

'Or have they other deities who have ordained for them of religion that which Allah has not authorized?' **[al-Shūrā:21]**

And He addressed the master of His Messengers with His saying—*exalted is He*:

'So remain on a right course as you have been commanded, [you] and those who have turned back with you [to Allah], and do not transgress. Indeed, He is Seeing of what you do. And do not incline toward those who do wrong, lest you be touched by the Fire, and you would not have other than Allah any protectors; then you would not be helped.' **[Hūd:112–113]**

—even though he (*May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace*) and those with him from the people of Badr [were among the addressed]. So reflect and take heed, if you are among those who take heed. When you have encompassed this with knowledge, and understood from Allah and His Messenger what He has made binding upon you in those pathways, you will know that it is incumbent upon you to recognize the truth and follow it, to be loyal to its people and be with them:

'O you who have believed, fear Allah and be with the truthful.' **[al-Tawbah:119]**

—and to part from falsehood and its followers, to keep apart from them:

'And whoever is an ally to them among you—then indeed, he is [one] of them.' **[al-Mā'idah:51]**

'You will not find a people who believe in Allah and the Last Day having affection for those who oppose Allah and His Messenger, even if they were their fathers or their sons or their brothers or their kindred.' **[al-Mujādilah:22]**

'O you who have believed, do not take My enemies and your enemies as allies, extending to them affection…' **[al-Mumtaḥanah:1]**

—in verses recited and reports transmitted. And you will not be able to know the truth and its people except by relying upon Allah's manifest proofs and His clear, evident evidences—by which He has guided creation to the truth—without bending to desire, without turning to wrangling or contentiousness, without heed to any [partisan] school or advocacy for position:

'O you who have believed, be persistently standing firm in justice, witnesses for Allah, even if it be against yourselves or parents and relatives…' **[al-**

Nisā':135]."[1]

Publications of the Ahl al-Bayt (ʿa) Library

By Allah's grace, the Ahl al-Bayt (ʿa) Library has published:

1. **Al-Shāfī** — by the Proof-Imam ʿAbd Allāh b. Ḥamzah (ʿa), d. 614 AH; appended with **al-Taʿlīq al-Wāfī fī Takhrīj Aḥādīth al-Shāfī**, by al-Sayyid al-ʿAllāmah Najm al-ʿItrah al-Ṭāhirah al-Ḥasan b. al-Ḥusayn b. Muḥammad(*may Allah have mercy on him*) (d. 1388 AH).
2. **Maṭalaʿ al-Budūr wa Majmaʿ al-Buḥūr fī Tarājim Rijāl al-Zaydiyyah** — by the jurist-historian Qāḍī al-ʿAllāmah Shihāb al-Dīn Aḥmad b. Ṣāliḥ b. Abī al-Rijāl (*may Allah have mercy on him*) (1029–1092 AH).
3. **Maṭāliʿ al-Anwār wa Mashāriq al-Shumūs wa al-Aqmār** — The Dīwān of Imām al-Manṣūr bi-llāh ʿAbd Allāh b. Ḥamzah (ʿa), d. 614 AH.
4. **Collected Books and Letters of Imām al-Mahdī al-Ḥusayn b. al-Qāsim al-ʿIyānī (ʿa)** (376–404 AH).
5. **Mhāsin al-Azhār fī Tafṣīl Manāqib al-ʿItrah al-Aṭhār** — a commentary on the ode composed by Imām al-Manṣūr bi-llāh ʿAbd Allāh b. Ḥamzah (ʿa); by the jurist-scholar and martyr Ḥamīd b. Aḥmad al-Miḥallī al-Hamdānī al-Wādiʿī (*may Allah have mercy on him*) (d. 652 AH).
6. **Majmūʿ al-Sayyid Ḥumaydān** — by al-Sayyid al-ʿĀlim Nūr al-Dīn Abū ʿAbd Allāh Ḥumaydān b. Yaḥyā b. Ḥumaydān al-Qāsimī al-Ḥasanī—may Allah be pleased with him.
7. **al-Safīnah al-Munjiyah fī Mustakhlas al-Marfūʿ min al-Adʿiyah** — by Imām Aḥmad b. Hāshim (ʿa), d. 1269 AH.
8. **Lawāmiʿ al-Anwār fī Jawāmiʿ al-ʿUlūm wa al-Āthār wa Tarājim Uli al-ʿIlm wa al-Anẓār** — by the Proof-Imam Majd al-Dīn b. Muḥammad b. Manṣūr al-Muʾayyadī (ʿa) (1332–1428 AH).
9. **Collected Books and Letters of the Greatest Imām, Commander of the Faithful Zayd b. ʿAlī (ʿa)** — by the Greatest Imam Zayd b. ʿAlī b. al-Ḥusayn b. ʿAlī b. Abī Ṭālib (ʿa) (75–122 AH).
10. **Sharḥ al-Risālah al-Nāṣiḥah bi-al-Adillah al-Wāḍiḥah** — by the Proof-Imam ʿAbd Allāh b. Ḥamzah (ʿa), d. 614 AH.

1. (*al-Tuhaf al-Fatimiyah Sharah al-Zulaf al-Imamiyah*) The Fatimid Treasures: Explanation of the Imamite Zulf.

11. **Ṣafwat al-Ikhtiyār fī Uṣūl al-Fiqh** — by the Proof-Imam ʿAbd Allāh b. Ḥamzah (ʿa), d. 614 AH.
12. **al-Mukhtār min Ṣaḥīḥ al-Aḥādīth wa al-Āthār min Kutub al-A'immah al-Aṭhār wa Shīʿatihim al-Akhyār** — abridged by al-Sayyid al-ʿAllāmah Muḥammad b. Yaḥyā b. al-Ḥusayn b. Muḥammad (*may Allah have mercy on him*), from **al-Ṣaḥīḥ al-Mukhtār** by al-Sayyid al-ʿAllāmah Muḥammad b. Ḥasan al-ʿAjrī (*may Allah have mercy on him*).
13. **Hidāyat al-Rāghibīn ilā Madhhab al-ʿItrah al-Ṭāhirīn** — by al-Sayyid al-Imām al-Hādī b. Ibrāhīm al-Wazīr (ʿa), d. 822 AH.
14. **al-Ifādah fī Tārīkh al-A'immah al-Sādah** — by Imām Abū Ṭālib Yaḥyā b. al-Ḥusayn al-Hārūnī (ʿa), d. 424 AH.
15. **al-Munīr** — on the madhhab of al-Hādī ilā al-Ḥaqq Yaḥyā b. al-Ḥusayn b. al-Qāsim b. Ibrāhīm (ʿa); by Aḥmad b. Mūsā al-Ṭabarī (*may Allah be pleased with him*).
16. **Nihāyat al-Tanwīh fī Izhāq al-Tamwīh** — by al-Sayyid al-Imām al-Hādī b. Ibrāhīm al-Wazīr (ʿa), d. 822 AH.
17. **Tanbīh al-Ghāfilīn ʿan Faḍā'il al-Ṭālibiyyīn** — by al-Ḥākim al-Jushamī, al-Muḥsin b. Muḥammad b. Karāmah (*may Allah have mercy on him*), d. 494 AH.
18. **ʿUyūn al-Mukhtār min Funūn al-Ashʿār wa al-Āthār** — by the Proof-Imam Majd al-Dīn b. Muḥammad b. Manṣūr al-Muʾayyadī (ʿa) (1332–1428 AH).
19. **Akhbār Fakhkh wa Khabar Yaḥyā b. ʿAbd Allāh (ʿa) wa Akhīhi Idrīs b. ʿAbd Allāh (ʿa)** — by Aḥmad b. Sahl al-Rāzī (*may Allah have mercy on him*).
20. **al-Wāfid ʿalā al-ʿĀlam** — by Imām Najm Āl al-Rasūl al-Qāsim b. Ibrāhīm al-Rassī (ʿa), d. 246 AH.
21. **al-Hijrah wa al-Waṣiyyah** — by Imām Muḥammad b. al-Qāsim b. Ibrāhīm al-Rassī (ʿa).
22. **al-Jāmiʿah al-Muhimmah fī Asānīd Kutub al-A'immah** — by the Proof-Imam Majd al-Dīn b. Muḥammad b. Manṣūr al-Muʾayyadī (ʿa) (1332–1428 AH).
23. **al-Mukhtaṣar al-Mufīd fīmā Lā Yajūzu al-Ikhlāl bihi li-Kulli Mukallaf min al-ʿAbīd** — by Qāḍī al-ʿAllāmah Aḥmad b. Ismāʿīl al-ʿAlafī (d. 1282 AH).
24. **Fifty Sermons for Fridays and Festivals.**
25. **Risālat al-Thabāt fīmā ʿalā al-Banīn wa al-Banāt** — by the Proof-Imam ʿAbd Allāh b. Ḥamzah (ʿa), d. 614 AH.
26. **al-Risālah al-Ṣādiʿah bi-al-Dalīl fī al-Radd ʿalā Ṣāḥib al-Tabdīʿ**

wa al-Taḍlīl — by the Proof-Imam Majd al-Dīn b. Muḥammad b. Manṣūr al-Muʾayyadī (ʿa) (1332–1428 AH).

27. **Īḍāḥ al-Dalālah fī Taḥqīq Aḥkām al-ʿAdālah** — by the Proof-Imam Majd al-Dīn b. Muḥammad b. Manṣūr al-Muʾayyadī (ʿa) (1332–1428 AH).
28. **al-Ḥujaj al-Munīrah ʿalā al-Uṣūl al-Khaṭīrah** — by the Proof-Imam Majd al-Dīn b. Muḥammad b. Manṣūr al-Muʾayyadī (ʿa) (1332–1428 AH).
29. **al-Nūr al-Sāṭiʿ** — by al-Hādī al-Ḥasan b. Yaḥyā al-Qāsimī (ʿa) (1343 AH).
30. **Sabīl al-Rashād ilā Maʿrifat Rabb al-ʿIbād** — by al-Sayyid al-ʿAllāmah Muḥammad b. al-Ḥasan b. al-Imām al-Qāsim b. Muḥammad (ʿa) (1010–1079 AH).
31. **al-Jawāb al-Kāshif li-al-Iltibās ʿan Masāʾil al-Ifriqī Ilyās** — followed by **al-Jawāb al-Rāqī ʿalā Masāʾil al-ʿIrāqī**; by al-Sayyid al-ʿAllāmah al-Ḥusayn b. Yaḥyā b. al-Ḥusayn b. Muḥammad (ʿa) (1358–1435 AH).
32. **Uṣūl al-Dīn** — by Imām al-Hādī ilā al-Ḥaqq Yaḥyā b. al-Ḥusayn (ʿa) (245–298 AH).
33. **al-Risālah al-Badīʿah al-Muʿlinah bi-Faḍāʾil al-Shīʿah** — by Qāḍī al-ʿAllāmah ʿAbd Allāh b. Zayd al-ʿAnsī, d. 667 AH.
34. **al-ʿAqd al-Thamīn fī Maʿrifat Rabb al-ʿĀlamīn** — by al-Amīr al-Ḥusayn b. Badr al-Dīn Muḥammad b. Aḥmad (ʿa) (663 AH).
35. **al-Kāmil al-Munīr fī Ithbāt Wilāyat Amīr al-Muʾminīn (ʿa)** — by Imām al-Qāsim b. Ibrāhīm al-Rassī (ʿa), d. 246 AH.
36. **Kitāb al-Taḥrīr** — by the Truth-Uttering Imām (al-Nāṭiq bi-al-Ḥaqq) Abū Ṭālib Yaḥyā b. al-Ḥusayn al-Hārūnī (ʿa), d. 424 AH.
37. **Collected Fatwas of Imām al-Mahdī Muḥammad b. al-Qāsim al-Ḥusaynī (ʿa)** (1319 AH).
38. **al-Qawl al-Sadīd — a commentary on the poem "Hidāyat al-Rashīd"** — by al-Sayyid al-ʿAllāmah al-Ḥusayn b. Yaḥyā b. al-Ḥusayn b. Muḥammad (ʿa) (1358–1435 AH).
39. **Qaṣd al-Sabīl ilā Maʿrifat al-Jalīl** — by al-Sayyid al-ʿAllāmah Muḥammad b. ʿAbd Allāh ʿAwaḍ (*may Allah preserve him*).
40. **Naẓarāt fī Malāmiḥ al-Madhhab al-Zaydī wa Khaṣāʾiṣih** — by al-Sayyid al-ʿAllāmah Muḥammad b. ʿAbd Allāh ʿAwaḍ (*may Allah preserve him*).
41. **Maʿārij al-Muttaqīn min Adʿiyat Sayyid al-Mursalīn** — compiled by al-Sayyid al-ʿAllāmah Muḥammad b. ʿAbd Allāh ʿAwaḍ (*may Allah preserve him*).

42. **al-Ikhtiyārāt al-Muʾayyadiyyah** — fatwas, selections, sayings, and gleanings of the Proof-Imam Majd al-Dīn b. Muḥammad b. Manṣūr al-Muʾayyadī (ʿa) (1332–1428 AH).
43. **Min Thimār al-ʿIlm wa al-Ḥikmah (Fatāwā wa Fawāʾid)** — by al-Sayyid al-ʿAllāmah Muḥammad b. ʿAbd Allāh ʿAwaḍ (*may Allah preserve him*).
44. **al-Tuḥaf al-Fāṭimiyyah: Sharḥ al-Zulf al-Imāmiyyah** — by the Proof-Imam Majd al-Dīn b. Muḥammad al-Muʾayyadī (ʿa) (1332–1428 AH).
45. **al-Manhaj al-Aqwām fī al-Rafʿ wa al-Ḍamm wa al-Jahr bi "Bismillāh al-Raḥmān al-Raḥīm," wa Ithbāt "Ḥayya ʿalā Khayr al-ʿAmal" fī al-Adhān, wa ghayri dhālik min al-fawāʾid allatī bihā al-nafʿ al-aʿamm** — by the Proof-Imam Majd al-Dīn b. Muḥammad b. Manṣūr al-Muʾayyadī (ʿa).
46. **al-Asās li-ʿAqāʾid al-Akyās** — by Imām al-Qāsim b. Muḥammad (ʿa).
47. **al-Balāgh al-Nāhī ʿan al-Ghināʾ wa Ālāt al-Malāhī** — by the Proof-Imam Majd al-Dīn b. Muḥammad al-Muʾayyadī (ʿa) (1332–1428 AH).
48. **al-Aḥkām fī al-Ḥalāl wa al-Ḥarām** — by Imām al-Hādī ilā al-Ḥaqq Yaḥyā b. al-Ḥusayn b. al-Qāsim b. Ibrāhīm (ʿa) (245–298 AH).
49. **al-Mukhtār min *Kanz al-Rashād wa Zād al-Maʿād*** — by Imām ʿIzz al-Dīn b. al-Ḥasan (ʿa), d. 900 AH.
50. **Shifāʾ Ghalīl al-Sāʾil ʿammā Taḥmiluhu al-Kāfil** — by the erudite scholar ʿAlī b. Ṣalāḥ b. ʿAlī b. Muḥammad al-Ṭabarī.
51. **al-Fiqh al-Qurʾānī** — by al-Sayyid al-ʿAllāmah Muḥammad b. ʿAbd Allāh ʿAwaḍ (*may Allah preserve him*).
52. **Taʿlīm al-Ḥurūf (Teaching the Letters).**
53. **Series: Teaching Reading and Writing for Beginning Students — Part One: The Alphabetic Letters.**
54. **Series: Teaching the Principles of Arithmetic — Part One: Numerical Numbers (from 11 to 10).**
55. **Tashīl al-Tashīl ʿalā Matn al-Ājurrūmiyyah.**
56. **Azhār wa Athmār min Ḥadāʾiq al-Ḥikmah al-Nabawiyyah** (upon its possessor and his family be the best blessings and peace) — by al-Sayyid al-ʿAllāmah Muḥammad ʿAbd Allāh ʿAwaḍ (*may Allah preserve him*).
57. **Matn al-Kāfil bi-Nayl al-Suʾul fī ʿIlm al-Uṣūl** — by al-ʿAllāmah Muḥammad b. Yaḥyā Bahrān (d. 957 AH).

58. **al-Mawʿiẓah al-Ḥasanah** — by Imām al-Mahdī Muḥammad b. al-Qāsim al-Ḥusaynī (ʿa) — 1319 AH.
59. **Asʾilah wa Mawāḍīʿ Hammah Khāṣṣah bi-al-Nisāʾ** — by al-Sayyid al-ʿAllāmah Muḥammad ʿAbd Allāh ʿAwaḍ (*may Allah preserve him*).
60. **al-Mafātīḥ limā Istughliqa min Abwāb al-Balāghah wa Qawāʿid al-Istinbāṭ** — by al-Sayyid al-ʿAllāmah Muḥammad ʿAbd Allāh ʿAwaḍ (*may Allah preserve him*).
61. **Series: Teaching Reading and Writing for Beginning Students — Part Two: Short Vowels and Word Formation.**
62. **Series: Teaching the Principles of Arithmetic — Numerical Numbers, Part Two.**
63. **al-Murakkab al-Nafīs ilā Adillat al-Tanzīh wa al-Taqdīs** — by al-Sayyid al-ʿAllāmah Muḥammad ʿAbd Allāh ʿAwaḍ (*may Allah preserve him*).
64. **al-Manāhil al-Ṣāfiyah: Sharḥ al-Muqaddimah al-Shāfiyah** — by al-ʿAllāmah Luṭf Allāh b. Muḥammad al-Ghayyāth al-Ẓafīrī, d. 1035 AH.
65. **al-Kāshif li-Dhawi al-ʿUqūl ʿan Wujūh Maʿānī al-Kāfil bi-Nayl al-Suʾul** — by al-Sayyid al-ʿAllāmah Aḥmad b. Muḥammad Luqmān, d. 1037 AH.
66. **al-Anwār al-Hādiyah li-Dhawi al-ʿUqūl ilā Maʿrifat Maqāṣid al-Kāfil bi-Nayl al-Suʾūl** — by the jurist-scholar Aḥmad b. Yaḥyā Ḥābis al-Ṣaʿdī, d. 1061 AH.
67. **Majmaʿ al-Fawāʾid al-Mushtamil ʿalā Bughyat al-Rāʾid wa Ḍallat al-Nāshid** — by the Proof-Imam Majd al-Dīn b. Muḥammad b. Manṣūr al-Muʾayyadī (ʿa) (1332–1428 AH).
68. **Kitāb al-Ḥajj wa al-ʿUmrah** — by the Proof-Imam Majd al-Dīn b. Muḥammad b. Manṣūr al-Muʾayyadī (ʿa) (1332–1428 AH).
69. **al-Masṭūr fī Sīrat al-ʿĀlim al-Mashhūr** — by al-Sayyid al-ʿAllāmah Muḥammad ʿAbd Allāh ʿAwaḍ (*may Allah preserve him*).
70. **Ramadan Lectures for Bringing Near the Meanings of Qurʾānic Verses** — by al-Sayyid al-ʿAllāmah Muḥammad ʿAbd Allāh ʿAwaḍ (may Allah preserve him).
71. **Zubr min al-Fawāʾid al-Qurʾāniyyah wa Nawādir min al-Farāʾid wa al-Qalāʾid al-Rabbāniyyah** — by al-Sayyid al-ʿAllāmah Muḥammad ʿAbd Allāh ʿAwaḍ (*may Allah preserve him*).
72. **al-Munta zaʿ al-Mukhtār min *al-Ghayth al-Midrār* (known as the Commentary on *al-Azhār*)** — by al-ʿAllāmah ʿAbd Allāh b. Muftāḥ—*may Allah have mercy on him*.

73. **Matn Ghāyat al-Su'ul fī 'Ilm al-Uṣūl** — by al-Sayyid al-ʿAllāmah al-Ḥusayn b. al-Imām al-Qāsim b. Muḥammad (ʿa), d. 1050 AH.
74. **Durar al-Farā'id fī Khuṭab al-Masājid** — by al-Sayyid al-ʿAllāmah ʿAbd Allāh b. Ṣalāḥ al-ʿAjrī—*may Allah have mercy on him*.
75. **al-Kāshif al-Amīn ʿan Jawāhir al-ʿAqd al-Thamīn** — by the jurist-scholar Muḥammad b. Yaḥyā Madāʿis (d. 1252 AH).
76. **al-Washī al-Mukhtār ʿalā Ḥadā'iq al-Azhār** — by al-Sayyid al-ʿAllāmah al-Ḥusayn b. Yaḥyā al-Muṭahhar (ʿa) (1358–1435 AH).
77. **'Uddat al-Akyās al-Muntazaʿ min Shifā' Ṣudūr al-Nās fī Sharḥ Maʿānī al-Asās**, authored by the noble Sayyid and eminent scholar Aḥmad ibn Muḥammad ibn Ṣalāḥ al-Sharafī al-Qāsimī, *may Allah have mercy on him* (975–1055 AH).
78. **Miʿyār Aghwār al-Afhām fī al-Kashf ʿan Munāsabāt al-Aḥkām**, authored by the jurist and eminent scholar ʿAbd Allāh ibn Muḥammad al-Najrī (825–877 AH).
79. **Al-Bayān al-Shāfī al-Muntazaʿ min al-Burhān al-Kāfī**, authored by the jurist and eminent scholar ʿImād al-Dīn Yaḥyā ibn Aḥmad ibn Muẓaffar (875 AH).
80. **Athmār al-Azhār fī Fiqh al-A'immah al-Aṭhār**, authored by Imam Sharaf al-Dīn Yaḥyā ibn Shams al-Dīn ibn Aḥmad ibn Yaḥyā al-Murtaḍā *(Peace be Upon Him)* (878–965 AH).
81. **Al-Mukhtaṣar al-Mughīth fī 'Ilm al-Mawārīth**, publications of the Ahl al-Bayt Library *(Peace be Upon Them)*.
82. **Collected Epistles of Imam al-Hādī** ilā al-Ḥaqq Yaḥyā ibn al-Ḥusayn ibn al-Qāsim ibn Ibrāhīm *(Peace be Upon Him)* (245–298 AH).
83. Commentary on al-Asās al-Kabīr, Entitled "**Shifā' Ṣudūr al-Nās fī Sharḥ Maʿānī al-Asās li-ʿAqā'id al-Akyās**", authored by the noble Sayyid and eminent scholar Aḥmad ibn Muḥammad ibn Ṣalāḥ al-Sharafī al-Qāsimī, *may Allah have mercy on him* (975–1055 AH).
84. **Shaqāshiq al-Ashjān**, authored by the noble Sayyid, eminent scholar, and mujtahid Muḥammad ʿAbd Allāh ʿAwad, *may Allah, Exalted is He, preserve him*.
85. **Ḥadīqat al-Ḥikmah al-Nabawiyyah fī Tafsīr al-Arbaʿīn al-Sayliqiyyah**, authored by Imam al-Manṣūr bi-Allah ʿAbd Allāh ibn Ḥamzah *(Peace be Upon Him)* (d. 614 AH).
86. **Hidāyat al-ʿUqūl ilā Ghāyat al-Su'ūl fī 'Ilm al-Uṣūl**, known as *(Sharḥ al-Ghāyah)*, authored by the Imam of the eminent verifiers al-Ḥusayn ibn al-Qāsim ibn Muḥammad *(Peace be Upon Him)* (999–1050 AH).

87. **Shifā' al-Awām**, authored by al-Amīr al-Nāṣir li-al-Ḥaqq al-Ḥusayn ibn Muḥammad *(Peace be Upon Him)* (d. 663 AH).

There is much else, of goodly works, on its way to the light, if Allah Most High wills. We ask Allah for aid and success.

We also extend, in this brief space, our heartfelt thanks to everyone who helped bring this noble work to light—many they are. We ask Allah to record that for all of them in the balance of good deeds and to grant them ample reward and recompense.

In conclusion, we are honored to dedicate this modest work to the soul of our master, the Proof-Imam Majd al-Dīn b. Muḥammad b. Manṣūr al-Muʾayyadī—*may Allah's peace and pleasure be upon him*—the reviver of the treasures and glories of the Household (ʿa), and the one with the signal merit in disseminating the heritage of the Ahl al-Bayt (ʿa) and their righteous followers (*may Allah be pleased with them*).

I supplicate Allah with what he (ʿa) supplicated, saying:

O Allah, bless Muḥammad and his family; complete for us Your favor in both abodes; inscribe for us Your mercy which You write for Your righteous servants. O Allah, teach us what benefits us, benefit us by what You have taught us, and make us guides who are rightly guided.

"Our Lord, forgive us and our brothers who preceded us in faith and put not in our hearts [any] resentment toward those who have believed. Our Lord, indeed You are Kind and Merciful." **[al-Ḥashr:10]**

We hope for Allah's enabling grace to the most upright path, by His bounty and generosity. I ask Allah to rectify this work so that it may be among the deeds accepted, to envelop us in His mercy on the Day of Resurrection, and to seal for us and for all believers with a good end. Indeed, He is the Guardian of response, and to Him is the utmost hope and attainment.

"My Lord, enable me to be grateful for Your favor which You have bestowed upon me and upon my parents and to do righteousness of which You will approve; and make righteous for me my offspring. Indeed, I have repented to You, and indeed, I am of the Muslims." **[alAḥqāf:15]**

And may Allah send blessings upon our master Muḥammad and upon his pure, immaculate Household.

Director of the Library

Ibrāhīm b. Majd al-Dīn b. Muḥammad al-Muʾayyadī

[Foreword]

In the name of Allah, the Most Gracious, the Most Merciful

All praise is due to Allah, Lord of the worlds, and may Allah bless and grant peace to our Prophet Muḥammad. To proceed:

This is the book **"Qaṣd al-Sabīl"**, in which we have presented the doctrines of Divine Unity and Divine Justice, and what is connected to them. In nearly every issue, we have addressed the well-known schools of thought and the most important evidences upon which they rely.

We have established the foundations of the sound doctrine upheld by the Imams of the Zaydiyyah, and we have discussed—using their own terminology—the excesses of the Muʿtazilah, the Jabriyyah, and others, and we have dismantled the doubts upon which they built their arguments.

In doing so, we have followed the clearest and most evident intellectual paths, paths that accord with sound human nature—approaches in which the intellect finds ease and the natural disposition finds reassurance. We avoided complex methods that the mind scarcely accepts except after great strain, and we supported this with clear transmitted proofs.

All of this has been presented in an easy and accessible language, close to understanding, and suitable for readers of all levels.

We have arranged its chapters according to the order of the book **"al-Asās"** by Imam al-Manṣūr bi-Allah al-Qāsim ibn Muḥammad *(Peace be Upon Him)*, and we have included almost all of its chapters in an expanded form. We have not introduced anything new beyond what our Imams *(Peace be Upon Them)* have mentioned; however, we have allowed ourselves a degree of expansion where the need for clarification required it.

[Introduction]

[Definition of This Science]

This science is called *ʿIlm al-Kalām*, and it is also called *ʿIlm Uṣūl al-Dīn* (the Science of the Principles of Religion). Through this science, the clear and direct path is made evident—the path that rational inquiry and reflection ought to follow in order to attain the correct Islamic doctrines related to the Oneness of Allah *Exalted is He*, His Justice, His Promise and His Threat, Prophethood, Imamate, and whatever is connected to or associated with these matters.

This science was named *Kalām* because the process of inference among the followers of the various schools is, for the most part, based on rational proofs, and the tongue expresses those indications through discourse and speech.

Before entering into the principal subject of this science—namely, Divine Unity, Divine Justice, and so forth—it is necessary to mention the intellect and what has been said regarding it, since, as has been established, rational proofs predominate in this science. Then we shall mention inquiry and reflection, as has also been indicated in defining this science, for the acquisition of doctrines is achieved only through inquiry and reflection.

Thereafter, we shall follow this by mentioning effects (al-āthār), due to their close connection to the subject of this science, inasmuch as the path to faith in Allah *Exalted is He* lies in inquiry and reflection upon effects. The effect is the field in which inquiry and reflection roam, and through it the inquirer reaches faith and affirmation in the All-Subtle, the All-Aware *Exalted is He*.

The effect is called *evidence*, and the expression of the manner of inquiry and reflection is called *inference*.

This science, in general, is among the individual obligations (*farḍ al-ʿayn*) that are incumbent upon every morally responsible person. It is not restricted to scholars alone; rather, it is obligatory upon the illiterate and the literate, the learned and the ignorant, the male and the female.

Allah *Exalted is He* has made the path easy for all those morally responsible, by granting them intellects, hearing, and sight, and by spreading for them His signs throughout the horizons of the heavens and the earth and within themselves—signs which they touch with their hands, see with their eyes, and hear with their ears.

[The Intellect]

The intellect is an attribute by which Allah *Exalted is He* has

distinguished those of His servants who are morally responsible. Through it, knowledge is recognized and sciences are acquired. This attribute is an accident that occurs in the body and does not remain permanently as the body remains. The heart itself is not the intellect; rather, it is its locus. This is evidenced by His saying, *Exalted is He*: *"Or are there locks upon their hearts?"* **[Muḥammad: 24]**, and by His saying, *Exalted is He*: *"Indeed, it is not the eyes that become blind, but rather the hearts within the breasts that become blind"* **[al-Ḥajj: 46]**.

It has also been said that the locus of the intellect is the brain. In my view, however, the disagreement regarding the essence of the intellect and its locus bears little benefit for the purposes of this science.

Imam al-Mahdī and the Muʿtazilah said that the intellect consists of necessary sciences, collectively amounting to ten sciences, which a poet summarized in his verse:

Knowledge of the state of the soul comes first, then self-evidence, Then experience, then observation comes as the fourth;

And the circular, and intention after transmission, Clear matters, and relation as the ninth;

And the tenth is discerning good from its opposite— These are the sciences of the intellect, whenever you examine them.[1]

This view is manifestly corrupt. There is no doubt among all that the intellect is an instrument by which sciences and forms of knowledge are acquired. Through what means, then, were these ten sciences obtained—through the intellect or through something other than it?

If they say: through the intellect, then the intellect would be other than these sciences.

And if they say: through something other than it—namely, that Allah created them within the human being and placed them in him, thus rendering him rational

1- *"Knowledge of the state of the soul"*: that is, awareness of its existence and its conditions, such as desire, aversion, pain, and pleasure. *"Self-evidence"*: such as knowing that ten is greater than five. *"Experience"*: such as knowing that glass breaks when struck by a stone. *"Observation"*: knowledge of what is directly witnessed when conditions are sound. *"The circular"*: knowledge of exhaustive division, such as knowing that an object must either exist or not exist. *"Intention"*: knowledge of the intentions of speakers in what becomes apparent and manifest. *"After transmission"*: knowledge derived from recurrent mass reports. *"Clear matters"*: evident matters, such as a person knowing after eating lunch or dinner what food and condiment he consumed. *"Relation"*: the attachment of an act to its agent in a general sense. *"Discerning good from its opposite"*: knowledge of the ugliness of what is ugly and the obligation of what is obligatory by reason, such as injustice, lying, and frivolity, and the obligation of repaying debts, returning trusts, and thanking the benefactor. (Adapted slightly from *ʿUddat al-Akyās*).

We reply: were the matter as you claim, then whoever did not have all of them present in his mind simultaneously would not be rational, due to their absence from his heart.

Moreover, theoretical knowledge is acquired by a person through inquiry and reflection, not through these ten sciences.

[The Judgment of the Intellect Regarding Good and Evil]

There is no disagreement that the intellect judges something to be good or evil insofar as it accords with one's natural disposition or conflicts with it. Thus, it judges tasty food to be good and repugnant food to be bad. The meaning of this judgment is the inclination of one's nature toward a thing or its aversion from it.

In reality, however, this is not a judgment of the intellect, but rather a judgment of nature; hence animals share with human beings in perceiving this.

Likewise, there is no disagreement that the intellect judges as good whatever constitutes a quality of perfection and as evil whatever constitutes a quality of deficiency. It therefore judges knowledge, truthfulness, generosity, courage, and all noble moral traits to be good, and judges ignorance, lying, miserliness, cowardice, and all blameworthy traits to be evil. Here, its judgment means its recognition that one attribute is a deficiency and the other a perfection.

Thereafter, people differed.

The Adliyya [*the proponents of Divine Justice*] ***said*** that the intellect judges that the doer of good deserves praise and reward, both immediately and in the Hereafter, and that the doer of evil deserves blame and punishment in this world and the next.

The Ashʿariyya and the Ḥashwiyya, on the other hand, ***said*** that the intellect does not perceive goodness or evil in such matters; rather, these are known only through revelation.

In response to them we say: all rational people approve and commend the act of praising one who does good or who shows beneficence toward them, and of blaming one who does evil or wrongs them, without distinguishing between what occurred long ago and what occurred recently.

Upon this practice has the course of humanity proceeded, in ancient times and in modern times alike. Such a matter does not require formal proof; it suffices for the morally responsible person, in knowing this, to possess hearing and sight, for he will find confirmation of it in what he hears and sees from the reports of people and the events of the world. One often hears, through global media outlets, praise and commendation

for advocates of peace or inventors, accompanied by their being honored with great awards. Likewise, we hear condemnation of advocates of war and perpetrators of crimes, and we see criminal courts established for crimes, even though those involved may be far removed from the heavenly laws.

Those who oppose us in this matter say: people's considering such acts reprehensible and approving their opposites does not arise from the judgment of the intellect, but rather from habituation and custom.

We reply to them: if it were as you claim—arising merely from habit and custom—then people's conventions regarding this would differ according to differences in lands. Do you not see that eating the desert lizard, frogs, or snakes varies in being considered good or bad from one country to another and from one society to another, depending on differing customs?

As for the goodness of justice and the evil of injustice, human conventions have unanimously agreed upon a single judgment in ancient times and in modern times alike. Had custom played a role in this, their conventions regarding it would have differed.

Indeed, the Adliyya—including the Zaydiyya—regard the intellect as the foremost of proofs and place the utmost trust in its judgment, not only in the realm of good and evil, but also in knowing truth from falsehood, distinguishing the truthful from the liar, the sound from the corrupt, the strong from the weak, and so forth.

As for the Jabriyya, they have entirely turned away from this and said: there is no confidence in the judgment of the intellect, nor is it permissible to rely upon it; rather, rulings are known only through revelation.

We say: were it not for the proof of the intellect, we would not distinguish between the call of the Prophet *may Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace* and the call of Musaylima, nor would we know the truthfulness of the Prophet *may Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace* and the falsehood of Musaylima, the legitimacy of Divine Unity and the invalidity of polytheism, and so forth.

[Inquiry and Reflection]

Inquiry and reflection mean directing one's thought toward a matter in order to attain a belief. Through it, most divine knowledges and what is connected to them are acquired, and there is no path to them other than this. For this reason, our Imams *(Peace be Upon Them)* and others among the Adliyya have said that inquiry is obligatory both rationally and textually.

As for the rational obligation of inquiry, this becomes clear through the following example: if a trustworthy, reliable, and truthful man were to come to you, O reader, and warn you of dangers and perils that you are on the verge of falling into, and that if you do not take precautions you will inevitably fall into them, then there is no doubt that the intellect, in this situation, compels you to examine the truthfulness of what he says. If what the man says is true, you would take precautions.

The judgment of the intellect in such a case is clear: it necessitates examining the validity of the report, for the sake of preserving oneself and safeguarding it from destruction.

From this we say that inquiry and reflection are rationally obligatory with respect to what the messengers—*may Allah's blessings be upon them*—have informed us of concerning the threat and severe punishment that Allah *Exalted is He* has prepared for the disobedient, conveyed through His messengers.

As for the textual obligation of inquiry and reflection, this is a matter about which there is no disagreement, except among the Taʿlīmiyya, who said: nothing is apprehended by the intellect except necessities, whereas inferential matters are apprehended by the Imam or the shaykh, who then teach them to the people.

The textual proofs are many, such as His saying *Exalted is He*: *"Say: Observe what is in the heavens and the earth"* **[Yūnus:101]**, and His saying *Exalted is He*: *"Have they not reflected upon themselves…"* **[al-Rūm: 8]**, and many other verses besides these.

For this reason, inquiry is an individual obligation upon all morally responsible persons, due to what it entails of knowing Allah, knowing His messengers, His promise and His threat, and so forth.

Moreover, Allah has facilitated the path of inquiry and reflection and made it easy for all His morally responsible servants. He *Glorified and Exalted is He* created them and endowed them with a natural disposition inclined toward inquiry and reflection that leads them to knowledge of Him. Hence, you see a child, at the very beginning of discernment, frequently questioning his mother: Where did he come from? Who created him? And so forth.

[Evidence]

Inquiry and reflection must necessarily engage with and attach themselves to something, and through that thing with which inquiry and reflection engage, the intellect arrives at the desired conclusion.

Scholars call the thing with which inquiry and reflection engage *evidence*.

It is also called a *sign* (*āyah*). Allah *Exalted is He* says: *"And on the earth are signs for those of sure faith, and within yourselves—do you not then perceive?"* **[al-Dhāriyāt]**, and He *Exalted is He* says: *"Indeed, in the creation of the heavens and the earth and the alternation of night and day are signs for those endowed with intellects"* **[Āl ʿImrān]**.

The expression describing how thought proceeds until it reaches the conclusion is called *inference* (*istidlāl*).

[Causal Factors[1]]

In reality, influence (*taʾthīr*) can only proceed from an agent (*fāʿil*). This is the doctrine of our Imams—may Allah exalt their rank. Some of the Muʿtazila and others, however, affirmed other causal factors besides the agent, namely: the *cause* (*ʿilla*), the *means* (*sabab*), the *condition* (*sharṭ*), the *motive* (*dāʿī*), and the *determinant* (*muqtaḍī*).

We shall clarify their intent through several examples.

They said that the cause is an essence from which a property or a ruling results. For example, a body is an essence from which spatial extension (*taḥayyuz*) results; thus, the body is a cause for the occurrence of the attribute of spatial extension. Likewise, knowledge gives rise to a property in the possessor of knowledge, which they express as "being knowing" (*ʿālimiyya*), or his being a knower. They said the same regarding life and power, and regarding blackness and whiteness, and the like. These examples pertain to an essence from which a property results.

As for an essence from which a *ruling* results, this is like similarity and dissimilarity, which cannot be conceived except by envisaging two things to which the ruling of similarity or dissimilarity applies. Thus, Zayd and ʿAmr, for example, are either similar or dissimilar, and from this arises the ruling of resemblance or difference.

Likewise, nearness and remoteness cannot be conceived or comprehended except between two things; hence, it is not valid to judge such matters unless one conceives, for example, of Zayd in relation to a house, at which point one judges Zayd to be near to or far from the house.

Just as a ruling may result from two things, it may also result from what takes the place of two things. They exemplified this with what they called the "validity of precise craftsmanship," which they considered a ruling resulting from knowledge and from the object precisely fashioned—which is created.

1- *This lesson is not prescribed in the curriculum for students.*

The *means*: is such as inquiry, through which knowledge is obtained.

The *condition*: is such as existence, for a body does not bring about spatial extension unless it exists.

The *motive* (*dāʿī*) is of two kinds:

1. **The motive of need**, such as eating and drinking, for the soul inclines to these in order to procure benefit and repel harm, and such as fleeing from the heat of the sun in order to ward off its harm.
2. **The motive of wisdom**, for wisdom calls to the practice of noble moral traits such as generosity and benevolence, and calls to abandoning blameworthy traits such as miserliness, cowardice, and the like.

As for the determinant (*muqtaḍī*), it is the most specific attribute. They posited for every essence a most specific attribute from which another attribute results. Thus, they said that a body has a most specific attribute, namely corporeality, from which another attribute of the body results, namely spatial extension. Likewise, regarding the Essence of the Exalted Creator—according to their claim—they said that His Essence has a most specific attribute from which His attributes, namely knowledge, power, life, and existence, result.

Yes, it may be that those who spoke of the causal efficacy of blackness and redness—saying that blackness and redness are causes for the occurrence of a property in black and red things, namely their being black or red—intended only that blackness and redness are causes for the validity of applying the attribute "being black" or "being red" to that thing. If this is what they intended, then there is no disagreement between us and them.

But if they meant that blackness and redness give rise to two other attributes, distinct from blackness and redness, in the thing characterized by them, then this is a rejected claim, alien to what sound intellects recognize.

For there is no doubt that a thing's being black—what they call "blackness"—is identical to blackness itself, not another attribute produced by blackness, as they claim.

[Refutation of the Claim of the Efficacy of These Factors]

As for the *means*, true influence belongs to the agent; the means is merely an instrument for attaining the intended outcome. For this reason, praise and blame are directed toward the agent who employs the means. Hence Allah *the Exalted* condemned the people of the Sabbath when they employed the means of fishing—namely, setting fishing nets

on Friday—so that the fish came on Saturday and were trapped by those set nets, after which the owners of the nets came and took the fish on Sunday. Allah *the Exalted* condemned them for this, cursed them, and transformed them into apes and swine.

As for the *condition*, the absence of any real influence on its part is clear, for the influencer is something other than it; it merely renders the influence of the influencer valid, as they themselves say. Therefore, it should not be mentioned among the causal agents.

As for the *motive*, there is no difficulty in recognizing that the agent is the one who eats and drinks, not the motive of need for eating and drinking; likewise is the case with actions performed for the motive of wisdom.

Furthermore, we have mentioned this topic here in following the *Asās* and its commentary; otherwise, there is little benefit in mentioning it. This is because the proponents of causes have passed away and no longer exist, and their philosophy regarding causes and the like in general—though it remains in the pages of theological books—is a misguided philosophy built upon illusions, swiftly dismantled by the innate dispositions of sound intellects.

[The Book of Divine Unity (*Al-Tawhid*)]

Divine Unity (*al-Tawḥīd*) is the knowledge of Allah—*Glorified and Exalted is He*—as possessing absolute oneness; the negation of any partner, consort, or child; the affirmation of what He deserves of the Most Beautiful Names and the Most Exalted Attributes; the knowledge of what is impossible for Him—*Exalted is He*—and of what is connected to and associated with all of that. The Commander of the Faithful *(Peace be Upon Him)* succinctly encapsulated the meaning of Divine Unity in a brief expression when he said: *"Divine Unity is that you do not imagine Him."* The meaning of this eloquent statement is that Allah—*Exalted is He*—does not resemble any of His creatures. He is not a body, nor confined to a place, nor described by the attributes of created beings; thus there is no modality and no likeness, and so on.

His statement *(Peace be Upon Him)* conveys all of this, because imagining is conceiving, and conceiving applies only to what is a body or an accident. Whatever a human being conceives is either a body or an accident. From this we know that Allah—*Exalted is He*—is not a body, that His attributes are not accidents as they are in created beings, and that He is not confined to a place nor do accidents inhere in Him, for such things occur only in a body that can be conceived.

[The Origination of the World]

The paths to knowing Allah—*Mighty and Majestic*—is He—are many. Allah—*Exalted is He*—has directed attention to His knowledge in His Book through verses and through diverse forms of indication.

Among the paths to knowing Him—*Exalted is He*—is the origination of the world, and its origination has become, in our time, one of the accepted theories among cosmologists.

The first proof cited by the author of *al-Asās* in this regard is His saying—*Exalted is He*—: *"Indeed, in the creation of the heavens and the earth, and the alternation of night and day, and the ships that sail through the sea for the benefit of people, and what Allah sends down from the sky of water whereby He revives the earth after its death, and disperses therein every kind of creature, and the directing of the winds, and the clouds subjected between the heaven and the earth—are signs for a people who use reason."* **[al-Baqarah]**

In this verse, Allah—*Mighty and Majestic—is He*—alerts minds to open their eyes to the wonders of this universe and calls them to reflection and contemplation upon the creation of the heavens and the earth.

[Methods of Reasoning for the Origination of the World]

The theologians have followed various methods in reasoning for the origination of the heavens and the earth, among them:

1. The Proof of Contingency (dalīl al-imkān), which is mentioned first in *al-Asās*.
2. The Proof of Difference (dalīl al-ikhtilāf), which is the second mentioned in *al-Asās*.
3. The Proof of Analogy (dalīl al-qiyās), which is the third mentioned in *al-Asās*.
4. The Proof of the Four Claims (dalīl al-daʿawā al-arbaʿ), which is not mentioned in *al-Asās* but is mentioned in its commentary.

[The Proof of Contingency]

As for the Proof of Contingency, they explained it as follows:

If the intellect considers the creation of the heavens and the earth, it will inevitably find them inseparably associated with the possibility of increase and decrease, transformation and change, combination and separation. Contingency exists only alongside the capacity for increase and decrease, and so on.

Capacity does not exist except after the validity of action, and the validity of action does not exist except after the existence of an agent.

According to this progression, the *validity of action* is originated, because it does not exist except after the existence of an agent.

Capacity and contingency do not exist except after the validity of action, and you have known that it is originated; therefore, whatever comes after it is originated. Thus, contingency is established to be originated. The intellect has judged it to be inseparably associated with the creation of the heavens and the earth; therefore, their origination necessarily follows.

[The Proof of Difference]

As for the Proof of Difference, it is that the heavens and the earth are different. Their difference must be due either to nonexistence, to a cause, or to a choosing agent. Nonexistence has no effect according to rational people.

If the cause is validly effective, its effect is one of necessity and does not exceed a single effect.

As you can see, the effects of difference in the heavens and the earth are many, and their manifestations are diverse. It is not valid for all of that to be due to a single cause.

If it is said that this is due to many different causes, each causing a different effect.

We say: the question then transfers to those different causes—are their differences due to nonexistence, to a cause, or to a choosing agent, and so on?

Thus, nothing remains except that their difference is due to a Choosing, Capable, Living, Knowing agent—and that is Allah—*Exalted is He.*

[The Proof of Analogy]

As for the Proof of Analogy, they said: the heavens and the earth are like constructed buildings, such as houses and towns built by human beings, assembled part to part. Houses and towns are unquestionably originated; therefore, the heavens and the earth are originated like constructed buildings, due to the absence of any relevant difference.

[The Proof of the Four Claims]

As for the Proof of the Four Claims, it is as follows:

1. That in the body there is an accident other than it.
2. That this accident is originated.
3. That the body has never been devoid of it, nor did it precede it.
4. That its inseparable association with it necessitates its origination.

- As for the proof that there is in the body an accident other than it, this is known necessarily, for nobody can be conceived except upon a state such as motion or rest; and there is no doubt that motion or rest is something other than the body itself.

Symptoms are: colors, tastes, smells, heat, cold, moisture, dryness, desire, aversion, life, power, composition, sounds, pains, beliefs, volitions, aversions, suppositions, and thoughts.

- As for the proof that accidents are originated, this too is among the necessary truths, and this is evident in the motion of a body.
- As for the proof of inseparability, it is also known, for bodies are neither comprehended nor conceived except as inseparable from originated accidents.
- As for the proof that inseparability necessitates origination, it is that when the origination of accidents is established, and their inseparability from bodies is established, the origination of bodies is thereby established—and this is clear.

[Qur'anic Evidence for the Existence of the Creator, His Greatness, and His Power]

Thus, after pointing to the evidences by which theologians reason, we pause at these verses from *Sūrat al-Anʿām*:

"Indeed, Allah is the Splitter of the grain and the pit; He brings forth the living from the dead and brings forth the dead from the living. That is Allah—so how are you deluded? [He is] the Splitter of the dawn; He made the night for rest, and the sun and the moon for reckoning. That is the determination of the Mighty, the Knowing. And He it is who made for you the stars so that you may be guided by them through the darknesses of the land and the sea. We have detailed the signs for a people who know. And He it is who produced you from a single soul—then [for you is] a place of settlement and a place of storage. We have detailed the signs for a people who understand. And He it is who sends down water from the sky; and with it We bring forth the growth of every thing, then We bring forth from it greenery from which We produce grains in layers, and from the palm trees—from their spathes—clusters hanging low, and gardens of grapes, and olives, and pomegranates, similar yet not alike. Look at their fruit when it bears and at its ripening. Indeed, in that are signs for a people who believe." **[al-Anʿām]**

Allah—*Mighty and Majestic is He*—halts minds with these verses at the evidences of His power and the signs of His greatness, so that one finds no escape from affirmation, humility, submission, surrender, and glorification with the praise of their Originator.

The first of Allah's signs and evidences of His power and greatness is *"the Splitter of the grain and the pit."* You see the grain split open to a growing plant, and the pit split open to a mighty tree. The emergence of living, growing vegetation and trees from lifeless grain and pits is a hidden secret at which minds stand perplexed, unable to grasp its reality or explain it except through faith in Allah.

These great signs are scattered and abundant, occurring at every time and every moment—visible and tangible. Then He—*Exalted is He*—said: *"He brings forth the living from the dead and brings forth the dead from the living. That is Allah—so how are you deluded?"*.

This earth existed when there was no life; then life came, which Allah brought forth from lifelessness. Today there is no disagreement among earth scientists that the earth existed without life, and that life came thereafter.

Thus, the origination of life and its emergence from dead earth is a tremendous sign and a wondrous secret that dazzles intellects and compels them to acknowledge and submit to the determination of a

Powerful, Wise One.

"[He is] the Splitter of the dawn; He made the night for rest, and the sun and the moon for reckoning. That is the determination of the Mighty, the Knowing." The splitting of the dawn and its emergence from the darkness of night is an astonishing sign, recurring and renewed for creatures. Making the night a time of rest is another such sign. In both signs—night and day—there are immense benefits for living beings and plants, such that the intellect, upon reflection, can only acknowledge that this is the determination of the Mighty, the Knowing.

The sun and the moon are two signs among Allah's signs and evidences of His power and wisdom. They traverse the expanse, each with a known course and prescribed stations, measured by precise reckoning—details known to astronomers.

Some of the natural scientists of this century said[1]: The suitability of the earth for life takes many forms that cannot be explained on the basis of chance and randomness. The earth is a sphere suspended in space, rotating upon itself, resulting in the alternation of night and day; it orbits the sun once each year, resulting in the alternation of seasons, which in turn increases the habitable area of our planet's surface and enhances the diversity of plant species more than if it were stationary. Surrounding the earth is a gaseous envelope containing the gases necessary for life, extending to a great height exceeding 500 miles.

This gaseous envelope has a density sufficient to prevent millions of deadly meteors from reaching us daily, plunging at a speed of thirty miles per second.

This envelope preserves the earth's temperature within limits suitable for life. It carries water vapor in the form of clouds from the oceans to far distances within the continents, by which Allah revives the earth after its death… and so on.

Hence, nothing remains for the intellect except to say: *"That is the determination of the Mighty, the Knowing",* who created everything and proportioned it with precise determination.

"And He it is who made for you the stars so that you may be guided by them through the darknesses of the land and the sea…"

This completes the signs of Allah in the revolving firmament. He—*Exalted is He*—mentioned it after mentioning the night and the day, the sun and the moon, and what pertains to them of benefits for humankind. The Arabs, in the bewilderments of land and sea, used to be guided by

1- Read: *al-Insān bayna Daynūnat li-Allāh wa al-Daynūnah li-Ghayrih*, p. 324.

the stars; likewise, were all peoples, and people remain so to this day, even if the means of guidance have differed and expanded through discoveries and experiments.

If people have been—and still are—guided by the stars when lost and astray in the darknesses of land and sea, then it is more fitting for people of insight and knowledge to be guided by them to their Wise Originator. For within them are creation, governance, and general benefits for creation that compel intellects to acknowledge and affirm the Wise Creator.

"And He it is who produced you from a single soul—then [for you is] a place of settlement and a place of storage…"

The beginning of creation from a single soul—Adam and Eve—then procreation, multiplication, growth, and spread; thereafter, races, colors, kinds, and languages; peoples and tribes beyond count, and types beyond enumeration—all arising from a single soul that multiplies through pairing. All of this causes natural disposition to submit and respond to the call of faith.

"And He it is who sends down water from the sky; and with it We bring forth the growth of every thing, then We bring forth from it greenery from which We produce grains in layers, and from the palm trees—from their spathes—clusters hanging low, and gardens of grapes, and olives, and pomegranates, similar yet not alike. Look at their fruit when it bears and at its ripening. Indeed, in that are signs for a people who believe." In this verse is an exposition of the marvels of His making—*Exalted is He*—in sending down water from the sky upon the earth, and what its descent causes of the emergence of kinds of trees and varieties of plants, and what comes forth of types of fruits, and the signs within them at their ripening and readiness. These verses we have recited require nothing more than being read and contemplated.

Hence, He—*Exalted is He*—said after these verses: *"There has come to you insights from your Lord; so whoever sees, it is for his own soul, and whoever is blind, it is against it…"* **[al-Anʿām: 104]**

[The Bahshamiyyah Philosophy Regarding the Origination of the World]

Among the philosophical views of the Bahshamiyyah[1] in this matter is their statement that the essences of the world are established in pre-eternity; yet, according to them, it is not correct to say that they are *existent* in pre-eternity, nor is it valid in their view to say that they are

1- They are a group among the Muʿtazilah, followers of Abū Hāshim (*Sharḥ al-Asās al-Kabīr*).

established in eternity.

Accordingly, Allah's creation and effect, in their claim, relate only to bringing about the attribute of existence for those essences that are established in nonexistence. As for the essence itself, Allah—*Exalted is He*—has no effect upon it, according to their assertion.

They further claimed that the attribute of existence to which Allah's power is attached is something additional to the essence: the essence is one thing, and the attribute of existence is another—so they said.

Then they said concerning the attribute of existence: it is neither a thing nor not-a-thing.

The response is that the Bahshamiyyah, by this philosophy of theirs, have exceeded the bounds of what is intelligible, bringing forth that which no sound natural disposition accepts and no intellect acknowledges. How can a rational person accept or believe in the establishment of something that does not exist, or believe in an attribute that is neither a thing nor not-a-thing?

Among the Muʿtazilite philosophies concerning the attributes of the world is their statement that attributes are not to be described at all—neither the attributes of the world nor the attributes of Allah—*Exalted is He*.

As for bodies, they said, they may be described; thus it is said: a long body, or a spatially extended body. Length is an attribute of the body, as is spatial extension, but it is not valid thereafter to describe length or spatial extension themselves.

Then they said regarding attributes such as length and spatial extension that they are matters, or distinctions, or states that are neither the described entity nor other than it, neither a thing nor not-a-thing. They generalized this philosophy to the attributes of Allah and the attributes of created beings.

The answer: their categorical judgment that attributes are not describable is a judgment devoid of correctness and unsupported by any evidence from language, revelation, or reason. As for language, there is no prohibition of this in its books, despite their abundance and breadth, and the masters of Arabic rhetoric have not spoken of such a judgment at all. As for revelation, the Book and the Sunnah are devoid of any discussion of this matter. As for reason, there is no impossibility entailed in describing an attribute; for example, our saying: "The heat of that body is intense," or "The motion of this body is light or swift," is a sound statement according to reason.

As for their statement, "It is neither the described entity nor other

than it, neither a thing nor not-a-thing," it is a false statement that no sound intellect accepts or believes. Perhaps this was an attempt on their part to flee and escape from what would necessarily follow them when they spoke about the attributes of Allah—*Glorified and Exalted is He*—when they said that His attributes—*Mighty and Majestic—is He*—are matters additional to His essence. Their opponents then asked them about those matters: Are they existent or nonexistent? Are they eternal or originated? Whatever answer they gave would necessitate their departure from the truth. Thus, they were compelled to respond by saying that attributes are not to be described: it is not said that they are Allah nor other than Him, neither a thing nor not-a-thing, neither existent nor nonexistent, neither eternal nor originated.

[Names and Attributes]

The term *attribute* (*ṣifah*) is applied to several meanings:

1. In its original linguistic usage, it refers to the statement of the describer that indicates some of the states of an essence, such as our saying: "This man is tall," or short, or intelligent, or foolish, or generous, and the like. All of these are linguistic attributes. As for terms such as man, horse, Zayd, and ʿAmr, they are not descriptions.
2. Description is also used, in common linguistic usage, for the meaning conveyed by the word *tall* or *short*, namely tallness and shortness.
3. In the terminology of the theologians, *attribute* is applied to two meanings—and these two meanings are according to the doctrine of the Muʿtazilah:
    1. Every matter additional to the essence that falls within the scope of knowing it and describing it; such as knowledge, which is an essence giving rise to an attribute, namely being knowing; and life, which is an essence giving rise to an attribute, namely being living. Likewise, motion, rest, conjunction, and separation—each of these gives rise to an attribute: being moving, at rest, conjoined, or separated. Likewise, the validity of precision, which is a judgment entailed by knowledge and the precise object—exactly as previously mentioned when discussing the influencers. And the example of negation: "not knowing," which is the negation of an attribute, entailing being not knowing. This meaning is general and encompasses judgment, attribute, affirmation, and negation, and we have given examples for all of these.

2. *The attribute* is also used to mean a particularity that does not subsist independently, and for whose intelligibility the mere existence of the essence suffices, such as knowingness and power, and so on. For knowingness and the like are particularities resulting from the essence that is knowledge. This meaning is specific.

Thus, the application of the term *attribute* to these two meanings is according to the terminology of the Muʿtazilah, as they said that the meaning of attribute in both the Creator and the created is a particularity that does not subsist independently in knowability, additional to the essence, neither the essence itself nor other than it. The response to them has already been given.

The Attributes of the Agent in the Origination of the World and What It Contains

In what has preceded, we established through rational demonstration the origination of the heavens and the earth, and we followed this by mentioning events whose origination is necessarily known through sense perception and direct observation. On this basis, it is inevitable that the originator of those events be Existent, Powerful, Knowing, and Living. The inquirer does not require a new act of reflection to know these four attributes; rather, the initial consideration suffices for attaining knowledge of them. This is because once it is established for the observer that the world and all created things within it are originated, and that they must have an originating, volitional agent, it follows necessarily that this originator is Existent, Powerful, and Living, since the nonexistent, the powerless, and the dead cannot perform any act whatsoever. It also follows that He is knowing, for one who is ignorant cannot produce perfection and creative precision.

The vastness of Allah's knowledge and its all-encompassing nature become evident to the observer upon reflecting on the realms of living creatures. The atom and the ant each possess hearing, sight, a digestive system, a circulatory system, and a reproductive system, along with all the other systems found in animals, in addition to perception and instinct. Hence, they avoid what harms and injures them, strive for their sustenance, and have dwellings to which they resort. You see them, for example, hastening to their shelters before rainfall in order to protect themselves from it. Had Allah's knowledge—*Exalted is He*—been absent from His creatures, they would have been lost and destroyed. Thus, we know that Allah's knowledge encompasses all things: it penetrates veils, passes beyond barriers, and permeates the innermost depths of the atom and the ant alike, regulating the heart, the circulatory system, and the digestive system, spreading His bounty through their limbs, sustaining

within their bodies the spirit and the soul, and preserving them within their dwellings. Hence Allah, *Exalted is He*, says: *"And there is no creature on earth but that upon Allah is its provision; and He knows its place of settlement and its place of storage. All is in a clear register."* **[Hūd:6]**

The originator of the world and what it contains must also be eternal.

The proof of this, and its detailed explanation, is as follows: it has been established that the origination of the world and all that is in it occurred through a volitional agent, and a volitional agent must necessarily precede its act. Therefore, simultaneity in existence between the maker and the made is impossible, for such simultaneity would nullify the fact that one is a maker and the other is made. Consequently, the maker must precede the made.

Moreover, this precedence must be eternal, without any beginning to His existence. For if He were originated, He would require an originator to bring Him into existence, and that originator would in turn require another, and so on ad infinitum—which is impossible.

Hence Allah, *Exalted is He*, says: *"He is the First and the Last …"* **[al-Ḥadīd: 3]**

Section: The Disagreement Concerning the Interpretation of Affirming Allah's Attributes

You have already come to know that the maker of the world and all that it contains is Existent, Powerful, Knowing, Lliving, and Eternal, and there is no disagreement among Muslims regarding affirming these attributes for Allah, *Exalted is He*. However, they have differed concerning the interpretation of this affirmation with respect to Allah.

The View of the Majority of Our Imams (*Peace be Upon Them*) and Some of the Muʿtazilites

The majority of our Imams, *peace be upon them*, and some of the Muʿtazilites said: the attributes of Allah, *Exalted is He*, are His essence. To understand the meaning of this statement, it is necessary to explain the meaning of "attribute" and "description" with respect to created beings. We say: an attribute or description is a meaning that subsists in a body. Standing or sitting, for example, is a meaning that inheres in a body; when this meaning subsists in a body, it becomes correct to describe it by saying: "it is standing" or "it is sitting."

Likewise, knowledge, power, and life are each meanings that inhere in a body; when they subsist in a body, it becomes correct to say that the body is knowing, powerful, or living. On this basis, standing, sitting, and the like are only valid in bodies.

Similarly, life, power, and knowledge can only subsist in bodies.

When you understand this, it becomes clear that standing is one thing and the body another, that knowledge is one thing and the body another, and that power is one thing and the body another—this is self-evident.

Do you not see that a human being may know something or several things, and then after a period that knowledge departs from him? Or that he may be capable of carrying a certain object, then that capability disappears? Likewise, he may be standing and then sit, such that the attribute of standing departs from him—along with other attributes.

Once you understand this, the meaning of their statement, "the attributes of Allah, *Exalted is He*, are His essence," becomes clear: it is a declaration of Allah's transcendence above any resemblance to created beings. It is therefore not valid that His attributes be meanings inhering in His essence, for if they were such meanings, it would entail that the Creator—*majestic and exalted*—is a body, since meanings, as you have learned, only inhere in bodies. It is neither permissible nor correct that the Creator be a body, for if He were a body He would be originated, since bodies are originated due to the indicators of origination inherent in them—such as their concomitance with originated accidents like motion and rest, conjunction and separation, and the like. For this reason, it became necessary to negate that Allah's attributes are meanings inhering in His essence in the manner of created beings. Thus we say: Allah's attributes are His essence, meaning that He is nothing other than His essence. He is Powerful by His essence, Living by His essence, Knowing by His essence, Hearing by His essence, and Seeing by His essence—unlike created beings, among whom one who hears is said to hear by an instrument of hearing, one who sees by an instrument of sight, one who is powerful by a power, and one who is knowing by knowledge.

Indeed, when we say that Allah, *Exalted is He*, is Powerful by His essence, this does not mean that His essence is an instrument of power. Rather, it signifies the absolute distinction between Allah, *majestic and exalted*, and the created being. If the created being is powerful by a power, knowing by knowledge, hearing by hearing, and seeing by sight, then Allah, *majestic and exalted*, is Powerful because He is Allah, and Knowing because He is Allah—there is no instrument, no cause, and no means except that He is Allah, *Exalted is He*. At this point, the knowledge of the creature comes to an end, and there is no path beyond this knowledge. Allah, *Exalted is He*, says: *"And they do not encompass Him in knowledge."*

[The Saying of the Amūriyyah]

Some of them said: Rather, His attributes, *Exalted is He*, are matters

additional to His Essence, *Exalted is He*; they are neither Allah nor other than Him, neither something nor nothing.

And they only said this because, according to them, there must necessarily be a matter additional to His Essence by which the distinction occurs between His Essence, *Exalted is He*, and all other essences. This is how they believe.

The reason for this belief is that they inserted the Essence of the Creator, *Glorious and Exalted is He*, among the rest of the essences, and made them all a single genus sharing in essentiality. At that point, it becomes necessary—according to them—that every essence, including the Essence of Allah, *Exalted is He*, possess something by which it is distinguished from the other essences that share with it in essentiality. This is what the people of logic call the *differentia*.

For further clarification, we say: They made the Essence of Allah, *Exalted is He*, an individual among the individuals of a single genus, in which the Essence of Allah and all other essences participate—just as the term "animal" is a single genus shared by all animals. Accordingly, man must have something additional to animality by which he is distinguished from the rest of the animals, and likewise the horse and the camel, and so on. Each one of these individuals must necessarily have something additional to animality in order to distinguish it from others.

The response: Their statement in explaining the attributes of Allah, *Exalted is He*, is a statement that the innate dispositions of sound intellects reject. How can intellects accept attributes that are neither Allah nor other than Him, neither something nor nothing, neither existent nor nonexistent, neither eternal nor originated?

There is no need, in invalidating their statement, for more than merely relating it.

[The Saying of the People of Distinctions]

Another group among the Mu'tazilah said: His attributes, *Exalted is He*, are distinctions—neither Allah nor other than Him, and so on.

The response to the people of this statement is the same as the response to the people of the first statement, and there is no difference between the two statements except in naming.

[The Saying of the Jahmiyyah]

The Jahmiyyah said: Rather, His attributes, *Exalted is He*, are other than Him, and they are originated, through an originated knowledge—thus stated in *al-Asās* and its commentary.

We say in response: It is far-fetched, in my view, that this report is

authentic; and if it is authentic, its invalidity is clear. For it necessitates that Allah, *Mighty and Exalted is He*, was incapable, ignorant, and not living before the occurrence of the originated knowledge.

It also necessitates that Allah, *Exalted is He*, be originated due to the origination of His existential attribute. All of this is known falsehood, and no one should adhere to it in the religion of Islam.

[The Saying of the Ashʿariyyah]

The Ashʿariyyah said: The attributes of Allah, *Exalted is He*, are eternal meanings subsisting in His Essence; they are neither Him nor other than Him, and none of them is identical to another, nor other than it.

This statement is close to the statements of the Muʿtazilah, except that the Muʿtazilah refrained from describing the attributes, whereas the Ashʿariyyah did not refrain from that. Thus, they said concerning them: they are eternal and subsisting in His Essence, *Mighty and Exalted is He*. And when the Muʿtazilah saw the repugnance of this doctrine, due to what it entails for those who hold it of anthropomorphism and affirming eternals alongside Allah, *Exalted is He*, they refrained from describing the attributes.

In my view, their refraining from describing the attribute does not remove them from such repugnance, and they are no more entitled to interpretation than the Ashʿariyyah in this matter. For the Ashʿariyyah, even though they affirmed eternal meanings, negated them by their statement: They are neither Him nor other than Him, and so on.

Thus, the Ashʿariyyah and the Muʿtazilah in this chapter are the same. Therefore, the Ashʿariyyah are not declared disbelievers on account of this statement, due to its collapse, since they said: They are neither Him nor other than Him, and none of them is identical to another nor other than it. In reality and in fact, they did not affirm anything—just like the Muʿtazilah. And they declare Allah, *Exalted is He*, transcendent above place, direction, the Throne, the Footstool, ascent and descent, the face and the two hands, and so on—exactly as the Muʿtazilah say in this chapter. The clear disagreement in which they opposed them is their statement affirming the vision of Allah, *Exalted is He*, on the Day of Resurrection; and that Allah, *Exalted is He*, is the One who created the acts of the servants, and willed them and desired them, and that the servant has acquisition (*kasb*) thereof; and they denied the judgment of reason in declaring things good or evil. They explicitly stated that all obligations are among obligations of what is beyond capacity. Al-Rāzī explicitly stated this in *al-Maḥṣūl*, and he is among their leading figures.

However, disbelief attaches to the Ashʿariyyah due to their attributing

vile acts to Allah, *Exalted is He*, and due to their statement that Allah obligated the servants with what they cannot bear—*Exalted is Allah far above what they say, with great exaltation*.

As for their statement affirming the vision of Allah, *Exalted is He*, on the Day of Resurrection: if they say, as al-Rāzī said, that its meaning is necessary knowledge, not vision by the eye, then disbelief does not attach to them by that.

And the statement of those who say that He is seen "without modality (bilā kayf)" is close to the statement of al-Rāzī. That is because they affirmed the vision of Allah, *Exalted is He*, and then negated it by their statement "without modality," since that which is seen is only seen according to modalities and attributes that it possesses at the time of vision, such as motion or rest, nearness or distance, largeness or smallness, [length or width], being in the direction of the front or the right or their opposites, and in the direction of above or below, and in light or in darkness, and upon the color white or other colors, and so on.

So if they negate that the Creator, *Exalted is He*, is upon any attribute or modality, they have negated His being seen. Thus, their affirmation of vision along with that returns vision to the meaning of necessary knowledge which al-Rāzī held. This is if we open the door of interpretation—and that is obligatory if possible and if it has a sound basis upon which it rests. However, interpretation does not benefit the Ashʿariyyah due to their disbelief from several angles, as has preceded.

And Allah is All-Hearing, All-Seeing (samīʿ baṣīr)

There is no disagreement regarding describing Allah, *Glorious and Exalted is He*, with these two names; rather, the disagreement is concerning their meaning. According to us, the meaning of *All-Hearing* with respect to Allah, *Exalted is He*, is: Knowing the things that are heard; and the meaning of *All-Seeing* is: Knowing the things that are seen. It is not valid to interpret them as one who possesses an instrument of hearing and an instrument of sight, because these two instruments are among the accidents of bodies and their properties, and Allah, *Exalted is He*, is not a body, so accidents do not inhere in Him.

Some of the Muʿtazilah said: Rather, the meaning of these two names is that He, *Exalted is He*, is living, with no defect in Him.

We say: *All-Hearing* in the Arabic language is applied to one for whom it is correct to hear by means of the instrument of hearing, and *All-Seeing* to one for whom it is correct to see by means of the instrument of sight. This is the literal meaning of these two names. It is not valid to interpret them with this meaning regarding Allah, *Exalted is He*, because Allah, *Exalted is He*, does not possess an instrument, nor do accidents inhere in

Him. Thus, your statement concerning their meaning—"living, with no defect in Him"—is a statement outside what is customary in the Arabic language, and therefore interpretation by it is not valid.

Yes, the statement of the Muʿtazilah regarding the meaning of these two names is based upon their philosophy concerning attributes. Thus, they made the two names effects of life and resulting from it, just as they said regarding power and knowledge that they result from the Essence or from the most specific attribute with respect to Allah, *Exalted is He*, and from knowledge and power with respect to the created being.

This philosophy is false, as has preceded. What the intellects recognize is that life is a condition for being described by these two attributes; thus, one is not All-Hearing and All-Seeing except if living.

As for one who is living, he may be All-Hearing and All-Seeing, and he may not be; therefore, it is not a condition of being living that one be All-Hearing and All-Seeing.

The foundation of the doctrine of the Muʿtazilah is that life, hearing, and sight are concomitant and none of them separates from the other.

If the matter were as they say, then the blind and the deaf would be seeing and hearing.

If they say: They are not hearing and seeing only due to the presence of an impediment to perception, namely the defect—

We say: The impediment to their perception is the negation of the meaning present in the pupil of the eye and the auditory canal of the ear. From here it becomes clear that hearing and sight are not due to the existence of life, but rather due to the existence of the meaning in the eye and the ear. At that point, there is no relation of life to these two attributes except insofar as it is a condition, and nothing more.

[Allah is Hearing and Seeing (sāmiʿ mubṣir)]

Hearing and *Seeing* are like *All-Hearing* and *All-Seeing* according to our Imams *(Peace be Upon Them)*—there is no difference; both are in the meaning of Knowing.

Some of the Muʿtazilah said: *Hearing* and *Seeing* are two attributes of Allah, *Exalted is He*, by which He is described when He perceives the heard and the seen by life. Thus, they differentiated between *Hearing* and *All-Hearing*, and *Seeing* and *All-Seeing*. They made *Hearing* and *Seeing* two attributes of Allah, *Exalted is He*, that are renewed for Him, by which He is described only at the time of perceiving the heard and the seen.

As for *All-Hearing* and *All-Seeing*, they are two attributes of Allah, *Exalted is He*, by which He is described in pre-eternity, meaning that it is

correct for Him to perceive the heard and the seen if they exist.

I say: There is no objection in what the Muʿtazilah say regarding *Hearing* and *Seeing*, for what they mentioned is one of the true meanings of the morphological form. This is in addition to what is mentioned in the commentary on *al-Asās*: that knowledge is used for three meanings. One of them is perception, which is an attributive relation between the perceiver and the perceived, and this does not occur except at the time of perception alone. According to this meaning, it is said regarding *Hearing* and *Seeing* that they are in the meaning of perception, which is an attributive relation between the perceiver and the perceived, and it does not occur except at the time of perception.

The objection against the Muʿtazilah in this matter is their restriction to this meaning alone. Thus, it becomes necessary for them that *Knowing* be an attribute of Allah, *Exalted is He*, that is renewed, by which He is described only at the time of perceiving the known—and there is no escape for them from this implication. For *Knower* and *All-Knowing*, and *Hearing* and *All-Hearing*, are expressions equal in terms of morphological form.

[On Declaring Allah, *Exalted is He*, Transcendent above Need]

"And Allah is Free of need, Praiseworthy." **[Fāṭir: 15]**

There is no disagreement among the Muslims that Allah, *Exalted is He*, is transcendent above need. This has been explicitly stated in His Noble Book in His saying, *Exalted is He*: *"O mankind, you are those in need of Allah, and Allah—He is the Free of need, the Praiseworthy."* **[Fāṭir: 15]** and in other verses.

The proof of this is that what necessitates need is either desire or aversion. If desire occurs, its possessor seeks that which satisfies it. If it is a desire for food, he seeks food; if it is a desire for marriage, he seeks women; if it is a desire for trade, he seeks its means; and so on. Thus, the possessor of desire, as you see, is in need—regarding what we mentioned—of that which satisfies it, such as food, women, and so forth.

Aversion is the opposite of desire. When aversion occurs, its possessor seeks that which repels it from himself. From here, a person builds for himself a house that shelters him from rain, wards off the harm of heat and cold, and prepares for himself the equipment of war by which he repels the harm of enemies, and so on.

These two attributes—desire and aversion—are among the natures of bodies. And Allah, *Exalted is He*, is not a body. Accordingly, there exists nothing that necessitates need with respect to Allah, *Exalted is He*, for He is not a body.

Here, what is meant by "need" is: procuring benefit and repelling harm.

Benefit is pleasure in benefits and what follows it of joy and happiness.

Harm is pain and what follows it of grief and sorrow.

Pleasure and pain are two accidents that cannot be conceived except in a body.

Among what indicates His being Free of need, *Glorious and Exalted is He*, is that He did not compel those who disobeyed Him to perform the obedience He commanded them with. Had He, *Mighty and Exalted is He*, been in need of it, He would have compelled them to perform it, for He is Powerful over all things.

And we find that He, *Exalted is He*, did not bring all things into existence all at once, despite His power to do so. Had He been in need of them, He would have brought them into existence all at once, due to the absence of any impediment.

[On Declaring Allah, *Exalted is He*, Transcendent above Resemblance to Created Beings]

There is no disagreement among the Muslims that Allah, *Exalted is He*, does not resemble created beings.

The Ḥashwiyyah said: Allah, *Exalted is He*, is a body possessing limbs and organs—*Exalted is Allah far above that, with great exaltation*.

The Ḥashwiyyah said this after they had agreed with the Muslims that Allah, *Exalted is He*, is transcendent above resemblance to created beings, due to His saying, *Exalted is He*: *"There is nothing like unto Him."* **[al-Shūrā: 11]** Then they contradicted their own statement and opposed the consensus, saying: He, *Exalted is He*, is a body, possessing limbs and organs; He walks and hastens, ascends and descends, and so on.

The response is that if Allah, *Exalted is He*, were a body, He would necessarily be originated, like all other bodies, due to the presence of the effects of measurement, administration, and craftsmanship.

[Negation of Place]

Allah, *Exalted is He*, is not one who is occupied by a place, nor is it permissible for Him to move from one direction to another. This is because nothing occupies a place except bodies, and nothing moves from one direction to another except what is a body or dependent upon a body, such as an accident by which bodies are described. Moreover, place and direction are originated, whereas Allah, *Exalted is He*, is the First and the Last

It was said: He is in the direction of above.

And it was said: He, *Exalted is He*, is in a direction above the Throne, in contact with the Throne.

And it was said: Above the Throne, separate from the Throne.

And the Ṣūfiyyah said: He, *Mighty and Exalted is He*, indwells in beautiful forms.

We say in response to them: Indwelling in a direction or in a form can only be for a body or an accident. And Allah, *Exalted is He*, is neither a body nor an accident; for if He were so, He would be originated, due to what has been established regarding the origination of bodies and accidents.

If it is said: Commands, prohibitions, mercy, and punishment descend from the heaven, which indicates what preceded regarding indwelling in a direction above—

We say: Since the heaven is the dwelling place of the angels—*may Allah's blessings be upon them*—and they are the chosen ones for conveying the messages of Allah, *Exalted is He*, to humankind, commands and prohibitions descended from there.

And the descent of mercy and punishment from the heaven was only so because Allah, *Exalted is He*, has disposed the upper directions to carry clouds, from which mercy descends upon the servants, or from which thunderbolts descend, by which Allah, *Exalted is He*, strikes whom He wills of His servants.

[The Meaning of the Saying of the Muslims: "Allah Is in Every Place"]

The meaning of the saying of the Muslims: "Allah is in every place" is that Allah, *Exalted is He*, has encompassed every place and everything with His knowledge, His power, and His mercy. Nothing of things is hidden from Him; nothing escapes Him; and nothing incapacitates Him. He, *Exalted is He*, said: *"There is no private conversation of three except that He is their fourth, nor of five except that He is their sixth ..."* **[al-Mujādilah: 7]** And as He, *Glorified is He*, said: *"Indeed, He is encompassing of all things."* **[Fuṣṣilat: 54]** And: *"And Allah is Witness over all things."* **[al-Burūj: 9]** And: *"And Allah is Powerful over all things."* **[al-Baqarah: 284]** And: *"And Allah is Knowing of all things."* **[al-Nisāʾ: 126]**

[The Consensus of the Muslims that Allah Is the Creator of All Places and That He Was When There Was No Place]

Thereafter, Allah, *Exalted is He*—without any disagreement among all Muslims—is the One who created the heavens and the earth, the upper

and lower directions. And He, *Exalted is He*, is the One who created the Throne and the Footstool. Likewise, there is no disagreement among the Muslims that Allah, *Exalted is He*, was when there was no place and no time. This indicates that Allah, *Exalted is He*, is free of need of the Throne and the Footstool, of the direction "above," and of all places. In this there is a clear proof that Allah, *Exalted is He*, is not a body, for had He been a body He would have required a place. And consensus has been established that Allah was when there was no place and no time.

If it is said: There is no doubt that Allah, *Exalted is He*, was when there was no place and no time, and that He, *Exalted is He*, is the Creator of all places and times; however, when He created places and directions, He chose for Himself the upper directions, making them the resting place of His Throne, then He established Himself upon it without modality—

We say: It has been established by consensus that Allah, *Exalted is He*, was when there was no place. Thus, it is established that He, *Mighty and Exalted is He*, is intrinsically independent of place, and it is not permissible for Him to depart from this essential attribute, because essential attributes do not change. Therefore, it is not valid that He be one who possesses a place after not having been so, nor that He be incapable after having been powerful, nor ignorant after having been knowing, nor originated after having been eternal, and so on.

[The Worshippers of the Winds and the Response to Them]

There is another group that says: His Essence, *Exalted is He*, is in every place, and that He is an infinite expanse. These are the worshippers of the winds, for they believe that air is their lord. They said: Because it encompasses things, everything is within it, and it is with everything. They said: We have found life in it, and upon its cessation comes death.

We say in response to them: The air by which life is sustained, and whose cessation brings about death, is a composite body, as modern science has established. Among the clearest proofs that it is a body is that accidents inhere in it, such as heat and cold, motion and rest—and accidents only inhere in a body. And it has been established by what preceded that all bodies are originated. Furthermore, air does not encompass everything. The animals of the seas, which do not live except in water, are far removed from air; none of it encompasses them, nor do they need it. Rather, if they leave the water, they die.

Moreover, the air by which life is sustained is limited, as has been established in recent times. For it—so they say—forms a layer extending around the earth that does not exceed five hundred miles. As for what lies beyond that, it is a vacuum that is not suitable for life at all.

[The Throne (*Al-ʾArsh*) and the Footstool (*Al-Kursiyy*)]

The majority of our Imams *(Peace be Upon Them)* said: The Throne mentioned by Allah, *Exalted is He*, in the Qur'an is metaphorical, intended to mean might and sovereignty. This metaphor is established in the Arabic language. Rabīʿah ibn ʿUbayd said:

"If they kill you, they have indeed shattered their thrones through
ʿUtaybah ibn al-Ḥārith ibn Shihāb,"

meaning: you have demolished their might and sovereignty.

And Zuhayr ibn Abī Sulmā said:

"You both rescued ʿAbs after its throne had been shattered,

while Dhubyān's sandal had slipped beneath its feet."

And another poet from Banū Kalb said:

"They saw my throne with its two sides broken,

so when it was complete, they isolated me."

This metaphorical usage has remained common until this very day. We often hear, in congratulations to kings, statements such as: "We congratulate you on your taking possession of the throne of such-and-such a kingdom," by which they mean taking possession of its sovereignty.

As for His saying, *Exalted is He*: *"And you will see the angels surrounding the Throne, glorifying the praise of their Lord..."* **[al-Zumar: 75]** It is among the figurative expressions that enhance the beauty of speech and elevate it to the heights of eloquence.

The aspect of eloquence and beauty in this figurative expression is the depiction of an intelligible meaning in a sensible form. For the Arabs addressed by this speech would not have comprehended the degree of the angels' glorification of their Lord were it not for this expression, which portrayed it for them in a form that their eyes almost see, in its full magnitude of glorifying Allah, *Glorious is His Majesty*.

The nature of figurative expression is that what is intended therein is the implied meaning. To clarify the nature of figurative expression, we mention some examples commonly used among people today.

Among them is their saying: "So-and-so has a big belly," by which they intend to describe him as greedy and avaricious.

And among them is their saying: "So-and-so has a big heart," by which they intend to describe him as foolish and dull.

As for His saying, *Exalted is He*: *"And eight will carry the Throne of your Lord above them on that Day."* **[al-Ḥāqqah: 17]** The Throne here means

sovereignty. And the meaning of the verse is that eight categories of angels will undertake, on the Day of Resurrection, and bear the matter of Allah's sovereignty, *Glorious is His Majesty*, including reckoning and other matters. Allah, *Exalted is He*, will command them to reckon with those who are morally responsible, to convey honor, bliss, and reward to the allies of Allah, *Exalted is He*, and to convey punishment and disgrace to the enemies of Allah, *Exalted is He*, and so on.

[The Footstool]

The Footstool mentioned in His saying, *Exalted is He*: *"His Footstool encompasses the heavens and the earth."* **[al-Baqarah: 255]** is the knowledge of Allah, *Exalted is He*. That is because the Footstool, in the original meaning of the language, is knowledge. The Arabs observed this original meaning in their language. Abū Dhūʾayb al-Hudhalī said:

"And no created being is enthroned upon the knowledge of the unseen,"

meaning: no created being knows the knowledge of the unseen.

Another poet said:

"Fair-faced ones surround them, and a group

thrones in times of calamities when they arise,"

meaning: scholars in times of events.

From this comes the name *kurrāsah* (notebook) for the sheet that contains knowledge.

It was also said: What is meant by the Footstool is the sovereignty of Allah, *Exalted is He*. And it was said: Rather, it is His omnipotence. And it was said: His governance.

These four statements are all sound in meaning, and each of them is appropriate to the context of the verse, which is the vastness of Allah's knowledge, the vastness of His sovereignty, and the encompassing of His power and governance over the heavens and the earth.

The Ḥashwiyyah said: The Throne is a couch, and the Footstool is smaller than it.

The response is that such things are only needed by a created being, to relax himself and grant himself comfort by sitting or reclining upon them. And Allah, *Exalted is He*, is not a body, so fatigue and weariness do not befall Him. From here, He, *Exalted is He*, said at the end of the Verse of the Footstool: *"And preserving them does not weary Him, and He is the Most High, the Most Great."* **[al-Baqarah: 255]**

Thereafter, Allah, *Exalted is He*, has praised Himself for His *istiwāʾ* over the Throne in His saying, *Exalted is He*: *"He who created the heavens and*

the earth and what is between them in six days; then He established Himself over the Throne—the Most Merciful—so ask about Him one well informed." **[al-Furqān]** And in His saying, *Exalted is He*: *"A revelation from Him who created the earth and the lofty heavens. The Most Merciful—He established Himself over the Throne. To Him belongs whatever is in the heavens and whatever is on the earth and whatever is between them and whatever is beneath the soil."* **[Ṭā Hā]** And in other verses similar to these. Thus, *Exalted is He*, placed the mention of His *istiwā'* over the Throne amidst a series of great acts of praise; therefore, it must be one of them. Indeed, the particle *"then" (thumma)*—which is a conjunction—indicates, according to the scholars of rhetoric in such a context, that what follows it is greater than what precedes it in praise and commendation. So if we were to interpret *istiwā'* over the Throne as sitting, reclining, or settling, there would be nothing in that of praise—and this is clear. Accordingly, the interpretation of the Ḥashwiyyah must be rejected, refuted, and not considered.

[Allah, *Exalted is He*, Is Not a Part of His Creation]

The Christians said: Allah, *Glorious is His Majesty*, united with ʿĪsā ibn Maryam *(Peace be Upon Him)*, so by that union ʿĪsā became Allah—meaning that the two, Allah and ʿĪsā, became one thing, which is ʿĪsā alone. Perhaps the doubt that led the Christians into this statement was what they saw in ʿĪsā *(Peace be Upon Him)* of great signs: he was born without a father, spoke in the cradle after his birth, cured the blind and the leper by Allah's permission, brought the dead to life by Allah's permission, and informed them of what they ate and what they stored in their houses.

The Ṣūfiyyah spoke with a statement similar to that of the Christians. They said: Allah, *Glorious is His Majesty*, united with prostitutes and beardless youths, and thus became them.

The response to the Christians and the Ṣūfiyyah: It is neither permissible nor sound in reason that the Eternal be transformed into the originated—since ʿĪsā *(Peace be Upon Him)* is originated, and prostitutes and beardless youths are originated—or that the originated be transformed into the Eternal.

The utmost that the verses manifested in ʿĪsā *(Peace be Upon Him)* indicate is that he attained the highest and most exalted degree of honor that a human being can reach, namely prophethood.

Allah, *Exalted is He*, created Ādam *(Peace be Upon Him)* without a father or a mother, yet no one claimed divinity for him because of that. And Mūsā *(Peace be Upon Him)* revived the slain by Allah's permission, split the sea with his staff, and many other signs appeared at his hands—

yet no one claimed divinity for him on that account, neither the Christians nor others.

[Allah, *Exalted is He*, Is Not Subject to Accidents]

Allah, *Exalted is He*, is not subject to accidents, because accidents are among the attributes and properties of bodies, and they cannot be conceived except in a body. Allah, *Exalted is He*, is not a body; therefore, heedlessness, thinking, forgetfulness, worry, grief, and the like—among the natures and attributes of bodies—do not apply to the Creator, *Glorious and Exalted is He*.

A group among the Magians said: Yazdān—who, according to them, is Allah—when his authority became established, reflected upon himself and said: "If I had an opponent who contended with me, what would my state be with him?" From this corrupt thought, Ahriman—the devil—came into being.

The response: This statement bears a mythical character and openly proclaims it. They have no proof for their claim, nor even a plausible doubt—nothing but mere delusions and imaginings that need no more to be refuted than to be presented to reason.

[The Tablet (*Al-Lawh*)]

The Tablet mentioned in the Qur'an is the knowledge of Allah, *Exalted is He*; there is no tablet in literal reality.

The Ḥashwiyyah and others said: Rather, the Tablet is literal, and it is the first created thing.

The response is that none needs recording and writing except one who fears forgetfulness and heedlessness. Allah, *Exalted is He*, is not subject to heedlessness or forgetfulness, for He is not a body—and heedlessness and forgetfulness are two accidents exclusive to bodies.

As for their statement that it is the first created thing, we respond: Some of the eminent members of the Ahl al-Bayt *(Peace be Upon Them)* have narrated from the Prophet Muhammad *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*: "*The first thing Allah created was the splitting open of the expanses*."[1] A similar narration has been reported from the Commander of the Faithful, ʿAlī *(Peace be Upon Him)*, as found in *Nahj al-Balāghah*. Moreover, reason judges that the splitting open of the expanses—which is space—precedes the creation of bodies, because bodies necessarily require a place, and the existence of a body without a place is impossible.

1- *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah*, 1/28.

Furthermore, all that has preceded under the heading *Declaring Allah Transcendent above Need*, and what follows until the heading stating *Allah is not subject to annihilation*, all share a single proof for what we adopt—namely, what has been established that Allah, *Glorious is His Majesty*, is not a body, as previously stated. Therefore, it is obligatory to negate from Him, *Exalted is He*, the natures and properties of bodies, such as limbs and organs, place, indwelling, settling upon the Throne, heedlessness, forgetfulness, thinking, worry, and so on; and vision, birth, offspring, direction, movement, annihilation, and the like. Whoever describes Allah, *Exalted is He*, with any of that has indeed corporealized Him.

If it is said: Such descriptions have come in the Qur'an and the Sunnah regarding Allah, *Exalted is He*.

We say: They have other meanings than those imagined by the ignorant—meanings known to those firmly grounded in knowledge. We have mentioned some of that in its appropriate places in this book.

[Allah, *Exalted is He*, Is Not Perceived by Sight]

The Zaydiyyah, the Muʿtazilah, and the Khārijites said: Allah, *Glorified and Exalted is He*, is not perceived by sight—neither in this world nor in the Hereafter—because He, *Exalted is He*, is not of the categories that can validly be seen.

The Ashʿariyyah and the Ḥashwiyyah, who are the people of ḥadīth, said: Allah, *Glorified and Exalted is He*, will be seen in the Hereafter.

The response—and Allah is the One who grants success:

1. Vision does not occur except with respect to a body. It has been established that bodies are originated, due to the evidences of origination found within them, namely originated accidents such as composition, formation, colors, motion, rest, and so on.

These natures are shared by all bodies. Sound reason judges—without doubt or hesitation—that vision does not occur except with respect to that which is characterized by such attributes. Thus, everything upon which sight falls must necessarily have a form among forms: either length, or shortness, or squareness, or triangularity, or roundness, and so forth.

It must also have a color among colors by which it is characterized, and it must likewise be either in motion or at rest. It has been established that these attributes are originated, and it has also been established that they accompany bodies and do not separate from them. From here, all bodies are originated. Therefore, we say that Allah, *Exalted is He*, is not seen—neither in this world nor in the Hereafter—because if

He were seen, He would be a body; and if He were a body, He would be originated. *Exalted is Allah far above that. "He is the First and the Last, the Manifest and the Hidden…"* **[al-Ḥadīd: 3]**

2. If it were valid that Allah, *Exalted is He*, be seen, He would necessarily be in a direction among directions and in a place among places, because vision is neither valid nor does it occur except with respect to that which is in a place or a direction. Allah, *Exalted is He*, is not in a place nor in a direction, for He, *Glorified is He*, is the Creator of places and directions, and He is independent of them. Indeed, Allah, *Exalted is He*, was when there was nothing.

[Some of the Doubts of Those Who Affirm Vision—and the Response to Them]

As for their statement: "Allah, *Exalted is He*, is seen without modality (bilā kayf)," its meaning is that He, *Exalted is He*, is seen while not being characterized by any attribute whatsoever. Thus, the vision of the seer falls upon Him on the Day of Resurrection while the Creator is neither in motion nor at rest, neither tall nor short, neither wide nor narrow, having no color among colors; neither in front of the seer nor behind him, neither to his right nor to his left, neither above him nor below him, neither near nor far, and so on. This is what they intend by their statement that He, *Exalted is He*, is seen without modality.

They only said this in order to negate from Him the attributes of originated bodies—attributes which, if affirmed, would necessitate that Allah, *Exalted is He*, be originated. Thus, they came with what the intellect cannot accept. These are the Ashʿariyyah.

Since this statement is contradictory and irrational, al-Rāzī—who is among the Ashʿariyyah—said: The meaning is that Allah, *Exalted is He*, will be known on the Day of Resurrection with necessary knowledge, such that doubt does not enter into it.

As for the rest of the adherents of this statement, when they fell into the constrictions of this position and became incapable of defending it in debate, they said: Belief in vision is obligatory, and asking about modality is an innovation. This is the final argument they advanced for their doctrine.

Ḍirār ibn ʿAmr, among the determinists, said, when stratagems failed him: Allah, *Exalted is He*, will be seen on the Day of Resurrection by a sixth sense. He only said this to escape what necessarily follows them, namely that vision does not occur except with respect to bodies, and so forth. Thus, he invented this statement to repel that consequence.

As for the Ḥashwiyyah, the corporealists, and the anthropo-

morphists, they affirmed the vision of Allah, *Exalted is He*, like the vision of visible bodies, and they did not refrain from what necessarily follows their view. They said: The ḥadīth has been authenticated: *"You will see your Lord on the Day of Resurrection as you see the moon on the night of the full moon."* And they cited His saying, *Exalted is He*: *"Faces on that Day will be radiant, looking toward their Lord."* **[al-Qiyāmah]**

The response to the verse and the ḥadīth is as follows:

As for the ḥadīth, we say:

1. It is an isolated report (āḥād) that conflicts with rational proofs. Whatever is so must be interpreted if possible and if it has a sound basis; otherwise, it must be discarded and rejected.

2. The ḥadīth is among the reports of single transmission. Even if the conditions of authenticity are fulfilled, its utmost yield is conjecture. What is required in the matter at hand is certainty. Allah, *Exalted is He*, said: *"Indeed, conjecture avails nothing against the truth."* **[Yūnus: 36]** Therefore, it is not valid to use this ḥadīth as evidence, because what is required is certainty, whereas it—if authentic—yields only conjecture.

3. The ḥadīth is narrated by Qays ibn Abī Ḥāzim from Jarīr ibn ʿAbd Allāh al-Bajalī. Qays has been criticized regarding his uprightness. It was said that he held the doctrine of the Khārijites and harbored hatred toward ʿAlī *(Peace be Upon Him)*. In addition, it has been narrated that he became confused at the end of his life; and prior to that confusion, he was aligned with the Umayyads and assisted them in their affairs.

Moreover, it is possible to interpret the ḥadīth—assuming its authenticity—in a manner that accords with the other evidences. Thus, we say: The meaning of the ḥadīth is: *"You will know your Lord ..."* and so on. This is because vision is frequently used in the Arabic language with the meaning of knowledge. Among that is His saying, *Exalted is He*: *"Have you not seen the assembly of the Children of Israel...?"* **[al-Baqarah: 246]** and: *"Have you not seen the one who disputed with Abraham concerning his Lord...?"* **[al Baqarah: 258]** and: *"Have you not seen how your Lord dealt with the companions of the elephant...?"* **[al-Fīl]** In these verses, vision is used in the sense of knowledge, and many similar examples occur in the Qur'an.

As for the verse, the response is that *looking* (*naẓar*) is used not only for visual sight but also with the meaning of waiting, as in His saying, *Exalted is He*: *"Thus she was waiting to see what the messengers would return with."* **[al-Naml: 35]** that is, waiting; and: *"Look at us so that we may acquire from your light."* **[al-Ḥadīd: 13]** that is, wait for us; and: *"And say: 'Look upon us.'"* **[al-Baqarah: 104]** that is, wait for us.

They said: When *naẓar* is transitive with *ilā* "toward", it can only mean visual sight.

We say: The matter is not so. *Naẓar* has come in the Qur'an transitive with *ilā* while not intending visual sight, as in His saying, *Exalted is He*: *"And Allah will not speak to them, nor look toward them on the Day of Resurrection, nor purify them."* **[Āl ʿImrān: 77]** The meaning here is not visual sight; rather, what is intended is mercy—i.e., He will not show them mercy.

And in His saying, *Exalted is He*: *"Do they not look toward the camels—how they were created and toward the heavennhow it was raised?"* **[al-Ghāshiyah]** What is intended is not the sight of the eyes, for it is known that the polytheists were sighted and did look with their eyes at camels, the heaven, and the earth. Rather, what is intended by *looking* here is reflection, contemplation, and taking heed. Accordingly, it is not appropriate to use the verse as evidence for the vision of Allah, *Exalted is He*, due to the many meanings borne by the word *naẓar*. The multiplicity of meanings of a word leads to confusion of the intended meaning, its ambiguity, and its obscurity. Allah, *Exalted is He*, has named that which is so *ambiguous (mutashābih)*, due to the intermingling, similarity, and divergence of its meanings.

[The Verses Indicating the Negation of Vision]

And to proceed: we have transmitted (*scriptural*) proofs indicating the negation of vision, in addition to what has preceded of rational evidence. Among them is His saying, *Exalted is He*: *"No vision can grasp Him, while He grasps all vision; and He is the All-Subtle, the All-Aware."* **[al-Anʿām: 103]** In this verse, Allah, *Exalted is He*, negates that vision can grasp Him with a general negation that is not restricted to a particular time rather than another time, nor to a particular place rather than another place, nor to a particular state rather than another state.

They say: "Idrāk (*grasping*) means overtaking or catching up; it is said: 'I grasped Zayd,' meaning I caught up with him. Thus, the meaning would not be the negation of seeing Allah, *Exalted is He*, but rather the negation of overtaking Him, *Exalted is He*."

We say: when *idrāk* is ascribed to sight, it can only mean seeing. Thus, when you say, "My sight grasped him," its meaning is, "I saw him." Upon this are the authorities of the Arabic language. Examine the linguistic dictionaries and you will find confirmation of what we have stated.

Idrāk has other meanings as well. Among them is attainment, as it is said: "The boy reached maturity (*adraka al-ghulām*)"; and among them is ripening, as it is said: "The fruit ripened (*adrakat al-thamarah*) and became fully ripe." However, when *idrāk* is coupled with sight, it signifies

nothing but seeing with the eye, as previously mentioned.

[The Response to the Claim of Specifying This Verse]

One of the Ahl al-Sunnah may say that His saying, *Exalted is He*: *"No vision can grasp Him, while He grasps all vision"* **[al-Anʿām: 103]** is general but specified by His saying, *Exalted is He*: *"Faces on that Day will be radiant, looking toward their Lord."* **[al-Qiyāmah: 22–23]** In that case, there would be no contradiction between the two verses, nor any inconsistency.

The response is from several aspects:

1. Allah, *Exalted is He*, praised Himself in the first verse by stating that visions do not grasp Him. Praise is not realized—indeed, it would not be praise at all—unless this is understood in an all-encompassing and comprehensive manner covering the times of this world and the Hereafter alike. This is because jinn and many created beings are not perceived by vision in this world, and there is no praise or commendation in that.
2. Praise is not realized, nor completed, except if seeing Allah is impossible and cannot occur. As for it being prevented merely due to an external impediment rather than intrinsic impossibility, then praise would not be valid. This is evident.
3. Specification here is neither valid nor permissible, for the following reasons:
    a. There is a long interval between the revelation of the two verses: one is in Sūrat al-Anʿām and the other is in Sūrat al-Qiyāmah, as is established in the principles of jurisprudence.
    b. His saying, *Exalted is He*: *"No vision can grasp Him"* **[al-Anʿām: 103]** is a report from Allah, *Exalted is He*, whose meaning must be believed and affirmed at the time of its revelation, without dispute. The meaning, as you see, is general. If it were specified, then believing in its apparent meaning would amount to ignorance, and Allah, *Exalted is He*, at the time of its revelation would have commanded belief in ignorance and falsehood, and commanded faith in it. Such a thing is impossible for Allah and is not befitting for a Muslim to attribute to Him, *Exalted and Glorious is He*.
    c. Many scholars of legal theory have said that specification applies only to commands and prohibitions, not to reports; and the mentioned verse is a report.

[The Response to the Claim of Abrogation of This Verse]

If it is said: "This is to be understood as abrogation,"

We say: abrogation is even more remote. That is because abrogation occurs only in rulings related to the interests of the servants, not in matters related to the attributes and names of Allah, *Exalted is He*, and what pertains thereto. The proof of what we say is that the interests of the servants differ according to changing circumstances and times; thus, rulings differ in accordance with those changes. Do you not see that Allah, *Exalted is He*, initially obligated the believers that each one of them stand firm in battle against ten disbelievers? At that time, the Muslims were very few in number and were in need of great patience, intense zeal, lofty determination, and conditioning themselves for self-sacrifice and steadfastness in the path of their religion and creed. Their condition at that time did not allow for laxity or indolence; had they not prepared themselves in that manner and conditioned themselves accordingly, the polytheists would have devoured them and exterminated them completely.

Then, when Islam became strong and its followers and supporters increased, Allah lightened this obligation for them and commanded that one stand firm against two. That was because the situation no longer required more than that.

Such is the case with all rulings related to the interests of the servants. As for rulings related to the names and attributes of Allah, *Exalted is He*, and what pertains to them, they do not change from time to time nor from one state to another. Thus, it is not permissible that His vision be impossible at one time and then valid at another, nor that His power differ from one time to another, and so on.

That is because His attributes, *Exalted is He*, are essential attributes (*zaatiyah*), and essential attributes do not change at all.

Therefore, when He, *Exalted is He*, praised Himself and extolled Himself by stating that visions do not grasp Him, we know that He is described by this attribute and uniquely characterized by it, with no partner sharing it with Him. And essential attributes do not change.

4. A linguist may say: "I looked at something and did not see it," and "I looked at the crescent and did not see it." Among this is His saying, *Exalted is He*: *"You see them looking toward you, yet they do not see."* **[al-Aʿrāf: 198]** Based on this, His saying, *Exalted is He*: *"Looking toward their Lord"* **[al-Qiyāmah: 23]** does not indicate seeing Allah, *Exalted is He*; therefore, there is no specification.
5. The word *naẓar* (looking) is a shared term with multiple meanings, among them seeing, among them waiting, and among them mercy, as has already been mentioned.

If it is said: "Here there is a contextual indicator determining the intended meaning, namely that *naẓar* is made transitive with *ilā* 'toward', and when it is made transitive with it, it can only mean seeing with the eye,"

We say: its being made transitive with *ilā* has come in the sense of waiting in His saying, *Exalted is He*: *"Then a respite until ease."* **[al-Baqarah: 280]** and it has come with *ilā* in the sense of mercy in His saying, *Exalted is He*: *"...and Allah will not look toward them on the Day of Resurrection, nor will He purify them..."* **[Āl ʿImrān: 77]** Here, *naẓar* is made transitive with *ilā*, yet it does not mean seeing.

6. All of this is in addition to the previously mentioned proofs that Allah, *Exalted is He*, is not a body. They indicate that Allah, *Exalted is He*, cannot be seen, for vision is valid only with respect to bodies, and Allah, *Exalted is He*, is not a body.

[Why Did Moses Request the Vision?]

And His saying, *Exalted is He*, in response to Moses when he said: *"He said: 'My Lord, show Yourself to me, that I may look at You.' He said: 'You shall never see Me.'"* **[al-Aʿrāf: 143]** Thus, the Exalted One negated vision in a general and absolute manner. The reason Moses requested the vision was that some of the foolish ones among the Children of Israel persistently urged Moses *(Peace be Upon Him)* to demand seeing Allah, Exalted is He, openly. Just as Allah, *Glorified is He*, has related about the Children of Israel in His saying: *"They had asked Moses for something even greater than that, for they said: 'Show us Allah openly.' So the thunderbolt seized them for their wrongdoing ..."* **[al-Nisāʾ: 153]**

Because of that demand and insistence, Moses requested the vision. By asking for the vision, he only intended to convince those who were pressing him by obtaining an answer from Allah, *Exalted is He*. He did not request it for himself. The proof of this is His saying, *Exalted is He*, relating from Moses *(Peace be Upon Him)*: *"Will You destroy us for what the foolish among us have done?"* **[al-Aʿrāf: 155]**

This verse indicates that the request for the vision was the act of the foolish ones, not his act, *blessings of Allah be upon him*.

If it is said: if that is the case, then why was he struck by the thunderbolt along with them?

And why did he repent after regaining consciousness, as Allah, *Exalted is He*, has related in His saying: *"Then when he regained consciousness, he said: 'Glory be to You! I repent to You ...'"* **[al-Aʿrāf: 143]**

We say: it has already been established from what preceded that the request for the vision was the act of the foolish ones. Moses *(Peace be*

Upon Him) was merely a messenger and an intermediary between them and Allah, *Exalted and Glorious is He*. Accordingly, Moses being struck by the thunderbolt may have been for one of two reasons:

1. Either because he requested the vision without seeking Allah's permission to make such a request.
2. Or because acting as an intermediary in such a matter is not permissible.

Thus, it would have been more appropriate for Moses *(Peace be Upon Him)* to deal with them as he had done initially when they asked him to make for them gods—by not responding to what they wanted in their request and demand to see Allah. Therefore, responding to them constituted a sin, because it carried the implication of the permissibility of vision.

[Further Elaboration on What the Verses Contain of Proofs for the Negation of Vision]

Thus, after mentioning what we have mentioned of the verses concerning Moses' request for vision, it is appropriate to present some elaboration on what these verses indicate of proofs negating vision with respect to Allah, *Exalted is He*. We therefore say:

1. *"You shall never see Me"* indicates the negation of vision in a general and comprehensive manner for all times.
2. *"So the thunderbolt seized them"* is evidence that the issue of vision is a grave sin equivalent to polytheism and disbelief. This is because Allah, *Exalted is He*, did not inflict this punishment—namely, the punishment of thunderbolts—except upon those who denied the Messengers and obstinately persisted in their disbelief, such as the people of Hūd, Ṣāliḥ, and Shuʿayb *(Peace be Upon Them)*.
3. His saying: *"for their wrongdoing"* is evidence that the issue of vision is a grave sin and a serious act of disobedience.
4. His saying, *Exalted is He*: *"Will You destroy us for what the foolish among us have done?"* **[al-Aʿrāf: 155]** is evidence that requesting the vision is among the actions of the foolish. There is no foolishness in seeking what is possible; rather, foolishness lies in seeking what is impossible. Do you not see how Abraham *(Peace be Upon Him)* asked his Lord to show him how He gives life to the dead, and so forth? That was not foolishness.
5. His saying, *Exalted is He*: *"Then when he regained consciousness, he said: 'Glory be to You…'"* **[al-Aʿrāf: 143]**. Moses' glorification *(Peace be Upon Him)* of his Lord upon regaining consciousness from the

thunderbolt indicates that Allah, *Exalted is He*, is transcendent above vision and sanctified from it.

6. His saying: *"...I repent to You..."* is taken to indicate that the question was a sin and an act of disobedience from which Moses *(Peace be Upon Him)* repented.
7. Allah, *Exalted is He*, said in response to Moses when he said: *"Will You destroy us for what the foolish among us have done?"* *"...He said: 'My punishment—I afflict with it whom I will...'"* **[al-Aʿrāf:156]**. Allah, *Exalted is He*, named what descended upon those who sought the vision as punishment. This indicates that requesting the vision is a grave sin whose perpetrator deserves severe punishment.

[Allah, *Exalted is He*, Neither Begets Nor Is Begotten]

The Jews said: Allah has begotten ʿUzayr; the Christians said: He has begotten Jesus *(Peace be Upon Him)*; the Jews and Christians said: "We are the children of Allah and His beloved"; and the polytheists said: "The angels are the daughters of Allah."

The response is that procreation is a characteristic of bodies and among their properties, and Allah, *Exalted is He*, is not a body. Hence, He, *Exalted is He*, said in refutation of the people of these false claims: *"And they say: 'The Most Merciful has taken a son.' You have indeed brought forth a monstrous thing, at which the heavens are about to rupture, the earth split asunder, and the mountains collapse in devastation, that they attribute a son to the Most Merciful. And it is not befitting for the Most Merciful to take a son. There is none in the heavens and the earth but that he comes to the Most Merciful as a servant. He has certainly encompassed them and counted them precisely."* **[Maryam: 88–94]** As you see, Allah, *Exalted is He*, responded in this verse to the people of those false statements with an angry response, such that the entire cosmos—with its heavens, earth, and mountains—was on the verge of trembling and shattering due to the enormity of that reprehensible claim uttered against the sanctity of the Most Merciful, which reduced Him from the majesty and greatness of divinity to the levels of procreating animals. *Exalted is Allah far above what they say, in lofty exaltation*.

Yes, what appears is that the statement of the Jews and Christians, "We are the children of Allah and His beloved," is not meant literally. Rather, they intended that they are close to Allah with a closeness exceeding that of other people, that Allah loves them with an exceptional love unattained by others, and that they are the elite of Allah's creation, and so on. They did not intend real sonship.

[Allah, *Exalted is He*, Is Not Subject to Annihilation]

The Muslims and the majority of the adherents of other religions, even disbelieving ones, have agreed that Allah, *Exalted is He*, has no end to His existence, and that annihilation and nonexistence are impossible for Him: *"He is the First and the Last…"* **[al-Ḥadīd: 3]**

The proof of this is that annihilation can only occur by the power of one who has power, and Allah, *Exalted is He*, is not of the category of things subject to power such that the power of a capable agent could pertain to Him. Therefore, we say that annihilation is impossible for Allah, *Exalted is He*.

The Muʿtazilah have, in this regard, a flawed philosophical approach. Some of them said, in arguing for the impossibility of annihilation for Allah: the attribute of existence is something additional to the Essence, and the Essence necessitates the attribute; thus, the Essence is the cause and the attribute of existence is its effect. Since it has been established that the Essence is existent eternally, its effect—namely, the attribute of existence—does not separate from it. Consequently, His existence in pre-eternity is necessary, and annihilation is impossible for Him due to the presence of the cause necessitating His existence eternally.

Others among them said: rather, it is because the most specific attribute necessitated for Him the four attributes, and so forth.

The response is that there is neither cause nor effect with respect to the Essence of Allah, *Exalted is He*, and His attributes, as has previously been established. To say otherwise is a statement beyond the bounds of reason. What is correct is what we stated initially: that Allah, *Exalted is He*, is not of the category of things subject to power: *"There is nothing whatsoever like unto Him."* **[al-Shūrā: 11]**

[Allah, *Exalted is He*, Has No Deity Other Than Him]

Allah, *Exalted is He*, has no deity other than Him: *"There is nothing whatsoever like unto Him."* **[al-Shūrā:11]** *"And there is none comparable to Him."* **[al-Ikhlāṣ:4]** He is the One, the Unique, singularly characterized by attributes of perfection. To Him belong the Most Beautiful Names. In this matter, various groups of polytheists have differed from the truth, such as the idol-worshippers, the Magians, the Christians, and the dualists.

As for the idol-worshippers, their deviation is manifest, for they made idols into deities alongside Allah and worshipped them, saying: *"We do not worship them except that they may bring us nearer to Allah in nearness."* **[al-Zumar: 3]**

As for the Magians, they professed the existence of two gods: a god of good and a god of evil. They named the god of good Yazdān, and said that

all goodness, righteousness, and benefits come from him. They named the god of evil Ahriman, and said that all harms, evils, killing, and corruption come from him.

As for the Christians, it is well known that they say that Allah is one in essence, by which they mean that He subsists by Himself and is not in need of anything else. By essence, they do not mean that He is spatially confined.

Then they say that He is three in hypostases. According to them, the hypostases are three: the hypostasis of the Father, which is the Essence of the Creator; the hypostasis of the Son, which is the Word; and the hypostasis of the Holy Spirit, which is life.

The term *hypostasis* is a Syriac word, which according to them means "a thing singular in number."

Moreover, what the Qur'an indicates is their explicit declaration that Allah, the Messiah, and Mary are three deities. Allah, *Exalted is He*, said: *"Did you say to the people: 'Take me and my mother as two gods besides Allah?'"* **[al-Mā'idah: 116]** It is also widely known among them that they say that there are two natures in the Messiah: a divine nature and a human nature—the first from the father, and the second from the mother.

As for the dualists, they said that light and darkness are eternal, and that the world came into existence as a result of their intermixture.

[The Invalidity of the Divinity of Other Than Allah]

The response is as follows: as for idols, they are carved stones that neither cause harm nor bring benefit before being carved. From where, then, did they acquire divinity after carving, given that through carving they did not depart from their original attribute, which is inanimacy?

The invalidity of their divinity is known by necessity, were it not for the dominance of superstitious illusions that prevailed over pre-Islamic societies due to familiarity, habit, and the passage of long periods of time.

As for the divinity of cattle, trees, the sun, the moon, light, darkness, and what resembles them among the claimed deities—such as Jesus and Mary *(Peace be Upon Them)*—we say: all of that is, by necessity, originated. And the created is not comparable to its Creator, for the created is owned by its Creator, and the owned does not share ownership with the Owner; rather, it and all that is under its control are part of the possession of its Owner.

[Reflecting on Created Beings Leads to the Negation of the Divinity of Other Than Allah, *Exalted is He*]

And to proceed: the visible created beings indicate a Wise Creator who

has no second. This is because all of them are directed toward a single purpose, such that this purpose is not fully realized except through the existence of all created beings. That purpose is the continuation of human life and their propagation. Thus, the earth is prepared and made ready for dwelling and settlement: some of it is mountains, and some of it is level land—all of that for benefits that return to humankind. Mountains are landmarks by which places and regions are known; were the earth entirely devoid of mountains, many people would be lost and would wander in its vastness. In addition, mountains have other benefits that return to humankind, among them: obtaining stones for building homes; being sources of rivers flowing upon the earth; containing shelters from rain for travelers, Bedouins, and others; and providing fortification for people against enemies—along with many other benefits that return to humankind.

The winds drive the clouds to various regions of the earth, where the clouds pour down their water, bringing forth thereby the plants of the earth from which humans and animals feed. From the earth, various minerals are extracted, from which humans derive benefit.

The sun rises and daytime comes, then it sets and nighttime comes, during which the nerves find calm. In this are benefits for humankind beyond enumeration. Among them: plants do not thrive except by the shining of the sun upon them; otherwise, they rot and perish. Among them also: the sun is the cause by which clouds are formed by the will and wisdom of Allah, *Exalted is He*, for clouds arise from seas and oceans due to the heat of the sun. Then Allah sends the winds to drive them wherever He wills. This is in addition to the warmth people gain from the sun's heat, and the light by which they go forth to seek their livelihoods. By the stations of the sun, people calculate the times of their affairs and know thereby the number of years and reckoning—along with many other great benefits.

The moon has great benefits for humankind in general. Among them, as modern science states, is that were it not for the moon's gravity, the waters of the oceans and seas would overflow the surface of the earth, and human life upon it would come to an end. Among them also is that by the moon months and years are known, as well as the times of acts of worship and others; by its phases appointments are determined and dates are recorded, in addition to the benefits of its light.

In the seas are benefits that return to humankind, among them: the flesh of fish upon which people feed; the extraction of pearls and coral; and sailing upon ships across the seas. In this age, petroleum and other minerals are also extracted from the seas.

In animals are great benefits: among them riding upon their backs; among them plowing and carrying loads upon them; among them benefiting from their milk; among them benefiting from their meat; among them benefiting from their wool; and so forth.

There are also types of animals that are harmful to humans, such as lions and tigers. Allah has cast fear into them, which causes them to keep away from humans and flee from them, and in this there is great benefit for humankind. For if wild beasts were to dominate people, they would make life miserable for them and render their living distressing, and so forth.

In the stars there are benefits for the servants: among them guidance by them in the darkness of land and sea; among them adornment and beauty. This is in addition to religious benefits, among them: looking at and reflecting upon their creation, which leads to faith in Allah; and among them: pelting with their shooting stars those devils who seek to eavesdrop.

Light has benefits, and night has benefits, and so forth.

In everything that Allah, *Exalted is He*, has created there are benefits. Birds have benefits, and every species among types of insects has benefits, and so forth.

Among examples of that is what we observe when an animal dies: types of birds quickly fly to it, and types of beasts rush to it to eat it. Were it not for that, putrefactions would occur, resulting in many diseases harmful to life. All of these benefits return to a single purpose and a single goal: the continuation of human life and its preservation.

This interconnection among created beings in purpose and goal—returning to the welfare of humankind—indicates to us that their Creator and the Creator of humankind are one. For if the Creator of the sun were other than the Creator of humankind, then the Creator of the sun would take away his sun, and the Creator of humankind would prevent benefiting from that sun. The same would apply to all that we have mentioned. Conflict and dispute would arise between the creators, and each god would take away what he created. Since none of that has occurred—despite the interconnection among created beings that we have mentioned—we know that the Creator of all is one Creator, with no partner in His dominion: one Knower, one Wise, who has perfected all that He created and prepared it for one purpose and one wisdom.

[There Is No Pre-Eternal Being Other Than Allah]

There is no pre-eternal (qadīm) being other than Allah, *Exalted is He*, contrary to those who say that the Speech of Allah, *Exalted is He*, is pre-

eternal—namely, the Ashʿarīs and the Ḥashwiyyah—and contrary to those who affirm pre-eternal meanings, namely, the Ashʿarīs and the Karrāmiyyah, who said that the attributes of Allah, *Exalted is He*, are pre-eternal meanings subsisting in His Essence.

We say: this necessitates the multiplicity of pre-eternals and that they possess, alongside Allah, *Exalted is He*, divinity.

It also necessitates that Allah, *Glorified and Exalted is He*, be composed and compounded; composition and compounding are among the properties of bodies, and Allah, *Exalted is He*, is not a body. Discussion of the Speech of Allah, *Exalted is He*, will come later.

[What Allah Has Obligated His Servants to Know About Him]

Allah, *Glorified and Exalted is He*, has not obligated His morally responsible servants to know about Him beyond what has already been mentioned: that He is a Lord, an Owner of the heavens and the earth and whatever is in them; First and Last; Powerful; Knowing; Living; Hearing; Seeing; that He brought the world into existence from non-existence; that He is Self-Sufficient; that vision does not grasp Him; that nothing is like Him. This is what the author of *al-Asās* and its commentator mentioned in this place. It is appropriate to add to that the explicit mention that Allah, Majestic and *Exalted is He*, is Most Merciful, Most Compassionate, even though what preceded already implied this insofar as the manifestations of mercy are evident in all created beings. Nevertheless, these two Names should be explicitly stated, and due to their rank in the religion, Allah, *Exalted is He*, repeated them at the beginning of every sūrah.

We have said that the morally responsible person is obligated to know of Allah, *Exalted is He*, only what has preceded, because there is no path to knowing Allah except through His signs spread throughout the horizons, and they indicate no more than what we have mentioned. There is no way to know anything beyond that, for Allah, *Exalted is He*, is not a body, as has preceded, and the intellect conceives only bodies and their attributes, which are accidents.

The scope of the intellect with respect to knowledge is twofold only:

First, assent (taṣdīq); and second, conception (taṣawwur). It has been established that Allah, *Exalted is He*, is neither a body nor an accident, and the intellect conceives only what is such. Hence, conceiving the Creator, *Exalted is He*, is not permissible. For this reason, the Commander of the Faithful, Imam ʿAlī *(Peace be Upon Him)*, said: "Tawḥīd is that you do not imagine Him," meaning: you do not conceive Him. Thus, nothing remains within the scope of the intellect except assent to what has preceded, and Allah does not burden any soul beyond its capacity.

Moreover, know that it is prohibited to contemplate the Essence of Allah, *Exalted is He*, for there is absolutely no path for the intellect to reach knowledge of the Essence of Allah, *Exalted is He*. Consequently, such contemplation yields nothing but doubt and imagined conceptions. Allah, *Exalted is He*, has cut off the ambitions of speculative thoughts and severed the root of the imaginers, saying: *"And they do not encompass Him in knowledge."* **[Ṭā Hā:110]** It is narrated from the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* that he said: *"Reflect upon creation, and do not reflect upon the Creator, for you will never be able to encompass His true measure."*[1]

And from ʿAlī *(Peace be Upon Him)*: "Whoever reflects upon the creation affirms divine unity; and whoever reflects upon Allah limits Him."

[The Name and the Attribute]

Theologians discuss the name and the attribute among the issues of theology due to their relation to it—namely, with respect to the Names and Attributes of Allah, *Exalted is He*.

[The Name]

The term *name* is used in language with one meaning, and among grammarians with another meaning. As for language, they use it for a word that indicates a meaning; thus, *Zayd* is a name, and *ḍaraba* (hot) is a name, and so on.

As for the technical usage of grammarians, they apply *name* to a word that indicates a meaning in itself without being associated with time; thus, *Zayd* is a name, and likewise *rajul* (man), and so on.

Accordingly, *Zayd*, *rajul*, and the like are names in both usages—linguistic and technical. Each indicates a meaning; this meaning is the referent (madlūl), and the name is the indicator (dāl) of it. From here, the invalidity of the statement of those who say that "the name is the named" becomes clear, for they made the indicator and the referent one and the same. The adherents of this view are the Karrāmiyyah among the determinists, and some later Ḥanafīs; this has been reported of them in *al-Asās*.

If the matter were as they claim, then the situation would be as the poet said:

If one who uttered "fire" were burned by it,

1- *Jāmiʿ al-Aḥādīth* (11/325), no. (10899), with similar wordings under nos. (10898, 10900). It was attributed to al-Ṭabarānī, Ibn ʿAdī, Ibn Mardawayh, al-Bayhaqī, al-Aṣbahānī, and others.

he would never pronounce the created name "fire."

And whoever uttered "honey" would taste its sweetness, and whoever uttered "aloes" would taste its bitterness, and so on.

It has been said regarding what drove them to this view that they held the Names of Allah, *Exalted is He*, to be pre-eternal; this necessitated for them the multiplicity of pre-eternals alongside Allah, *Exalted is He*, so they fled to inventing this statement.

It is also possible that what drove them was a confusion between the name and the named: they interpreted the named as the meaning imprinted in the mind, and the name as inner speech, so the two meanings became confused for them.

Thus do false doctrines act upon their adherents, carrying them beyond the bounds of the rational. For the one who examines such doctrines, it suffices—regarding their invalidity—to merely recount them, due to what they contain of contradiction to necessity. How could it be confusing to a rational person between the name *Zayd*, composed of three letters, and its referent, composed of flesh, blood, and soul, and so on

[The Attribute]

The term *attribute* is applied to five meanings—some linguistic, some grammatical, and some theological:

1. A name that entails praise and exaltation for that to which it relates, such as the Names of Allah, *Exalted is He*.
2. The term *attribute* is applied to a sentence that entails a meaning in the described subject; our saying "Zayd is generous" is called a description and an attribute, and likewise "Zayd is brave," and the like.

   The application of these two meanings is linguistic.
3. The subsistence of an entity upon something, such as the subsistence of life upon an animal, for it is an attribute of the animal.
4. That which is an expression of something that is the Essence itself, such as the power of Allah, *Exalted is He*, and His knowledge, and so on—for they are His Essence, *Majestic and Exalted is He*.

   These two meanings are theological.
5. Names assigned to an essence in consideration of a meaning, such as the active participle, the passive participle, and the intensive adjective; this meaning is grammatical.

It is narrated from Imam al-Mahdī *(Peace be Upon Him)* that the attribute is nothing other than the description, as in the second of the five meanings mentioned.

According to this view, it would follow that the attributes of Allah, *Exalted is He*, are nothing but the utterance of the describer—meaning that He would have no attribute other than the mere utterance of the describer—and this is clearly invalid.

It would also follow that the listener understands nothing from the speaker's statement, "Allah, *Exalted is He*, is Knowing and Powerful," except the mere utterance, without understanding any further meaning.

Yes, it can be said that the dispute concerning the meaning of *attribute* returns to a linguistic matter. If it is established that *attribute* in the language is not said except of the utterance of the describer, as stated by al-Mahdī *(Peace be Upon Him)*, then that is valid—and it does not entail what we mentioned, namely, that the listener understands nothing beyond the mere utterance, or that Allah, *Exalted is He*, has no attribute other than the utterance of the describer.

[Literal Meaning and Figurative Expression]

The theologians mention literal meaning (*ḥaqīqah*) and figurative expression (*majāz*) in books of theology in order to clarify what may be applied to Allah, *Exalted is He*, of Names and Attributes by way of literal usage or figurative usage, and what may not be applied. Therefore, we say:

The Name Is Divided into Literal and Figurative

[Literal Meaning and Its Categories]

Literal meaning (*ḥaqīqah*) is a word used in the meaning for which it was originally assigned in the convention by which communication occurs.

Literal meaning is divided into categories:

1. **Linguistic literal meaning**: such as *lion* for the predatory animal, *mountain*, *sun*, *moon*, and similar names that have remained upon the meanings for which the Arabs originally assigned them when they established the language.
2. **General customary literal meaning**: such as *bottle* for a vessel made of glass, and *beast* for a four-legged animal, and similar words which the Arabs transferred from their original meanings to other meanings. In what we mentioned, *bottle* was originally a name for everything in which something settles, then the Arabs transferred it to a vessel made of glass. Likewise, *beast* was a

name for everything that moves upon the earth, then the Arabs came to customarily restrict it to four-legged animals only.

3. **Specific customary literal meaning**: such as *speech*, *nominative case*, *literal meaning*, and *figurative expression*. Thus, *speech* is literal among the scholars of the principles of religion within the science of theology; *nominative case* is literal among grammarians for the known grammatical marker; *literal meaning* is a true technical term among rhetoricians for a word used in what it was assigned for; and *figurative expression* is a true technical term among them for a word used in other than what it was assigned for. All of this came after *speech* had originally referred to a compound utterance, *raising* to lifting something from below to above, *literal meaning* to a banner, and *figurative expression* to a path.
4. **Legal (sharʿī) literal meaning**: such as *prayer*, *fasting*, *almsgiving*, *divorce*, and the like—terms which the Law transferred from their linguistic meanings to other meanings and used them therein. Thus, *prayer* originally meant supplication, then the Law transferred it to the specific act of worship.
5. **Religious (dīnī) literal meaning**: such as *faith*, *believer*, *disbeliever*, *transgressor*, and the like—terms which the Lawgiver transferred from their linguistic meanings to meanings belonging to the foundations of religion.

[The Dispute Concerning the Occurrence of Legal and Religious Literal Meaning]

Some people have opposed the occurrence of legal literal meaning and religious literal meaning.

The response to them is to say: the term *prayer* was originally for supplication, then the Law transferred this term to a new meaning, namely the specific act of worship. Thus, when *prayer* is mentioned, nothing is understood from it except the act of worship, not supplication—and this is what we mean by legal literal meaning. Likewise, the term *almsgiving* (*zakāh*) is understood only as the specified wealth.

The term *faith* in the language signifies affirmation; then, in the Law, it came to signify another meaning: utterance by the tongue, belief of the heart, and action by the limbs. This is indicated by His saying, *Exalted is He*: *"Indeed, the believers are only those who, when Allah is mentioned, their hearts tremble; and when His verses are recited to them, it increases them in faith, and upon their Lord they rely; those who establish the prayer and from what We have provided them they spend."* **[al-Anfāl]**

They say: Allah, *Exalted is He*, said: *"And whoever believes in Allah and does righteous deeds ..."* **[al-Taghābun: 9]** He conjoined righteous deeds to faith with the conjunction *and*, from which it is taken that righteous deeds are other than faith, since conjunction entails distinction.

We say: *faith* here is used in its linguistic meaning, and there is no impediment to using a word, after its transfer, in its original meaning if an indicator points to that.

[Figurative Expression and the Response to Those Who Deny Its Occurrence]

Figurative expression (*majāz*) is a word used in other than what it was assigned for in the convention of communication, due to a contextual indicator—such as *lion* when applied to a brave man; it is then called figurative. Likewise, *prayer* when the people of the Law apply it to supplication is figurative, because it is used in other than what it was assigned for according to them.

If you have understood this, then know that some people have denied figurative expression and said: no figurative expression occurs in the Qur'an nor elsewhere; and others have denied its occurrence in the Qur'an and the Sunnah.

We respond by saying:

The poetry of the Arabs is replete with figurative expressions. Among them is the saying of al-Hudhalī:

"When death sinks in its claws, you find every amulet of no avail."

Death is death, and it has no claws to sink.

In the Noble Qur'an there are many figurative expressions, among them His saying, *Exalted is He*: *"And lower for them the wing of humility out of mercy."* **[al-Isrāʾ: 24]**

And His saying, *Exalted is He*: *"Falsehood does not come to it from before it nor from behind it."* **[Fuṣṣilat: 42]** Thus, He affirmed for the Qur'an two "hands," though it has no hands. And He, *Exalted is He*, said: *"So We made it an exemplary punishment for what was before it and what came after it."* **[al-Baqarah: 66]** Thus, He affirmed for the destroyed town two "hands."

And He, *Exalted is He*, said: *"He sends the winds as glad tidings before His mercy."* **[al-Aʿrāf: 57]** So He named the rain *mercy* and affirmed for it two "hands." And He, *Exalted is He*, said: *"So when Our signs came to them, clear-seeing ..."* **[al-Naml: 13]** Thus, He affirmed sight and coming for the signs—and this is figurative.

And His saying, *Exalted is He*, regarding the Qur'an: *"And indeed it is, in*

the Mother of the Book with Us, exalted and wise." **[al-Zukhruf: 4]** He said *in the Mother of the Book*, though the Book has no mother in reality, and He affirmed exaltedness for the Qur'an, whereas in reality it is preserved in chests, recited upon tongues, and written in codices.

And He, *Exalted is He*, said: *"And the star and the tree prostrate."* **[al-Raḥmān: 6]** True prostration is placing the forehead upon the ground, and this does not occur with trees.

If you have understood this, then know that it is not permissible to apply to Allah, *Exalted is He*, any figurative expression that entails likening Allah—such as figurative usage whose relation is resemblance, generality, particularity, part-ness, whole-ness, temporality, or locality—because such relations pertain only to bodies, and Allah, *Exalted is He*, is not a body.

Interpretation of the Verses That May Give the Impression of Anthropomorphism

There are verses in the Qur'an that may give the impression of anthropomorphism. Among them is His saying, *Exalted is He*: *"Everything is perishing except His Face"* **[al-Qaṣaṣ: 88].** It might be imagined that *face* here is a figurative expression whose relation is partiality—whereby the part (the face) is mentioned while the whole is intended. This is not the case, because Allah, *Exalted is He*, is not a body, and therefore cannot be described as having a whole or parts. *Exalted is He* above that, as He says: *"There is nothing like unto Him"* **[al-Shūrā: 11].**

Rather, the sound interpretation of the verse is to say that the figurative usage mentioned therein is of the type whose relation is *addition*, as in His saying, *Exalted is He*: *"There is nothing like unto Him"* **[al-Shūrā: 11].** This is what they have stated.

They also said that there is no remoteness in considering it among those figurative expressions whose relation is partiality, since the "part" in such figurative usage is not intended, and therefore does not entail anthropomorphism. However, it is affirmed only where it occurs in the Qur'an, and it is not permissible for us to invent similar figurative usages.

Among such verses is His saying, *Exalted is He*: *"Rather, His two hands are outspread"* **[al-Mā'idah: 64]**; His saying: *"It runs under Our eyes"* **[al-Qamar: 14]**; His saying: *"What prevented you from prostrating to what I created with My two hands?"* **[Ṣād: 75];** and His saying, *Exalted is He*: *"You know what is within myself, and I do not know what is within Yourself"* **[al-Mā'idah: 116],** and the like.

We say: the Qur'an was revealed in the language of the Arabs, as He, *Exalted is He*, said: *"In a clear Arabic tongue"* **[al-Shuʿarā': 195].** The Arabs,

in their language, employ literal meanings, figurative expressions in their various forms, and metonymy, and they expanded in this to such an extent that Ibn Jinnī said: figurative usage is predominant in the language. The poetry and speech of the Arabs are replete with it, and rhetoricians have unanimously agreed that figurative expression and metonymy are more eloquent than literal meaning and explicit expression.

Upon this language the Qur'an was revealed. There is therefore no impediment to the occurrence of figurative expressions whose relations are as mentioned. However, such expressions are affirmed only where they occur, and it is not permissible for the legally responsible person to employ similar figurative usages in reference to Allah, for the reasons previously stated.

Thus, His saying, *Exalted is He*: *"Everything is perishing except His Face"* **[al-Qaṣaṣ: 88],** means—according to all—"except Him." It is not valid for anyone to infer from this verse that Allah, *Exalted is He*, possesses a *face* in the sense that the relation in this figurative usage is partiality, which would entail that Allah consists of parts, and this would necessitate likening Allah to created bodies. *Exalted is Allah above that*.

Rather, we say: the *face* in His saying, *Exalted is He*, *"except His Face"* is neither intended nor meant in itself. Consequently, it is not valid to use it as evidence for anthropomorphism, whether the relation be addition or partiality. The same applies to all figurative expressions. Thus, when you apply the word *lion* to a brave man, no one understands from that that the man has claws, hair like the lion's mane, or fangs like its fangs, and so on.

If it is said: if the relation is partiality, then anthropomorphism necessarily follows from it.

We reply: the relation merely validates the usage and is not intended in itself; its case is the same as that of figurative expression. There is no impediment to interpreting the relation, for we have already interpreted the figurative usage.

His saying, *Exalted is He*: *"Rather, His two hands are outspread"* **[al-Mā'idah: 64]** is a metonymy for the vastness of giving and generosity; the outspreading of hands is not intended.

His saying, *Exalted is He*: *"It runs under Our eyes"* **[al-Qamar: 14]** is a metonymy for Allah's preservation and protection. The *eye* is neither intended nor meant; rather, it is a word that conveys the intended meaning, which is preservation and protection, and nothing else.

His saying, *Exalted is He*: *"What prevented you from prostrating to what*

I created with My two hands?" **[Ṣād: 75]** is a metonymy indicating the honoring of Adam and his special status with Allah. Metonymy is one of the branches of rhetoric.

It is not valid to infer affirmation or negation from a metonymic expression, because the wording therein is not intended; rather, what is intended is another meaning that accompanies that wording. This is the nature of metonymy. Added to this is the impossibility of the literal meaning of the wording.

His saying, *Exalted is He*: *"You know what is within myself, and I do not know what is within Yourself"* **[al-Mā'idah:116]** belongs to a type of figurative expression called *mushākalah* (formal correspondence). The meaning is: You know my unseen, and I do not know Your unseen.

His saying, *Exalted is He*: *"Oh, my regret over what I neglected in regard to Allah"* **[al-Zumar: 56].** The *side of Allah* (*janb Allāh*) is a figurative expression by which obedience to Allah is intended, since negligence on the part of the legally responsible person can only occur with respect to obedience to Allah. *Janb* means direction or side; it is said: *akhṣaba janābu al-qawm*, meaning: their region became fertile.

Al-Akhfash recited:

The people are a side, and the ruler is a side,

that is, the people are one party and the ruler is another.

Thus, the figurative usage here is naming the state by the name of the locus, and this relation does not entail anthropomorphism, because what is intended by *janb* is obedience.

The All-Merciful, the Ever-Merciful

Al-Raḥmān (the All-Merciful) and *al-Raḥīm* (the Ever-Merciful) are two Names of Allah, *Exalted is He*, that are literal in the sense of religious literal meaning. The proof of this is that they are applied to Allah, *Exalted is He*, without any contextual indicator, and indeed they are not applied except to Him, *Mighty and Majestic*—this being a sign of literal meaning.

It is not far-fetched to say that they are figurative expressions whose relation is resemblance: Allah, *Exalted is He*, likened His acts to those of created beings in terms of bestowing blessings upon them in this world and the Hereafter, granting them respite, covering them in this world, accepting repentance, and the like—acts resembling those of one characterized by tenderness and compassion. Likeness of His act to the act of created beings does not necessitate likening Allah Himself to His creation.

The mercy of Allah is figurative, and the relation is resemblance

between His act and the act of one characterized by tenderness and compassion among His creation. This does not entail anthropomorphism, as we have mentioned.

Of this type are His sayings, *Exalted is He*: *"He deceives them"*, *"the best of plotters"*, *"We shall draw them on little by little"*, and the like. This does not entail anthropomorphism, since He likened His act toward the hypocrites to the acts of His creation.

His saying, *Exalted is He*: *"We shall attend to you, O two weighty beings"* **[al-Raḥmān: 31]** is a metonymy indicating the severity of the threat.

In conclusion, all that we have mentioned of figurative expression and metonymy may not be applied to Allah, *Exalted is He*, except on the basis of transmitted revelation.

[What May and May Not Be Attributed to Allah, *Exalted is He*, from Names]

It is not permissible to name Allah, *Exalted is He*, with any of the names except that which entails praise of Allah, *Exalted is He*, and extolling Him, as He, *Exalted is He*, said: *"And to Allah belong the Most Beautiful Names, so call upon Him by them"* **[al-Aʿrāf: 180]**. And the true names that entail praise of Allah, *Exalted is He*, and extolling Him do not require an auditory authorization[1].

A group said: rather, authorization is necessary, and these are the ones who say: indeed, the names of Allah, *Exalted is He*, are tawqīfiyyah (restricted to textual evidence).

I say: Allah, *Exalted is He*, has named Himself in His Book and upon the tongue of His Messenger, *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*, with the Most Beautiful Names, and He praised Himself by them, and it is not within the capacity of the morally responsible person to praise Allah, *Exalted is He*, with more than what He praised Himself with. And in the supplication of the Prophet, *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*: *"I do not enumerate praise upon You; You are as You have praised Yourself".*

And the term "***thing***": it is not from His names, *Exalted is He*, so it is not permissible to apply it to Allah, *Exalted is He*, except if it occurs as a circumlocution referring to Him, *Glorified and Exalted*, and it is not a circumlocution except with an adjunct that joins to it, and then it is valid that we say: *(a thing, not like things).*

And the term "thing" may be a circumlocution without an adjunct, and

1- Evidence from the Quran or the Sunnah.

that is in the like of the context of inference, inquiry, and generalization.

As for inference, then like it being said: there must be, for the origination of the originated, a thing from which origination issued.

As for inquiry, then like: *"Say: Which thing is greatest in testimony? Say: Allah is Witness between me and you"* **[al-Anʿām: 19].**

And as for generalization, then like: *"And Allah is Knowing of every thing", "and every thing will perish except His Face"* **[al-Qaṣaṣ: 88].**

And as for other than what we mentioned, it is not permissible to apply it to Allah, *Exalted is He*, since there is no praise in it of Allah nor extolling, and its application to Allah, *Exalted is He*, does not yield any benefit.

[al-Jalālah]

Al-Jalālah (Allah) is a name of Allah, *Exalted is He*, that conveys praise and extolling of Him, *Exalted is He*. And the meaning of al-Jalālah is that which gathers the attributes of divinity by which He deserves worship. Thus, from its application are understood all the attributes of greatness, majesty, magnificence, and perfection. And al-Jalālah is not a proper noun, as the grammarians say, because proper nouns do not convey a meaning other than designating the named entity. Also, the proper noun is that which is placed to distinguish an entity from its genus, and Allah, *Exalted is He*, has no genus so that some of Him would be distinguished from some. And the term al-Jalālah conveys the meanings of greatness, majesty, magnificence, and perfection.

[One (Wāḥid) and One (Aḥad)]

And Wāḥid and Aḥad are two names of Him, *Glorified and Exalted*, that entail praise, since they mean the One who is singular with the attributes of divinity and majesty in which none shares with Him.

And this meaning which we mentioned for these two names is what is intended when they are applied to the Creator, *Glorified is He*.

And for these two names there are other meanings that are not permissible regarding Allah, *Exalted is He*, and among these meanings are: numerical one; and that which does not accept division and partition; and that which is exclusive in attributes in which participation is little, as it is said: so-and-so is the unique one of his era. So these meanings are not permissible to be applied to Allah, *Exalted is He*.

[The Difference Between Attributes of Essence and Attributes of Action]

Attributes of essence are those which He, *Glorified and Exalted*, deserves eternally, such as: Powerful, Knowing, Living, First, Hearing,

Seeing.

And attributes of action are those which He, *Exalted is He*, deserves by consideration of an action that He performs, and He is not described by them except after the existence of the action, such as: Creator, Provider, Giver of life, Giver of death.

[Owner, Lord, Forbearing, Forgiving]

There is disagreement regarding these attributes: to which of the two categories do they belong?

And what appears to me is that they are from the attributes of action. That is because the term Owner is established for Allah, *Mighty and Majestic*, by consideration of an action, which is His bringing the owned into existence and His owning it.

Likewise Lord, for it is established for Him, *Exalted is He*, by consideration of an action, which is His bringing the lorded into existence and His owning it.

And Forbearing is an attribute of Allah, *Exalted is He*, by consideration of an action, which is His granting respite to the disobedient, along with the bestowal of blessings.

Likewise Forgiving, for it is by consideration of an action, which is the acceptance of repentance.

And it has been said: Owner and Lord are attributes of essence, either because they are in the meaning of Powerful, as Imam al-Mahdī *(Peace be Upon Him)* says, or because they are in the meaning that the owned belongs to Him, *Glorified and Exalted*, without consideration of an action. And this meaning is established for Allah, *Mighty and Majestic*, before He created the owned and the lorded. And this is built upon the view that it is valid to apply the derivative truly to its subject before the action occurs. And the author of al-Asās chose this view.

And it was said regarding Forbearing and Forgiving: indeed, they are not from the attributes of action, but from the attributes of negation, meaning that He, *Exalted is He*, is one who leaves off punishing the disobedient.

We say: if Owner and Lord were in the meaning of Powerful, then they would be attributes of essence, but they do not indicate the meaning of Powerful. And if they do indicate it, then they indicate it only by implication, not by correspondence. And indication by implication is not sufficient for the validity of that. Otherwise, it would be valid for us to say: Knowing is in the meaning of Powerful, in that Knowing indicates, by correspondence, the doer of the perfected act, and indicates Powerful by implication. And this is not said by anyone among the theologians.

And the argument of the author of al-Asās is not beneficial. Otherwise, it would necessitate that Creator and Provider be attributes of essence, and the like of that from the attributes of action. And there is no one who says that. That is because he, *(Peace be Upon Him)*, built his argument on the view that it is valid to derive the attribute from a future action, and that its application is literal, not metaphorical.

[The Active Participle]

The active participle, such as "standing" and "striking," is applied to the one from whom the standing and striking occurred in the past, and to the one from whom it occurs at the time of speech, and to the one from whom it will occur in the future.

And there has been agreement that it is applied truly to the one from whom it occurs in the present. And there has been disagreement regarding its application to the past and the future: is it literal or metaphorical? And what appears is that the active participle is applied literally in the past and the present, but not the future. So it is said: so-and-so is a striker and a killer for one from whom striking and killing occurred in the past, or for one from whom that occurs in the present, but not for one from whom it will occur in the future. And the evidence for that is the understanding of those two when the attribute is applied, unlike the future, for it does not come to mind at all unless the description is accompanied by an indicator.

If you know that, then it is valid for us to say: indeed, Allah, *Exalted is He*, is the Creator of what will be, and that is metaphorical, and it does not require an auditory authorization. This is due to the occurrence of agreement, as narrated by al-Najrī, that it is permissible to describe Allah, *Exalted is He*, by what He will certainly do without an auditory authorization, even if it is metaphorical, such as: the Rewarder of the prophets, and the Punisher of the wretched.

[Those Names Which Are Exclusive to Allah, *Exalted is He*]

Allah, *Exalted is He*, is distinguished among the names by ***[al-Jalālah]***, so it is not applied except to Him, *Glorified is He*. And He is distinguished by ***[al-Raḥmān]***, so it is not applied except to Him, *Exalted is He*, whether it is annexed or not. And by ***[al-Raḥīm]*** when it is not annexed; however, if it is annexed, it is permissible to apply it to other than Him, such as: so-and-so is merciful of heart, and merciful to his kin, and Zayd is merciful. For it is then in the ruling of the restricted; because reporting it of Zayd restricts it, and by that it departs from indicating the universality of mercy that encompasses everything.

And [Rabb] (Lord) is like Raḥīm in what we have mentioned, equally so.

And the proof of what we mentioned regarding Raḥīm and Rabb is that when they are applied absolutely, the listener does not carry them upon other than Allah, *Exalted is He*.

And Allah, *Exalted is He*, is distinguished by [Dhū al-Jalāl] (the Possessor of Majesty), and [Dhū al-Kibriyāʾ] (the Possessor of Grandeur), and [Badīʿ al-Samāwāt wa al-Arḍ] (the Originator of the heavens and the earth), and [Quddūs], and [Muhaymin], and [ʿĀlim al-Ghayb] (the Knower of the unseen), and [Muḥyī al-Mawtā] (the Giver of life to the dead), and the like of that which includes the utmost degree of glorification that none other than Him deserves, *Glorified is He*.

And He, *Exalted is He*, is distinguished by [Thābit fī al-Azal] (Established in pre-eternity), contrary to those who affirm the essences of things in pre-eternity, namely the Muʿtazilah, who said: indeed, the essences of things are established in pre-eternity though non-existent. So they differentiated between establishment and existence, and the response to them has already been mentioned.

And He, *Exalted is He*, is not distinguished by [Qadīm] (ancient), contrary to Abū ʿAlī al-Jubbāʾī. And the proof of what we have said is His, *Exalted is He*, saying: *"And the moon—We have determined for it phases until it returns like the old date stalk"* **[Yā Sīn: 39]**.

And it has been established among the Ummah, without objection, expressions such as: an old drawing, and an old building. So, if it were exclusive to Allah, *Exalted is He*, the scholars would have objected to that.

[The Book of Justice]

[Definition of Justice]

Justice here means: knowledge of declaring Allah, *Exalted is He*, free from committing what is reprehensible, and that all of His actions are good. So whoever believes that is among the people of justice, and from here the ʿAdliyyah were named ʿAdliyyah. Thus our saying that Allah is Just means: that He, *Exalted is He*, is free from committing what is reprehensible, and that all of His actions are good.

And the meaning of justice with regard to the created being is: one who does not commit what is reprehensible, does not fall short of what is obligatory, and whose actions are all good.

And the Trustee ʿAlī ibn Abī Ṭālib *(Peace be Upon Him)* said regarding the meaning of justice with respect to Allah, *Exalted is He*: *(Justice is that you do not accuse Him)*—that is, you do not accuse Him in His action of being reprehensible.

Yes, the determinists (*al-Mujabbirah*) agree with us in principle, so they say: indeed, Allah, *Exalted is He*, is free from committing what is reprehensible, and that all of His actions are good. However, they undermined this principle and did not adhere to its implications. So they said: there is no injustice, falsehood, sin, aggression, or disobedience in the universe except that Allah, *Exalted is He*, is the One who created it, brought it into existence, willed it, desired it, decreed it, and determined it. Thus, the declaring of the determinists that Allah is free from committing what is reprehensible is a flawed declaration, unsatisfactory and unacceptable. That is because they did not declare Allah, *Exalted is He*, free except by a mere utterance of the tongue devoid of any meaning. So their declaring Allah free in that manner is, in reality, mockery. And the like of that is the faith of the hypocrites mentioned in His saying, *Exalted is He*: *"When the hypocrites come to you, they say: 'We bear witness that you are indeed the Messenger of Allah.' And Allah knows that you are indeed His Messenger, and Allah bears witness that the hypocrites are surely liars."* **[al-Munāfiqūn: 1]**.

So Allah, *Exalted is He*, judged them to be liars because their belief contradicted their tongues.

[A Section on the Reality of the Good and the Reprehensible]

The good: that for which there is no punishment, whether it be obligatory, recommended, permissible, or disliked.

And the reprehensible is that for which its doer is punished in some respects.

So his statement "in some respects" is in order to include reprehensible acts committed by children and the insane, for they are described as reprehensible though there is no punishment for them. And based on what we have mentioned, there is no intermediary between the good and the reprehensible.

[The Cause of the Reprehensibility of an Act According to Our Imams and Those Who Agree with Them]

Our Imams (Peace be Upon Them), the Zaydiyyah, and the Mu'tazilah of Basra said: an act is not reprehensible except due to its occurring in a manner to which something pertains. The meaning of that is that killing, for example, is reprehensible if it occurs in a manner of corruption and aggression. So if corruption and aggression are negated from killing, then it is not reprehensible, such as killing in retribution or as a legal punishment. And lying is reprehensible due to what results from it of the diminishment of the one who lies, and what results from it of the lack of trust in him, and what results from it of aggression and corruption if there is harm to someone in it.

And adultery is reprehensible because of what it contains of violating honors and mixing of lineages, along with what occurs through it of deadly diseases. And drinking wine is reprehensible because of what it contains of corruption of the intellect and what results from it of aggression and corruption. And likewise are the rest of the rational and legal reprehensible acts, for their reprehensibility is only due to a matter pertaining to them by which the act becomes reprehensible.

[Those Who Say That an Act Is Reprehensible in and of Itself]

It has been reported from some theologians and some jurists that an act is reprehensible not due to something that occurs upon it, but rather it is reprehensible in and of itself. They argued for that by saying: the default regarding unrestricted actions is prohibition.

And the default is such because they are a disposal in the dominion of Allah, *Exalted is He*, and that is not permissible except with His permission. So whatever permission comes from Allah for the morally responsible to do is good, and whatever permission does not come is reprehensible. From here, reprehensibility does not need a manner, as the first group says.

The response to them is that rational people do not blame one who takes his drink from rivers and the like, or walks upon the earth before the advent of the laws. Nor do they deem correct the punishment of one who punishes him. And if the default were prohibition, rational people would have blamed him and deemed correct the punishment of one who punished him, for his transgression in the act before knowing the

permission of the Law.

[The Ashʿarī Justification for the Reprehensibility of an Act]

The Ashʿarīs*[1] *and others said: rather, an act is reprehensible only because the Lawgiver forbade it. And the morally responsible does not know, prior to the prohibition, what is reprehensible or good. Thus, all reprehensible acts, according to them, are legal.

We say: it is known that the disbelievers who deny the laws deem injustice, aggression, and corruption on earth to be reprehensible, and they deem punishment for it to be good. Rather, they demand punishment for it, as is the case today, for the disbelieving states have unanimously agreed upon combating terrorism and punishing terrorists. And in disbelieving states, organizations have been established that care for human rights, denouncing the oppression of the innocent and calling for the trial of criminals.

Also, all rational people among atheists and others—if one of them were to see a child about to fall into a well, or extending his hand to take a snake—would deem it good to prevent him from that and would deem it reprehensible to leave him, even if there were no kinship between them.

Furthermore, it would have been expected that such a matter would not be a point of disagreement among the morally responsible, due to the clarity of deeming the reprehensible as reprehensible by innate disposition, and deeming the good as good.

And there is no doubt that the people of this view do not rely upon any proof or evidence. Rather, they invented it from themselves as an invention, in order to close upon their opponents the doors of debate upon which torrents of criticism and compulsion poured upon them due to their saying of determinism and what attaches to it of the servant being non-choosing, and so on.

[The Saying of Some of the Determinists Regarding the Cause of the Reprehensibility of an Act]

Some of the determinists said: an act is reprehensible from the servant only because he is lorded and an owned servant. In sum, all of the determinists hold that an act is reprehensible due to prohibition and good due to the absence of prohibition, or reprehensible due to the servant being lorded or owned, and good due to permissibility.

And with respect to Allah, *Exalted is He*, an act from Him is good due to

1- Attributed to the school of Abū al-Ḥasan al-Ashʿarī—he is ʿAlī ibn Abī Bishr ibn Isḥāq ibn Sālim ibn Ismāʿīl ibn ʿAbd Allāh ibn Mūsā ibn Abī Burdah ibn Abī Mūsā al-Ashʿarī. *(ʿUddat al-Akyās, vol. 1).*

the absence of prohibition regarding Him, *Glorious is His Majesty*, or due to His being Lord. Thus, lying and injustice from Him, *Exalted is He*, are good and not reprehensible, due to the absence of prohibition or due to His being Lord. Upon this principle they built their doctrine, wherein they said: indeed, Allah, *Exalted is He*, is the One who creates disbelief in the disbeliever and constrains him to it such that he is unable to exit from it, then He punishes him in the Fire, abiding therein eternally.

We say: if the matter were as you mentioned, it would necessitate that His report, *Exalted is He*, not be trusted, and that attributes of deficiency—such as lying and the like—would attach to Him. And all of that is false and impermissible by consensus, and whatever leads to falsehood is false.

Furthermore, injustice and lying are reprehensible; the intellect deems them reprehensible and innate disposition recoils from them. And that does not differ with the difference of the doers, except that if the reprehensible issues from one who knows its reprehensibility and is free of need of it, then it is more reprehensible and more abhorrent.

[Legally Reprehensible Acts and the Cause of Their Reprehensibility]

The legally reprehensible acts are deemed reprehensible due to the corruption entailed in committing them. From here, He, *Exalted is He*, said: *"Say: My Lord has only forbidden immoralities—what is apparent of them and what is hidden"* **[al-Anʿām: 151]**.

Thus, the prohibition of adultery is due to what it contains of violating honors and mixing of lineages, and then due to what results from committing it of the emergence of strange diseases which the Sunnah has spoken of, and which have appeared abundantly in this time.

And the prohibition of wine is due to what it contains of the corruption of the intellect, from whose corruption result many crimes and sins.

And the prohibition of singing is due to what it contains of calling to adultery. From here it has been said: the chaste woman is not drawn down from her chastity by anything like singing. And due to what it contains of heedlessness from the remembrance of Allah, which leads to the corruption of the heart. From here there came in the narration: *"Singing causes hypocrisy to grow in the heart just as water causes trees to grow".*[1]

1- And in another narration: *"...just as water causes vegetables to grow"*, and in another narration: *"...crops"*. See: *al-Balāgh al-Nāhī ʿan al-Ghināʾ wa Ālāt al-Malāhī* by Imam al-Ḥujjah Majd al-Dīn ibn

=

And likewise the rest of the legally prohibited matters. However, there are prohibited matters whose corruption resulting from committing them may be hidden. From here Allah, *Exalted is He*, divided immoralities into two categories in His saying: *"Say: My Lord has only forbidden immoralities—what is apparent of them and what is hidden"* **[al-Anʿām: 151]**. So there is a category whose immorality is apparent, and a category whose immorality is hidden.

This said, there is no contradiction between what we have mentioned and the saying of the earlier among our Imams *(Peace be Upon Them)*: that the cause of the reprehensibility of a legally reprehensible act is its being ingratitude for the favor of the Bestower of favors. And ingratitude for blessing is rationally reprehensible. That is because there is no impediment to the multiplicity of the causes of reprehensibility.

[Legal Goodness]

The aspect of the goodness of legal good acts, such as prayer and fasting, is due to the benefits they contain for the morally responsible. From here Allah, *Exalted is He*, said at the end of the verse of ablution: *"Allah does not intend to place upon you any hardship, but He intends to purify you and to complete His favor upon you"* **[al-Māʾidah: 6]**.

There is no contradiction between what we have mentioned and what many of our Imams *(Peace be Upon Them)* have held, that the aspect is their being gratitude for the blessings of Allah, *Exalted is He*—for what we mentioned regarding the reprehensible.

[The View of the Muʿtazilah Regarding the Cause of the Reprehensibility of the Legally Reprehensible, and the Cause of the Goodness of the Legal Good and the Recommended]

Many of the Muʿtazilah held that the aspect of the reprehensibility of the legally reprehensible is its being a corruption in rational obligations.

They said: corruption is that with which the morally responsible is closer to committing what is reprehensible and abandoning what is obligatory. And they held that the aspect of the goodness of the legal good is its being a gentleness (luṭf) and a benefit in rational obligations.

They said: gentleness is that with which the morally responsible is closer to performing rational obligations and not neglecting them.

And they said regarding legally recommended acts: that the aspect

---

Muḥammad al-Muʾayyidī (*peace be upon him*); *Musnad al-Imām Zayd* (278); *Kitāb al-Bisāṭ* by Imam al-Nāṣir (44); and see *Muṣannaf ʿAbd al-Razzāq*, *Muṣannaf Ibn Abī Shaybah*, *Sunan Abi Dawud, al-Sunnah li-Abi Baker al-Khallab, al-Ibanah al-Kubra li-Ibn Batta,Shub al-Iman li-al-Bayahaqi, al-Muhallah li-Ibn Hazm* … and so on.

of their recommendation is their facilitating rational obligations. And some of them said: their being a gentleness in performing rational recommended acts and abandoning rational disliked acts. And the aspect of abandoning the legally disliked, according to them, is its being a facilitation for abandoning reprehensible acts.

The response is: we do not deny that performing legal obligations calls to performing rational obligations, due to His saying, *Exalted is He*: *"Indeed, prayer restrains from immorality and wrongdoing"* **[al-ʿAnkabūt: 45]**. However, they erred when they restricted themselves to mentioning this aspect alone, as evidenced by what we mentioned in the verse of ablution. And there is no impediment to the multiplicity of aspects. Thus, prayer is an act of worship intended as gratitude to the Bestower of favors, as evidenced by His saying: *"Work, O family of Dāwūd, in gratitude"* **[Saba': 13]**, and His saying, *Exalted is He*: *"And I did not create the jinn and mankind except that they worship Me"* **[al-Dhāriyāt: 56]**.

Along with what it contains of bodily health due to its comprising athletic movements, and then the purification of the outward, which results in the purification of the inward—of vitality, ease, and the soundness of innate disposition. Conversely, the presence of filth and impurities on the body or clothing arouses anxiety in the soul, and the innate disposition becomes disturbed because of it. This is in addition to the fact that performing prayer calls to abandoning reprehensible acts and to performing acts of obedience in general, both rational and legal.

And Allah, *Exalted is He*, in what He has legislated of acts of worship, has wisdoms and benefits returning to the servants beyond their being gratitude, worship, and acts of gentleness, as we mentioned regarding prayer: health, cleanliness, vitality, ease, and the soundness of the intellect. I have seen in some modern scientific discoveries statements by some discoverers, the gist of which is: there are on the surface of the body numerous points related to the internal organs of the body, and most of these points are concentrated in the limbs, the face, the hands, the ears, and the feet. Massaging these points restores balance and vitality to the internal systems of the body and is beneficial in treating many chronic diseases such as back pain, neck pain, spinal pain, high blood pressure, chronic constipation, insomnia, headaches, tension, and other illnesses. It also reduces the severity of stress arising from the pressures of daily life that cause many diseases, restores to a person the feeling of comfort and relaxation, stimulates blood circulation, helps eliminate toxic and harmful substances from the body, and renews vitality and energy, and so on.

I say: for this reason Allah, *Exalted is He*, mentioned at the end of the verse of ablution His saying: *"Allah does not intend to place upon you any*

hardship, but He intends to purify you and to complete His favor upon you, so that you may give thanks" **[al-Mā'idah]**. Thus Allah, *Exalted is He*, clarified in this verse that in legislating the ritual bath from major impurity and ablution there are benefits returning to the human being. However, He mentioned them in a general manner in His saying: *"to purify you and to complete His favor upon you".*

By what we have mentioned, the weakness of the philosophy of the Muʿtazilah in this chapter becomes clear, as well as the weakness of the view of those who restricted the aspect to their being gratitude.

[Compulsion and Choice]

The servant is choosing in his actions; he brings them about as he wills according to his will and the motive of his soul. This is the doctrine of the Zaydiyyah, the Muʿtazilah, and others.

All of the determinists (al-Mujabbirah) said: the servant has no action, and that everything that issues from the servant of good and evil is Allah, *Exalted is He*, who creates it in him. And the servant is nothing but like a tree that moves by Allah moving it. And the attribution of the action to the servant is nothing but like the attribution to him of tallness and shortness, blackness and whiteness. Except that a group among the determinists, when they saw the ugliness of this doctrine and the appearance of its repulsiveness, invented for it a new philosophy and presented it to people in a new garb. They said: indeed, Allah, *Exalted is He*, is the One who creates the actions of the servant, but the servant has acquisition (*kasb*). And this view belongs to the Ashʿarīs, and there is no escape for them in this addition, as will come.

[The Ashʿarī View of Concomitant Power and Acquisition]

Others among the later Ashʿarīs said: the power of the servant is effective in his actions. However, this power is created by Allah, *Exalted is He*, at the time of the occurrence of the action—meaning that the power is concomitant with the action; it comes into existence when it occurs and ceases at its end.

Then they spoke about this power and said: it is a power necessitating the object of power, meaning that when the power occurs, the occurrence of the action necessarily follows.

This is exactly the first doctrine of the determinists, because the creator of the cause is the creator of the effect.

We say in response to them:

The factions of the determinists are all agreed upon attributing the action to Allah, *Exalted is He*, rather than to the servant. So the Ashʿarīs and the later among them fled to no escape; they did not exit, in their

flight, from the doctrine of compulsion. For all of them say: indeed, Allah, *Exalted is He*, is the One who creates the actions of the servant; they only differed in the philosophy that speaks about that doctrine.

And the acquisition (*kasb*) of the Ashʿarīs is unintelligible. That is because they say: Allah, *Exalted is He*, is the One who creates the actions of the servants, and the servant has from them acquisition. At that point, is the acquisition that they attributed to the servant an action among actions or not an action? They have not given an answer to this question to this day. So, they were perplexed and confounded at this question. For the principles of the doctrine did not allow them to say that acquisition is an action among actions, because actions, according to them, are all created by Allah, and it is not permissible that any of them be attributed to the servant. And if they say that acquisition is not an action, they are incapable of clarifying what it is.

At that point, it becomes clear to us that the factions of the determinists are agreed that all actions are from the creation of Allah and not from the action of the servant.

[The Response to the Factions of the Determinists]

From here, we respond to them all with a comprehensive answer, and we say:

1- The doctrine of compulsion clashes with what every rational person finds within himself and perceives by the necessity of his intellect in his dispositions and actions, which he brings about according to his will and choice, without any awareness of any motive other than his will and choice. And the strongest proofs absolutely are those attained through inner awareness (conscience), for the intellect apprehends that directly without the mediation of thought or reflection.

The theologians express such knowledge as *necessary knowledge*, which is that which occurs without the mediation of thought or reflection, such as a person's knowledge that he is hungry, thirsty, healthy, ill, fearful or secure, blind or seeing, compelled or choosing, and so forth.

From here, the people of compulsion are unable to deny the difference between the movement of one who trembles due to fever, and the movement of one who trembles by his own choice without illness.

2- It is known beyond doubt that the actions of every rational person issue from him according to his will and aversion. This is unlike tallness and shortness, and the whiteness or blackness of color, for these do not depend upon the servant's will and choice.

3- From the Qur'an is His saying, *Exalted is He*: *"Do whatever you wish"*

[Fuṣṣilat: 40]. Thus, by this verse Allah, *Exalted is He*, indicated that actions issue from the servants and that they issue from their will. And the like of this is abundant in the Qur'an, for it is filled with expressions such as: *you do*, *you make*, *you act*.

4- If the matter were as the determinists say, it would necessitate that the Creator, *Mighty and Majestic*, be called a disbeliever, a liar, an oppressor, a thief, and so forth—because He, *Glorified is He*, would then be the One who did that, willed it, and desired it, not the servant, who would be declared free of it and innocent thereof. *"May Allah destroy them; how are they deluded?"* **[al-Tawbah]**.

Look to where caprice has taken them, and to what extent misguidance and wretchedness have carried them?! They ascribe the committing of reprehensible acts and enormities to Allah, *Exalted is He*, and absolve themselves of committing them. *"Glory be to Him and Exalted is He far above what they say, with great exaltation"* **[al-Isrāʾ]**.

5- The doctrine of the determinists also entails the invalidation of commands and prohibitions, the sending of messengers, and the revelation of books—because commanding one who is incapable of acting or refraining is reprehensible.

In sum, this doctrine is a mythical, false doctrine. Sound innate disposition turns away from it; conscience, necessity, and inner awareness belie it; the texts of the Qur'an and the Sunnah refute it; justice and wisdom disavow it. Refuting it requires nothing more than knowing it.

Their statements: Allah, *Exalted is He*, is too great for something to occur in His dominion that He does not will; Glory be to the One in whose dominion nothing occurs except what He wills. And their statement: What Allah wills occurs, and what He does not will does not occur. And their statement: From affirming the oneness of Allah is attributing all the actions of the servants to Him, *Exalted is He*; Whoever claims that he is the doer of his own action is an associator, not a monotheist; and the like of that—are nothing but deceptive methods and cunning tricks by which they promote their doctrine among the weak-minded and the simple.

Yet in all that they have mentioned, there is nothing that contradicts the greatness of Allah, His transcendence, or His oneness. For He, *Exalted is He*, said: *"And Allah does not love corruption"* **[al-Baqarah]**—and there is no doubt that corruption in the world is abundant. And He, *Exalted is He*, said: *"And Allah wants to accept your repentance, while those who follow desires want you to incline with a great inclination"* **[al-Nisāʾ]**. And He, *Exalted is He*, said: *"And He does not approve disbelief for His servants"* **[al-Zumar: 7]**. And there is no doubt that the world is filled with disbelief and

disbelievers.

[A Doubt and Its Answer]

Among the doubts of the determinists by which they argue for the doctrine of compulsion is His saying, *Exalted is He*: *"And Allah created you and what you do"* **[al-Ṣāffāt]**—meaning, as they claim, that He created you and your actions.

We say in response to them: this verse came to denounce the idolaters for worshipping idols. Thus, He, *Exalted is He*, said: *"Do you worship what you carve, while Allah created you and what you make?"* **[al-Ṣāffāt]**. So, Allah, *Exalted is He*, condemned them for worshipping stones which they carve with their own hands and fashion into idols, while He, *Glorified is He*, is the One who created them and created the idols carved from stone. And *"what"* here is a relative pronoun, not a verbal noun.

[The Actions of the Servant: Generated Actions]

The actions of the servant are divided into two categories: one of them being actions obtained by direct performance, and the other being those obtained through generation.

Generated actions are those that occur by means of an instrument or the like. Whatever is generated from the action of the servant is attributed to him, and its rulings apply to him. It has been narrated from some of the Muʿtazilah statements regarding generated actions, among them: that the generated action is an action of Allah—this is narrated from al-Naẓẓām[1] and Ṣāliḥ Qubbah[2].

And among them is the view that it is an occurrence with no originator—this is narrated from Thumāmah[3].

And among them is the claim that the servant has no action except will, and that everything besides it—whether direct or generated—only occurs by the nature of the substrate, neither from Allah *Exalted is He* nor from the servant.

We say, in response to them: if the matter were as they claim, then retaliation (qiṣāṣ) would not be permissible against one who kills another with a sword, or by shooting an arrow, or by throwing a stone,

1- Ibrāhīm ibn Sayyār ibn Hānīʾ al-Baṣrī, Abū Isḥāq al-Naẓẓām, one of the leading Imams of the Muʿtazilah. He held unique opinions, which were followed by a faction of the Muʿtazilah known as the Naẓẓāmiyyah, attributed to him. *(al-Aʿlām by al-Ziriklī, abridged).*

2- It is said: Ṣāliḥ ibn ʿAbd Allāh, and it is also said: Ṣāliḥ ibn Ṣubayḥ ibn ʿUmar, a Muʿtazilī of the seventh generation, and a student of al-Naẓẓām. *(Margin of ʿUddat al-Akyās, vol. 1).*

3- Thumāmah ibn Ashras al-Numayrī, Abū Maʿn, one of the eminent Muʿtazilah and among the foremost eloquent rhetoricians. He had connections with al-Rashīd and then with al-Maʾmūn. Among his students was al-Jāḥiẓ. *(al-Aʿlām by al-Ziriklī, abridged).*

and the like.

Moreover, it is known by the necessity of reason that the acts of throwing, writing, killing, and similar actions are acts of the servant, and necessity does not differentiate between the direct act and the generated act; rather, it judges all of them to be from the act of the servant.

We shall clarify necessity, even though it is not in need of clarification, and we say:

1- Generated acts occur according to the servant's intention and motive, and they cease according to his aversion.
2- They follow ability in terms of being few or many.
3- They occur with the presence of the instrument and cease with its absence.
4- Rational people deem it good to command writing and throwing, and all of this clarifies what we have mentioned.

[The Acts of Allah, *Exalted is He*]

The acts of Allah *Exalted is He* are acts of power, meaning that Allah *Exalted is He* creates whatever He wills without the mediation of anything. Thus, the acts of Allah *Exalted is He* are the created things, and He has no act other than them—such as motion, rest, or accident—unlike the acts of the servants, which are only motion or rest.

The Muʿtazilah have, in this matter, an unintelligible philosophy.

They said that Allah *Exalted is He* creates created things or annihilates them by means of an accident, and they said regarding this accident that it has no substrate. They called the accident of creation "will," and the accident of annihilation "perishing."

We say: there is no proof for what they have mentioned, nor any way to establish it, neither through reason nor revelation. To affirm that which is so is ignorance and misguidance. Rather, decisive proof and clear evidence have been established for the impossibility of an accident without a substrate.

It has already been established previously that accidents are among the attributes and properties of bodies, and that they are not conceivable at all except within bodies, inseparable from them.

[The Difference Between the Acts of the Servants and the Acts of Allah, *Exalted is He*]

The acts of the servants are acts of the limbs and acts of the heart. The acts of the limbs are those of the bodily organs, and the acts of the heart are such as thinking, knowledge, conjecture, love and hatred, resolve, intention, and the like.

All the acts of the servant, both bodily and inward, are only accidents, for they are either motion or rest, or the like, such as the acts of the hearts.

It is impossible for servants to bring bodies into existence, or some accidents, such as colors, tastes, smells, and heat.

All the acts of the servant are either direct or generated.

As for the acts of the Creator, *Mighty and Exalted*, among them are the initiated and the generated. The initiated among His acts *Exalted is He* is that which occurs without mediation, and the generated is that which occurs by means of a cause, such as stirring the clouds and driving them in the sky, for that is by means of the winds; and such as the creation of light and illumination, and the ripening of fruits, and so on, for that occurs by means of the sun.

[Ability]

Allah *Exalted is He* created for the servant a limited ability, and He *Exalted is He* made it for him like an instrument by which he does whatever he wills of the affairs of his religion and his worldly life. And the servant, with the existence of ability within him, may perform the act or may not perform it.

Some of the determinists—those who affirm ability for the servant—said: Allah *Exalted is He* creates for the servant an ability, and when the ability occurs, the act necessarily occurs with its occurrence. When the act ends, the ability ends. According to them, Allah *Exalted is He* creates for the believer the ability to believe, so belief necessarily occurs due to the occurrence of the ability for it; and He creates for the disbeliever an ability for disbelief, so disbelief necessarily occurs; and He creates for the one who prays the ability to pray, so prayer inevitably occurs; and likewise every act of obedience or disobedience, or motion or rest. Allah *Exalted is He* creates for each one a specific ability: when the ability for motion occurs, motion occurs, and when the ability does not occur, its occurrence is impossible. Thus, regarding the servant who does not pray, they say: he was unable to pray due to the absence of ability. In this manner, they explain the absence of acts by the absence of ability, and the existence of acts by the existence of ability.

According to them, it is impossible for one who is able to walk to sit, for one who is sitting to walk, for a disbeliever to believe, and for a believer to disbelieve, and so on.

We say: this statement of yours contradicts what every rational person finds within himself by the necessity of reason. For every rational person finds within himself that he disposes of his actions however he

wills, according to his will and the motive of his soul: if he wills, he acts, and if he does not will, he does not act.

All rational people, including the determinists themselves, deem it appropriate to ask one another: "Why did you do [this]?" and "Why did you refrain?" They pose this question intending to clarify the motive of the soul that prompted it to act or refrain. This is only because human actions occur according to the motive of the soul and its will, not according to the existence of ability or its absence. If the matter were otherwise, it would be appropriate for a man to answer such a question by citing the existence or absence of ability. Yet the determinists themselves, like other people, do not deem answering by ability or its absence to be appropriate.

Furthermore, if ability were to necessitate the act and bring it about inevitably, then the doer would not be free in his actions. And it is from necessity and self-evident truth that the human being is free in his actions, disposing of them however he wills.

[The Confusions of the Ashʿarites and the Determinists Regarding Ability, and the Response to Them]

Now then, among the confusions of the Ashʿarites regarding ability is their claim that the servant has an ability by which no action occurs at all, and that the ability by which his actions do occur is the ability of Allah *Exalted is He*.

We say to them: what benefit is there in the servant's ability so long as no action occurs by means of it?

Some of the determinists said: Allah *Exalted is He* did not create any ability for the servant whatsoever; rather, He is the One who directs them and acts upon them as He wills. The response to this is derived from what has preceded.

Then the determinists in general said: if Allah *Exalted is He* were to create for His servants an ability by which they act, and then they disobeyed Allah *Exalted is He*, their disobedience would amount to disputing Allah *Exalted is He* in His sovereignty and contending against Him, *Mighty and Exalted*, since He forbade them from that and they disobeyed Him, opposed Him, and contended with Him and thus overcame Him. This would entail that Allah *Exalted is He* is overcome, and that is neither permissible nor valid—thus do they argue.

The response—and Allah is the One who grants success—is that there is no disputation nor contention in what you have mentioned. That is because Allah *Exalted is He* clarified to those morally responsible what He loves of deeds and what He dislikes, encouraged them toward

obedience to Him, and warned them against disobedience to Him. Thus, whoever obeys Him, He admits him into Paradise, and whoever disobeys Him, He admits him into the Fire. And He enabled them to choose either of the two paths by what He has instilled in them of intellects and ability. Therefore, the disobedient one is not considered to be contending with his Lord nor disputing Him in His sovereignty. This is nothing but like the action of a servant whose master says to him: "I do not approve of you eating wheat, nor do I forbid you from it; but if you do it, I will punish you." The servant's disobedience of his master is not considered contention nor disputation against him, for contention and disputation consist of resistance by numbers, equipment, and the like. It is not said of a servant that by his disobedience he is an overcomer or a contender. Likewise, are the rulers among humans with their subjects: the disobedience of subjects is not considered contention or disputation, nor is it said "overcomer" or "overcome," except when the ruler is unable to requite the disobedient and discipline him. But if the ruler disciplines the disobedient and imposes upon him the consequence of his disobedience, it is not valid to say that the disobedient is an overcomer, nor that the ruler is overcome.

The determinists also said: it has already preceded in the knowledge of Allah *Exalted is He* that the disobedient will commit the act of disobedience, so how can he be able to refrain from it despite that?

We said in response to them: the knowledge of Allah *Exalted is He* has no effect upon the occurrence of the act of obedience or disobedience, by agreement between us and the determinists. As for us, this is clear; and as for the determinists, they say that the acts of the servants occur by the power of Allah and by His act, not by His knowledge.

If they say: the knowledge of Allah, *Exalted is He,* drives the one who has ability toward the act, not that it is itself the effective cause; rather, the effective cause is ability, and knowledge is a driver.

We say: if the matter is as such, then it necessarily follows—according to your doctrine—that the Creator, *Mighty and Exalted*, is compelled in creating the acts of His servants, of obediences and disobediences, having no choice in them, and likewise in all of His acts, due to the precedence of knowledge. Yet you do not say that.

[An Act Within the Power of Two Agents]

The majority of the Muʿtazilah and some of the later Zaydīs held it to be impossible, and they argued for that by saying: if an act were validly within the power of two agents, it would be valid for it to occur from them in differing ways, such that one of them, for example, wills to make the thing still while the other wills to move it, which would lead to the

combination of two opposites.

It was answered: the impossibility applies only in the case of disagreement; as for the case of agreement, there is no impediment.

Furthermore, in my view, this issue does not possess the degree of importance that they have given it, nor does much benefit result from it.

[The Impossibility of Bringing About Two Contradictories]

It is impossible for any agent to bring about two contradictories in a single essence. Contradictories are those such that one negates the other and they cannot both be negated, such as menstruation and purity, existence and nonexistence, motion and rest, and the like.

[The Impossibility of Bringing About Two Contraries]

It is also impossible to bring about two contraries, which are those such that the existence of one prevents the existence of the other, in that they do not coexist together in a single essence, while it is permissible for them both to be absent together, such as whiteness and blackness, which are both removed by redness and the like.

Contrary to the determinists, for they permitted the coexistence of contradictories and contraries in a single substrate, and they said: Allah, *Glorified and Exalted*, is capable of that, due to His saying: *"And Allah is Powerful over all things",* and similar verses.

We say: perhaps the determinists only said that in glorification of Allah *Exalted is He*, affirming that His power has no limit and that nothing renders it incapable. However, there are three decisive theories:

The first: it is not permissible with respect to Allah *Exalted is He* that there be perishing, incapacity, ignorance, death, and so on. Some theologians express this by saying: Allah *Exalted is He* is "Necessary in Existence" and "Impossible in Nonexistence."

The second: everything that we observe of created things is subject to existence and nonexistence, and this is termed by the theologians "possible existence."

The third: there are assumed notions whose existence reason deems impossible, such as the coexistence of contradictories and contraries in a single substrate. Such is termed by the theologians "impossible existence."

When you know this, then perishing with respect to Allah *Exalted is He*, as well as incapacity, ignorance, death, and nonexistence—all of that is impossible, neither possible nor subject to power. Likewise, the coexistence of contradictories and contraries in a single substrate: power does not extend to that, nor is the one who is capable described as

incapable due to that, for incapacity only applies to that toward which power is directed. Thus, the power of Allah *Exalted is He* creates the heavens and the earth, the sun and the moon, the human being, life and death. As for Allah *Exalted is He* making the sun and the moon existent and nonexistent at one time, or making the children of Adam living and not living at one time, or making the heavens and the earth existent and nonexistent at one time—these are false suppositions that never occur, and none occupies his thought with them except a fool.

[Will]

Will, with respect to created beings, is intention, inner resolve, and determination. In them it is an accident that comes and goes. Likewise, aversion in created beings is an accident that comes and goes. It has already been established previously that accidents are among the properties of bodies, and that Allah *Exalted is He* is not subject to accidents.

It has been established that Allah *Exalted is He* is described as One who wills, as in His saying: *"Allah intends for you ease and does not intend for you hardship"* — **[al-Baqarah: 185]**; and: *"His command, when He intends a thing, is only that He says to it, 'Be,' and it is"* **[Yā Sīn: 82]**. It has also been established that He *Exalted is He* is described as One who dislikes, as in His saying: *"But Allah disliked their setting forth"* **[al-Tawbah: 46]**.

[The Meaning of Allah's Will and His Dislike]

Accordingly, we say: the meaning of Allah's will, *Glorified and Exalted*, is His apprehension, by His knowledge, that an act comprises wisdom and benefit; and His dislike is His apprehension, by His knowledge, that an act comprises corruption.

On this basis, will is a relational matter that does not entail anything contrary to the majesty of the Most Merciful, *Glorified and Exalted*, for apprehension is other than the apprehended, and the apprehender is other than the apprehended.

If it is said: will is something additional to knowledge, and thus it must be other than knowledge.

We say: will, with respect to Allah *Exalted is He*, is the motive of wisdom, and that is His knowledge of an act's comprising benefit and wisdom. It is not rationally sound to affirm anything beyond that, except inclination of the heart, yearning of the soul, and longing— and all of that is impossible with respect to Allah *Exalted is He*. This is the precise determination of the meaning of will.

As for the Muʿtazilah, they stumbled in determining its meaning, and made it like the will of created beings, except that they placed it without

a substrate in order to flee from what would be entailed of anthropomorphism.

Then they said: will occurs at the time of the occurrence of the willed thing, and its existence does not require a will. The invalidity of their statement is evident and not hidden, for an accident without a substrate is impossible, and the bringing about by the All-Wise of something without will is a negation of wisdom. That is because reason judges that the Wise does not perform an act except with will.

[False Statements in Interpreting Will]

Some of the determinists said instead: His will *Exalted is He* is an eternal meaning, as they say regarding the rest of His attributes.

The response is that affirming an eternal meaning necessitates multiplicity of eternals, whereas there is no Eternal except Allah. It also entails anthropomorphism, since meanings only subsist in bodies.

It has been narrated from some theologians that will is a motion that is neither Allah nor other than Him.

And from others: that it is a motion in other than Him *Exalted is He*.

The invalidity of both doctrines is clear. The first is unintelligible, for there is no intermediary except nonexistence. The second entails that the one who wills is the one in whom the motion occurs, not the Creator *Exalted is He*.

Those who affirm a real will said: the proof that He is one who wills like the will of one of us is that His saying: *"Muhammad is the Messenger of Allah"* **[al-Fatḥ: 29]** is a report that applies to everyone whose name is Muhammad, and it is not determined that what is meant by it is Muḥammad ibn ʿAbd Allah, the unlettered Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*, except by a will from Allah *Exalted is He* specifying him as the one intended by this report among all the Muhammads.

They also said: Allah *Exalted is He* has commanded, threatened, and permitted with a single form, such as: *"Establish the prayer"* **[al-Anʿām: 72]**; *"So now have relations with them"* **[al-Baqarah: 187]**; *"Do whatever you will"* **[Fuṣṣilat: 40]**. None of these is distinguished from the others except by will.

We say: we did not negate will; rather, it is as we have mentioned, due to the impossibility of real will—namely intention and inner resolve—with respect to Allah *Exalted is He*.

Moreover, contextual indicators and signs determine what is intended in such as His saying: *"Muhammad is the Messenger of Allah"* **[al-Fatḥ: 29]**

and determine what is intended by the imperative form, without the need for will, since will is a concealed inner matter that cannot be accessed.

When you know the meaning of will, then know that Allah *Exalted is He* is one who wills all of His acts.

Some of the Mu'tazilah said: Allah creates will and dislike without will. This is among the confusions of the Mu'tazilah regarding will, and the response to it has already preceded.

[Will with Respect to the Servant]

Servants possess a will which they bring about for the interests of their own selves and to repel harm from them. By it they deserve praise and blame. It is from the nature of this will that it does not necessitate the willed thing, nor does it generate it. The determinists denied this and said: servants have no will whatsoever. Their denial of it is a stubborn rejection of the necessity of reason. Allah *Exalted is He* has said: *"So whoever wills may take a path to his Lord"* **[al-Muzzammil: 19]**, He attributes will to the servant. And He, *Glorified and Exalted*, has said: *"And Satan intends to mislead them into far error"* **[al-Nisā': 1]**. He has also said, *Mighty and Exalted*: *"You desire the goods of this world, while Allah desires the Hereafter"* **[al-Anfāl: 67]**. And He has said: *"Those who follow desires intend that you should incline with a great inclination"* **[al-Nisā': 27]**. And He, *Glorified*, has said: *"They intend that they be secure from you and secure their own people"* **[al-Nisā': 91]**—and other verses besides these that affirm the will of the servant.

Will is the preparing of the soul and fixing it upon acting or refraining, and it follows the act in goodness and badness. Thus, willing good is good, and willing evil is evil. From here they said that reward and punishment attach to it, and they adduced as evidence His saying: *"Whether you disclose what is within yourselves or conceal it, Allah will bring you to account for it"* **[al-Baqarah: 284]**.

It was said: Allah *Exalted is He* overlooks such matters, due to His *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* saying: *"Allah has pardoned my community for what their souls speak to them, so long as they do not speak of it or act upon it."*[1]

We say: will and resolve are one thing, and the passing thought of the soul is another. Will and resolve are voluntary acts among the acts of the servant, whereas the passing thought comes to a person without his

1- *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim (1/116), no. (127); Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī (7/46), no. (5269); Mukhtalaf al-Shī'a by al-Ḥillī (8/417), with wordings that convey the meaning stated here.*

choice. In that case, it is not from his act. Thus, the ḥadīth is intended to refer to the passing thought of the soul over which the servant has no choice in its occurrence. Allah *Exalted is He* has said regarding what is of this nature: *"Allah does not burden a soul except with what it can bear"* **[al-Baqarah: 286]**.

And what supports what we have mentioned is what has been narrated from the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* that he said: "*If two Muslims meet each other with their swords, then both the killer and the one killed are in the Fire*." It was said: O Messenger of Allah, this is the killer—so what about the one killed? He replied: "*Indeed, he intended to kill his companion*."[1]

This being so, many of the Muʿtazilah said: will does not attach to negation; rather, it only attaches to affirmation.

We say: what is known by the necessity of reason is that each one of us finds within himself a will that something not be so, just as [he finds] the will of affirmation, without any difference. Denying such a thing is obstinacy and stubborn opposition.

[Allah's Satisfaction and His Love]

Allah's pleasure, His love, and His guardianship— the meaning of all of that is the judgment from Allah *Exalted is He* that the servant deserves reward before its time, and then conveying it to its recipient in the Hereafter.

Dislike is the opposite of love, and it is the judgment from Allah *Exalted is He* that the servant deserves punishment before its time, and then conveying it to him at its time.

Wrath, anger, and hatred—all of that carries the meaning of dislike.

This being so, know that Allah's love *Exalted is He* only attaches to the servant when he is obedient to Allah *Exalted is He*. If he disobeys Him, He is displeased with him. Thus, the ruling of displeasure and love follows the action of the servant.

Interpreting pleasure, displeasure, and the like in the manner we have mentioned is what befits the greatness of Allah *Exalted is He*. As for the real meanings of these expressions, they are impossible with respect to Allah *Exalted is He*. That is because anger is the boiling of the blood of the heart, the swelling of the veins, the reddening of the eyes, and the agitation of the soul that drives its possessor toward revenge.

Pleasure is an affection in the heart that leads to expansion of the

1- *Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī (49), no. (6875); Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim (4/2213), no. (2888); Musnad Aḥmad (32/361), no. (19590); Sunan Abī Dāwūd (6/324), no. (4268).*

chest, and so on.

All of that consists of accidents, which are impossible with respect to Allah *Exalted is He*, in light of what has preceded, namely that accidents are among the properties of bodies.

[The Attachment of Will]

The attachment of will: Allah *Exalted is He* wills acts of obedience from His servants—those that occur and those that do not occur—and He wills the abandonment of acts of disobedience—those that occur and those that do not occur.

All of the determinists said: Allah *Exalted is He* wills all acts of obedience and all acts of disobedience, and that there is no motion or rest that occurs in existence except that it occurs by His power, His will, and His volition; that all acts of immorality and disobedience are by His will and His power; and that He alone is the one who creates them and wills them, apart from His servants.

Then they said: as for acts of obedience and disobedience that do not occur, Allah *Exalted is He* neither wills them nor intends them. The sum of their statement is that whatever occurs, Allah wills it; and whatever does not occur, He does not will it—then, when it occurs, Allah wills it.

We say: if Allah *Exalted and Sanctified is He* is the One who undertakes the creation of disbelief, misguidance, indecencies, sins, crimes, obediences, and disobediences according to Al-Mujbara, then why do they object to Allah, to His will, His decree, and His predestination?

That is because they denounce the doctrines of the Shiʿa and the Muʿtazilah, declare them misguided, and even declare them unbelievers, while they themselves believe and affirm that Allah *Exalted is He* is the One who created these things, brought them into existence, willed them, intended them, decreed them, and predestined them.

This doctrine, in reality, is among the doctrines of the polytheists, as evidenced by His saying—exalting what He related about them: *"Those who associated others with Allah will say: If Allah had willed, we would not have associated [others with Him] ..."* until His saying: *"Thus did those before them deny until they tasted Our punishment. Say: Do you have any knowledge that you can bring forth for us? You follow nothing but conjecture, and you are nothing but guessing."* **[al-Anʿām]**.

This polytheistic creed infiltrated the religion of the Muslims, and it received the support of the Umayyad rulers from the moment of its emergence during the reign of Muʿāwiyah ibn Abī Sufyān, who was the first to promote it.

The reason Muʿāwiyah, and thereafter the rest of Banū Umayyah,

promoted this doctrine was what it contained of consolidating and strengthening the caliphate. For if people believe in this doctrine, they will be content with whatever Allah has willed, intended, decreed, predestined, and brought about regarding the authority of Muʿāwiyah.

Thus, Muʿāwiyah clothed his authority, through this doctrine, in the garb of legitimate caliphate, draped it in the mantle of religion, and thereby made it held high, even though the proofs of the Book openly proclaim the invalidity of this doctrine. Among them is His saying: *"And Allah does not intend injustice for the servants"* **[Ghāfir: 31]**; *"And Allah does not love corruption"* **[al-Baqarah: 205]**; *"And He is not pleased with disbelief for His servants"* **[al-Zumar: 7]**; *"All of that—its evil is disliked by your Lord"* **[al-Isrāʾ]**; *"Allah intends for you ease and does not intend for you hardship"* **[al-Baqarah: 185]**.

And He, *Glorified and Exalted*, said: *"And I did not create the jinn and mankind except that they may worship Me"* **[al-Dhāriyāt]**. In this verse Allah *Exalted is He* clarified His intent in creating the jinn and mankind. And He, *Glorified*, said: *"And We did not send you except as a mercy to the worlds"* **[al-Anbiyāʾ]**. In this verse He *Exalted is He* clarified what is intended by the sending of the messengers.

[Some of Al-Mujbara's doubts to Prove that Allah Wills Disobedience and Disbelief]

Al-Mujbara may say: Allah does not approve disbelief for His servants, nor does He love corruption; yet He *Exalted is He* wills and intends it.

We say: the coexistence of that is not valid, due to the contradiction it entails.

Do you not see that if a man were to say to his children: "I do not approve of you chewing qat, nor do I love it, but I will and intend that you chew it," how would listeners view that man and his statement? There is no doubt that they would judge him to be ignorant and contradictory, and his speech contradictory—if they do not judge him insane or foolish.

If they say: the fasting person may love eating during the daytime of Ramaḍān due to hunger, yet he does not will it because it involves disobedience to Allah *Exalted is He*; thus there is neither contradiction nor inconsistency.

We say: the believing fasting person does not love eating during the daytime of Ramaḍān because it involves disobedience to Allah *Exalted is He*. Rather, he recoils from it with the utmost aversion and detests it; indeed, he detests the one who does it and is repelled by him. He neither wills it nor intends it—all of that due to what eating entails of disobedience to Allah.

Furthermore, among what Al-Mujbara adduce as evidence is His saying: *"And thus We have made for every prophet an enemy—devils from mankind and jinn, inspiring one another with embellished speech as delusion; and if your Lord had willed, they would not have done it"* **[al-Anʿām: 112]**. They said: the verse is evidence that Allah wills the actions of the devils.

The response is that the meaning of the verse is that Allah *Exalted is He*, had He willed, could have caused them to die or restrained them from committing acts of disobedience. But He *Exalted is He* left them to themselves and entrusted them to their own choice, so that the obligation whose consequence is recompense might be fulfilled. Thus He did not prevent them from committing disbelief and disobedience. "Making" here is intended as leaving and granting free scope; and this leaving is from Allah *Exalted is He*, so the act was ascribed to Him. This is figurative attribution, known among the rhetoricians as al-majāz al-ʿaqlī (*logical metaphor*).

[Their Inference from the Verse: *"And if your Lord had willed, those on earth would have believed..."* and the Response]

Among what they also cite as evidence is His saying: *"And if your Lord had willed, all who are on the earth would have believed, all together. So will you compel the people until they become believers?"* **[Yūnus: 99]**.

They said: the verse is evidence that Allah *Exalted is He* did not will the belief of all people, and that had He willed it, they would have believed. From this they infer that He *Exalted is He* wills the disobedience of the disobedient and the belief of the believers.

The response to them is that the meaning of the verse is that Allah *Exalted is He*, had He willed to compel the people of the earth to believe, they would have believed; but He *Exalted is He* did not will that, because of what would follow from the nullification of obligation and choice. With the nullification of that, reward and punishment would be nullified, for reward and punishment are based upon deservingness, and there is no deservingness in the absence of choice. This interpretation accords with the logic of innate disposition and harmonizes with wisdom. Moreover, the end of the verse bears witness to what we have stated, for His saying: *"So will you compel the people until they become believers?"* **[Yūnus]** is evidence that the meaning is: had your Lord willed to compel people to believe, those on earth would have believed—so will you… and so on.

Then Al-Mujbara said: Allah *Exalted is He* is the owner of His servants, so He may dispose of them as He wills. Thus it is for Him, *Glorious is His Majesty*, to create His servants, create disbelief within them, bind them to it so that they are unable to escape from it, and then

punish them with the Fire. And that would not be ugly; rather, it would be justice and beneficence.

We say: it has been established by consensus among the Muslims—including Al-Mujbara—that Allah *Exalted is He* is Just and does not wrong even the weight of an atom; and if there is a good deed, He multiplies it and gives, from Himself, a tremendous reward. The concept of justice is well known among people and firmly established in their minds. There is no doubt that what Al-Mujbara claim is the height of contradiction, as it entails denying the praises by which Allah *Exalted is He* has praised Himself in His Noble Book, such as His saying: *"And your Lord does not wrong anyone"* **[al-Kahf]**; and His saying: *"Allah intends for you ease and does not intend for you hardship"* **[al-Baqarah: 185]**.

Thus, Al-Mujbara' statement that Allah *Exalted is He* created the human being, then created within him disbelief, immorality, and disobedience, and willed, intended, decreed, and predestined that—such that the human being has no act, no will, and no volition therein, and Allah *Exalted is He* alone undertook that without the human being—then Allah *Exalted is He* punishes him with everlasting residence in the Fire and with shackles: this is among the highest degrees of hardship, indeed the most severe of them; rather, there is no hardship beyond that. According to Al-Mujbara, then where is that which Allah praised Himself by negating in His saying: *"And He does not intend hardship for you"* ?

In sum, we are not able to enumerate all the proofs for the invalidity of the doctrine of Al-Mujbara. It suffices, after the self-evidence of reason, for the rational person to read the Qur'an; for he will find it, from its beginning to its end, refuting Al-Mujbara and crying out against their satanic doctrine.

[Invoking Supplication for Divine Enablement, Rectitude, and the Like as Evidence]

Al-Mujbara may argue for their doctrine—namely, that Allah *Exalted is He* is the One who creates acts of disobedience and obedience, wills them, intends them, decrees them, and predestines them—by appealing to the legitimacy of supplicating for enablement (*tawfīq*), rectitude (*tasdīd*), assistance, protection (*ʿiṣmah*), guidance (*hidaya*), and the like.

Among this are the supplications transmitted from the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*, such as: "*O Allah, help us to perform Your remembrance, to thank You, and to worship You well. O Allah, make good our end in all matters… guide us and make guidance easy for us… take us by our forelocks to goodness, and make Islam the utmost of our satisfaction*," and other supplications besides these—many of which pertain to this subject.

They also support this with His saying *Exalted is He*: *"But Allah has made faith beloved to you and adorned it in your hearts, and has made disbelief, wickedness, and disobedience hateful to you"* **[al-Ḥujurāt: 7]**.

The response—and Allah is the One who grants success—is that supplicating for such matters and then their occurrence does not negate choice. That is because enablement, rectitude, protection, assistance, and the like mean facilitation toward ease, which Allah *Exalted is He* mentioned in His saying: *"As for him who gives and is mindful, and affirms the best—We shall ease him toward ease"* **[al-Layl]**. The attainment of all of that occurs only for believing, God-fearing people, as Allah mentioned in this verse, and as in His saying: *"And whoever is mindful of Allah, He will make for him a way out"* **[al-Ṭalāq: 2]**, that is, a way out from the trials of falling into sins and grave offenses.

This, as we have stated, does not negate choice. For it is the believing servant who chooses to perform acts of obedience and to abandon acts of disobedience, while the care and guardianship of Allah encompass him and watch over him.

As for the manner of enablement, rectitude, and protection that Allah *Exalted is He* grants His Allah-fearing servants, it is that Allah *Exalted is He* increases the insight of those who are guided and responsive, as He said: *"And those who are guided—He increases them in guidance"* **[Muḥammad: 17]**; and: *"And He will make for you a light by which you walk"* **[al-Ḥadīd: 28]**; and: *"If you are mindful of Allah, He will grant you a criterion"* **[al-Anfāl: 29]**. The criterion (furqān) is an increase in the illumination of the intellect.

When the light of the heart increases, the believer's faith in Allah increases, knowledge of Him *Exalted is He* becomes firmly established, and reverent fear of Him, *Mighty and Exalted*, becomes more deeply rooted.

When the fear of Allah is attained and firmly rooted, it restrains its possessor from falling into acts of disobedience, binds him away from them, and drives him toward acts of obedience and the pursuit of Allah's pleasure *Exalted is He*. This also causes an increase in love of faith and hatred of disbelief, wickedness, and disobedience. At that point, the believer attains Allah's facilitation of the paths of obedience and His averting him from the paths of disobedience.

[Allah's Facilitation of the Paths of Obedience and Averting the Paths of Disobedience]

This occurs in many forms. Among them is that Allah provides the servant with a righteous spouse who assists him in the affairs of his religion; that Allah *Exalted is He* grants him righteous children likewise;

that he be within a righteous community, or in a land of truthful scholars, with relationships made easy for him with them and their love cast into his heart; and that Allah *Exalted is He* enriches him from poverty and grants him sufficiency, so that his soul thereafter does not prompt him to fall into consuming the unlawful and the like.

As for how Allah *Exalted is He* averts him from the paths of disobedience, that too occurs in many forms. Among them is that Allah *Exalted is He* grants him provision to the extent of sufficiency and need, without expanding it for him, lest he fall into tyranny, sin, and transgression—regarding which Allah said: *"Indeed, man transgresses when he sees himself self-sufficient"* **[al-ʿAlaq: 6–7]**; and He *Exalted is He* said: *"And if Allah were to expand provision for His servants, they would transgress in the land"* **[al-Shūrā: 27]**.

Among them is that Allah grants him a spouse commensurate with his need, such that his soul thereafter does not prompt him to fall into the unlawful.

Among them is that distractions, obstacles, and diversions confront him when he resolves upon travel, for example, in which he might be exposed to the temptation of falling into the unlawful, or upon performing an act whose outcome might be sinful.

The forms of this are many, and our intent is merely to present examples to clarify what is meant.

Moreover, supplication is an independent act of worship that Allah *Exalted is He* loves and calls His servants to, as in His saying, Mighty is His mention: *"And your Lord said: Call upon Me; I will respond to you. Indeed, those who are too proud for My worship will enter Hell, humiliated"* **[Ghāfir]**; and His saying: *"Call upon your Lord in humility and privately"* **[al-Aʿrāf]**; and other verses besides these. That is because it manifests neediness toward Allah, humility, and the expression of dependence upon Him; that He is the source of every good and the Lord of every blessing; that the human being owns for himself neither benefit nor harm; that life is from Him, increase of lifespans is from Him, bodily health is from Him; that He provides for His servants by sending down rain and then bringing forth provision from the earth; that He sent the messengers and revealed the Books to guide people, teaching them the paths of obedience and guidance and how to obey and give thanks, warning them against the paths of Satan, and teaching them what they did not know, and so on.

Thus, even though the believer knows that Allah *Exalted is He* grants these worldly provisions without supplication, as He said: *"Each We supply—these and those—from the bounty of your Lord, and the bounty of*

your Lord is not restricted" **[al-Isrā']**; and He said: *"We have apportioned among them their livelihood in the life of this world"* **[al-Zukhruf: 32]**; and that He *Exalted is He* has guided all people by what He sent of messengers, what He revealed of Books, and what He granted them of intellects, and so on—nevertheless, within supplication are rulings and secrets that Allah intends, among them:

1- Manifesting poverty and need toward Allah.
2- Manifesting that Allah *Exalted is He* is the One who gives and withholds.
3- Manifesting humility and abasement.
4- Proclaiming Allah's encompassing of all things, the dominance of His power over everything, and that the reins of all affairs are in His hand and their sources issue from His decree—He does what He wills and judges what He wills.
5- Manifesting that the servant owns for himself neither benefit nor harm.
6- Supplication is a bond with Allah by which the servant pours out his complaint to his Lord and asks Him, from His bounty, what none besides Him can provide—such as relief of distress and removal of anguish and so on—thereby resulting in tranquility of the heart and alleviation of the weight of affliction and the severity of trial.
7- With the persistence of supplication, that bond with Allah lives and becomes firmly established. If he sees a response, he praises Allah *Exalted is He* and increases in gratitude; and if he sees otherwise, he says: perhaps sins have stood between me and the response—so he looks to the faults of his soul and his sins, reforms them, and increases in seeking forgiveness, specifically and generally.
8- Supplication is the believer's equipment and weapon against enemies, and within it is refuge from the evil of what Allah *Exalted is He* has created. Through it fears are reduced, the mind is put at ease, and the soul finds tranquility, and so on. And in the ḥadīth: *"Supplication is the weapon of the believer."* And there are many other such wisdoms and secrets.

[Explanation of "*There is no power nor strength except with Allah*"]

Al-Mujbara may say that in this phrase—*"There is no power nor strength except with Allah"*—there is an indication of the doctrine of compulsion. In reality, however, there is no proof in it for their reprehensible doctrine.

Its meaning is that all power belongs to Allah alone. The human being

has no independent power, no independent might, and no independent ability. The human being's ability and power are from Allah; He *Exalted is He* is the One who bestows them and creates them. He *Exalted is He* is the One who enables His servants to engage in actions and to do what they wish. Thus, He made that easy for them, facilitated it, and enabled them to attain it by what He granted them of the instrument of walking—namely the two legs—and the instrument of action—namely the two hands. He spread out the earth for them to walk upon and move about on it, made it broad pathways and routes, and subjected for them the means of livelihood. Thus, He *Exalted is He* spread out the earth with soil, subjected for them the clouds and rains, the growth of the earth, and the bringing forth of fruits and grains; He subjected for them the winds, and subjected for them the sun and the moon for the ripening of fruits, and so on. In all of that, they possess no independent power nor strength.

He sent to them the messengers, revealed the Books, and granted them intellects that distinguish between truth and falsehood, gratitude and ingratitude, wholesome things and vile things, and so on.

Thus, the human being has no power nor strength to abandon acts of disobedience. Were it not for the power and might of Allah—by what He granted the human being of intellect, then by sending the messengers and revealing the Books that contain the detailed exposition of wholesome things and vile things, indecencies, lessons and parables, promise and threat, reward, punishment, bliss, and Hellfire, and so on—the human being would give free rein to what his soul desires, with nothing to deter him from it, no power to restrain him from himself, no boundary at which he would stop, and so on. He would be like the rest of the animals, exactly as He *Exalted is He* said: *"And were it not for the favor of Allah upon you and His mercy, you would have followed Satan…"* **[al-Nisāʾ: 83]**; and: *"And were it not for the favor of Allah upon you and His mercy, none of you would ever have been purified…"* **[al-Nūr: 21]**.

[Explanation of His Saying, Exalted is He: *"And we would not have been guided had Allah not guided us"*]

The human being has no power and no capacity to attain guidance to the path of everlasting happiness in the Gardens of Bliss. Were it not for Allah's guidance *Exalted is He* to that path, he would go astray and perish in his misguidance. Allah *Exalted is He* reminded His believing servants of this blessing—the blessing of guidance—so that they might thank Him. He *Exalted is He* said: *"And remember the favor of Allah upon you—when you were enemies and He brought your hearts together, so you became, by His favor, brothers; and you were on the brink of a pit of Fire, and He saved you from it…"* **[Āl ʿImrān: 103]**.

[Explanation of His Saying, Exalted is He: *"And you do not will unless Allah wills..."*]

This verse, in meaning, is like the previous verse. The human being's will is limited; it cannot, on its own, reach the will of true faith, sound beliefs, and acting upon the laws of Islam that lead to everlasting happiness in the Gardens of Bliss and to safety from painful punishment. Were it not for Allah's will *Exalted is He* to send the messengers and reveal the Books to guide creation to that, people would be perplexed, go astray, and perish.

Thus, the human being's will for guidance is contingent upon Allah's will to send the messengers, reveal the Books, and clarify the religion and the laws. The people of Mecca and the people of Medina, before the Messenger *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*, was sent to them, had no power nor ability to will Islam and guidance. When Allah *Exalted is He* willed to send the Messenger *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* to them and to reveal guidance to them, they were then able to will guidance and to act upon the laws of Islam.

[Explanation of His Saying, Exalted is He: *"He leads astray whom He wills and guides whom He wills"*]

Its meaning is that Allah *Exalted is He* judges misguidance for whom He wills and judges guidance for whom He wills. He, *Mighty and Exalted*, does not judge misguidance for one who is morally responsible until He has clarified the proof for him and made the path clear. If he turns away after having clarified, understood, and become certain of it, Allah *Exalted is He* then judges him to be misguided and perishing—exactly as He *Exalted is He* said: *"And Allah would not lead a people astray after He has guided them until He makes clear to them what they should avoid"* **[al-Tawbah:115]**; and: *"So that he who perishes may perish upon clear evidence, and he who lives may live upon clear evidence"* **[al-Anfāl:42]**.

Allah *Exalted is He* further informed, by way of restriction and limitation, of what we have mentioned in His saying in Sūrat al-Baqarah: *"He leads many astray by it and guides many by it; and He does not lead astray by it except the defiantly disobedient—those who break Allah's covenant after its binding, sever what Allah has commanded to be joined, and spread corruption in the land"* **[al-Baqarah: 26–27]**. Thus, He *Exalted is He* informed that misguidance is restricted and confined to the defiantly disobedient transgressor who breaks Allah's covenant after having committed to it.

[Explanation of His Saying, Exalted is He: *"And if We had willed, We would have given every soul its guidance, but the word from Me has*

come to pass: I shall surely fill Hell with jinn and humans all together"]

If Allah, *Exalted is He* had willed to compel people to enter guidance by force and coercion, He would have brought them all into it, leaving no one unguided. But He *Exalted is He* wills that His servants be choosing freely. Thus, whoever wills—let him believe; and whoever wills—let him disbelieve. Whoever enters guidance and faith by his own choice and will, without coercion, deserves reward and honor in the Gardens of Bliss. And whoever turns away from guidance and chooses disbelief—after guidance has become clear to him—deserves punishment and humiliation in the Fire of Hell.

[An Overview of the Doctrine of Al-Mujbara]

To further clarify and explain the invalidity of the doctrine of Al-Mujbara and its contradiction of the religion of Islam, its laws, and its Book, we say: the doctrine of Al-Mujbara is built upon foundations, each of which aims to undermine an aspect of the religion of Islam. The following is a clarification of that:

1- Calling to the commission of crimes, major sins, and grave enormities.

This is manifested in what they narrate of the well-known ḥadīth—among them—which has become an accepted foundational principle. That ḥadīth is: "Whoever says: 'There is no god but Allah' will enter Paradise, even if he commits adultery and even if he steals…"[1]; and the ḥadīth: "My intercession is for the people of major sins from my community."[2]. Then there is their statement in the principles of their doctrine that everlasting residence in the Fire is exclusive to the disbelievers.

2- Among the foundations of their doctrine—without which, in their view, Islam and faith are not complete—is the belief, affirmation, and certainty that Allah *Exalted is He* alone undertakes the creation of acts of disobedience and their performance, apart from the servants; and that He *Exalted is He* wills them, intends them, decrees them, and ordains them without any involvement of the servant.

3- Committing crimes, major sins, immorality, and disobedience does not expel the servant from faith.

4- Among their accepted foundations is that loving the Family of

1- Muʿjam al-Shuyūkh al-Kabīr by al-Dhahabī (2/93). He then said: "Its chain is sound, firmly established in origin; al-Bukhārī and Muslim narrated it."

2- Muʿjam al-Shuyūkh by al-Subkī (1/314). He said: "al-Tirmidhī narrated it in al-Zuhd."

Muḥammad and loving ʿAlī *(Peace be Upon Him)* is rejectionism and heresy, while loving Muʿāwiyah is faith, and hating him is heresy—this despite the fact that they do not even raise their heads against cursing ʿAlī *(Peace be Upon Him)* and harboring hatred toward him.

These are some of the foundations of their doctrine. These four foundations have encompassed Islam and surrounded it from all sides, extinguishing its spirit and meaning. Through them they have achieved the utmost of what Satan desires: making sins seem trivial, clearing the way for criminals, and granting security to oppressors. Thus, let the oppressors do whatever they wish, act tyrannically, grow arrogant, and spread corruption, and so on—for the intercession of the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* is before them, and the protection of "*there is no god but Allah*" is with them. Their reputations are safeguarded, their dignity preserved, and their sanctity deemed great.

In the Hereafter they will enter Paradise through the intercession of the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*, and there is, according to them, no harm upon sinners—alongside "there is no god but Allah"—in neglecting obligations and other duties. Then, after demolishing the laws and obligations and facilitating the commission of crimes, they went further to demolish tawḥīd, justice, and wisdom through the foundations they established of superstitious doctrines and polytheistic delusions. By that they overthrew the religion of Islam, which is embodied in sound faith in Allah, righteous deeds, and piety.

[The Determinists and Their Stance toward the True Religion]

From their very first day, the determinists have known that the true religion is their greatest enemy and their most bitter adversary. Therefore, they rolled up their sleeves to wage war against the people of truth to the utmost degree, and they were not satisfied with that until they made this war part of the foundations of doctrine and a completion of Islam itself. The people of truth are the Family of Muḥammad *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*, and whoever surveys the books of history will find confirmation of what we have stated.

To fortify and guard their doctrine, they established among their foundations the invalidation of the proofs of reason and prohibited reliance upon them. They said that intellects do not distinguish between good and evil, corrupt and sound, or truth and falsehood; and that whatever distinction appears in intellects and among rational people occurs only due to familiarity and habit.

[Some of the Determinists' doubts and the Response to Them, with Clarifying the Meanings of Guidance]

Among what they adduce as evidence is His saying *Exalted is He*: *"Indeed, Allah does not guide the wrongdoing people."*

They said: the meaning is that Allah does not indicate guidance to them, does not admit them into it, and does not call them to it.

We say: it is known by the necessity of religion that Allah *Exalted is He* has called all disbelievers and others to faith in Him and to affirming His messengers—through what He sent to them of messengers and revealed of books. Allah *Exalted is He* said: *"As for Thamūd, We guided them, but they preferred blindness over guidance"* **[Fuṣṣilat: 17]**.

And He *Exalted is He* said: *"There is no nation but that a warner has passed among them"* **[Fāṭir: 24]**. And He *Exalted is He* said, relating their words: *"Did a warner not come to you? They said: Yes, indeed a warner came to us, but we denied..."* **[al-Mulk: 8–9]**, and other verses besides these.

Guidance (hudā) has several meanings in which it is used:

1- Calling to good, as in His saying *Exalted is He*: *"As for Thamūd, We guided them, but they preferred blindness over guidance"* **[Fuṣṣilat: 17]**.
2- Increase in insight, as in His saying *Exalted is He*: *"And those who are guided—He increases them in guidance"* **[Muḥammad: 17]**; and similarly His saying *Exalted is He*: *"If you are mindful of Allah, He will grant you a criterion"* **[al-Anfāl: 29]**, meaning insight and illumination. This guidance—meaning an increase in insight and illumination of the heart—the All-Wise *Exalted is He* grants as a reward to His allies, which they receive in this worldly life. Similar to this is what is narrated from the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*: "*Indeed, whoever renounces the world and shortens his hopes therein, Allah grants him knowledge without learning and guidance without seeking guidance. And whoever inclines toward the world and lengthens his hopes therein, Allah blinds his heart according to the extent of his inclination toward it.*"
3- Meaning reward, as in His saying *Exalted is He*: *"Indeed, those who believe and do righteous deeds—their Lord will guide them by their faith; rivers will flow beneath them in the Gardens of Bliss"* **[Yūnus: 9]**. That is, their Lord rewards them because of their faith. Upon this meaning also is His saying *Exalted is He*: *"Indeed, those who do not believe in the signs of Allah—Allah does not guide them"* **[al-Naḥl: 104]**, meaning: He does not reward them.
4- Meaning judgment and designation, as in the saying of the Arab

poet:

"*He continues to guide his people and to declare us misguided openly, and he ascribes us to the licentious.*"

That is, he judges his people to be guided and names them guided, and he judges us to be misguided and names us misguided.

When you know this, it becomes necessary to interpret guidance in the verses of the Qur'an in light of these meanings. It may be correct to interpret guidance in one verse with one meaning and in another verse with another meaning—each according to what the contextual indicators and the verse's context direct. A condition for the validity of this is that there be no contradiction with Allah's justice, wisdom, and the vastness of His mercy, nor anything that contradicts the definitive verses of the Qur'an or the proofs of reason. For the verses of the Qur'an do not contradict one another, nor does discrepancy enter them, as He *Exalted is He* said: *"Falsehood does not approach it from before it nor from behind it; a revelation from One Wise and Praiseworthy"* **[Fuṣṣilat]**; and He *Exalted is He* said: *"Had it been from other than Allah, they would have found in it much contradiction"* **[al-Nisā']**.

Likewise, definitive proofs do not contradict one another, nor does discrepancy enter them. The proofs of reason do not oppose the Qur'an, nor do they oppose one another.

From here, Allah *Exalted is He* addressed, in the Qur'an, the people of intellects and commanded them to return to their intellects so that, through them, they might recognize the truth of what the Qur'an has brought to them—such as in His saying: *"Will you not reason?"* and *"Will you not remember?"* This clearly indicates that what Allah *Exalted is He* has brought of the proofs of the Qur'an is supported by what Allah *Exalted is He* has implanted of the proofs of reason. To recognize this, it suffices to recall what Allah has implanted in the natural disposition of proofs.

His saying *Exalted is He*: *"And if We had willed, We would have given every soul its guidance…"* **[al-Sajdah: 13]**.

The intended meaning is: had We willed, We would have compelled every soul to guidance in a manner that would leave it unable to depart from guidance. But Allah *Exalted is He* does not will that, because it would nullify obligation.

For obligation entails reward and punishment, and reward and punishment occur only for voluntary actions—and this is clear.

[The Meanings of Misguidance]

Misguidance (ḍalāl), in the language of the Arabs, is used in different

meanings:

1- With the meaning of loss and perishing, as in His saying *Exalted is He*: *"Their striving is lost in the life of this world"* **[al-Kahf: 104]**; and His saying *Exalted is He*: *"And lost from them is what they used to fabricate"* — **[al-Anʿām: 24]**; and His saying *Exalted is He*: *"And they said: when we are lost in the earth..."* **[al-Sajdah: 10]**.
2- With the meaning of torment and punishment, as in His saying *Exalted is He*: *"Indeed, the criminals are in misguidance and in flames"* — **[al-Qamar]**; and His saying *Exalted is He*: *"Rather, those who do not believe in the Hereafter are in torment and far misguidance"* **[Sabaʾ]**.
3- With the meaning of going astray from the clear path, among which is His saying *Exalted is He*: *"And Pharaoh misled his people and did not guide"* **[Ṭā Hā]**.
4- Misleading (iḍlāl) may be with the meaning of judgment and designation, as in:
   "He continues to guide his people and to declare us misguided..."
5- Misguidance may be with the meaning of forgetting, as He *Exalted is He* said: *"lest one of them forget..."* **[al-Baqarah: 282]**.
6- And with the meaning of heedlessness, as in His saying *Exalted is He*: *"And He found you unaware, and He guided"* **[al-Ḍuḥā: 7]**.

When you know this, you can interpret what has come in the Qur'an of the like of: that Allah leads the wrongdoers astray, by what accords with the meanings mentioned.

It is not permissible to interpret that as leading astray from the path of truth, for Allah *Exalted is He* is Just and Wise and does not do that.

The determinists said regarding His saying *Exalted is He*: *"He leads astray whom He wills"* **[Fāṭir: 8]**; and His saying *Exalted is He*: *"And Allah leads the wrongdoers astray"* **[Ibrāhīm: 27]**; and the like, that it means: He causes them to go astray from the path of truth and admits them into misguidance.

We say: that is a deficiency that the Wise does not do, and it is an insult to Him *Exalted is He*, and a lowering of Him, *Mighty and Exalted*, from sanctity, and from justice and wisdom—along with what is in that of commending Iblīs and his soldiers, since they absolved Iblīs of misleading and leading astray, then attributed the act of Iblīs to their Lord, Mighty and Exalted. Glorified is He and Exalted greatly above what they say.

Allah *Exalted is He* said, relating the saying of Iblīs: *"He said: By Your might, I will surely mislead them all—except Your servants among them who are made sincere"* **[Ṣād]**.

[The Meanings of Deviation]

Deviation (ighwā'), in the language of the Arabs, comes for meanings:[1]

1- With the meaning of turning away from the clear path.
2- With the meaning of exhausting an animal; it is said: *aghwā al-faṣīl* (he caused the young camel to be exhausted) when he exhausted it by keeping it from water and milk.
3- With the meaning of judgment and designation.

Therefore, it is permissible to say regarding *Allah led the misguided astray* that it means: He judged them with deviation and named them by it when they deviated and went astray from the path of truth; or with the meaning that He exhausted them with punishment. It is not permissible to interpret it as meaning that Allah turned them away from the path of truth and admitted them into deviation and misguidance, because that would be an insult to Allah *Exalted is He* and a commendation of Iblīs, as has preceded.

[The Meanings of Fitnah]

Fitnah, in the language, comes for meanings:

1- With the meaning of testing, as in His saying *Exalted is He*: *"And We certainly tested those before them, so Allah will surely make evident those who are truthful, and He will surely make evident the liars"* **[al-ʿAnkabūt]**, meaning: We tested them.
2- With the meaning of hardship and trial, as in the ḥadīth: "*After me there will come trials resembling one another like pieces of the dark night. The believers will think they are perishing in them, then Allah will remove them from us, the People of the House*." The intent here is hardships, trials, and terrors.
3- With the meaning of misleading and leading astray from the path of

1- Among that is what was mentioned in *Lisān al-ʿArab*. It said under: "al-ghayy is misguidance and disappointment. Ibn al-Aʿrābī: al-ghayy is corruption. Ibn Barrī said: ghawn is the active participle from ghawiya, not from ghawā; likewise ghawiyy. Its counterpart is rashada, so he is rāshid; and rashida, so he is rashīd. It is said: the man ghawā—he failed; and another caused him to be misled. And His saying, *Mighty and Majestic*: *'And Adam disobeyed his Lord, so he went astray'*, meaning: his living became corrupted. It was said: al-ghawwah and al-ghayyah are one. And it was said: ghawā, meaning: he left the prohibition and ate from the tree. And land that is maghwāh: a place of going astray. And the young camel and the kid goat ghawiya—its belly was upset from milk; and it was said: it is that it is prevented from suckling so it does not drink until it becomes emaciated and hunger harms it, its state worsens and it dies from emaciation or nearly perishes. And al-ghawā: indigestion; and it is said: thirst. And in the rarities of the Bedouins it is said: I spent the night mughwā, and ghawwā, and ghawiyyan, and qāwiyan, and qawwā, and qawiyyan, if I spent the night alone and desolate. And it is said: I saw him ghawiyyan from hunger, and qawiyyan, and ḍawiyyan, and ṭawiyyan, when he was hungry." (abridged).

truth, as in His saying *Exalted is He*: *"You are not, by it, able to tempt anyone—except one who will burn in Hell"* **[al-Ṣāffāt]**, meaning: you are not able to mislead except one who is among the people of misguidance.

4- With the meaning of torment, as He *Exalted is He* said: *"The Day they will be tried upon the Fire"* **[al-Dhāriyāt:13]**, meaning: they will be punished.

Thus, it is permissible to say: Allah tested the morally responsible, meaning He tested them with obligations and hardships; and it is said: Allah *Exalted is He* tries the criminals, meaning He punishes them for their sins.

It is not permissible to say that its meaning is that Allah *Exalted is He* admits them into misguidance and deviation, because that would be dispraise of Allah *Exalted is He* and a commendation of Iblīs and his soldiers.

The determinists say regarding that: Allah *Exalted is He* admits them into fitnah, misguidance, and deviation, and they have made these verses that we mentioned and explained evidence for their doctrine.

Know that these verses that we have mentioned are among the ambiguous verses (mutashābihāt).

It is appropriate that we explain the ambiguous that Allah *Exalted is He* mentioned in His saying: *"In it are verses that are decisive,they are the foundation of the Book, and others that are ambiguous. As for those in whose hearts is deviation, they follow what is ambiguous of it"* **[Āl ʿImrān:7]**.

So, we say: a verse may be among the ambiguous because of the presence of a word in it that can bear several different meanings, and because of that the intended meaning becomes unclear to the one who looks. This is as has preceded in the verses we mentioned: for guidance, misguidance, deviation, and fitnah—each word of them can bear several different, mutually contradictory meanings. This meaning that we have mentioned in explaining the ambiguous accords with the derivation of the term "ambiguous," for "mutashābih" and "tashābuh" are forms placed in the language to denote shared participation in the meaning of an action between two or more. Hence, when a word bears several different meanings, it deserves the name "tashābuh," meaning that the meanings the word bears are mutually comparable in the correctness of applying the word to them.

[Testing and Trial]

It has previously been mentioned that fitnah comes with the meaning of testing and trial in His saying *Exalted is He*: *"And We certainly tested*

those before them, so Allah will surely make evident those who are truthful, and He will surely make evident the liars" **[al-ʿAnkabūt]**. It is therefore appropriate here to clarify the meaning of testing and trial that issue from Allah *Exalted is He*. ***So we say***: Allah *Exalted is He* knows the treachery of the eyes and what the breasts conceal; He is aware of the hidden matters of the unseen. Neither the weak in faith nor the strong in faith, nor the false claimant to faith, is concealed from Him. Yet His wisdom *Exalted is He* has required that He not recompense except for outward deeds, not for His knowledge.

Therefore, He *Exalted is He* wills that the deeds of His servants become manifest, so that each one of them is distinguished and known from the other by what appears of his deed, which expresses the truthfulness of faith or its falsity, and which is a truthful translation of what the conscience conceals of sincerity or the lack of it.

Thus, Allah *Exalted is He* likened the obligations and hardships with which He burdens His servants—through which the truthful and the liar are exposed, and by which the believer and the hypocrite are distinguished—He *Exalted is He* likened His act in that to the act of one who tests while being ignorant of the true reality. Therefore Allah *Exalted is He* called it "testing," since, in outward form, it resembles the act of one who tests.

In the same manner is interpreted what is of this kind, such as His saying *Exalted is He*: *"Then We raised them up so that We might know which of the two parties had best calculated the time they had remained"* **[al-Kahf]**, meaning: so that there appears in existence, as an actual manifestation, what Allah *Exalted is He* already knew of the answer to the question mentioned in the verse.

[Stamping and Sealing]

Stamping (*al-Tab'*) and sealing (*al-Khatm*), mentioned in the Qur'an, in the language of the Arabs, revolve between:

1- ***The mark***; it is said: he stamped a thing and sealed it when he placed a mark upon it.
2- ***Covering***; it is said: he stamped the vessel and sealed it when he covered it.

When you know this, it is not permissible to say that the meaning of His saying *Exalted is He*: *"Allah has sealed their hearts"* **[al-Baqarah: 7]** and the like is that He covered them and prevented faith from reaching them, because that would conflict with moral responsibility (taklīf). Thus it would not be valid to obligate one whose heart is sealed, for it would then be among obligating what is beyond capacity. Allah *Exalted is He* has said: *"Allah does not burden a soul except with what it can bear"* **[al-**

Baqarah: 286]; and: *"Allah does not burden a soul except with what He has given it"* **[al-Ṭalāq: 7]**; and: *"So be mindful of Allah as much as you are able"* **[al-Taghābun: 16]**.

One whose heart is sealed is not able to believe, nor is he able to be mindful; and obligating that in such a case is ugly, and Allah is Most High above doing what is ugly.

The determinists opposed this and said that Allah covered the hearts of the disbelievers and prevented faith from reaching them.

We say in response—beyond what has preceded—that Allah *Exalted is He* commanded the disbelievers and forbade them; and if their hearts were as the determinists claim, He would not have commanded them nor forbidden them. For addressing one who does not understand is a deficiency from which He must be declared free.

Some of the people of justice said: the stamping and sealing from Allah *Exalted is He* is that He places, in the hearts of disbelievers and immoral sinners, a black spot by which they are distinguished for the angels.

This is the opposite of the believer, for Allah *Exalted is He* places in his heart a white spot.

The Commander of the Faithful *(Peace be Upon Him)* said: "Faith begins as a small whiteness; whenever faith increases, the whiteness increases."

It was answered that the deeds of the disbelievers and immoral sinners are clearer than that; and that the angels—*may the blessings of Allah be upon them*—do not see what clothing conceals of nakedness, as has been narrated from the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* that they lower their gaze at the time of relieving oneself.

And what is narrated from ʿAlī *(Peace be Upon Him)* is a metaphor intended to mean illumination and insight.

Yes—what is foremost regarding stamping and sealing is to say: stamping and sealing in such as His saying *Exalted is He*: *"Allah has sealed their hearts..."* **[al-Baqarah: 7]** has come by way of allusion (kināyah), which is more emphatic than explicit statement. The intended meaning then is to inform about the disbelievers that they have reached, in heedlessness, turning away, obstinacy, and abandoning reflection and listening to the verses of Allah, the utmost limit and final extremity. This utmost limit and final extremity that the disbelievers have reached of turning away, heedlessness, and so on—Allah has depicted it for us with the most eloquent, clearest, and most complete depiction, by mentioning

sealing and stamping. For the listener does not fully conceive the extremity of heedlessness, the greatness of turning away, and obstinacy at its farthest limits except in the case of one whose heart is sealed and stamped—whose sealing and stamping have become so firm that understanding and perception are not conceived of from him.

Allah *Exalted is He* informed of this meaning that we have mentioned with another style in His saying *Exalted is He*: *"And the example of those who disbelieve is like one who shouts to what hears nothing except a call and a cry—deaf, dumb, blind—so they do not reason"* **[al-Baqarah]**. Allah *Exalted is He* likened the disbelievers to cattle that hear only mere sounds without understanding what is said to them. Then He *Exalted is He* described them as deaf who do not hear, blind who do not see, and dumb who do not speak, and finally He said: *"so they do not reason."* All of this is intended as a depiction of what we have mentioned of the intensity of turning away and heedlessness, and so on.

The Creator *Exalted is He* did not intend thereby to inform that they are deaf in reality, blind in reality, dumb in reality, and without intellect in reality. For it is known that they had sight and hearing: they saw the verses of Allah and heard them; and they possessed tongues and eloquence. In this last verse there is evidence for what we have mentioned regarding the interpretation of the verse of sealing.

[Why Were Sealing and Stamping Ascribed to Allah?]

If it is said: why were sealing and stamping ascribed to Allah?

We say: ascribing that to Allah increases the strength of the allusion to the intended meaning that we have mentioned.

Furthermore, among what strengthens the meaning we have mentioned is His saying *Exalted is He* about the disbelievers and their turning away from listening to the verses and reflecting upon them: *"And they said: Our hearts are within coverings from what you call us to, and in our ears is deafness, and between us and you is a veil—so act; indeed, we are acting"* **[Fuṣṣilat]**. For when the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* called them to Islam and repeated the call to them, they wanted to convince the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* with an answer that was decisive, after which he would not hope for their faith nor have any expectation of their Islam. So they said: our hearts are covered and veiled with coverings, so what you call us to of your religion does not reach them; and our ears are blocked by heaviness, so we do not hear the sound of your call; and between us and you is a veil that prevents us from what you call to. So you and your affair—for we are persistent upon what we are upon of polytheism, and we are doing its deeds, not departing from that.

There is no doubt that they did not intend thereby to inform that their hearts are covered in reality and that their ears are blocked such that sounds do not penetrate them, and so on.

And in the manner of what we have mentioned of interpretation is interpreted His saying *Exalted is He*: *"And over their eyes is a covering"* **[al-Baqarah: 7]** and the like. All of that is an allusion to the meaning we have mentioned.

[Adorning]

Adorning (*tazyīn*) in the language means beautifying.

The people of justice said: Allah *Exalted is He* does not adorn acts of disobedience for His servants nor beautify them for them, because adorning and beautifying them is ugly, and Allah is Most High above doing what is ugly.

The determinists said: Allah *Exalted is He* adorns acts of disobedience for the disobedient and beautifies them for them.

We say: adorning acts of disobedience has different aspects with differing rulings

1- From the aspect of the soul's inclination, natural disposition, and desire, there is no doubt that every morally responsible person finds within himself that inner inclination and the love of falling into acts of disobedience. Were it not for the deterrents of the Most Merciful and His threat, then His enablement and rectitude, nearly all people would fall into acts of disobedience. From this aspect, there is no objection to ascribing adornment to the Creator, *Mighty and Exalted*. From here came His saying *Exalted is He*: *"Beautified for people is the love of desires—of women, children, heaped-up treasures of gold and silver, fine branded horses, cattle, and tilled land…"* **[Āl ʿImrān: 14]**. For Allah, *Glorified and Exalted*, is the One who stamped people upon that nature and originated them upon it—while at the same time He *Exalted is He* originated people upon finding vile things and indecencies repugnant, denouncing them, and recoiling from them.

2- There is no doubt that Allah *Exalted is He* has encouraged His servants toward acts of obedience by what He has made of multiplied reward, abundant recompense, and a good end. From this aspect, it is not permissible to say that Allah *Exalted is He* adorned acts of disobedience for His servants, meaning that He *Exalted is He* encouraged them toward them and called them to them, like His encouragement toward acts of obedience and His call to them.

3- The first aspect is from the angle of adorning disobedience in the

presence of desire. Here there is another aspect: adorning disobedience in the presence of reason. Adorning disobedience in the presence of reason is not something that occurs. That is because Allah *Exalted is He* originated the intellects of the morally responsible upon one nature, whose judgments do not differ. Every rational person judges, by the natural disposition of his intellect, that one is half of two, and that the whole is greater than the part, and so on. Every rational person, by the mere judgment of his intellect, loathes injustice and oppressors and loves justice and the just, and so on.

From this aspect, it is not permissible to say that Allah *Exalted is He* adorned acts of disobedience for the disobedient, because that would contradict reality. Indeed, all disobedient people are only overcome from the side of whims and desires, according to the texts of the Qur'an, as in His saying *Exalted is He*: *"They follow nothing but conjecture and what the souls desire"* **[al-Najm: 23]**; and His saying *Exalted is He*: *"Have you seen the one who has taken his desire as his god…"* **[al-Furqān: 43]**.

[Interpreting the Verses of Adorning]

His saying *Exalted is He*: *"Is he whose evil deed has been made fair to him so he sees it as good…"* **[Fāṭir: 8]**.

The meaning is that those immersed in acts of disobedience have had desires dominate them and whims overcome them. Therefore, they look at their deeds only with the eye of whim and desire. Whatever accords with their whims and desires they deem good, and it becomes marketable among them; and whatever opposes that they recoil from, and it becomes unsought among them.

The proof of what we have mentioned is that Allah *Exalted is He* described the disbelievers and hypocrites as deaf, dumb, blind—without understanding. That is only because of what we have mentioned of the domination of desires and whims over their senses, feelings, and intellects until they became like cattle, concerned with nothing but satisfying their desires and attaining their pleasures. From here He *Exalted is He* said: *"They have hearts with which they do not understand, and they have eyes with which they do not see, and they have ears with which they do not hear. Those are like cattle—rather, they are more astray. Those are the heedless"* **[al-Aʿrāf]**. Thus, the one who adorned for them evil deeds is the desires of the soul that commands evil and its whims, not the innate dispositions of intellects.

For further clarification, we say: within the soul of every morally responsible person are two motives:

1- The motive of desire.

2- The motive of reason.

As for the motive of desire: it calls to doing everything the soul desires and longs for of foods, drinks, sexual relations, domination, and so on. The soul deems all of that good, inclines toward it, and longs for it. In attaining its desires, the soul does not regard any law or divine ordinance. This is the motive of the soul that commands evil and the action upon which it is fashioned.

Alongside this motive is another motive: the motive of reason and wisdom, whose function is to call to abandoning what the soul calls to of vices, low traits, and vile things, and so on.

Among its functions is reflecting upon outcomes, calling to caution and abandoning deception, and to doing what earns a person dignity, safety, honor, elevation, purity, and perfection, and so on.

What we have mentioned regarding these two motives we have taken from His saying *Exalted is He*: *"And [by] a soul and the One who proportioned it, then inspired it with its wickedness and its piety, successful is the one who purifies it, and failed is the one who corrupts it"* **[al-Shams]**.

Thus, if a person responds and submits to the motive of desire, the motive of reason weakens, and the weakness increases as submission to desire increases, until desire dominates the person. At that point, reason has no authority; its role may even end entirely, and its possessor becomes as Allah *Exalted is He* related: *"Deaf, dumb, blind—so they do not reason"* **[al-Baqarah]**.

If a person responds to the motive of reason and wisdom and submits to it, the motive of desire weakens. The more a person increases in responding and submitting to the motive of wisdom, the more the motive of desire weakens.

Allah *Exalted is He* has charged His servants with striving against the soul and suppressing its whims. Allah *Exalted is He* says: *"As for the one who feared standing before his Lord and restrained the soul from desire, then indeed Paradise is the refuge"* **[al-Nāziʿāt]**.

And the Messenger of Allah *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* named struggling against whims and desires, restraining them, and overcoming them as the greater jihad, in his *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* saying: "*We have returned from the lesser jihad to the greater jihad*."[1]

1- *al-Iʿtibār wa Salwat al-ʿĀrifīn* p. 575; *al-Uṣūl al-Thamāniyah* by Imām Muḥammad ibn al-Qāsim al-Rassī p. 68; *al-Kashshāf* by al-Zamakhsharī (3/173); *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah* (10/54); *al-Zuhd* by al-Bayhaqī p. 165; and so on.

Among what the determinists cite as evidence for their statement is His saying *Exalted is He*: *"Thus We have adorned for every nation their deeds..."* — **[al-Anʿām: 108]**.

So, we say: the meaning is that Allah *Exalted is He* adorned for every nation—upon the tongues of the messengers sent to them—His obediences, His acts of worship, and His piety, for which Allah *Exalted is He* created them. Thus Allah *Exalted is He* adorned that for them and encouraged them toward it by what He has made of great reward, abundant recompense, and a good end in this world and the Hereafter, in addition to the great benefits that acts of obedience contain in this worldly life.

As for acts of disobedience, they arise from the soul's enticement toward what it desires and from Satan's adorning—exactly as He *Exalted is He* said: *"And when Satan adorned their deeds for them"* **[al-Anfāl: 48]**; and He *Exalted is He* said in what He related: *"Rather, your souls have enticed you to a matter; so patience is beautiful"* **[Yūsuf: 18]**; and He *Exalted is He* said: *"Then his soul prompted him to kill his brother..."* **[al-Mā'idah: 30]**.

[The Meanings of Qaḍā']

Qaḍā', in the language, carries several meanings, among them:

1- Creation, as in His saying *Exalted is He*: *"So He completed them as seven heavens in two days"* **[Fuṣṣilat:12]**.
And from it is the saying of Abū Dhu'ayb:

And on them are two riveted (armors),
Made by Dawud, or crafted by Tubba', the maker of broad armors. [1]

2- With the meaning of obligation and judgment, as in His saying *Exalted is He*: *"And your Lord has decreed that you worship none but Him"* **[al-Isrā':23]**. And from that is: the judge decreed such-and-such, meaning he judged and obligated.
3- With the meaning of informing and concluding, as in His saying *Exalted is He*: *"And We conveyed to him that matter"* **[al-Ḥijr: 66]**.
4- With the meaning of finishing, as in the saying of a speaker: "I have fulfilled my need," meaning: I have finished.
5- With the meaning of payment; you say: "I paid my debt."
1- It may also come for other than that, such as their saying: "he fulfilled his vow," meaning: he died; and "he struck him and finished him," meaning: he killed him, and so on.

1- This is the poetic verse describing two famous Arabian, which are two armors of Dawud (Prophet David). The meaning: the two armors are riveted (made of interconnected iron rings) in the form of rads (long and straight), either Dawud himself made them, or the maker is Tubba' (a king of Yemen) who used to made sabatgh (large and wide armor).

When you know this, it is permissible to say that Allah *Exalted is He* decreed the acts of obedience in the sense of obligating them and judging their obligatoriness, not in the sense of creating them—contrary to the determinists, for they said that it means creating them.

Likewise, they say regarding acts of disobedience that Allah *Exalted is He* decreed them in the sense of creating them.

The response to them is taken from what has preceded; and we add to that by saying: if Allah *Exalted is He* were the One who undertook the creation of acts of obedience and disobedience, apart from the servants, then He would not have commanded nor forbidden, nor would He have encouraged with great reward and threatened with painful punishment.

[The Meanings of Qadar]

Qadar has several meanings, among them:

1- Perfection and precision, as in His saying *Exalted is He*: *"Indeed, We have created everything with a measure"* **[al-Qamar:49]**; and His saying *Exalted is He*: *"And He created everything and measured it with precise measuring"* **[al-Furqān]**.
2- Magnification, as in His saying *Exalted is He*: *"And they did not measure Allah with the due measure of Him"* **[al-Anʿām:91]**, meaning: they did not magnify Him with due magnification. It is said in *al-Ṣiḥāḥ* that qadar and qadr are one meaning.
3- With the meaning of knowledge, as in His saying *Exalted is He*: *"But He sends down in measure what He wills"* **[al-Shūrā:27]**, meaning: with knowledge; and it is permissible that the meaning be: with a measuring from Him *Exalted is He*.
4- With the meaning of amount, as in His saying *Exalted is He*: *"So valleys flowed according to their measure"* **[al-Raʿd:17]**, meaning: according to their amount.
5- With the meaning of informing, as al-ʿAjjāj said:

"And know that the Possessor of Majesty has already decreed
in the former pages that were inscribed."

6- With the meaning of term, as He *Exalted is He* said: *"Then We placed it in a secure resting place until a known term"* **[al-Mursalāt]**.
7- With the meaning of inevitability, as He, *Glorified and Exalted*, said: *"And the matter of Allah has ever been a decreed decree"* **[al-Aḥzāb]**.

Based on this, it is said: acts of obedience are by Allah's qadar, meaning His making them inevitable and His obligating them. It is not permissible to say that this means that He *Exalted is He* created them.

The determinists said that it means creating them, and likewise they said regarding acts of disobedience that they are by Allah's qadar.

The response to them is taken from what has preceded.

The intensified form "*qaddar*" comes with meanings, among them:

1- With the meaning of creating, as in His saying *Exalted is He*: *"And He measured therein its provisions"* **[Fuṣṣilat: 10]**, meaning: He created them.
2- With the meaning of perfecting, as in His saying *Exalted is He*: *"And He created everything and measured it with precise measuring"* **[al-Furqān]**, meaning: He perfected it with perfection.
3- With the meaning of determining; it is said: the judge determined the maintenance of the wife and the relative.
4- With the meaning of measuring; it is said: I measured this garment against that one, meaning: I measured it by it and made it like it.
5- With the meaning of prescribing; it is said: "determine whatever you wish," meaning: prescribe and obligate whatever you wish.

Based on this, it is said: Allah *Exalted is He* determined obedience in the sense that He prescribed it and obligated it, and He determined disobedience in the sense that He clarified it and made it clear.

It is not permissible to say that it is in the sense of creating—contrary to the determinists—and the response to them is taken from what we have already set forth.

[The Ḥadīth of Jābir Regarding Qadar]

It is narrated from Jābir that he said: the Messenger of Allah *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* said: "A *servant does not truly believe until he believes in qadar—its good and its evil—and until he knows that what afflicted him was not going to miss him, and what missed him was not going to afflict him*." It has been narrated with a similar wording. The determinists use this as evidence for the doctrine of compulsion.

We say: what is intended by the ḥadīth is close to what came in the verse of al-Ḥadīd: *"No calamity befalls in the earth nor in yourselves except that it is in a Book before We bring it into being. Indeed that is easy for Allah—so that you do not grieve over what has escaped you, nor exult over what He has given you"* **[al-Ḥadīd: 22–23]**. And close to that is His saying *Exalted is He*: *"And We will surely test you with something of fear and hunger and a loss of wealth and lives and fruits; and give glad tidings to the patient"* **[al-Baqarah]**.

All of that is intended to refer to what Allah, *Glorified and Exalted*, decrees and measures of fertility and drought, health and illness, wealth and poverty, security and fear, life and death, and the like—matters for which servants have no way or means to procure or to repel. As for the

disobediences of servants and their actions, they are not from the qadar mentioned in the ḥadīth, nor from what the verse of **[al-Ḥadīd]** mentioned. That is because the texts of the Qur'an attribute the acts of servants to them—both obediences and disobediences—along with the consensus of the nation upon attributing them to the servants, including the determinists.

Had the matter been as the determinists claim, the nation would not have unanimously agreed upon what contradicts faith, nor would that have come in the texts of the Qur'an.

Moreover, there is no indication in what they mention for what they claim. For the ḥadīth narrated by Jābir speaks about what afflicts a person or misses him, not about what a person does; thus, there is no mention of it in the ḥadīth.

The meaning of the ḥadīth is the obligation of believing that what descends upon a person of disliked things, harms, and trials issues from Allah's decree, *Glorified and Exalted*, with no stratagem by which to repel it; and that what misses him of worldly benefits also issues from a decree from Allah *Exalted is He*. As for acts of disobedience and acts of obedience, they do not afflict a person; rather, the person is the one who afflicts them—he does them and brings them about.

What we have mentioned is made yet clearer by the fact that acts of obedience and disobedience are not called "calamities" with respect to their doer, and that what is legislated is rejoicing at performing obediences and remorse and regret at performing disobediences.

Contrary to what afflicts a person of harms or what escapes him of benefits, for it is not legislated to grieve and sorrow due to what has descended of affliction and what has escaped of benefits, nor is it commendable to exult over what a person has attained of benefits— all of that due to His saying *Exalted is He*: *"So that you do not grieve over what has escaped you, nor exult over what He has given you"* **[al-Ḥadīd:23]**.

And due to the consensus upon the obligation of being content with what Allah *Exalted is He* has decreed and measured. And in the ḥadīth: "*Whoever is not content with My decree, and does not endure My trial, and does not thank My blessings, then let him take a lord other than Me*."

And it is undisputed that it is not permissible to be content with acts of disobedience, vile deeds, and indecencies.

[The Qadariyyah and Who They Are]

It is authentically reported from the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* that he said: "*The Qadariyyah are the Magians of this nation.*" There is no disagreement among the nation

regarding its authenticity. Yet after agreeing upon its authenticity, they differed as to who is intended by that blameworthy name.

All of the people of justice said: those whom the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* intended by that description are those who say that all the acts of servants—good and evil—occur only by Allah's decree, measurement, will, volition, and creation, and these are the determinists.

And the determinists, in all their groups, said: what is intended by that is those who say that the acts of servants occur by their own wills and volitions, and that they are the ones who do them and bring them about apart from the Creator, *Mighty and Exalted*; and these are the people of justice.

Thus, the groups of Muslims exchanged that description: each group disavows it and hurls it at its opponents, and each insists upon what it says.

The people of justice argued for their position by saying that the name "Qadariyyah" that came in the ḥadīths is ascribed to qadar with the yā' of attribution, and the determinists frequently mention qadar and continually speak of it, so they are more deserving of that attribution. For one who repeatedly mentions a thing is ascribed to it, just as it is said: *umūrī* for one who says that the attributes are "matters" additional to the essence, and *ṭabʿī* for one who frequently mentions ṭabʿ.

Also, the determinists affirm qadar, so they are more deserving of the name "Qadariyyah" than one who denies it.

The people of justice do not frequently mention qadar, nor do they affirm it; rather, they deny it. Thus it is not valid to call them Qadariyyah for that reason.

The determinists argued that the people of justice are the Qadariyyah because they deny qadar and because they affirm for the servant an ability; therefore they are Qadariyyah.

The response is that attribution is only from affirmation, not from negation. Otherwise, it would be valid for us to call the monotheist a dualist, because he denies a second alongside Allah; and to call the polytheist a ḥanīf Muslim, because he denies ḥanīfiyyah and Islam, and so on.

And the attribution to the servant's ability which the people of justice affirm is *qadarī* with a ḍammah on the qāf, whereas the term "Qadariyyah" that came in the narration is ascribed to qadar with a fatḥah on the qāf. Thus al-qudrah (ability) and al-qadar (decree/measure) are two different nouns.

This is the proof of the determinists for their claim, and it is, as you see, far from even being a *doubt* or *objection*. However, the Umayyad rulers straightened it with their swords and empowered it with their authority. They used to rule that whoever openly professed the doctrine of justice be killed, on the pretext that he was "Qadarī." Al-Ḥākim narrated in *al-Safīnah* from Yūnus that he said: "The name 'qadar' used to be a name for us, then the Muʿtazilah nicknamed us with it, and the ruler aided us in that. So they called us by a name worse than that, namely 'the determinists.'"[1]

This being so, many ḥadīths have come in dispraise of the Qadariyyah, mentioned by the commentator of *al-Asās*. Among them is his *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* saying: "*Two groups from my community are not reached by my intercession: the Qadariyyah and the Murjiʾah*." He was asked: and who are the Qadariyyah? He said: "*A people who commit acts of disobedience and say: Allah decreed them upon us*." He was asked: and who are the Murjiʾah? He said: "*Those who say: faith is speech without action*."[2]

Among them is his *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* saying: "*At the end of times there will be a people who commit acts of disobedience and then say: this is by Allah's decree and measure. The one who refutes them is like one who unsheathes his sword in the path of Allah.*"[3]

[Section: On Indicating that Allah is Just and Wise]

The Ḥashwiyyah, who are a faction among the determinists, ***and some of the determinists said***: Allah, *Glorified and Exalted*, punishes the children of the polytheists in the Fire of Hell. They may cite narrations from the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* as evidence.

They may also argue that such children are buried in the graveyards of the polytheists, are taken captive, and the funeral prayer is not

1- This was mentioned in *ʿIddat al-Akyās* (1/345). In its margin: al-Ḥākim is Muḥsin ibn Muḥammad ibn Karāmah al-Bayhaqī al-Jushamī, ascribed to Jusham; he is the shaykh of al-Zamakhsharī, and among his books is *al-Safīnah*. As for Yūnus, he is Yūnus ibn Ḥabīb al-Ḍabbī by walāʾ, Abū ʿAbd al-Raḥmān, known as "the grammarian," a leading authority in literature; he was the imām of the grammarians of Baṣrah in his era. Sībawayh, al-Kisāʾī, al-Farrāʾ and others learned from him. (abridged).

2- This narration with this wording is found in *Lawāmiʿ al-Anwār* (1/450) quoting from *al-Shāfī*, and in *Majmaʿ al-Zawāʾid* (7/206), nos. (11885, 11886, 11887, 11888) without mentioning the explination of the Murjiʾah and the Qadariyyah.

3- This narration with this wording is found in *Lawāmiʿ al-Anwār* (1/450) quoting from *al-Shāfī*, and in *al-Islām Īmān wa ʿAmal* by al-Sayyid Sābiq (1/64), and in *Mutashābih al-Qurʾān* by Ibn Shahr Āshūb (1/258).

performed over them. They said: this is, from Allah *Exalted is He*, a good act and justice, and He is not unjust in it—because He *Exalted is He* is a Lord and Owner, who does in His dominion whatever He wills; or because He is not commanded nor forbidden. Based on that, it is for Him to punish His allies and reward His enemies; and it is for Him to create in Hell a servant whom He punishes therein forever and ever, without any sin having preceded.

The explicit import of their doctrine is that Allah *Exalted is He* punishes the wretched in Hell and makes them abide therein eternally without any sin they committed. Upon this, the determinists' calling of the Creator *Exalted is He* "Just and Wise" is a naming empty of meaning.

The response is that what the determinists mention is an insult to Allah *Exalted is He*, for they ascribed to Him what does not befit His majesty.

Moreover, the clear texts of the Qur'an refute them. He *Exalted is He* said: *"Indeed, Allah does not wrong the people at all, but the people wrong themselves"* **[Yūnus]**; and: *"Indeed, Allah does not wrong even the weight of an atom; and if it is a good deed, He multiplies it and gives from Himself a tremendous reward"* **[al-Nisā']**; and: *"And no bearer of burdens bears the burden of another; and We would not punish until We send a messenger"* **[al-Isrā']**.

The Qur'an is Arabic, revealed to the Arabs in their Arabic language, and they understood the meaning of *injustice* and *justice*. There is no doubt that what the determinists mention contradicts what the Arabs understand by the meanings of *injustice* and *justice*.

Allah *Exalted is He* has detailed, clarified, and made perfectly clear the meaning of what He praised Himself by negating from Himself. He *Exalted is He* said: *"So whoever does the weight of an atom of good will see it, and whoever does the weight of an atom of evil will see it."* **[az-Zalzala]**. And He *Exalted is He* said: *"And if there is the weight of a mustard seed, We will bring it, and sufficient are We as Reckoners"* **[al-Anbiyā']**.

And He *Exalted is He* informed of what will occur on the Day of Reckoning: the testimony of witnesses, the testimony of limbs and organs, the scribes and the books, the heaviness and lightness of the scales, and so on. In that is a clarification—unhidden—of what Allah *Exalted is He* praised Himself with of justice and the negation of injustice from Himself.

And He *Exalted is He* said, after mentioning warning and proofs upon the tongues of His messengers—*may the blessings of Allah be upon them*: *"So that there will not be for people against Allah an argument after the messengers"* **[al-Nisā': 165]**.

Had the matter been as the Ḥashwiyyah and some determinists claim, then the children who are punished in the Fire would have the greatest argument against their Lord.

[The Wisdom in Creating the Morally Responsible]

Allah, *Glorious is His Majesty*, has clarified the wisdom in creating the morally responsible. He *Exalted is He* said: *"And I did not create the jinn and mankind except that they may worship Me"* **[al-Dhāriyāt]**. And worship is the path to attaining abundant reward and lofty ranks in the Gardens of Bliss. Based on this, the wisdom in creating the morally responsible is exposing them to that tremendous good and lofty ranks. This is Allah's grace, *Mighty and Exalted*, and His beneficence and mercy.

As for Allah's *Exalted is He* creation of the rest of the creatures that do not possess intellect, they almost all share two matters:

1- The benefit of those legally responsible (the morally accountable) from them in the affairs of their lives; due to His saying *Exalted is He*: *"He it is Who created for you all that is on the earth ..."* **[al-Baqarah: 29]**.
2- Manifesting the greatness of the Creator *Exalted is He*, His wisdom, and the signs of His knowledge and power.

There are secrets of wisdoms and interests dispersed throughout created beings; among them are those whose wisdom is manifest, and among them are those in which there is some hiddenness.

It is obligatory for the legally responsible person to believe that in the creation of every created thing there is a wisdom, even if its aspect does not become apparent to him, for it has been established that Allah *Exalted is He* is All-Knowing and All-Wise, and the All-Knowing, All-Wise does not do that in which there is no wisdom.

The determinists (al-Mujabbirah) said: Rather, Allah *Exalted is He* created some of those legally responsible in order to admit them into Paradise, and He created others to admit them into the Fire. They cited His saying *Exalted is He*: *"And We have indeed created for Hell many of the jinn and humankind"* **[al-Aʿrāf: 179]**.

The answer is what we previously presented from His saying *Exalted is He*: *"And I did not create the jinn and humankind except that they may worship Me"* **[al-Dhāriyāt]**, that is: that they may obey Me and worship Me.

Moreover, Allah's *Exalted is He* obligating the legally responsible to worship and obey in His revealed Books, and upon the tongues of His messengers and the bearers of knowledge, is proof of the invalidity of the claim of the determinists.

The lām in the verse by which they argue for what they have adopted

is called lām al-ʿāqibah (the lām of consequence), and it is like the lām in His saying *Exalted is He*: *"Then the people of Pharaoh picked him up so that he would become for them an enemy and a grief"* **[al-Qaṣaṣ: 8]**.

What is preferable is that the lām be taken upon its original meaning of causation, and that what is intended by al-dharʾ (bringing forth) be the second bringing forth. In this manner the verse was explained by the two Imams, al-Qāsim and al-Hādī *(Peace be Upon Them)*. The second bringing forth is the bringing forth in the graves. With this interpretation, the verses of the Qur'an are harmonized and its verses are preserved from contradiction and discrepancy—unlike the interpretation of the determinists, for it contradicts His saying *Exalted is He*: *"And I did not create the jinn and humankind except that they may worship Me"* **[al-Dhāriyāt]**.

There is no disagreement among the Muslims that the Qur'an is free from contradiction and discrepancy: *"Falsehood does not come to it from before it nor from behind it"* **[Fussilat:42]**, and: *"Had it been from other than Allah, they would have found within it much discrepancy"* **[al-Nisāʾ]**.

[Pain and What Is Related to It]

Pain occurs in an animal by the act of an agent, and the agent is Allah *Exalted is He;* Allah *Exalted is He* brings it about, with a cause or without a cause.

The cause may be from the servant, such as striking and the like, for it is a cause for the occurrence of pain. Thus, the pain that occurs with the striking and after it is from the act of Allah *Exalted is He*, not from the act of the servant; the servant only performed the cause.

The naturalists said: Rather, pains that occur without a cause from the servant occur due to changes in natures and temperaments, and they named that "nature."

We say: Pain is from Allah *Exalted is He,* and changes in natures and temperaments are causes created by Allah *Exalted is He*. Heat, coldness, moisture, dryness, and the like are from the making of Allah *Exalted is He*.

The germs that cause the occurrence of diseases are also from the creation of Allah *Exalted is He.* At that point it becomes clear that diseases are from the act of Allah *Exalted is He*, and Allah *Exalted is He* may create disease in an animal without a cause.

As for this, the statement of the Muṭrafiyyah is close to the statement of the naturalists, because they say that pains result from transformations of bodies and the effects of natures; thus, the response to them is like the response to the naturalists.

If it is said: Pains may depend in their occurrence upon the choice of

the servant, for he may arrive at some lands known for epidemics and be afflicted by al-sadam (malaria), which indicates that pain is from the act of the nature of the land.

We say: Entering a land of malaria is a cause for the occurrence of illness.

Know that Allah *Exalted is He* has built the affairs of this world upon causes: He made the creation of a child caused by placing the drop of fluid in the specific place; the sprouting of seeds caused by rain and soil; the attainment of knowledge caused by thought and reflection, and so on. In all of that, Allah *Exalted is He* has wisdoms and interests, some of which may be known by people of intelligence and acumen.

That which indicates that illness is from the act of Allah *Exalted is He* is that a group of people may enter a land of malaria and fever afflicts some of them while it does not afflict others; and they may be exposed to the sun and some fall ill while others do not. This is evidence that the illness of some is by the act of a choosing agent. The nature of the land has no choice and is not an effective cause in the occurrence of illness; rather, it is a cause, and the cause is not necessitating of illness, as we mentioned regarding one who enters a land of malaria or is exposed to the rays of the sun.

[Inflicting Pain upon Children]

Allah *Exalted is He* sends down pain upon children for great interests and wisdoms, among them:

1- Attaining compensation that exceeds the pain, for Allah *Exalted is He* will compensate the one who suffered pain with that which, upon seeing it, he would wish that he had been cut with shears, due to what he sees of immense benefits and compensations.
2- Exposing the parents—if they are patient—to the reward of the patient, due to what the infliction of pain upon their child causes them of worry and grief, in addition to what is added to that of compensation for the pain of worry and grief.
3- What is therein of admonition, reflection, and subtle kindnesses.

[Inflicting Pain upon Animals]

Allah *Exalted is He* has permitted His servants to slaughter some animals and to ride others, and He has left—*glorified is He*—some among others, so He left some to eat others, and some to attack others, and so on.

Thus we say: In that, Allah *Exalted is He* has great wisdoms and interests, for He *Exalted is He* is Just and Wise, and it is necessary that Allah *Exalted is He* compensate them with compensations that exceed

what befell them of harm. From here, Allah *Exalted is He* will resurrect them on the Day of Resurrection so that they may receive their compensations in full. He *Exalted is He* said: *"There is no creature on the earth nor any bird that flies with its wings except that they are communities like you. We have not neglected in the Book a thing; then to their Lord they will be gathered"* **[al-Anʿām]**.

[Inflicting Pain upon the Believer]

Inflicting pain upon the believer occurs for interests, among them:

1- His taking admonition from it; for illness and the like are a cause for restraint and an increase in faith. Hence Allah *Exalted is He* said: *"Do they not see that they are tried every year once or twice, yet they do not repent nor do they take heed?"* **[al-Tawbah]**, and He *Exalted is He* said: *"If only, when Our punishment came upon them, they had humbled themselves"* **[al-Anʿām: 43]**, and other verses besides these.
2- The attainment of the cause of reward, which is patience and contentment. Allah *Exalted is He* said: *"And give glad tidings to the patient"* **[al-Baqarah]**, and He *Exalted is He* said: *"Indeed, the patient will be given their reward without measure"* **[al-Zumar]**. The inflicting of pain upon the prophets and those like them falls under this category.
3- The removal and erasure of sins; for illness reminds one of sins, which causes the sick person to regret what he previously neglected, to repent, and to seek forgiveness.
4- The admonition of others; for the intelligent person, when he sees one afflicted, remembers Allah's blessing upon him in that He granted him well-being from such an affliction, and so on.

[Inflicting Pain upon the People of Disobedience]

It is appropriate from Allah *Exalted is He* to inflict pain upon the people of major sins for wisdoms, among them:

1- Hastening punishment for their committing major sins and persisting in disobedience.
2- What they themselves have therein of admonition and consideration first, and for others second.

The proof of that is His saying *Exalted is He: "And We shall surely make them taste the nearer punishment short of the greater punishment, that perhaps they may return"* **[al-Sajdah]**, and His saying *Exalted is He*: *"Whatever affliction befalls you is because of what your hands have earned, and He pardons much"* **[al-Shūrā]**.

There is no compensation for the people of major sins for what befalls them of pains and the like, as indicated by the verses of threat and

severe, everlasting punishment.

The determinists (al-Mujabbirah) said: It is appropriate from Allah *Exalted is He* to inflict pain upon everyone without compensation, admonition, or the like of what we mentioned. This is built upon their doctrine that nothing ugly is deemed ugly from Allah.

The answer: What is well known of the meaning of injustice is harm devoid of procuring benefit, repelling harm, or entitlement. If the pain that befalls the servant contains no benefit for him, does not repel harm from him, and he does not deserve it, then it would be injustice. Allah *Exalted is He* said: *"And your Lord does not wrong anyone"* **[al-Kahf: 49]**.

Furthermore, it has been established that Allah *Exalted is He* is Wise, and the Wise does not do except what wisdom necessitates of actions. It has also been established that He *Exalted is He* is Just, and the Just does not inflict harm upon anyone unless he deserves it, or there is in the harm an interest greater than the harm, or there is in the harm the repelling of a greater harm from him.

Harm from Servants May Be Deemed Good in These Matters:

1- That the harm be a punishment, such as retaliation (qiṣāṣ).
2- That there be in it the attainment of a benefit, such as disciplining a child, a servant, or a woman—whether the benefit is religious or worldly.
3- That there be in it the repelling of harm, such as amputating a limb afflicted with cancer, cauterization, cupping, and the like.
4- By Allah's *Exalted is He* permission, such as slaughtering animals; and this is not injustice, for we know that Allah *Exalted is He* did not permit that except after guaranteeing for them benefits and compensations that exceed what befell them of harm many times over.

[The Aggression of Some Created Beings against Others]

If an oppressor aggresses against a believer and the oppressor does not repent, then Allah *Exalted is He* will recompense the oppressor with what he deserves of punishment in the Fire of Hell. Allah, the Creator *Exalted is He*, will make the oppressed believer aware of what befell the oppressor of punishment for his injustice, then He will grant him the reward of patience for the pain of the injury and the like, in addition to the compensation of abandonment (*takhliyah*). The compensation of abandonment may be benefits and interests that accrue to the injured party, or it may be the removal of some of his bad deeds.

It has been narrated from Amīr al-Muʾminīn *(Peace be Upon Him)* that he said to his companions: "Indeed, there will appear over you after me a

man wide of throat, distended of belly; he eats whatever he finds and seeks what he does not find. Kill him—but you will not kill him. Indeed, he will command you to curse me and to disavow me. As for cursing, then curse me—it is purification (zakāh) for me and salvation for you. As for disavowal, then do not disavow me, for I was born upon the natural disposition, and I preceded to Islam and migration."

His saying *(Peace be Upon Him)*, "it is purification for me," means: a cleansing from sins and an expiation for them.

If the oppressor aggresses against one who commits major sins, then it does not go beyond Allah *Exalted is He* informing him on the Day of Recompense of what befell the oppressor of punishment due to his injustice, in order to manifest Allah's justice. It may also be that the oppressor's aggression against one who commits major sins is a hastening of punishment, so the oppressed will not be informed on the Day of Resurrection. Allah *Exalted is He* said regarding that: *"And thus We set some of the wrongdoers over others because of what they used to earn"* **[al-Anʿām]**. Allah's *Exalted is He* granting authority to some wrongdoers over others means abandonment and non-prevention.

If the aggression is against a child, a mad person, or an animal, then there must be an interest for the injured party, as previously mentioned regarding pain that occurs from Allah *Exalted is He* upon one who is not legally responsible. What accrues to the child and the like is compensation for him for what befell him due to the abandonment, such as pain and the like.

It has been said: that Allah *Exalted is He* fully compensates the child for what befell him of harm from the compensations of the wrongdoing aggressor.

This view is not sound, because there are no compensations for the people of the Fire, as they are nullified by major sins.

If the aggressor repents, it is possible that Allah *Exalted is He* graciously settles it on his behalf, and it is possible that Allah *Exalted is He* fully compensates the injured party from the compensations of the aggressor or from benefits and pleasures to which he is entitled.

If the aggressor is not legally responsible—such as children, the insane, animals, and vermin—then the ruling is like that which is from Allah *Exalted is He*, and what has preceded of detail applies.

The ruling is thus because Allah *Exalted is He* has taken away from them discriminating intellects, left them with the injured party, enabled them to commit the injury by what He granted them of ability and strength, and did not prevent them.

As for the believer's injuring another by mistake, it is like the injury of the repentant as previously mentioned.

The injury by mistake of one who commits major sins is like his intentional injury, except that there is no punishment upon him because of it, due to the generality of the evidences of pardon for mistakes, such as His saying *Exalted is He*: *"And there is no blame upon you for that in which you have erred ..."* **[al-Aḥzāb: 5]**.

[The Continuance of Compensations]

The compensations that Allah *Exalted is He* grants to the injured party—whether from among the legally responsible, or from children, the insane, and animals—are enduring for them. They remain, and they enjoy them in the Hereafter, and they do not cease.

Some scholars said—and it is a good opinion—that whatever among animals is beautiful in form and appearance, Allah *Exalted is He* will adorn Paradise and its gardens with it, such as various kinds of birds, gazelles, and the like. As for those among them that are repugnant, such as snakes, scorpions, and beasts of prey, Allah *Exalted is He* will, by His power, place their pleasure and benefit in the Fire; Allah *Exalted is He* will increase the punishment of the people of the Fire by means of their poisons and harm, and their enjoyment will be like that of the guards (al-zabāniyah) in the punishment of the people of the Fire.

Some theologians said: Compensations do not endure.

We say: By the cessation of compensations, one of two things would occur—either harm would befall the compensated one, or he would perish due to the cessation of his compensation—and both of these are impermissible with respect to Allah *Exalted is He.* We only deemed such a thing permissible in this world due to the interests for the one who suffers pain and harm, in terms of compensations and benefits and the like, as previously mentioned. As for the Hereafter, there is no interest at all therein. It has been established that Allah *Exalted is He* is Self-Sufficient, Just, and Wise; and one who is such does not do that in which there is no interest and no wisdom.

Some theologians said: It is permissible that some animals be compensated in this world and not be returned on the Day of Resurrection.

We say: Decisive proof has indicated the return of all beasts, and that is His saying *Exalted is He*: *"There is no creature on the earth nor any bird that flies with its wings except that they are communities like you. We have not neglected in the Book a thing; then to their Lord they will be gathered"* **[al-Anʿām]**.

Know that there is no mutual requital on the Day of Resurrection between children and the insane, and likewise among all animals and birds; rather, Allah *Exalted is He* will give the one who was harmed compensation for what befell him of harm—due to His having removed from them discerning intellects.

Most of the Mu'tazilah said: Rather, Allah will exact mutual requital among them.

We say: Allah *Exalted is He* has lifted the pen from children and the insane—this has been established by the Sunnah—and lifting the pen from animals is even more fitting. Thus, transgressions in this matter are as though they are from Allah *Exalted is He*, as previously explained.

[The Appointed Term (al-Ajal)]

The appointed term is the time of the departure of the soul from the body of the animal.

If the departure of the soul from the body is by death, then the appointed term is one by agreement, and this is the named appointed term (al-ajal al-musammā). If the soul departs from the body by killing, then the soul has two terms:

The first is the killing by which the soul departed. The second is the named appointed term, which—had the killed person been spared from killing—he would certainly have lived until reaching it and attaining it, and then would have died at it. This is the doctrine of the early scholars of the Ahl al-Bayt *(Peace be Upon Them)*.

The Bahshamiyyah and their followers said: We do not assert decisively that he would live if spared from killing; rather, his living is possible and his dying is possible, and we do not determine either of the two.

The determinists (al-Mujabbirah) said: Rather, it is decisively determined that he would die. This is built upon their doctrine that all actions are from Allah *Exalted is He*.

[Evidence from the Qur'an and the Sunnah that Killing Interrupts the Appointed Term]

The evidence for what we have adopted is His saying *Exalted is He*: *"And for you in retaliation there is life, O people of understanding"* **[al-Baqarah: 179]**.

This verse is explicit that killing interrupts the appointed term. That is because one whose soul whispers to him to kill another, when he knows of retaliation, is deterred; and then, by safety from killing, the lives of both the killer and the killed are prolonged.

Imam al-Hādī *(Peace be Upon Him)* said in the interpretation of this verse: "The 'life' that is in retaliation is what enters the wrongdoers of fear of retaliation in killing the oppressed, so they desist from that when they know that by whom they kill, they will be killed. Thus, their lives are prolonged when they desist from their corruption, and they refrain from killing one by whom they would be killed; and by his destruction through the judgment of Allah, they are destroyed." End.

This is also indicated by His saying *Exalted is He* in the story of Prophet Nūḥ *(Peace be Upon Him)* and his people: *"Worship Allah, fear Him, and obey me. He will forgive you some of your sins and defer you to a named appointed term. Indeed, the appointed term of Allah, when it comes, is not deferred"* **[Nūḥ: 3–4]**.

The meaning is that if they obeyed Nūḥ *(Peace be Upon Him)*, Allah *Exalted is He* would defer them until they reached and attained the named appointed term, which is the term of death that is not deferred. If they disobeyed him and did not obey him, Allah *Exalted is He* would interrupt their terms by punishment before they reached the named appointed term. This appointed term can be deferred, unlike the named appointed term, which is not deferred. Had they believed, Allah *Exalted is He* would not have caused them to die by the drowning that eradicated them.

What we have said is also indicated by what Allah *Exalted is He* related in Sūrat al-Kahf regarding the story of al-Khiḍr *(Peace be Upon Him)* killing the boy: *"As for the boy, his parents were believers, and we feared that he would overburden them with transgression and disbelief; so we desired that their Lord replace him for them with one better than him in purity and closer in mercy"* **[al-Kahf]**. This indicates that had the boy been spared from killing, he would certainly have lived until he overburdened his parents with transgression and disbelief.

In the Sunnah there is much of this sort, such as what has been narrated that maintaining the ties of kinship increases one's lifespan, and from Ali *Peace be upon Him "Maintaining the ties of kinship increases wealth and postpones the appointed term."*

[Doubts of the Determinists and the Response to Them]

The determinists said: If the killed person had an appointed term other than that in which he was killed, this would expose ignorance on the part of Allah, in that He affirmed for the killed person another appointed term which he did not reach and did not attain.

We say: Allah *Exalted is He* knows that a person will reach the named appointed term and attain it if he is spared from killing and interruption; and He *Exalted is He* knows that the person will be killed before reaching

the named appointed term, and that had he not been killed he would have reached it. What the determinists mentioned would only follow if Allah *Exalted is He* knew that the person would reach the named appointed term and did not know that his term would be interrupted by killing and then he would be killed—then killing would reveal ignorance of Allah *Exalted is He*. We do not say this.

The determinists said: Allah *Exalted is He* said: *"Say: If you had been in your houses, those upon whom killing was decreed would have gone forth to their resting places"* **[Āl ʿImrān: 154]**, which indicates that the killed person, had he not been killed, would have died.

We say: The verse is an informing from Allah *Exalted is He* of what He knows of the truthfulness of the believers' intentions in jihad and obedience to the Messenger *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*—that they would go forth to killing and fighting, not deterred by fear, nor turned away by rumor s or discouragement. This is the meaning of the verse.

There is no proof in it negating the named appointed term which—had they been spared from killing—they would have lived until reaching it. Rather, it merely informs that they would be killed in their striving.

[The Statement of the Muṭrafiyyah Regarding the Appointed Term]

The Muṭrafiyyah said: Whoever dies before reaching one hundred and twenty years has died without the will of Allah, and due to a cause that is not from Allah *Exalted is He*. The appointed term that is from Allah is only the term of one who reaches one hundred and twenty years—no other. They said: That is the natural lifespan.

They also said: Allah has made people equal in six matters: creation, provision, death, life, worship, and recompense.

The response: As for death and life, Allah *Exalted is He* said: *"We have decreed death among you"* **[al-Wāqiʿah: 60]**.

This verse is explicit that death, absolutely, is from the act and decree of Allah *Exalted is He*. There are many evidences for this from the Book and the Sunnah.

As for creation, disparity in it is perceptible: the female differs from the male; the black differs from the white; people's forms differ, their colors differ, their physiques differ, and their natures differ—among them are the intelligent and among them the dull-witted, and so on.

As for provision, Allah *Exalted is He* said: *"And Allah has favored some of you over others in provision"* **[al-Naḥl: 71]**, and other verses besides this.

As for worship, the obligations of the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* differ from the obligations of his community; likewise, the obligations of the Imams differ from the obligations of the subjects. Establishing prescribed punishments, jihad, the distribution of fayʾ and charities, and the like are among the obligations of the Imams, not the obligations of the subjects.

The obligations of the woman differ from those of the man: there is no jihad upon her, nor Friday prayer, nor adhān nor iqāmah; her ʿawrah differs from that of the man; her iḥrām differs from the iḥrām of the man; and other legal rulings besides.

As for recompense, the texts of the Noble Qur'an have come that recompense is according to deeds. Allah *Exalted is He* said: *"And the recompense of an evil deed is an evil like it"* **[al-Shūrā: 40]**, and He *Exalted is He* said: *"So whoever does an atom's weight of good will see it, and whoever does an atom's weight of evil will see it"* **[al-Zalzalah]**.

He *Exalted is He* also said regarding the people of the slander: *"For every person among them is what he earned of sin, and the one who took upon himself the greater share thereof—for him is a tremendous punishment"* **[al-Nūr]**. Thus, He *Exalted is He* did not make them equal in recompense; rather, He singled out some of them with a type of tremendous punishment. The verses on this topic are many.

[The Soul (al-Rūḥ)]

The soul is that by which the animal is alive; it is among the secrets of Allah *Exalted is He,* whose knowledge He has reserved to Himself. Allah *Exalted is He* said: *"And they ask you about the soul. Say: The soul is from the affair of my Lord, and you have not been given of knowledge except a little"* **[al-Isrāʾ]**.

Imam al-Qāsim ibn Ibrāhīm, Imam al-Hādī, Imam al-Nāṣir, Imam al-Ḥusayn ibn al-Qāsim al-ʿAyyānī, Imam al-Muʾayyad bi-llāh, Imam Aḥmad ibn Sulaymān *(Peace be Upon Them)*, and others said: The soul is a body whose reality is known only to Allah *Exalted is He.* Hence, there is no path to knowing its true reality and quiddity, and it is not appropriate to delve into that. The same applies to the intellect, hearing, sight, and the rest of the senses: their quiddities and realities are among that whose knowledge *Allah Exalted is He* has reserved to Himself. The utmost that a human can know in this regard is to know that the intellect is an accident whose locus is the heart—according to our view—or the brain according to another view; by it, a person distinguishes between good and evil, and so on.

Sight is an accident whose locus is the pupil; by it visible things are perceived. Hearing is an accident whose locus is the auditory canal; by it

sounds are perceived. In this manner it is said regarding the rest of the senses. As for knowing what lies beyond that, there is no path to it, and humans have no capacity to reach it by their intellects.

The sciences of medicine and anatomy—even if they reach the utmost limit of development—are confined to knowing the organs of the body, its systems, and its instruments, which are the places of the soul, the intellect, hearing, sight, and so on.

[The Annihilation of the World]

There is no disagreement among the people of Islam regarding the annihilation of the world; rather, the disagreement is regarding the manner of annihilation.

Knowledge of this is attained only through transmitted revelation, though some intellects may reach it. It is narrated that ʿAbd al-Muṭṭalib used to say: No oppressor will leave this world except that Allah will exact vengeance from him. It was said to him: So-and-so died a natural death. He paused for a moment and then said: There must be an abode other than this abode, in which the good-doer is recompensed for his good, and the evil-doer for his evil.

Imam al-Hādī *(Peace be Upon Him)* said in *al-Bāligh al-Mudrik*: "When the deeds of the obedient were completed and they were not rewarded, and the terms of the disobedient ended and they were not punished, it became obligatory—by the guiding of tawḥīd and the consistency of wisdom—that there be an abode after this abode in which the obedient are rewarded and the evil-doers are punished. These are matters necessitated by innate nature and established by faith …" to the end of his statement *(Peace be Upon Him)*.

The manner of annihilation is that Allah *Exalted is He* brings it to pure nonexistence, as though it had never been. This is the view of the majority of our Imams *(Peace be Upon Them)*, and of Abū ʿAlī, Abū Hāshim, and others.

The determinists (al-Mujabbirah) said: The annihilation of the world is only its tearing apart, alteration, and dispersion.

Some theologians said: The annihilation of the world is impossible.

We say: That is not impossible. Just as Allah *Exalted is He* originated and invented it, so too He brings it back to pure negation, as though it had never been—like the extinguishing of a lamp's flame, the disappearance of light, the disappearance of darkness, the disappearance of clouds, and the disappearance of winds. Human capability in this era has reached the manufacture of atomic and nuclear weapons; this destructive weapon has the capacity to explode the atoms of which

everybody is composed. By exploding the atoms of which a body is composed, the body is annihilated and comes to an end completely, and no existence remains for it. By this, the falsity of the claim that pure annihilation is impossible becomes clear.

What we have said is also indicated by His saying *Exalted is He*: *"He is the First and the Last"* **[al-Ḥadīd: 3]**. The meaning is that Allah *Exalted is He* alone possesses absolute priority; Allah existed and nothing whatsoever existed with Him. Likewise, is the meaning of "the Last." If annihilation meant mere dispersion and scattering, it would not be true that He *Exalted is He* is the Last, because dispersed bodies would then share with Him in this attribute.

The commander of faithful *(Peace be Upon Him)* said in *Nahj al-Balāghah*: "He is the One Who annihilates them after their existence until their existent becomes like their nonexistent. The annihilation of the world after its origination is not more wondrous than its creation and invention … And indeed Allah *Exalted is He* remains after the annihilation of the world alone, with nothing alongside Him, just as He was before its origination; thus He will be after its annihilation—without time, without place, without moment and without duration. At that time, terms and times are nullified, years and hours vanish …" until his saying *(Peace be Upon Him)*: "And there is nothing except Allah, the One, the Subduer."

It is said in the commentary: The apparent meaning of the statements of al-Qāsim, al-Hādī, and al-Murtaḍā *(Peace be Upon Them)* is that the annihilation of the world is its dispersion, tearing apart, and reconstitution into forms other than those upon which it was—rather than its complete nonexistence—although that is rationally possible, for Allah *Exalted is He* is over all things powerful.

I say: This is supported by the like of His saying *Exalted is He*: *"When the earth is shaken with a violent shaking, and the mountains are crushed to powder and become scattered dust"* **[al-Wāqiʿah]**. When the earth and the mountains become scattered dust, then after the falling of that dust they become level, as He *Exalted is He* said in describing them on that Day: *"And you will see the earth laid bare"* **[al-Kahf: 47]**, *"You will not see therein any crookedness or unevenness."* All of this indicates that this earth itself is the earth of the Gathering, except that it changes and transforms into a leveled earth. And Allah knows best.

[The Wisdom in the Annihilation of the World]

The aspect of goodness in the annihilation of the world lies in the distinction and separation between the Abode of Obligation and the Abode of Recompense. That is because if Allah *Exalted is He* were to reward the righteous and punish the wicked in the worldly abode, then

whatever reward or punishment reached them would be recompense for what they had done, yet each of them might interpret it otherwise. The disobedient one might say: What has reached me of punishment is merely a calamity among the calamities of time that befall people like me; and the obedient one might say: That is among the various favors of Allah upon His servants, and part of His bestowal and beneficence. Through annihilation and then resurrection, both the obedient and the disobedient come to know—knowledge in which there is no doubt—that what reached them was recompense for their past deeds.

Moreover, Allah *Exalted is He* has mentioned the wisdom of resurrection in His saying, relating the statement of those who disbelieved: *"And they swore by Allah their strongest oaths that Allah will not resurrect one who dies. Yes indeed—[it is] a promise binding upon Him in truth, but most people do not know—so that He may make clear to them that concerning which they differ, and so that those who disbelieved may know that they were liars."* **[al-Naḥl]**.

There is another aspect: Allah *Exalted is He* made this world the Abode of Obligation. Had He, *Mighty and Majestic*, sent down punishment upon the disobedient in this abode, the disobedient would then repent upon witnessing the punishment; and in that state, repentance and excuse would not be accepted. Yet they would argue against Allah *Exalted is He* and say: We repented like the repentant, and we obeyed like the obedient—so why do You punish us? And why do You not accept our repentance as You accepted it from those who are like us?

With annihilation and then resurrection, no argument remains for them against Allah *Exalted is He*, due to what they have witnessed of the separation between the Abode of Action and the Abode of Recompense.

[On the Mention of Provision]

Provision (rizq) is everything from which benefit is derived—whether wealth or other than wealth—such as intellect, strength, limbs, and that which is enjoyed and desired of food and drink, marriage and fragrance, and the like. As for what is unlawful, it is not called provision.

The determinists (al-Mujabbirah) said: The unlawful is among provision.

We say: Allah *Exalted is He* has forbidden the consumption of the unlawful and benefiting from it—how then can He, with that, deem it provision?

Allah *Exalted is He* has distinguished between the unlawful and the lawful in His saying: *"And from the fruits of the date-palms and the grapes you take from it an intoxicant and a good provision"* **[al-Naḥl: 67]**. Thus, He

named what is beneficial from the fruits of date-palms and grapes as provision, and He did not name wine provision.

A group among the Bāṭiniyyah and the Ṣūfīs said that everything whose prohibition is known in the religion of Islam—of wealth, private parts, and the like—is lawful; except that the Ṣūfīs exclude killing. They interpret the verses in which prohibition and forbiddance appear according to what they love and desire, and they say that these texts have an inner meaning contrary to their outward meaning—such as their saying regarding the ḥadīth: *"There is no marriage except with a guardian and two just witnesses,"* that it means: no marriage except with a male organ and two testicles.

[Causes of Ownership]

Whatever is taken possession of from that which is permissible—such as water, firewood, grass, and unclaimed land—or is acquired through lawful earning such as purchase, gift, lease, and the like, is the property of the one who takes possession of it, and it is not permissible for another to take it. Upon this are all the Muslims and others.

The Muṭrafiyyah said: There is no ownership for a sinner; whatever he acquires and takes possession of is usurped, because Allah *Exalted is He* did not permit him to take anything of His provision.

The response*:** What has come in many verses explicitly contradicts the saying of the Muṭrafiyyah, such as His saying *Exalted is He: "And they assign to what they do not know a portion of what We have provided them"* ***[al-Naḥl: 56]; and His saying *Exalted is He*: *"And they forbade what Allah had provided for them"* **[al-Anʿām: 140]**; and His saying *Exalted is He*: *"We provide for you and for them"* **[al-Anʿām: 151]**. The permissibility of taking their wealth as booty does not negate ownership, because that is a punishment for them in this world—like enslavement and killing.

[The Provider]

The Provider (ar-raziq) is Allah *Exalted is He*, because He is the One Who created provision and brought it into existence: *"Have you seen what you sow? Is it you who cause it to grow, or are We the Grower?"* **[al-Wāqiʿah]**. The human merely performs the cause—such as plowing, irrigation, selling, buying, and the like.

The term "provider" may be used metaphorically for the giver, the one who gives charity, the one who vows, and the like, as in His saying *Exalted is He*: *"So provide for them from it"* **[al-Nisāʾ: 8]**.

Provision is of two kinds: provision that you seek, and provision that seeks you.

The first is that which comes by way of agriculture, trade, leasing, and

the like.

The second is that which comes without seeking or effort.

Earning a livelihood may be obligatory—such as for the maintenance of a child, a wife, or parents; it may be recommended, permissible, disliked, or prohibited.

There is no contradiction between earning and reliance upon Allah (tawakkul). The farmer relies upon Allah *Exalted is He* in casting the seed, causing it to grow, watering it, and preserving it from blights; and the one who journeys upon the land relies upon Allah *Exalted is He* as he traverses deserts and crosses seas.

Allah's *Exalted is He* guarantee of the provision of His servants—as in His saying: *"There is no creature on the earth except that upon Allah is its provision"* **[Hūd: 6]**—does not negate the permissibility, recommendation, or obligation of earning. For Allah *Exalted is He* has made the affairs of this world arranged according to causes and bound to them. The death of one who dies from hunger or thirst does not contradict the guarantee of provision, because that is a cause among the causes of death which Allah *Exalted is He* has made for a benefit to the legally responsible person or as a punishment for him.

[Low Prices and High Prices]

Low prices and high prices may occur due to a cause from Allah *Exalted is He,* and they may occur due to a cause from creation. When Allah bestows upon creation an abundance of rainfall and blessing in crops, low prices occur; and when He *Exalted is He* tests them with scarcity of rain and increased drought, high prices occur.

The occurrence of low prices due to a cause from creation may take place when merchants bring goods from a fertile region to one more fertile than it; thereby goods become plentiful in the market, and low prices occur. High prices occur when oppressors and major merchants, during times of scarcity, monopolize grain and the like; then their availability in the market decreases, and thus high prices occur.

The Ḥashwiyyah and the determinists (al-Mujabbirah) said: Rather, all high prices are from Allah, whether there is a cause from Allah or a cause from other than Him.

We say in response: There has come an authentic prohibition against hoarding food and against selling *labād* (i.e., monopolized staples), and that is only due to what results from it of high prices.

[On Obligation (Taklīf)]

What is meant by obligation here is imposing upon the legally

responsible person the legal rulings—namely, the five rulings: obligation, recommendation, prohibition, dislike, and permissibility—whether rational or legal. Thus, the legally responsible person is charged with performing what is obligatory, such as prayer and the rest of the legal and rational obligations; charged with refraining from what is unlawful, such as adultery and injustice and the like; charged with performing what is recommended and leaving what is disliked by way of preference, not compulsion; and charged with knowing the ruling of what is permissible.

The aspect of goodness in obligation is that it is a cause for attaining everlasting bliss and lofty ranks in the Gardens of Delight. This is in addition to what has preceded at the beginning of the Book of Justice regarding the interests and wisdoms that return to the legally responsible person in worldly life, and its being gratitude to Allah *Exalted is He*. There are also obstacles that accompany this obligation, increasing its severity and difficulty—such as granting respite to Iblīs until the Day of Judgment and leaving him free to tempt servants; the sending down of ambiguous verses of the Qur'an and combining them with the clear; the retention of abrogated verses recited alongside abrogating ones; the dispersal of the verses of the five rulings throughout the Qur'an; the intensification of the motive of desire; trials with calamities, pains, and poverty; and jihad. All of this is for the sake of attaining everlasting bliss and lofty ranks in the Gardens of Delight, for reward is commensurate with hardship. The greater the hardship of obligation, the greater the reward and recompense. From this is known the goodness of increasing obligation.

This is in addition to what lies in its increase of purification and testing, by which the truthful in faith is distinguished from the false.

[Obligating What Is Beyond One's Capacity]

Allah *Exalted is He* said: *"Allah does not burden a soul beyond its capacity"* **[al-Baqarah: 286]**; and He *Exalted is He* said: *"Allah does not burden a soul except with what He has given it"* **[al-Ṭalāq: 7]**; and He *Exalted is He* said: *"So fear Allah as much as you are able"* **[al-Taghābun: 16]**; and He *Exalted is He* said: *"And to Allah belongs the pilgrimage to the House for whoever is able to find a way to it"* **[Āl ʿImrān: 97]**; and He *Exalted is He* said: *"Allah does not intend to place upon you any hardship"* **[al-Mā'idah: 6]**; and He *Exalted is He* said: *"Allah intends for you ease and does not intend for you hardship"* **[al-Baqarah: 185]**—and other verses in this chapter.

Therefore, we say: Allah *Exalted is He* has not obligated anyone among His creation with anything except what is within capacity. This is

together with what is firmly established in rational dispositions regarding the ugliness, reprehensibility, and indecency of obligating what is beyond capacity.

The Ashʿariyyah said: All obligations are obligations of what is beyond capacity. Al-Rāzī stated this explicitly in *al-Maḥṣūl*. Formerly, the determinists avoided mentioning this until Abū al-Ḥasan al-Ashʿarī came. Among what Abū al-Ḥasan al-Ashʿarī cited as evidence for obligating what is beyond capacity is his statement that Allah *Exalted is He* obligated Abū Jahl to believe in what the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* brought, while among what the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* brought was that Abū Jahl would not believe until he died. Thus, Abū Jahl would be obligated to believe at a time when he must believe that he will persist in disbelief until death—something impossible for Abū Jahl and not within his capacity to fulfill.

They also argue that Allah *Exalted is He* obligated His servants to perform obligations while they are not able to perform them due to the absence of power and capacity, because Allah *Exalted is He* is the One Who created, decreed, willed, and intended their actions; thus, they are unable to depart from what Allah created, decreed, and intended.

***The response*:** Allah *Exalted is He* negates from Himself obligating creation with what is beyond capacity and disavows it, as in the verses with which we opened this chapter—along with what reason establishes regarding the ugliness and indecency of that, which should not be attributed to the Holy Sovereign *Exalted is He*. With all this, it neither befits nor is appropriate to heed the speech of one who disputes and argues over it. This is a general response sufficient for the believing, affirming person.

As for the detailed response, we say: What Abū al-Ḥasan al-Ashʿarī mentioned regarding obligating Abū Jahl does not entail obligating what is beyond capacity. That is because Abū Jahl is not mentioned in the Qur'an; rather, what is mentioned in the Qur'an is Abū Lahab. What Allah *Exalted is He* mentioned concerning him is His saying: *"Perish the hands of Abū Lahab, and perish he! His wealth did not avail him, nor what he earned. He will burn in a Fire of blazing flame ..."* **[al-Masad]**. There is nothing in this indicating that he will not believe, or that he is a disbeliever, or that he will die upon disbelief. What Allah *Exalted is He* mentioned about him is that he will burn in a Fire of blazing flame. Knowing that he will burn in the Fire and believing it does not contradict the faith to which Allah called him. It is not impossible that belief in what the Messenger *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* brought and belief in entering the Fire coexist in one person. As for their

argument that Allah *Exalted is He* Himself undertook the creation of their actions of disbelief and belief, decreed them, willed them, and intended them—and that therefore they are unable to depart from them—the response to that has already preceded.

Moreover, Allah's *Exalted is He* informing that the disbelievers will die upon disbelief came only after the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* had called them to believe in what he brought, presented the signs to them, and exerted the utmost effort in calling them. In what he called them to at that time, there was no informing that they would not believe. Only at the end did Allah *Exalted is He* inform His Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* that they would not believe, even if every sign came to them, until they see the painful punishment. Thus, there did not occur, in reality, obligating the disbelievers with what is beyond capacity—except if they were to believe at the end in what the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* brought with a sound belief, and this is impossible due to Allah's *Exalted is He* informing that they will not believe.

[al-Alṭāf (Divine Subtleties / Gracious Aids)]

What is meant by *luṭf* here is the technical (*terminological*) meaning: that by which the legally responsible person becomes closer to performing obedience and refraining from disobedience. This includes such matters as reminding, warning, reflection, taking admonition, and pains. As for performing obedience and abandoning disobedience for the sake of prestige and love of reputation, or due to coercion and compulsion, that is not the technical *luṭf* intended here.

Imam al-Mahdī divided *luṭf* into three categories:

1- ***Luṭf of enabling (tawfīq):*** That by which obedience is performed inevitably, without compulsion.
2- ***Luṭf of protection (ʿiṣmah):*** That by which disobedience is abandoned inevitably, without compulsion.
3- ***Absolute luṭf:*** That whereby the legally responsible person is closer to complying with what he has been charged with—namely, performing obedience and abandoning disobedience.

Luṭf is not necessitating with respect to the one to whom it is given; for the luṭf that calls to faith may occur, yet faith may not occur. Among examples of this is what Allah *Exalted is He* mentioned regarding the hypocrites in His saying: *"Do they not see that they are tried every year once or twice, yet they do not repent nor do they take heed?"* **[al-Tawbah]**.

And His saying *Exalted is He*: *"And We tested them with good times and bad times, so that they might return"* **[al-Aʿrāf]**. And His saying *Exalted is*

He: *"If only, when Our punishment came upon them, they had humbled themselves; but their hearts hardened"* **[al-Anʿām: 43]**. And His saying *Exalted is He*: *"And We shall surely make them taste the nearer punishment short of the greater punishment ..."* **[al-Sajdah: 21]**. And His saying *Exalted is He*: *"As for Thamūd, We guided them, but they preferred blindness over guidance"* **[Fuṣṣilat: 17]**. The verses concerning this matter are many.

[Abandonment (al-Khidhlān)]

What is meant here by *khidhlān* is the absence of illuminating the heart with an increase in intellect.

Its clarification is as follows: Allah *Exalted is He* has made all the legally responsible equal in the innate endowments of intellect without which obligation is not realized. Then Allah *Exalted is He* rewards the one who responds to his Lord and obeys Him with an increase in his intellect; by this increase, He *Exalted is He* illuminates his insight and expands his breast, as He *Exalted is He* said: *"And those who are guided—He increases them in guidance ..."* **[Muḥammad: 17]**, and as He *Exalted is He* said: *"O you who believe, fear Allah and believe in His Messenger; He will grant you a double share of His mercy and will make for you a light by which you walk ..."* **[al-Ḥadīd: 28]**. If the legally responsible person turns away from the call of his Lord and does not respond, Allah *Exalted is He* deprives him of the illumination of the heart which He grants to those who respond to Him and obey Him, and this is called *khidhlān* (abandonment). This meaning accords with the linguistic meaning of *khidhlān*, for in language it means leaving aid and support.

[Infallibility (al-ʿIṣmah)]

Infallibility in technical usage is restraining the self from intentionally committing disobedience and from intentionally abandoning obedience, with the continual presence of grace and illumination.

As mentioned previously just before this, Allah *Exalted is He* increases those who respond to Him in illumination of the heart and insight. The more the legally responsible person advances in piety, the more Allah *Exalted is He* increases him—proportionately—in illumination and guidance, until the legally responsible person reaches, by what Allah *Exalted is He* has increased him of illumination, guidance, and insight, the degree of infallibility.

The proof of this is His saying *Exalted is He: "If you fear Allah, He will make for you a criterion"* **[al-Anfāl: 29]***; and His saying Exalted is He*: *"And those who are guided—He increases them in guidance and grants them their piety"* **[Muḥammad]**; and His saying *Exalted is He*: *"O you who believe, fear Allah and believe in His Messenger; He will grant you a double share of His mercy and will make for you a light by which you walk, and He will*

forgive you …" **[al-Ḥadīd: 28]**; and other verses like these.

Infallibility is not coercive for its possessor, nor does it compel him to perform obedience and abandon disobedience. Rather, with it he remains choosing; he is able to perform obedience and able to commit disobedience. However, due to what he possesses of infallibility, he chooses obedience and leaves disobedience.

[Allah's Favor upon His Servants in the Hereafter]

It is not said of anything that Allah *Exalted is He* does that it is obligatory upon Him. That is because attributing obligation to Him implies compulsion that entails burden and hardship, and anything that implies error must not be attributed to Allah *Exalted is He*.

Moreover, it has been established—by what follows—that acts of obedience were made obligatory upon the legally responsible as gratitude to Allah *Exalted is He* for His innumerable blessings. Accordingly, the reward which Allah *Exalted is He* promised them for these acts is pure grace.

If it is said: Allah, *Exalted is He,* has made reward a recompense for righteous deeds in many verses, such as His saying *Exalted is He: "As recompense for what they used to do"* **[al-Wāqiʿah: 24]**, and His saying *Exalted is He*: *"Eat and drink in satisfaction for what you used to do"* **[al-Mursalāt: 43]**.

We say: Allah *Exalted is He* made it a recompense by way of grace. This is indicated by His saying *Exalted is He*, relating the words of the people of Paradise: *"And they will say, 'Praise be to Allah, who has removed from us sorrow. Indeed, our Lord is Forgiving, Appreciative—who has settled us in the Abode of Permanence from His favor; no weariness touches us therein, nor fatigue touches us therein.'"* **[Fāṭir]**.

Imam ʿAlī *(Peace be Upon Him)* said in *Nahj al-Balāghah*: "… But He—*Glorified is He*—made His right upon the servants that they obey Him, and He made their recompense upon Him the multiplication of reward, as a favor from Him and an expansion from that of increase of which He is worthy."

And he *(Peace be Upon Him)* said: "By Allah, even if you were to moan like the moaning of infatuated camels, supplicate with the cooing of doves, cry out with the cries of devout monks, and go forth to Allah sacrificing wealth and children, seeking nearness to Him by raising a rank with Him or erasing a sin recorded by His books and preserved by His messengers—your deeds would still be little in comparison to what I hope for you of His reward, and what I fear for you of His punishment. By Allah, even if your hearts were to melt completely and your eyes were to flow with blood from longing for Him or fear of Him, and then you were

to live in this world as long as it remains—your deeds would not repay Him, even if you exhausted all your effort, for His tremendous blessings upon you and His guiding you to faith."

In the supplication of ʿAlī ibn al-Ḥusayn *(Peace be Upon Them)* in *al-Ṣaḥīfah* there is something close to this.

The commentator of al-Asās said: In the speech of the early members of the ʿItrah *(Peace be Upon Them)* there is much of this meaning. End.

Those who oppose us in this issue—the Muʿtazilah—argued by His saying *Exalted is He: "Your Lord has prescribed mercy upon Himself: that whoever among you does evil in ignorance and then repents after that and reforms—then indeed He is Forgiving, Merciful"* **[al-Anʿām]**.

They say that kataba (*He prescribed*) means obligated, as in His saying *Exalted is He*: *"Fasting has been prescribed upon you"* **[al-Baqarah: 183]**.

We say: Allah *Exalted is He* likened His mercy toward His servants—namely, His acceptance of the repentance of the repentant—to an obligatory, binding matter, as a notification from Him to the legally responsible and an announcement that He does not break this promise nor alter it. Thus, Allah *Exalted is He* expressed this meaning and indicated it with the word *kataba*, which conveys definitiveness and obligation.

What indicates the soundness of this interpretation are several matters:

1- What has preceded of verses and the words of Amīr al-Muʾminīn *(Peace be Upon Him)*.
2- What has preceded that acts of obedience are gratitude for blessings.
3- The propriety and etiquette with Allah *Exalted is He* in this interpretation—unlike interpreting it as real obligation, which entails an implication of error, namely burden and hardship, which the term "obligation" suggests.
4- The statement of our opponents themselves regarding His saying *Exalted is He: "And there is none of you except that he will pass over it; this is, upon your Lord, a decree firmly decided"* **[Maryam: 71]**—for entering Hell is not obligatory upon Allah *Exalted is He*; rather, Allah *Exalted is He* likened it to an obligation in the sense that it will inevitably occur.

[The Book of Prophethood]

Prophethood is a great honor from Allah *Exalted is He* that is granted only to the purest of humankind in creation and character. Messengership is like prophethood, except that a Messenger is one whom Allah sends with a new law, such as Moses, Jesus, and our Prophet Muhammad *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*, and upon them all *(Peace be Upon Them)*. As for one who did not bring a new law, he is not called a Messenger, but rather a Prophet—such as the Prophets of the Children of Israel, for they brought nothing except what Moses *(Peace be Upon Him)* brought—*may Allah's blessings be upon them all*.

Prophethood and messengership are a bounty from Allah upon His servants and a mercy, just as He *Exalted is He* said: *"And We did not send you except as a mercy to the worlds"* **[al-Anbiyāʾ]**, and He *Exalted is He* said: *"Say: In the bounty of Allah and His mercy—in that let them rejoice; it is better than what they gather"* **[Yūnus]**.

The Prophets of Allah and His Messengers have never ceased to warn and give glad tidings throughout the whole history of humankind. Allah *Exalted is He* said: *"And there is no nation except that a warner has passed among them"* **[Fāṭir]**. Among them are those whose accounts Allah *Exalted is He* related to us in the Qur'an, and among them are those whose accounts He did not relate to us. He *Exalted is He* said: *"And Messengers We have related to you before, and Messengers We have not related to you"* **[al-Nisāʾ: 164]**. However, it has come from the Messenger *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* a general report concerning them, as it is narrated that he was asked about the Prophets, and he said: *"One hundred and twenty-four thousand."* It was said: "How many of them were Messengers?" He said: *"Three hundred and thirteen."*

Belief in all of them is among the foundations of faith. Allah *Exalted is He* said: *"Say: We believe in Allah and in what has been sent down to us and what was sent down to Abraham …"* **[al-Baqarah: 136]**, and He *Exalted is He* said: *"The Messenger has believed in what was sent down to him from his Lord, and the believers—all of them have believed in Allah, His angels, His books, and His messengers; we make no distinction between any of His messengers …"* **[al-Baqarah: 285]**.

[The Superiority of the Angels over the Prophets]

The angels—*may Allah's blessings be upon them*—are superior to the Prophets *(Peace be Upon Them)*, in the sense that the reward of the lowest angel is greater than the reward of the most excellent of the Prophets. This is the view of the Ahl al-Bayt *(Peace be Upon Them)*, their followers, and the Muʿtazilah.

The Ashʿarīs said: Rather, the Prophets are superior to the angels.

The Imāmiyyah said: Rather, the Prophets and the Imams are superior to the angels.

Others said: Rather, the Prophets and the believers are superior to the angels.

The evidence for what we have stated is His saying *Exalted is He* in describing the angels: *"They do not disobey Allah in what He commands them, and they do what they are commanded"* **[al-Taḥrīm]**.

There is no doubt that lapses occurred from the Prophets *(Peace be Upon Them)*.

And His saying *Exalted is He: "Say: I do not say to you that I possess the treasuries of Allah, nor do I know the unseen, nor do I say to you that I am an angel"* **[al-Anʿām:50]**, *and His saying Exalted is He*: *"Your Lord did not forbid you from this tree except lest you become angels or become of the immortal"* **[al-Aʿrāf]**, and His saying *Exalted is He*: *"The Messiah will never disdain to be a servant of Allah, nor will the angels brought near …"* **[al Nisāʾ: 172]**.

This verse was revealed in response to the Christians due to their excess regarding Jesus *(Peace be Upon Him)*. Each of these verses indicates that the angels are superior to the Prophets *(Peace be Upon Them)*.

Moreover, Allah *Exalted is He* created the angels from light and purified them from bestial natures, whereas humans are created from dust and are formed upon bestial dispositions. There is no doubt that light is better than dust, and that one purified from bestial natures is superior to one imprinted with them.

[The Superiority of Our Prophet Muhammad *May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace*]

Our Prophet Muhammad *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* is the best of the Prophets *(Peace be Upon Them)*, and there is no disagreement among the Muslims regarding this, due to his saying *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*: *"I am the master of the children of Adam—and no boast,"* and his saying: *"Adam and those below him are under my banner on the Day of Resurrection."*

And his saying *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*: *"I am the first to knock on the gate of Paradise; I am the first for whom the earth will be split open; and I am the first intercessor whose intercession will be accepted on the Day of Resurrection,"* and reports similar to these.

Perhaps the secret in this—*and Allah knows best*—is that the reward of our Prophet is greater than the reward of the rest of the Prophets, because his followers *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* are more numerous than the followers of other Prophets. It has come in the ḥadīth: *"Whoever establishes a good practice shall have its reward and the reward of those who act upon it until the Day of Resurrection."*

Accordingly, our Prophet Muhammad *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* will have a reward like the reward of every legally responsible person from his community until the Day of Resurrection. There is no doubt that he *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* is the Prophet with the most followers, as has come in many narrations from the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*. This is from one aspect. From another aspect, Allah *Exalted is He* favored him over the rest of the Prophets with unique characteristics that He singled him out with, as is established in authentic narrations from the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*, among them:

- That he was sent to all people universally, whereas the Prophets *(Peace be Upon Them)* were sent specifically to their own peoples.
- That spoils of war were made lawful for him, whereas they were not made lawful for any Prophet before him.
- That he *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* was supported by awe for the distance of a month's journey, and that the earth was made for him a place of prostration and a means of purification.
- That his community will be resurrected on the Day of Resurrection radiant and marked from the traces of ablution.
- That Allah *Exalted is He* made him the Seal of the Prophets and Messengers.
- That Allah *Exalted is He* favored his community over all other communities.
- That his miracle endures for as long as obligation endures.
- That a group from his community will continue to remain manifest upon the truth until the Day of Resurrection.
- And among what Allah *Exalted is He* specially granted him and his community are the virtue of the Night of Decree, the Night of Friday and its day, and the like.

There are many virtues and unique characteristics; the intent here is merely to indicate them.

[The Miracle]

A claim to prophethood is not valid except with a clear proof and an

overwhelming evidence that testifies to the truth of the claim. Whatever bears such testimony is called a miracle.

The miracles of our Prophet Muhammad *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* are many. It has been said that they are one thousand miracles, and it has been said that they are more than that.

His greatest miracle *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* is the Noble Qur'an. It is the enduring proof until the Day of Resurrection. Its miraculous nature lies in eloquence and expression. The secret in Allah *Exalted is He* making the miracle of the Prophet of Allah *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* of this kind is that the Arabs had, at that time, reached the utmost limit in the craft of speech and attained the peak in pursuing the paths of eloquence and rhetoric. This craft flourished greatly among the Arabs. They would gather for it in their markets, presenting what they possessed of exquisite poetry and fine oratory, competing therein and contending before judges who would issue their rulings in that competition and announce the name of the one who excelled in this field. Due to their intense love for this craft and inclination toward it, Quraysh hung seven poetic odes upon the Kaʿbah, having seen in them mastery of craft and excellence of expression. Those seven odes were among the finest—or the finest—of what had been composed in speech and among the most splendid that had ever struck the ears.

Allah sent His Prophet Muhammad *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* while those odes were hanging upon the Kaʿbah. When the Messenger *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* recited to Quraysh the verses of the Qur'an and they heard its eloquence, originality, and beauty of expression, they tore down those hanging odes from the walls of the Kaʿbah and removed them. Because of the Arabs' mastery in the craft of speech and their deep knowledge of the paths of eloquence and expression, Allah *Exalted is He* made the miracle of His Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* of the very kind with which they were engaged and occupied—just as He made the miracle of Jesus *(Peace be Upon Him)* the curing of the blind and the leper and the giving of life to the dead, since the people to whom he was sent were engaged in medicine and the treatment of the sick and had attained the utmost proficiency therein.

Likewise, He *Exalted is He* made the miracle of Moses *(Peace be Upon Him)* the turning of the staff into a living serpent and the bringing forth of his hand white without harm, since the people to whom he was sent practiced magic and were occupied with it, and had known magic with true knowledge. Thus are the miracles of the Prophets *(Peace be Upon Them)*.

Hence, when the magicians of Pharaoh saw the staffs of Moses *(Peace be Upon Him)* when they became living serpents that swallowed what they had made, they believed in the Lord of the worlds—the Lord of Moses and Aaron *(Peace be Upon Them)*. That is because they knew and were certain that what Moses *(Peace be Upon Him)* brought was not magic, but rather a sign among the signs of Allah *Exalted is He,* whose crafting does not fall within human power. Had Allah *Exalted is He* reversed matters—making the sign of Moses *(Peace be Upon Him)* that of Jesus *(Peace be Upon Him)* and the sign of Jesus *(Peace be Upon Him)* that of Moses *(Peace be Upon Him)*—their prophethood would not have become manifest with complete clarity, and people might have supposed it to be of the genus of magic rather than among the signs of Allah *Exalted is He*. For this reason, when Quraysh and the Arabs heard the verses of the Qur'an, they knew that it was not from the speech of the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* nor from the speech of human beings, and that they were incapable of producing anything like it. Yet they acted arrogantly, denied the Qur'an and the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*, and rejected it—just as He, *Majestic and Exalted*, said: *"And they denied them, while their souls were convinced of them, out of injustice and arrogance"* **[al-Naml: 14]**. When they persisted in denial, Allah *Exalted is He* said to His Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*: *"Say: Then bring a sūrah like it"* **[Yūnus: 38]**; and He *Exalted is He* said: *"Then bring a sūrah like it, and call your witnesses besides Allah, if you are truthful"* **[al-Baqarah]**—that is, if you are truthful in your claim that the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* is lying and that the Qur'an is a lie, and that it is not from the speech of Allah *Exalted is He* but rather from the speech of people, then bring a single sūrah like one of its sūrahs, and cooperate with whomever you are able among jinn and humankind. If you bring a sūrah like it, then you are truthful in what you say; otherwise, you are liars and false. This challenge and call has continued until today, and since the descent of the Qur'an, the enemies of Islam and its deniers have not been able to bring a single sūrah comparable to any of the sūrahs of the Qur'an in eloquence and expression.

[Forms of the Qur'an's Inimitability Other than What Has Preceded]

Moreover, in the Qur'an there are other miracles besides what we have mentioned, among them:

1- Informing of unseen matters, such as His saying *Exalted is He: "The Romans have been defeated in the nearest land, but after their defeat they will overcome within a few years"* **[al-Rūm]**. And the matter occurred

exactly as Allah *Exalted is He* stated, for the Romans overcame the Persians after seven years from the descent of this verse; likewise what Allah *Exalted is He* informed regarding the secrets of the hypocrites, the Jews, and the polytheists, and much else.

2- Informing about the previous Prophets and the bygone nations, while the polytheists of Quraysh and others knew that the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* had not associated with the scholars of the People of the Book nor with others knowledgeable in history.

3- The Qur'an's inclusion of wise rulings and laws toward which the innate disposition of reason inclines, due to what they contain of justice, loftiness, elevation, dignity, and mercy, and the like. Among examples of this is what Allah *Exalted is He* mentioned regarding the regulation of marriage, divorce, and the waiting period, the securing of the wife's rights, and justice among wives; then the command to seek permission upon entering houses and to lower the gaze.

He *Exalted is He* forbade the display of adornment by women, commanded them to cover and to remain within their homes. In this there is such justice, chastity, and purity that its value cannot be fully measured. Then there is what Allah *Exalted is He* mentioned regarding fortifying these matters and preserving them by what He legislated of the legal punishments for adultery and false accusation. Likewise, are all the laws of Islam: they came to raise the human being from the depths of lust and vice to the heights of virtue, dignity, and purity. This is while all humankind—if they were to gather and cooperate to establish laws and regulations like those that came in the Qur'an and in the religion of Islam—would not be able to do so, nor would they be guided to it. That is because Allah *Exalted is He* has encompassed with His knowledge what rectifies the servants and what corrupts them, and the extent of their strengths and capacities in every time and in every place. Thus, He *Exalted is He* legislated His laws and rulings in accordance with what knowledge and wisdom necessitate.

As for human beings, they are not so; hence they have failed in all the laws they devised and the rulings they enacted. The greatest example of this is what they instituted in the twentieth century, after long historical experiments, namely two principles: the communist principle and the Western capitalist principle.

As for the communist principle, its own proponents soon passed a sentence of execution upon it. As for the Western principle, it is still alive; however, its calamities have dominated those societies. AIDS, which resulted from unrestrained freedom, has counted its victims in the

millions, and the principle of usurious dealings has exhausted poor peoples, increasing their misery and poverty, and so on.

In sum, the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* came with a law that resolves human problems at all levels—health, economic, political, and others. Had the wealthy implemented the law of zakāh, there would not have remained upon the face of the earth a single poor person. Had they established the laws of retaliation (qiṣāṣ), prescribed punishments (ḥudūd), discretionary penalties (taʿzīr), and punishment, crime would have disappeared—or nearly so—and so on.

4- The Qur'an contains secrets from astronomy, secrets from the science of the seas, and from medical science—matters that no one among the inhabitants of the Arabian Peninsula at that time could have known, due to their remoteness from those sciences.

Thus, the Qur'an came with information about waves beneath the surface of the seas other than the visible waves, in His saying *Exalted is He*: *"Or like layers of darkness in a deep sea, covered by a wave—above it a wave—above it clouds ..."* **[al-Nūr: 40]**, while it is known that humanity did not discover such subsurface waves except in this era.

The Qur'an also mentioned the early stages of the creation of the heavens and the earth in His saying *Exalted is He*: *"Then He turned to the heaven while it was smoke, and He said to it and to the earth ..."* **[Fussilat: 11]**. And in His saying *Exalted is He*: *"Have those who disbelieved not seen that the heavens and the earth were a joined entity, then We split them apart ..."* **[al-Anbiyā': 30]**.

Thus, modern science has affirmed the correctness of what came in the Qur'an.

There is much of this kind in the Qur'an, and likewise in the Sunnah. The intent here is merely to indicate it. The tafsīr of Sayyid Quṭb contains much of this; whoever seeks more should refer to it, or to other books devoted to scientific inimitability in the Qur'an and the Sunnah.

The evidences for the prophethood of our Prophet Muhammad *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* are many. We suffice with this amount, for in it there is proof and evidence that our Prophet Muhammad is a Messenger from Allah, truthful, and that what he brought is from Allah—true and truthful—and that glad tidings of him came in the earlier scriptures.

[Muhammad *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*, the Seal of the Prophets and Messengers]

He is the Seal of the Prophets *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* and Messengers, and his law is the final law. There is

no Prophet after him, nor is his law abrogated—due to His saying *Exalted is He*: *"But he is the Messenger of Allah and the Seal of the Prophets"* **[al-Aḥzāb: 40]**.

His Book *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*, the Qur'an, is preserved by Allah *Exalted is He* from addition, diminution, alteration, and substitution, as He *Exalted is He* said: *"Indeed, We sent down the Reminder, and indeed We are its Preserver"* **[al-Ḥijr]**. And He *Exalted is He* said: *"Indeed, it is a mighty Book; falsehood does not come to it from before it nor from behind it—[it is] a revelation from One Wise, Praiseworthy"* **[Fussilat]**.

This is in addition to what we find in confirmation of this: the codices of the Qur'an written in the early centuries and thereafter until our day contain no discrepancy—neither little nor much.

He *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* was sent to jinn and humankind, due to His saying *Exalted is He*: *"And when We directed to you a group of the jinn listening to the Qur'an ..."* **[al-Aḥqāf: 29]**.

His law *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* is new—no Prophet before him brought it—although it is not devoid of some rulings found in previous laws, such as pilgrimage, fasting, trimming the mustache, circumcision, rinsing the mouth and sniffing water into the nose, and the like. That is merely a matter of concurrence in some rulings.

As for His saying *Exalted is He: "The creed of your father Abraham"* **[al-Ḥajj:78]**, and His saying *Exalted is He*: *"So by their guidance follow"* **[al-Anʿām:90]**; what is meant by that is what is one and unchanging in truth—such as faith in Allah, His Books, His Messengers, and the Last Day, preferring obedience to Allah, and adhering to patience and piety.

This is indicated by the well-known ḥadīth: *"I have been given five things that no Prophet before me was given ..."* (the ḥadīth).[1]

[The Sharīʿah]

What is meant by the Sharīʿah are the five rulings: obligation, recommendation, permissibility, prohibition, and dislike.

These five rulings are derived from the Book and the Sunnah, without disagreement among the Ummah.

Our Imams *(Peace be Upon Them)* and the majority added a third

1- The ḥadīth with this wording appears in most ḥadīth collections. It also appears with the wording: "I have been given three ..." in the Musnad of Imam Zayd—ʿalayhi al-salām—under the chapter on the tooth-stick and the virtue of ablution, in Taysīr al-Maṭālib (p. 78), Uṣūl al-Aḥkām (p. 67), and others.

source—analogy (qiyās)—saying that it is a proof by which the aforementioned legal rulings are derived. The Imāmiyyah, the Ẓāhiriyyah, the Khārijites, and others said: it is not permissible to act upon analogy.

The response is from several angles:

1- It is well known—beyond doubt to people of reason—that there is no difference between the Lawgiver explicitly stating the prohibition of wine and intoxicating nabīdh, and His stating the prohibition of wine while also stating that the cause of its prohibition is intoxication.

2- What Allah *Exalted is He* has related to us of the stories of the nations of the Prophets *(May Allah's Blessings be Upon Them)* in His Noble Book is intended for admonition and lesson. It is as though Allah *Exalted is He* says: Do not do like their deeds, lest what befell them befall you. This is what Allah *Exalted is He* intends by the stories He has related to us in the Qur'an. In this there is a clear indication of analogy that is not hidden from the observer—among it His saying *Exalted is He*: *"They ruin their houses with their own hands and the hands of the believers; so take heed, O people of insight"* **[Al-hashr]**.

3- What is Reported of the Consensus of the Companions on Acting upon Analogy (Qiyās), including them Ali *(Peace be Upon Him)*. Among his statements on this matter is his saying *(Peace be Upon Him)*: "*The first source of judgment is what is in the Book of Allah; then what the Messenger (May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace) has said; then what the righteous have agreed upon. If that is not found in the Book of Allah, nor in the Sunnah, nor in what the righteous are upon, the Imam then exercises ijtihād therein, sparing no effort in precaution, and he considers and analogizes matters one with another. If the truth becomes clear to him, he enacts it; and the judge has what his Imam has.*"[1]

If it is said: Had analogy been a legal proof, the evidences indicating its probativity would have appeared just as the evidences for the probativity of the Qur'an and the Sunnah appeared; and the evidences you presented are not convincing to the examiner.

We say: What appears to me is that the probativity of analogy is established and grounded in the innate dispositions of intellects. Indeed, animals often apprehend the judgments of analogy. For if a sheep, a camel, or the like finds its food or drink in a place, then when it becomes hungry or thirsty the second time, it goes to that place where it found it the first time. Nothing drives it to that except what is ingrained in its perception of analogizing the second time to the first.

1- *Musnad of Imam Zayd (Peace be Upon Him)*, Chapter on Judging.

Likewise, if you strike a cat or the like at one time, it will flee from you the next time; and if you treat it kindly at one time, it will become familiar with you the next time.

From here Allah *Exalted is He* said to His Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*: *"So if you encounter them in war, disperse by means of them those behind them, that they may take heed."* **[al-Anfāl]**. And He *Exalted is He* said: *"So We made it an exemplary punishment for what was before it and what came after it, and an admonition for the God-fearing."* **[al-Baqarah]**.

[The Qur'an]

The Qur'an is the foremost of the evidences, and it is transmitted by mass transmission (mutawātir) among the Muslims.

The *basmalah* is a verse at the beginning of every sūrah except Sūrat al-Tawbah. Many of the early scholars, many reciters, and jurists disagreed with this and said that it was brought for virtue and blessing, acting upon his saying *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*: "*Every matter of importance that is not begun with the name of Allah is cut off.*"

It is said in *al-Taysīr fī Maʿrifat al-Qirāʾāt al-Sabʿ*: They differed regarding the *basmalah* between the sūrahs. Ibn Kathīr, Qālūn, ʿĀṣim, and al-Kisāʾī would recite the *basmalah* between every two sūrahs throughout the entire Qur'an, except between al-Anfāl and Barāʾah, regarding which there is no disagreement about leaving the *basmalah* between them. The others, according to what we read from them, would not recite the *basmalah* between the sūrahs.

And they unanimously agreed that it is part of a verse in Sūrat al-Naml.

The evidence for what we stated—that the *basmalah* is a verse at the beginning of every sūrah—is from several angles:

1- His saying *Exalted is He: "Read in the name of your Lord who created—created the human being from a clinging form."* **[al-ʿAlaq]**. Thus Allah *(Blessed and Exalted)* commanded His Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* to read with the *basmalah*.
2- The consensus of the Ummah in affirming it in the muṣḥaf at the beginning of every sūrah except Sūrat Barāʾah—together with their complete care in purifying the muṣḥafs from anything that is not from the Qur'an.
3- The consensus of the Ahl al-Bayt *(Peace be Upon Them)*. Imam Abū al-Fatḥ al-Daylamī said in his tafsīr: "According to us and according

to the scholars of the ʿItrah *(Peace be Upon Them)*, it is a verse of Sūrat al-Fātiḥah and of every sūrah in which it is affirmed; and whoever leaves it has left a verse from the Book of Allah …" and so on.

[The Readings (al-Qirāʾāt)]

The relied-upon reading with our Imams *(Peace be Upon Them)* is the reading of the people of Madinah, namely the reading of Nāfiʿ. Imam al-Hādī *(Peace be Upon Him)* said: "No other than it has been transmitted by mass transmission."

The majority said: Rather, all seven readings are mutawātir. They are: the readings of Nāfiʿ, Abū ʿAmr, al-Kisāʾī, Ḥamzah, Ibn ʿĀmir, Ibn Kathīr, and ʿĀṣim.

I say: There is no remoteness in the statement of the majority that all seven are mutawātir. That is because the Ahl al-Bayt *(Peace be Upon Them)* and the people of Yemen became well known for the reading of the people of Madinah, and it was mutawātir for them, while no other reading was mutawātir for them. The people of Makkah had another of the seven readings transmitted to them by mass transmission, and no other was mutawātir for them. Likewise, the people of Syria had a reading transmitted to them, and no other; and likewise the people of Kūfah and the people of Baṣrah—each had one reading transmitted to them by mass transmission, and no other.

If no reading other than their own was mutawātir for the people of a given land, that does not indicate that the reading of another land is not mutawātir. ***From here we said*** that there is no remoteness in the statement of the majority; rather, holding it is more appropriate—because of what would follow if we did not hold that the seven readings are mutawātir, namely that the Qur'an would have been affected by misreading and distortion, and the like.

It is known that Allah *Exalted is He* has undertaken to preserve it from that, as He *Exalted is He* said: *"Indeed, We sent down the Reminder, and indeed We are its Preserver."* **[al-Ḥijr]** and: *"Falsehood does not come to it from before it nor from behind it—[it is] a revelation from One Wise, Praiseworthy."* **[Fuṣṣilat]**.

Moreover, the preferred reading is the reading of the people of Madinah—the reading of Nāfiʿ—because it is the reading of the Ahl al-Bayt *(Peace be Upon Them)* that was transmitted to them by mass transmission.

Likewise, the people of every land should read according to what has been transmitted to them by mass transmission from among the

readings. This was how people were formerly: the people of Syria would read with their reading and not go beyond it; and the people of Kūfah, the people of Madinah, and the people of Makkah—each would read with what was transmitted to them by mass transmission and would not go beyond it to another reading.

As for today, the situation has changed. The reading of Ḥafṣ—which is one of the seven readings—has become the most widespread in the lands, to the point that the majority know no other. This is due to the abundance of its printing, which led to its wide dissemination and fame.

[Facilitating the Recitation]

The Qur'an was revealed upon seven *aḥruf* for the sake of facilitation and alleviation; what is meant by this is that it was revealed in seven Arabic dialects.

The wisdom in this—*Allah knows best*—is that had it been revealed in a single dialect, it would have been difficult for speakers of other dialects to recite it. Some Arabs incline the *alif* toward *yā'* and can hardly abandon that in their speech; thus the Qur'an came with *imālah* and without it. Some Arabs articulate two hamzahs when they occur together, while others lighten them; thus the Qur'an came with both lightening and full articulation, and so on. By this means, it became easy for every Arab tribe to recite the Qur'an in its own dialect.

This interpretation is the most appropriate, because the Arabic language itself is called a *ḥarf*.

It has also been said that what is meant by the seven *aḥruf* are categories of legal meanings—namely: lawful, unlawful, clear, ambiguous, parable, imperative, and report—and other views have also been stated.

The preferred view is what we have mentioned.

[The Clear (*al-Muḥkam*) and the Ambiguous (*al-Mutashābih*)]

The muḥkam is that whose meaning is clear—being either explicit or apparent—and which does not contradict an explicit text or a consensus, and does not affirm what reason has judged to be false.

The mutashābih is that whose meaning is not clear—such as when a word is shared between two different meanings that cannot both be intended together, in which case the intended meaning becomes ambiguous and confusing to the reader; or when a word is apparent in its meaning but clashes with a definitive proof from the Book, the Sunnah, or reason.

The wisdom in the revelation of the ambiguous is an increase in

obligation, leading to an increase in reward—due to the hardship of investigation and reflection, the exertion of the soul, and preferring guidance over misguidance. In this there is a distinction between one firmly grounded in faith and one wavering in it.

Those firmly grounded in knowledge know the interpretation of the ambiguous—those whom the Messenger *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* bore witness to guidance, as in the ḥadīth of the Two Weighty Things (*al-Thaqalayn*) and others.

Others among the scholars also know it—those whose intellects have not been tainted by the whims of blind imitation and fanaticism.

[Refuting the Claim that None Knows the Ambiguous Except Allah]

Some of the Ashʿarīs said: None knows the interpretation of the ambiguous except Allah. They interpreted the ambiguous as matters such as the number of the keepers of Hell and the number of the bearers of the Throne; accordingly, they pause at the Divine Name.

The response: Allah *Exalted is He* said regarding the ambiguous: *"As for those in whose hearts is deviation, they follow that which is ambiguous of it, seeking discord and seeking its interpretation ..."* **[Āl ʿImrān: 7]**.

This indicates that it has a meaning which the people of deviation follow and by which they cause people to fall into tribulation. Accordingly, there must be another correct meaning for the ambiguous—other than the meaning followed by the people of deviation—and this other meaning is the intended one, known to those firmly grounded in knowledge. This is because:

1- The word *tashābaha* and its derivatives, by their very form, indicate resemblance between two or more things. Here, the resemblance is between the meanings conveyed by the ambiguous verses. The people of deviation follow one of the meanings of the ambiguous verse and leave the other correct meaning. What further confirms this is that deviation occurs precisely by following the meanings with which they interpret the ambiguous. Allah *Exalted is He* also said at the end of the verse: *"... seeking discord and seeking its interpretation"* **[Āl ʿImrān: 7]**; and *taʾwīl* means interpretation.
2- If we were to say that of the ambiguous only the meaning followed by the people of deviation is knowable, and not the correct meaning, this would entail attributing what is blameworthy to Allah *Exalted is He,* for the ambiguous would then be deception, confusion, and enticement, which is blameworthy and not permissible to attribute to Allah *Exalted is He*.
3- If the matter were as they claimed, it would not be valid to act upon

all the verses of the Qur'an, because it would be possible for every verse to be ambiguous. The hearer of a command would say: perhaps this understood meaning of the verse is among the meanings followed by the people of deviation. We say this because there is nothing in the Qur'an that distinguishes the ambiguous from the clear.

4- The number of the keepers of Hell, the number of the bearers of the Throne, and the like—none of this has been a cause for plunging Muslims into tribulation. Disagreement in interpreting such matters does not lead to misguidance, tribulation, or deviation. The polytheists' fixation on the number nineteen was merely mockery and ridicule, not adherence.

5- His saying *Exalted is He* at the end of the verse of the ambiguous: *"And none knows its interpretation except Allah and those firmly grounded in knowledge ..."* **[Āl ʿImrān: 7]** indicates that those firmly grounded in knowledge know the interpretation of the ambiguous and its explanation, because the *wāw* is manifest in conjunction.

If they say: It has been reported from the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* and from the early generations that there is a pause at the Divine Name.

We say: Pausing does not prevent conjunction. This is evidenced by the permissibility of pausing at the end of a verse even when a conjunction follows it in many verses, and by the permissibility of pausing in the middle of verses. Thus, such a pause does not prevent conjunction. What prevents valid conjunction—according to the scholars of meanings and rhetoric—is complete disconnection, complete connection, or something akin to either; none of that exists here.

Accordingly, the pause at the Divine Name reported from the Prophet is intended for etiquette and reverence toward Allah *Glorified and Exalted,* and to distinguish between the knowledge of Allah *Exalted is He* and the knowledge of His servants.

Moreover, the lived reality of the Muslims bears witness to what we have stated: there are many verses in the Qur'an by which the people of misguidance argue for their misguidance and by which they mislead people, while the people of truth interpret those verses with the correct interpretation in harmony with the truth.

We have not found anyone among the scholars of Islam who stopped at interpreting a verse of the Qur'an, or forbade or prevented its interpretation on the pretext that it is ambiguous.

As for the number of the keepers of Hell, the bearers of the Throne, the disjointed letters, and the like, it has not been reported from any

scholar of Islam—across all ages—that he denounced another for interpreting any of that, or declared him misguided or an unbeliever because of it. In sum, such matters have not been a source of misguidance or tribulation, to our knowledge.

[The Opening Letters of the Sūrahs]

The openings of the sūrahs—such as *Alif Lām Mīm*, *Alif Lām Rā'*, *Ṭā Sīn Mīm*, *Qāf*, *Nūn*, and the like—are from the letters of the Arabic alphabet. However, disagreement has arisen regarding the meanings intended by them. Some of our early Imams *(Peace be Upon Them)* said: This is among that whose knowledge Allah *Exalted is He* has reserved to Himself.

What appears more evidently is that they remain upon their conventional meanings, and that nothing is intended by them at the beginnings of the sūrahs other than that they are alphabetic letters.

Perhaps the secret in this—*Allah knows best*—is that they indicate that the Qur'an, by which the challenge and inimitability occurred, is composed of the very alphabetic letters from which the speech of the Arabs is composed. In this there is an increase in establishing the proof, reproach, and rebuke of the polytheists—by obligating them with an argument after which no excuse remains for them.

In addition to this, there are other benefits, among them:

1- Naming the sūrahs by the letters, such that it is said: *Sūrat Ṭā Hā*, *Sūrat Kāf Hā Yā ʿAyn Ṣād*, *Sūrat Qāf*, and the like.
2- In opening with these disjointed letters there is a strangeness and originality unfamiliar to the Arabs, which calls for their attentiveness and draws their ears to listen to the Qur'an.

[The Qur'an Is the Speech of Allah *Exalted is He* by Consensus]

The Qur'an is the speech of Allah *Exalted is He*, there is no disagreement regarding this among the Muslims. It is that which we hear recited in prayer niches and mosques.

The Ashʿarīs said: The speech of Allah *Exalted is He* is a meaning subsisting in the Essence of Allah *Exalted is He*. They thus made it an attribute of Him—*Majestic and Exalted*—like His being All-Powerful and All-Knowing, and they did not consider it to be of the category of letters and sounds. They regarded these audible letters as an indication of that attribute subsisting in the Essence. Thus, according to them, speech is an essential attribute of the speaker.

We say: What is well known is that *speech* in the language of the Arabs consists of letters and sounds. As for what the Ashʿarīs have mentioned, it is not known, and it is not permissible to interpret the words of the Qur'an in a manner unknown to the Arabs. Allah *Exalted is He* has said:

"In a clear Arabic tongue" **[al-Shuʿarāʾ]**.

Allah *Exalted is He* also said: *"And Allah spoke to Moses with direct speech"* **[al-Nisāʾ]**. It is known that what Moses *(Peace be Upon Him)* heard was letters and sounds. As for the "inner speech" claimed by the Ashʿarīs, it is not audible.

He *Exalted is He* also said: *"And if any one of the polytheists seeks your protection, then grant him protection so that he may hear the speech of Allah"* **[al-Tawbah: 6]**. What the polytheists and others hear are letters and sounds; as for inner speech, no one hears it.

Imam Yaḥyā *(Peace be Upon Him)* narrated from the Ashʿarīs that *speech* is used homonymously for two meanings:

1. The meaning subsisting in the self.
2. These audible letters.

Accordingly, there is no dispute between us and them that this audible speech is truly called the Speech of Allah *Exalted is He*. The disagreement is only over whether the term *Speech of Allah* is also applied, in reality, to a meaning subsisting in the self. The Ashʿarīs affirm that it is truly called speech, and that the audible letters and sounds are an expression and translation of that inner meaning.

We deny and reject this and say: nothing may be affirmed without evidence, and whatever has no evidence must be negated. Allah *Exalted is He* said: *"Say: Bring your proof, if you are truthful"* **[al-Baqarah]**.

Among their arguments is their statement that the active participle is derived only from a meaning subsisting in the subject—thus one is called *black* because blackness inheres in him, and *white* because whiteness inheres in him; likewise, *speaker* (*mutakallim*) would be one in whom speech inheres.

We say: this contradicts what is agreed upon by the scholars of the Arabic language. They do not apply the active participle—such as *standing*, *sitting*, *striking*, or *speaking*—except to one who has performed the act of standing, sitting, striking, or speaking. Thus, the correctness of applying the active participle depends upon the occurrence of the act from which it is derived.

Moreover, it is known to us and to them that Allah *Exalted is He* is called *Creator* and *Provider*, while creation and provision do not subsist in His Essence.

[What Led the Ashʿarīs to Affirm Inner Speech, and the Response to Them]

What appears to me—*and Allah knows best*—is that what led the

Ashʿarīs to affirm inner speech as an essential attribute of the Speaker is what their shaykhs established regarding the createdness-eternity debate of the Qur'an. When they held that view, they were compelled to say that the Speech of Allah *Exalted is He* is a meaning subsisting in the self, because they could not establish the eternity of the audible letters, since their origination is evident to sound reason by necessity. They were thus forced to affirm inner speech in order to preserve the doctrine of their predecessors. As for the Ḥashwiyyah, due to their crudity, they said that the recited letters themselves are eternal.

The response to them is as follows:

1. The Qur'an is ordered and composed of letters and words, some preceding others. A verse is composed of a set of words, and a word is composed of several letters. A word preceded by another word is originated, and a letter preceded by another letter is originated—this is a necessary proof.
2. Allah *Exalted is He* named it *originated* in His saying: *"No reminder comes to them from their Lord, newly revealed, except that they listen to it while they are at play"* **[al-Anbiyāʾ]**; and His saying: *"No reminder comes to them from the Most Merciful, newly revealed, except that they turn away from it"* **[al-Shuʿarāʾ]**.
3. He *Exalted is He* said: *"Indeed, We have made it an Arabic Qur'an"* **[al-Zukhruf: 3]**. By the explicit wording of this verse, the Qur'an is an effect of an acting agent—Allah *Exalted is He—and likewise other verses that state the Qur'an is an act of Allah Exalted is He*, such as His saying: *"Its verses have been perfected, then detailed, from One Wise and All-Aware"* **[Hūd]**.

The Ashʿarīs may argue for inner speech with the following:

1. What is reported that the Qur'an is preserved in the breasts of the scholars.
2. What is reported in the poet's saying:

"Indeed, speech is within the heart;

the tongue was made only as a guide to the heart."

3. That what is heard is merely the speech of the reciter—whether righteous or wicked, young or old—and not the Speech of Allah *Exalted is He*; all of which indicates, in their view, that the Speech of Allah is inner speech, not the audible speech composed of letters and sounds.

The response:

1. What is meant by the Qur'an being preserved in the breasts is that

the memorizer has the verses of the Qur'an imprinted in his chest in their precise order, such that he can recite them as Allah *Exalted is He* revealed them.

The Ashʿarīs do not interpret inner speech in this way.

2. The poet meant that the tongue clarifies and translates what the speaker conceives of speech in his heart. The Ashʿarīs do not interpret inner speech in this way either.
3. What is heard of the Qur'an is called the Speech of Allah *Exalted is He* in any tongue whatsoever. This is well known among all Muslims and accords with established linguistic convention. Thus, what is heard from the poetry of Imruʾ al-Qays is called the speech of Imruʾ al-Qays, and what is heard from the sermons of Amīr al-Muʾminīn *(Peace be Upon Him)* is called his speech; likewise, what is heard from the Qur'an is called the Speech of Allah *Exalted is He* and is called *Qur'an*. Accordingly, the Qur'an states: *"And if any one of the polytheists seeks your protection, then grant him protection so that he may hear the speech of Allah"* **[al-Tawbah: 6].**
4. The Ashʿarīs have not clarified the reality of inner speech except with statements that yield no meaningful understanding—so much so that some of their greatest imams said that, after more than thirty years of investigation and inquiry, he still did not understand what inner speech Abu al-Ḥasan al-Ashʿarī intended. For they say that inner speech is a real attribute of Allah *Exalted is He*, distinct from what the speaker conceives in himself before speaking, distinct from knowledge of it, and distinct from the ability to express it—yet after that they were unable to define what is intended by it. Such is the nature of falsehood.

They have doctrines of this kind that they cannot prove—nor even adequately explain—such as *acquisition* (*kasb*), concerning which their schools became constricted in attempting to interpret and clarify it.

Likewise, is their statement that Allah *Exalted is He* will be seen on the Day of Resurrection "without how," and similarly the statement of their brethren, the Ḥashwiyyah, that Allah *Exalted is He* has a face "without how," and hands "without how," and so on.

[The Sunnah]

It is the second proof after the Book of Allah *Exalted is He*, and what is meant by it is the report transmitted from the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*—whether it is a report, a command, or a prohibition; and whether the report concerns an action, an approval, or anything else.

Those who lived during the time of the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* received the Sunnah directly from him, and did not need hardship or effort for that.

As for those who did not see the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*, or did not live in his time, it is obligatory upon them to investigate, examine, and scrutinize the authenticity of what is narrated from the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*. Whatever of his Sunnah *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* is established as authentic for them, they follow it; and whatever is not authentic, they leave it.

[The Mass-Transmitted Report (*al-Khabar al-Mutawātir*)]

There is no disagreement regarding the validity of the mass-transmitted report from the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*. It is that which is transmitted by a group from a group, such that reason deems it impossible for them to have agreed upon a lie, and so on back to the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*. It is stipulated that their report concern something perceptible.

A specific number is not stipulated; rather, whatever yields knowledge and certainty.

Justice is not stipulated in the reporters, because knowledge may be attained through reports of towns and kings from those who are not just.

Knowledge may also be attained when a single person reports about himself and about a group present with him that "we saw such-and-such" or "we heard such-and-such," and the present ones remain silent—neither denying him nor contradicting him—when there is no motive for their silence such as fear or the like.

Types of Mutawātir

Semantic mass transmission (al-tawātur al-maʿnawī): This is when the reports of the narrators differ in wording but share in conveying one meaning. An example of this is the events concerning the Executor (al-Waṣī) *(Peace be Upon Him)*, for they are many occurrences reported in separate narrations, yet they agree upon one meaning—namely, indicating his bravery *(Peace be Upon Him)*.

[The Report Accepted by the Ummah]

A solitary report that does not reach the level of mass transmission, if the Ummah has received it with acceptance, then there is no disagreement regarding its validity and the obligation of acting upon it. This is because the Ummah's acceptance of it takes the place of their consensus; and whatever is so yields knowledge according to most of our

Imams *(Peace be Upon Them)*. Likewise, whatever the ʿItrah (the Ahl al-Bayt) *(Peace be Upon Them)* have received with acceptance yields knowledge.

All of this is due to the establishment of evidences for the infallibility of the collective body of the Ummah and the collective body of the ʿItrah, such as His saying *Exalted is He*: *"And whoever opposes the Messenger after guidance has become clear to him and follows other than the way of the believers—We shall turn him to what he has turned to and burn him in Hell ..."* **[al-Nisāʾ: 115]**.

And in the ḥadīth: *"My Ummah will not agree upon misguidance,"* and *"There will always remain a group from my Ummah manifest upon the truth ..."*.

And concerning the ʿItrah: the Verse of Purification, the Verse of Affection, the ḥadīth of the Two Weighty Things (*al-Thaqalayn*), the ḥadīth of the Ark, and many others. God willing, a discussion of this will come later.

As for solitary reports, there are details and disagreements concerning them mentioned in the principles of jurisprudence.

[Acting Devotionally upon a Solitary Report]

Acting devotionally upon a solitary report is permissible, and there is no impediment to it. Evidence for this includes:

1- The consensus of the Companions and those after them upon acting by it; this was mentioned by Imam ʿAbd Allāh ibn Ḥamzah *(Peace be Upon Him)*.
2- His saying *Exalted is He*: *"O you who have believed, if a wicked person comes to you with news, then verify it, lest you harm people out of ignorance and then become regretful over what you have done"* **[al-Ḥujurāt]**. In it—together with the cause of its revelation—is evidence that the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* and the Companions acted upon solitary reports.
3- What is established in rational minds regarding the permissibility—or obligation—of acting upon a solitary report to avert harm from oneself.

The conditions for acting upon a solitary report are: justice and precision (accuracy), then presenting it to the Book of Allah *Exalted is He*.

The stipulation of presenting it (to the Qur'an) is the view of al-Qāsim, al-Hādī, his son al-Murtaḍā, al-Qāsim ibn ʿAlī al-ʿAyyānī *(Peace be Upon Them)*, and others—based on what is narrated from the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* that he said: *"Indeed,*

lies will be attributed to me as they were attributed to the Prophets before me. Whatever is narrated from me, present it to the Book of Allah; whatever accords with it is from me, and I have said it …"—the ḥadīth.[1]

[The Elaboration of the Commander of the Faithful *(Peace be Upon Him)* on the States of Narrators]

The Commander of the Faithful *(Peace be Upon Him)* has a detailed exposition regarding the conditions of narrators, mentioned in *Nahj al-Balāghah*. He said:

"Indeed, in the hands of people there is truth and falsehood, truthfulness and lying, abrogating and abrogated, general and specific, decisive and ambiguous, preservation and illusion. Lies were indeed attributed to the Messenger of Allah *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* during his lifetime, until he stood as a preacher and said: *'Whoever lies about me deliberately, let him prepare his seat in the Fire.'"*

What reaches you of ḥadīth comes only from four men—there is no fifth:

A hypocrite who outwardly displays faith and pretends Islam, who does not consider sin a burden nor feel constrained, and who deliberately lies about the Messenger of Allah *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace).* If people knew that he was a hypocrite and a liar, they would neither accept from him nor believe his word. But they say: 'He was a Companion of the Messenger of Allah *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace);* he saw him, heard from him, and received from him,' so they take from him—while Allah has already informed you about the hypocrites and described them as He described them to you. Then they remained after him *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* and drew near to the leaders of misguidance and the callers to the Fire through falsehood and slander. They entrusted them with offices, placed them over the necks of people, and consumed the world through them. People are with kings and the world, except those whom Allah protects. This is one of the four.

1- Reported by Imam al-Qāsim al-Rassī in *al-Radd ʿalā al-Rawāfiḍ* from his collected books and epistles, and likewise by Imam al-Hādī; and by al-Mutawakkil ʿalā Allāh Aḥmad ibn Sulaymān in *Ḥaqāʾiq al-Maʿrifah* (p. 414). See the detailed discussion in *Faṣl al-Khiṭāb fī Khabar al-ʿArḍ ʿalā al-Kitāb* by Imam al-Ḥujjah Majd al-Dīn ibn Muḥammad al-Muʾayyadī in *Majmaʿ al-Fawāʾid*. See also *Kashf al-Khafāʾ* (1/532) with the wording *"lies will be attributed to me"*—without its ending—and it narrates another ḥadīth indicating it with a different wording; it appears similarly in other sources. As for its ending, many ḥadīth scholars narrated it independently with the wording: *"Whatever comes to you from me, present it to the Book of Allah; whatever accords with it …"* See: *Maʿrifat al-Sunan wa al-Āthār* (1/111), no. 69; and something close to it in *Jāmiʿ al-Masānīd wa al-Sunan* (1/655), no. 1368; *Jāmiʿ al-Aḥādīth* (5/49), no. 3715, attributed to al-Ṭabarānī.

And a man who heard something from the Messenger of Allah *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* but did not preserve it as it was, so he erred in it without intending a lie. It is in his hands—he narrates it, acts upon it, and says: 'I heard it from the Messenger of Allah *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace).*' If people knew that he erred in it, they would not accept it from him; and if he himself knew that, he would abandon it.

And a third man who heard the Messenger of Allah *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* command something and then later forbid it, while he did not know; or heard him forbid something and then later command it, while he did not know. Thus he preserved the abrogated and did not preserve the abrogating. If he knew that it was abrogated, he would abandon it; and if the Muslims knew, when they heard it from him, that it was abrogated, they would abandon it.

And a fourth man who did not lie about Allah, Mighty and Majestic, nor about His Messenger *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*—one who detests lying out of fear of Allah and reverence for His Messenger, who did not err in it, but preserved what he heard exactly as he heard it, conveying it as it was without addition or omission. He preserved the abrogating and acted upon it, preserved the abrogated and avoided it, recognized the specific and the general and placed everything in its proper place, and recognized the ambiguous and the decisive.

Speech from the Messenger of Allah *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* sometimes had two aspects: specific speech and general speech. One who does not know what the Messenger *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* intended hears it and carries it, directing it without knowing its meaning, purpose, or the context from which it emerged.

Not all of the Companions of the Messenger of Allah *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* would ask him and seek clarification. Indeed, they used to like that a Bedouin or a newcomer would come and ask him *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* so they could hear his answer. Nothing of that ever passed by me except that I asked about it and preserved it. These are the causes of people's differences and the reasons for defects in their narrations." — End of his words *(Peace be Upon Him).*

[The Path to Knowing an Authentic Narration]

I say: The narrations transmitted from the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* have multiplied, as the Commander of the Faithful *(Peace be Upon Him)* stated. The Islamic sects today have become many, and each sect narrates from ḥadīth what can

scarcely be counted, compiling it in books. It is not permissible to accept what is narrated from the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* unless a sound proof is established for the authenticity of the narration.

What indicates the authenticity of a narration is either:

—That the differing sects agree upon its authenticity; or

—That a reliable proof is established for the trustworthiness and uprightness of the narrators. No such proof has been established except for the trustworthiness and uprightness of the Ahl al-Bayt *(Peace be Upon Them)*—such as the ḥadīth of al-Thaqalayn, the ḥadīth of the Cloak, the Verse of Purification, the Verse of Affection, and the like. These constitute testimony from Allah and His Messenger *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* to the uprightness and trustworthiness of the Household of the Messenger, that they are the people of conveyance and guidance, that whoever follows them is saved, and whoever opposes them is ruined.

Accordingly, whatever the Ahl al-Bayt authenticate from ḥadīth is authentic, and whatever they do not authenticate is not. As for the rest of the sects, they have not produced proof for the authenticity of what they narrate.

Some have said that it is impermissible, by transmitted evidence, to act upon a solitary report, citing His saying *Exalted is He: "And do not pursue that of which you have no knowledge"* **[al-Isrāʾ: 36]**, *and His saying Exalted is He*: *"Indeed, conjecture avails nothing against the truth"* **[Yūnus: 36]**, and similar verses that forbid following conjecture.

***The response*:** A specific proof has established acting upon the solitary report of a trustworthy narrator. Thus, the generality of the aforementioned verses must be specified by that particular proof—so as to reconcile the evidences. Such reconciliation is necessary in cases like this, as established in the books of legal principles.

[The Infallibility of the Prophets from Whim and Error]

It is not permissible for the Prophets *(May Allah's Blessings be Upon Them)* to err or forget in what they were commanded to convey, because permitting that would remove trust. Allah *Exalted is He* said: *"Whatever the Messenger gives you—take it; and whatever he forbids you—refrain from it"* **[al-Ḥashr: 7]**, and He *Exalted is He* said: *"He does not speak from desire; it is nothing but revelation revealed"* **[al-Najm]**.

Thus, Allah *Exalted is He* commanded taking everything that proceeds from His Messenger *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* absolutely and in all circumstances, without exception. We

therefore know that Allah *Exalted is He* protected His Messenger from error and forgetfulness in what he was commanded to convey to people.

[Analogy (Qiyās)]

Analogy is the third of the legal proofs. We have previously mentioned something indicating its consideration. It is: attaching a subsidiary case to an original case to obtain the same ruling of the original for the subsidiary, due to their sharing in an effective cause.

An example is analogizing nabīdh, hashish, and all intoxicants to wine, because of their shared cause—the intoxication that led the Lawgiver to prohibit wine.

There is also a type of analogy called *inverse analogy (qiyās al-ʿaks)*, which is attaching a subsidiary case to an original to obtain the opposite of the ruling of the original for the subsidiary, due to their divergence in the effective cause. An example is analogizing the witr prayer to the dawn prayer.

The ruling derived from this analogy is that witr is supererogatory. The effective cause in the subsidiary case is the permissibility of performing witr on a mount, whereas the effective cause in the original case is the impermissibility of performing the dawn prayer on a mount.

Analogy has details, categories, and conditions mentioned in the books of *uṣūl al-fiqh*.

[Consensus (al-Ijmāʿ)]

Consensus is one of the evidences, and it is divided into two types: general consensus and specific consensus.

The first is the agreement of the just mujtahids from the Ummah of Muhammad *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* in a given era upon a matter.

The second is the agreement of the just mujtahids from the Family of the Messenger *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* in a given era upon a matter.

What indicates that the consensus of the Ummah is an evidence is the saying of Allah *Exalted is He*: *"And whoever opposes the Messenger after guidance has become clear to him and follows other than the way of the believers—We shall turn him to what he has turned to and burn him in Hell; and an evil destination it is."* **[al-Nisāʾ]** Thus, whoever opposes the consensus of the believers is following other than their way, and whoever follows other than their way falls under the threat mentioned—by the explicit wording of this verse.

And in the ḥadīth: *"My Ummah will never agree upon misguidance."*

And in another ḥadīth: *"There will always remain a group from my Ummah manifest upon the truth …"*—the ḥadīth.

In the books of *uṣūl al-fiqh* there are many more proofs for consensus; take them from there.

[The Consensus of the Family of the Messenger *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*]

What indicates that the consensus of the Family of the Messenger *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* is an evidence and a proof is his statement in the well-known, mass-transmitted ḥadīth, narrated by groups of the Ummah and recorded in *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*[1] and others: "*Indeed, I am leaving among you that which—if you hold fast to it—you will never go astray after me: the Book of Allah and my progeny, my Ahl al-Bayt. The Subtle, the All-Aware has informed me that they will never separate until they return to me at the Pond*."[2]

In the Sunnah there is an abundance—almost beyond counting—of what supports what we have mentioned.

This is in addition to what has come in the Qur'an confirming it, such as the Verse of Purification and the Verse of Affection, and the like.

Yes, these four evidences—the Book, the Sunnah, analogy (qiyās), and consensus (ijmāʿ)—are the foundations from which the rulings of the Sharīʿah are derived. Hence, they are called "the foundations of the laws" (uṣūl al-sharāʾiʿ). Included under this designation—along with what we have mentioned—are matters known of the religion by necessity, such as prayer, fasting, pilgrimage, zakāh, jihād, the prohibition of adultery, wine, usury, and similar definitive, well-known rulings.

Division and Disagreement

Division in religion and disagreement concerning it are forbidden in

1- Imam al-Ḥujjah Majd al-Dīn ibn Muḥammad al-Muʾayyadī *(Peace be Upon Him)* said in *Lawāmiʿ al-Anwār* (1/101–102, 4th ed.), when mentioning Muslim's narration of this ḥadīth: "He narrated it in the sermon of Ghadīr through several routes, but did not complete them; rather, he mentioned the report of al-Thaqalayn and omitted the rest." See the margin of *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim* (4/1492), no. (2408), Dār Ibn Ḥazm edition.

2- See the documentation of this ḥadīth in *Lawāmiʿ al-Anwār* by Imam al-Ḥujjah Majd al-Dīn ibn Muḥammad al-Muʾayyadī *(Peace be Upon Him)* (1/99, 4th ed.), under the heading [Those Who Transmitted the Reports of al-Thaqalayn and Holding Fast to Them]. He mentioned those from the Ahl al-Bayt *(Peace be Upon Them)* and their followers (*May Allah be pleased with them*) who narrated it, as well as those among the scholars of the wider community, including: Aḥmad ibn Ḥanbal and his son ʿAbd Allāh, Ibn Abī Shaybah, al-Khaṭīb, Ibn al-Maghāzilī, al-Kanjī, al-Samhūdī, al-Thaʿlabī, al-Nasāʾī, Abū Dāwūd, al-Tirmidhī, Abū Yaʿlā, al-Ṭabarānī, al-Ḍiyāʾ, Abū Nuʿaym, ʿAbd ibn Ḥumayd, Abū Mūsā al-Madanī, Abū al-Futūḥ al-ʿAjalī, Isḥāq ibn Rāhawayh, al-Dūlābī, al-Bazzār, al-Zarandī, Ibn al-Baṭrīq, al-Jaʿābī, and others (abridged from pp. 99–104).

the Book of Allah, *Exalted is He*. Allah says, addressing the Muslims in Sūrat Āl ʿImrān: *"And do not be like those who became divided and differed after clear proofs had come to them; and for those there is a tremendous punishment."* **[Āl ʿImrān]** And He, *Exalted and Glorious*, says: *"He has ordained for you of religion what He enjoined upon Noah, and that which We have revealed to you, and what We enjoined upon Abraham, Moses, and Jesus: that you establish the religion and do not become divided therein…"* **[al-Shūrā: 13]**

And in the well-known ḥadīth: *"My Ummah will split into seventy-three sects; all of them are doomed except one".*[1]

To proceed: disagreement that tears apart unity and leads to enmity, mutual hatred, and severing of ties is detestable to reason and reprehensible to sound human nature, because of the corruption and destruction to which it leads. Allah, *Exalted is He*, has said: *"And do not dispute, lest you lose courage and your strength depart…"* **[al-Anfāl: 46]**

Therefore, it is neither permissible nor appropriate to pay attention to what some interlopers say in trivializing disagreement, or to their attacking the ḥadīth *"My Ummah will split…"*, and then narrating the report: *"The difference of my Ummah is a mercy."*

This is because the ḥadīth of division is well known among all groups of the Ummah and has been received with acceptance. What is received in such a manner does not admit of disparagement. Even if they were able to criticize that well-known ḥadīth, the verse from Sūrat Āl ʿImrān that we cited explicitly and decisively states the prohibition of disagreement and division and threatens severe punishment for it.

As for their adducing the report *"The difference of my Ummah is a mercy"*[2], it is not sound due to its contradiction of the explicit text of the Qur'an. Whatever contradicts the Qur'an must not be considered nor relied upon.

1- This has been transmitted in the books of ḥadīth scholars with similar wording. See *Kashf al-Khafā'* (1/169), no. (446), where it is mentioned that Ibn Abī al-Dunyā, Abū Dāwūd, al-Tirmidhī, al-Ḥākim, and Ibn Ḥibbān narrated it and authenticated it, as did al-Shaʿrānī in *al-Mīzān* (abridged).

2- al-Manāwī said in *Fayḍ al-Qadīr* (1/274), quoting al-Subkī: "It is not known among the ḥadīth scholars, and I have not found for it a sound, weak, or fabricated chain (perhaps it appeared in some books of the ḥadīth masters that have not reached us)." It was attributed in *al-Madkhal* and likewise by al-Daylamī in *Musnad al-Firdaws*, both from Ibn ʿAbbās, raised, with the wording *'The difference of my Companions is a mercy.'* The difference of the Companions concerning rulings is the difference of the Ummah, as mentioned earlier. However, this ḥadīth—al-Ḥāfiẓ al-ʿIrāqī said—has a weak chain. His son, the verifying scholar Abū Zurʿah, said: It was also narrated by Ādam ibn Abī Iyās in *Kitāb al-ʿIlm* with the wording *'The difference of my Companions is a mercy for my Ummah'*, and it is a weak, mursal report. In *Ṭabaqāt Ibn Saʿd* there is something similar from al-Qāsim ibn Muḥammad.

Types of Disagreement

Disagreement is of two kinds:

1. Disagreement in foundational (uṣūlī) matters.
2. Disagreement in subsidiary, practical matters.

Disagreement in Foundational Matters

Disagreement in foundational matters is the disagreement that has torn apart the unity of the Ummah and turned it into sects and parties—*"each party rejoicing in what it has"* **[al-Muʾminūn]**—with some declaring others unbelievers, some cursing others, and so on.

All this disagreement and hostility arose from disagreement over matters that pertain to knowledge of Allah, *Exalted is He*, and what is connected to it from the issues of the foundations of religion.

Disagreement in Subsidiary Matters

Disagreement in subsidiary matters, although it falls under the general prohibition mentioned in the Qur'an, is light and tolerable, for several reasons:

1. Because it occurred in the time of the Companions.
2. Because it occurred among the Imams from Ahl Al-Bayt, *peace be upon them.*
3. Because it does not lead to enmity, misguidance, or mutual excommunication.
4. Because it does not weaken the bond of affection and loyalty among those who differ.

Moreover, it is unavoidable, due to the differing perspectives of qualified scholars in deriving the finer points of legal rulings. Allah, *Exalted is He*, has said: *"Allah does not burden a soul beyond its capacity."* **[al-Baqarah: 286]** *"Allah does not burden a soul except with what He has given it."* **[al-Ṭalāq: 7]**

Error in ijtihād and reasoning is excused, as indicated by His saying: *"And there is no blame upon you for that in which you erred, but only for what your hearts deliberately intended."* **[al-Aḥzāb: 5]**

And in the ḥadīth: *"My Ummah has been pardoned for error and forgetfulness…"*

Nevertheless, it is incumbent upon qualified scholars to strive, as much as possible, for agreement in subsidiary matters, through discussion, mutual understanding, and each becoming acquainted with the evidences held by the other in a given issue. In this way disagreement will be reduced, and this is what is required. To something of this nature,

Imam al-Hādī, peace be upon him, alluded.

As for disagreement in matters of creed, its remedy is difficult and arduous, and it is not removed or reduced except by an overriding authority and a strong state.

However, it remains obligatory upon the scholar to manifest his knowledge and clarify his proofs to the obstinate opponent, so that *"he who perishes may perish upon clear proof, and he who lives may live upon clear proof."* **[al-Anfāl: 42]**

The Unity of Truth in Foundational Matters

The truth in foundational matters is one.

By foundational matters is meant the issues of the foundations of religion—which are the subject of this book—the issues of the foundations of jurisprudence, along with the foundational laws mentioned shortly before this chapter, and definitive matters among subsidiary rulings.

All such matters admit of only one truth, meaning that it is not permissible to deem all differing opinions correct in any of them.

There is no disagreement among the sects of the Ummah concerning this principle. The Muʿtazilah declare misguided whoever opposes them in any of these matters; likewise the Ashʿarīs and the various determinist sects—each sect declares its opponent misguided. The Imāmiyyah declare their opponents misguided, as do the various Shiʿi sects—each declaring the other misguided—and the Zaydiyyah likewise declare their opponents misguided, and so on.

After their consensus on this point, there is no need to establish further proof that the truth in these matters is one.

[The Ruling Concerning One Who Opposes the Truth in This Chapter]

The ruling that applies to one who opposes the truth in any of the aforementioned issues varies according to the differences of the issues themselves and the circumstances. The gravest of these rulings is disbelief, and the least of them is pardon.

1- Whoever denies the obligation of prayer, or zakāh, or denies the prohibition of wine, or denies what is similar to these definitive rulings that are well known in the religion of Islam—such a person is a disbeliever, upon whom the rulings of disbelief apply; because he has denied Allah *Exalted is He* and His Messenger *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*. The Bāṭiniyyah fall under this category according to many scholars.

2- The one who is ignorant of Allah *Exalted is He* is a disbeliever, whether that ignorance is due to deliberate intent and obstinacy, or due to error and ignorance.

The evidence for this is that Allah *Exalted is He* did not excuse any of the polytheists, nor others from the People of the Book, on account of ignorance, error, or otherwise. Rather, He commanded His Messenger *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* to apply to them the rulings of disbelief, such as killing, enslavement, and the taking of spoils of wealth, and so forth.

Likewise, the one who likens Allah *Exalted is He* to His creation is ignorant of Allah *Exalted is He*, and similarly the determinist (al-mujbir). This is in addition to their denial of Allah *Exalted is He* in texts of the Qur'an that can hardly be counted, which cry out in refutation of the determinists and the anthropomorphists. *Exalted is Allah far above what they say, with a great exaltation.*

3- Whoever interprets the verses of the Qur'an in a manner they do not bear and without evidence—such as the Bāṭiniyyah—is a disbeliever, due to their denial of Allah and His Messenger. This is because of their claim to possess knowledge of the hidden inner meaning, for which Allah has not made any path.

4- Whoever deliberately opposes one of the two consensuses [the general and specific consensuses] is a transgressor, due to his intentional opposition to the truth, but this does not raise him to the level of disbelief. This is because the evidence indicating the authority of the two consensuses is not necessary knowledge, but rather inferential.

5- Whoever opposes the truth by mistake in matters other than those mentioned—such as one who marries a woman during her waiting period (ʿiddah) out of ignorance, or one who errs in some foundational issues in which error does not necessitate ignorance of Allah *Exalted is He*—then he is excused, due to the saying of Allah *Exalted is He*: *"And there is no blame upon you for that in which you have erred, but only for what your hearts intended."* **[al-Aḥzāb: 5]**

[Disagreement in Speculative Ijtihād Issues]

The majority of our Imams *(Peace be upon them)* and the majority of others have said: The truth in speculative subsidiary matters is one; whoever attains it is correct, and whoever misses it is mistaken.

It has also been said: Every mujtahid in speculative subsidiary matters is correct with respect to the truth, meaning that Allah has no specific ruling therein prior to ijtihād; rather, the intent of Allah *Exalted is He* for each mujtahid is whatever his ijtihād leads him to.

I say: Speculative subsidiary matters are divided into two categories:

The first: That which is derived from the Book and the Sunnah through one of the recognized forms of indication.

The second: That which is derived through ijtihād, such as the detailed rulings of compensations for injuries, valuation of damaged property, estimation of maintenance expenses, estimation of the penalty for hunting, and similar matters for which no specific ruling has come in the Book or the Sunnah.

As for the first category, the truth therein is with one. As for the second category, every mujtahid therein is correct.

The Evidence for What We Have Mentioned

As for the first category: there is no doubt that the Book and the Sunnah contain legal rulings indicated by recognized evidences in the Arabic language.

Both the Qur'an and the Messenger *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* are Arabic, and the Lawgiver is Wise and does not address with that which He does not intend.

Thus, whoever attains the intent of Allah *Exalted is He* therein is correct, and whoever misses it is mistaken.

Therefore, the mujtahid who acts upon a general text without a complete investigation of its specification is mistaken, insofar as he includes what is specified under the ruling of the general, while in reality it is not included.

Likewise, the mujtahid who acts upon an abrogated ruling and abandons the abrogating one is mistaken, because the ruling of Allah *Exalted is He* is determined in the specified and in the abrogating text.

As for the second category: no one can claim that the ruling of Allah *Exalted is He* is specifically determined therein in the manner mentioned. This is due to the agreement that there is no way to establish rulings in such matters except through ijtihād, because Allah *Exalted is He* mentioned in His Book and upon the tongue of His Messenger *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* only general rulings. As for detailed rulings, He *Exalted is He* entrusted them to the judgment of rulers and mujtahids.

Thus, if the mujtahid exerts effort in such matters, exhausts his investigation, and then issues a ruling in light of that, then without doubt he has fulfilled the intent of Allah, has been correct in his ruling, and has carried out what he was charged with—provided that he exerted maximum effort in investigation and inquiry.

[The Proofs of Those Who Say That Every Mujtahid in Speculative Subsidiary Issues Is Correct, and the Response to Them]

Yes, those who say that every mujtahid in speculative subsidiary issues is correct argue with evidences, among them the saying of Allah *Exalted is He*: *"Whatever palm trees you cut down or left standing on their roots—it was by the permission of Allah."* **[al-Ḥashr: 5]** And His saying *Exalted is He* regarding those who were confused about the direction of the qiblah: *"So wherever you turn, there is the Face of Allah. Indeed, Allah is All-Encompassing, All-Knowing."* **[al-Baqarah]**

And they argue that the Companions differed in many issues, yet some of them did not object to others.

The response: As for the first verse: cutting and leaving are from the permissible matters in which doing and leaving are equal; whoever cut did so by the permission of Allah, and whoever left did so by the permission of Allah *Exalted is He*. Thus, there is no blame upon the one who cut nor upon the one who left.

As for the second verse: those who prayed toward other than the qiblah after exerting effort were correct in what they did and fulfilled what was required of them toward Allah, because Allah *Exalted is He* does not burden a soul beyond its capacity.

And His saying at the end of the verse: *"Indeed, Allah is All-Encompassing, All-Knowing,"* indicates what we have said. That is, the meaning is that Allah *Exalted is He* is vast in mercy; therefore, He does not constrict those who prayed toward other than the qiblah, nor does He deprive them of reward. And He is Knowing of their condition and their weakness; therefore, He did not impose hardship upon them for their mistake, due to His knowledge of their inability in that situation.

As for what has been narrated regarding the Companions not objecting to one another in their disagreements, it does not indicate what you have claimed—that the truth is with each one of them. This is because objection is only obligatory against one who commits sins by abandoning an obligation or committing a prohibition, and the differing Companions were not like that, since every mujtahid is accountable for what his ijtihād leads him to.

Moreover, it is well known from the Commander of the Faithful *(Peace be upon him)* that he objected to many issues in which the Companions differed, and objection has also been transmitted from many of the Companions.

[The Ruling Concerning One Who Errs in Matters of Ijtihād]

If a mujtahid errs and does not attain the truth after exhausting

investigation, examination, and diligent inquiry, then there is no sin upon him, due to the saying of Allah *Exalted is He*: *"And there is no blame upon you for that in which you have erred, but only for what your hearts intended."* **[al-Aḥzāb: 5]** However, this is conditional upon the mujtahid not deliberately opposing the Ahl al-Bayt *(Peace be upon Them)*, that the sciences of the Ahl al-Bayt be the source of his ijtihād, and that the principles of their uṣūl be the foundations upon which his ijtihād is built.

We have said this because it has been established by abundant evidences that the Ahl al-Bayt are the people of the truth, that whoever follows them is saved, and whoever opposes them is doomed. And even if there were no evidence other than the mutawātir ḥadīth of al-Thaqalayn, it would suffice—how much more so when there has come regarding this what can hardly be counted?

[Abrogation]

Abrogation (*al-naskh*) is the replacement of one legal ruling with another legal ruling, with the condition that a period of time passes in which acting upon the first ruling is possible. The Muslims have agreed upon the permissibility of abrogation, and only anomalous individuals have opposed it.

The aspect of wisdom in abrogation lies in what results from it of rulings and interests that return to the servants, and there is no doubt that these differ according to changing circumstances and times.

Al-badāʾ is not permissible with respect to Allah *Exalted is He*, because it necessitates heedlessness, and heedlessness is impossible for Allah *Exalted is He*.

Al-badāʾ means that one commands something, then forbids that very thing or commands its opposite, because it appeared to him after the first command that the interest lay in abandoning it or in something else.

[The Book of Imamate]

The issue of Imamate is among the greatest and most momentous issues of the fundamentals of religion, due to what results from it of striving against oppressors, reviving the religion, establishing justice, equity, and prescribed punishments, securing roads, collecting alms and fayʾ, then distributing them, and due to what it contains of reforming religion and worldly life.

The Imam is the successor of the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* and his deputy, carrying out his actions and functions; therefore, knowledge of the Imamate is obligatory upon every legally responsible person. This is affirmed by the well-known report: *"Whoever dies without knowing his Imam dies a death of ignorance".*

And in *Nahj al-Balāghah* it is stated: *"Indeed, the Imams are the overseers of Allah over His creation, His representatives over His servants. None enters Paradise except one who knows them and whom they know, and none enters the Fire except one who denies them and whom they deny."*

Much has been transmitted in *Sharḥ al-Asās* regarding this meaning from the Imams of the Ahl al-Bayt *(Peace be upon Them)*, in which they emphasized and strongly stressed the obligation of knowing the Imams upon every legally responsible person.

However, Imam al-Qāsim ibn Ibrāhīm *(Peace be upon Him)* excluded from this the non-Arab, the woman, and the ignorant one who has neither read the Qur'an nor learned knowledge, for he said that the general affirmation of Islam suffices them.

He *(Peace be upon Him)* intended that their acknowledgment of Islam in general suffices them.

The Imamate can only belong to a single person, because the multiplicity of Imams at one time and in one land leads to conflict, dispute, and corruption.

This is unlike prophethood, for none of that occurs therein, because the Prophet follows revelation. It is permissible for two Imams to exist at the same time when the lands between the two Imams are far apart, as was the case between Imam al-Hādī ilā al-Ḥaqq and Imam al-Nāṣir al-Uṭrūsh *(Peace be upon Them)*.

The Imamate is among the obligations affirmed by both reason and revelation.

Reason necessitates repelling the harm of some people from others, and this cannot be achieved except through an Imam. This is because people, despite their great numbers and differing dispositions and

motives, do not refrain from some transgressing against others and some oppressing others, nor are they deterred from that except when there is a leader possessing power, authority, and supporters, whose fear prevents them from injustice and transgression. Moreover, the custom of humankind in every time and place is that no tribe or people exist except that they have a leader who restrains the strong from the weak and gives justice to the oppressed against the oppressor.

As for the evidence from revelation: when the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* passed away, the Companions unanimously agreed that there must be a leader to manage the affairs of the Ummah. Likewise, from after them until today, whenever the Imam dies, they hasten to appoint an Imam, seek him out, and believe in the obligation of his establishment.

It is obligatory upon the Ummah to support the one who is suitable for it with wealth, life, hearts, and limbs, and upon this the Ummah has agreed.

This is because the preservation of the core of Islam, the establishment of its rites, the establishment of justice and equity, the implementation of prescribed punishments, and so forth, cannot be achieved except through supporting and aiding the Imam.

[No Era Is Devoid of One Fit for the Caliphate]

There must, in every era, exist one who is suitable for the Imamate in its legal office. Upon this the ʿItrah have agreed, and others have concurred with them.

The evidence for this is his saying *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* in the well-known ḥadīth: *"My Ahl al-Bayt are like the stars; whenever a star sets, another star rises"*.[1]

And his saying *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* in the ḥadīth of al-Thaqalayn: *"Indeed, I am leaving among you that which, if you hold fast to it, you will never go astray after me: the Book of Allah and my progeny, the people of my House. The All-Subtle, the All-Aware has informed me that they will never separate until they return to me at the Pond".*

And his *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* saying: *"Indeed, with every innovation by which Islam is nearly destroyed, there is a guardian from my Ahl al-Bayt appointed, who proclaims the truth, illuminates it, and repels the plot of the schemers. So take heed, O*

1- See the ḥadīth and its verification in *Lawāmiʿ al-Anwār* by Imam al-Ḥujjah Majd al-Dīn ibn Muḥammad al-Muʾayyadī *(Peace be upon Him)*, (vol. 1, p. 125, 4th ed.).

people of insight, and rely upon Allah".[1]

And the Commander of the Faithful (Peace be upon Him) says, as reported in Nahj al-Balāghah: *"O Allah, indeed, the earth is never devoid of one who stands for Allah with a proof—either manifest and well-known, or fearful and concealed—so that the proofs of Allah and His clear signs may not be rendered void."*[2]

The absence, in some eras, of an Imam's undertaking leadership and manifest appearance occurred only due to the oppression of the unjust and the domination of tyrants. In such circumstances, it is not obligatory upon the Imam to rise and appear, due to the absence of the condition that necessitates that obligation. In such a state, the Ummah is excused, while remaining resolved upon supporting Islam.

[The Most Important Conditions of the Imamate]

Among the most important conditions of the Imamate are: the designated office, knowledge, piety, courage, sound governance, freedom from defects that undermine the functions of the Caliphate and from repelling traits, and superiority.

As for the office of the Caliphate, it belongs to ʿAlī *(Peace be upon Him)*, al-Ḥasan and al-Ḥusayn *(Peace be upon Them)*, and their progeny.

The evidence for this is the well-known, mutawātir, and established ḥadīth of al-Thaqalayn, which has been transmitted by the groups of the Ummah. In it, the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* clarified to the Ummah two successors who would stand in his place *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* after his passing and fill the void that the Ummah would find after the separation from its Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*: one of them is the Book of Allah *Exalted is He*, and the other is his progeny, the people of his House *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*. Then he *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* clarified his progeny, the people of his House, in the well-known, mutawātir ḥadīth of al-Kisāʾ, narrated by Muslim and others. Thus, the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* clarified the office of the Caliphate with the most complete clarification and distinguished it with the most complete distinction.

It has also been said that its office belongs to all of Quraysh, and other views have been stated as well. They cited as evidence what has been narrated from the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and*

1- See the ḥadīth and its verification in *Lawāmiʿ al-Anwār* by Imam al-Ḥujjah Majd al-Dīn ibn Muḥammad al-Muʾayyadī *(Peace be upon Him)*, (vol. 4, p. 53, 1st ed.).
2- *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah*, (vol. 18, p. 347).

grant them peace): *"The Imams are from Quraysh"* and *"Put Quraysh forward and do not put yourselves before them".*

The response is that what is intended by this are those whom we have mentioned, due to the ḥadīth of al-Thaqalayn, the ḥadīth of al-Kisāʾ, and the consensus of the Ahl al-Bayt *(Peace be upon Them)* upon this matter—and their consensus is authoritative, as has preceded.

And due to the saying of ʿAlī *(Peace be upon Him)*: *"The Imams are from Quraysh; they were planted in this branch of Hāshim. It is not suitable upon others, nor are rulers suitable from other than them."*

And because those whom we mentioned are the closest in kinship to the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*, and Allah *Exalted is He* has said: *"And those of kinship are more entitled to one another in the Book of Allah."* **[al-Anfāl: 75]**

This is while the two aforementioned ḥadīths are from solitary reports (āḥād), which—if authentic—do not yield anything but conjecture. Whereas what we are dealing with here pertains to matters of knowledge and belief, which are established only through definitive, well-known proofs. Our proof is mutawātir, well known, supported by the verses of the Book, and by what can hardly be counted of the ḥadīths of the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*.

It was incumbent upon the Ummah, after the death of the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*—even if there had been no explicit texts—to appoint, after his death, the members of his Household to occupy the position of the Caliphate. This is because the household of a man are the most entitled of people to his position. Upon this practice were all the Arabs and non-Arabs, and they remained upon it until this century. However, the Ummah, after his death *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*, turned away from the general custom of humankind, departed from its norms, and completely disregarded the texts of its Prophet.

As for knowledge, it is stipulated that the Imam be a mujtahid, because the Imam is the successor of the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* and stands in his place. No one is able to fulfill the rights of the Caliphate except a learned mujtahid; as for the ignorant, it is inconceivable that he could undertake the application and execution of the laws of Islam.

As for piety (warʿ), it is the main axis upon which the millstone of the Caliphate revolves, because the objective of the Caliphate is the establishment of justice among people, equity, and so forth. One who does not refrain from the forbidden cannot achieve this, because impurity is not purified by washing with impurity; rather, it is purified

only by washing with pure water.

Some theologians have said: the Imamate and the Caliphate are established for one who gains them through domination, even if he is immoral and ignorant. This is a widespread doctrine among the Ahl al-Sunnah. What appears to me is that it is a doctrine imposed by political reality, for people had been pledging allegiance to the Imamate and Caliphate, since the time of Muʿāwiyah, to whoever overpowered authority, without regard to whether the one who overpowered deserved the Imamate. By this, he would be called an Imam and a Caliph.

Refuting such a claim does not require the presentation of proofs, for sound natural reason does not regard a treacherous betrayer as fit to bear any trust, even if it were small—so how could he be fit to bear the trust of the Caliphate, which is the function of the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*? Allah *Exalted is He* has said: *"And do not incline toward those who have done wrong, lest the Fire touch you ..."* **[Hūd: 113]** And He *Glorified is He* has said: *"And I would not take the misguiders as assistants."* **[al-Kahf]** And He, *Majestic is His Majesty*, has said: *"My covenant does not reach the wrongdoers."* **[al-Baqarah]**

As for superiority (afḍaliyyah), it is necessary that he be the best of the people of his time, or among the best of them, in knowledge, piety, sound governance and policy, eloquence, good character, and the like of those qualities that have a role in the functions of the Caliphate.

The evidence for this is the saying of Allah *Exalted is He*: *"... He said: Indeed, Allah has chosen him over you and has increased him abundantly in knowledge and physique ..."* **[al-Baqarah: 247]** And His saying *Exalted is He*: *"Men are caretakers of women by virtue of what Allah has favored some of them over others ..."* **[al-Nisāʾ: 34]** In these two verses, Allah *Exalted is He* clarifies that kingship and authority are due to an increase in merit.

Upon this the Companions agreed. Whoever reads what occurred in the pledges of allegiance to Abū Bakr, ʿUmar, and ʿUthmān will know this and verify it.

This is in addition to what Allah *Exalted is He* has implanted in the innate dispositions of minds of the repugnance toward the domination of the inferior over the superior. Do you not see the repulsiveness and lack of propriety in the command of a son over his father, a young person over an elder, an ignorant person over a scholar, and so forth?

Abū al-ʿAbbās stipulated infallibility (ʿiṣmah) as a condition for the Imam. There is no evidence for what he said, nor is there any path to knowledge of it after the cessation of revelation. Perhaps his intent was that whoever appears to us to possess the complete qualities of the Imamate is judged to be infallible, because had he not been so, his hidden

immorality would have become apparent.

There is no need to stipulate infallibility when justice and piety are stipulated. The assumption of the occurrence of sin does not invalidate or undermine matters when justice and piety are present. If the Imam commits disbelief or manifest immorality, his Imamate becomes void, just as it would if he were to die.

[The Path to the Imamate]

The Caliphate and the Imamate are not established for anyone among the people except by a legal proof. This is because it is an authority over people's lives and wealth, and by it the Imam gains the right to obligatory obedience from the subjects in what he commands and forbids. By it, he becomes the successor of the Messenger *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*, speaks with his tongue, strikes with his hand, and has the rights that the Messenger *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* had, and bears the responsibilities that he bore.

Thus, this great legal foundation is not established for anyone except by a definitive legal proof to whose authenticity the Muslims submit.

Therefore, ***all of the Zaydiyyah said***: the path to the Imamate is the explicit designation (naṣṣ) of ʿAlī *(Peace be upon Him)* and al-Ḥasan and al-Ḥusayn *(Peace be upon Them)* individually, and within their progeny a general designation contained in the well-known, mutawātir ḥadīth of al-Thaqalayn, namely his saying *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*: *"Indeed, I am leaving among you the Two Weighty Things: the Book of Allah and my progeny, the people of my House".*

The Muʿtazilah and the Ashʿariyyah said: there is no designation of a specific Imam after the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*, but the Companions agreed upon contract and choice; whoever was contracted for and chosen—and he is from Quraysh—becomes an Imam, due to consensus upon that, and consensus is a legal proof. Thus they said.

The Ḥashwiyyah said: the Imamate is established by coercion and domination.

The Imāmiyyah said: there is an explicit designation of twelve Imams, specified by name.

The soundest and most upright of these opinions is the first opinion, which is the opinion of the Zaydiyyah. As for the other opinions, none of them is supported by any proof that upholds it.

As for the Muʿtazilah's and Ashʿariyyah's argument from consensus, it is an argument refuted by reality. The pledge to Abū Bakr was a sudden

affair (*faltah*), and Allah protected from its evil whom He protected, as has been narrated in the Ṣaḥīḥ collections. The pledge to ʿUmar was by nomination from Abū Bakr, without doubt. And the pledge to ʿUthmān was by nomination from ʿUmar among one of six. Thus, there was no consensus in that, nor contract, nor genuine choice.

If it is said: they agreed upon the Imamate of Abū Bakr, even if it was a sudden affair, and likewise upon the Imamate of ʿUmar, even if it was by nomination, and likewise upon the Imamate of ʿUthmān, even though the people of binding and loosing did not intervene in the Imamate of any of the three.

We say: a group of the Companions did not accept the Imamate of Abū Bakr, foremost among them the Commander of the Faithful *(Peace be upon Him)*. This is well known and mentioned in the books of history.

Their being forced to pledge allegiance after their refusal and their gathering in the house of Fāṭimah *(Peace be upon Her)* is well known.

The silence of the Commander of the Faithful *(Peace be upon Him)* and those with him thereafter does not indicate approval. Moreover, he *(Peace be upon Him)* later spoke openly after that silence and revealed what was in his heart, such as his saying in the sermon known as al-Shaqshaqiyyah: *"By Allah, the son of Abū Quḥāfah clothed himself with it, while he knew that my position with respect to it was like the position of the pivot in relation to the millstone. From me the floodwaters descend, and the bird does not soar up to me ...".*

Up to his saying: *"So I closed my eyes upon the speck, and drank upon the choking pain, seeing my inheritance plundered."*

Up to his saying: *"Then I looked, and there was no helper for me except my Ahl al-Bayt, so I refrained with them from death."* ...and to the end of the sermon. He *(Peace be upon Him)* has much speech of this kind recorded in the book *Nahj al-Balāghah*.

By this, the invalidity of the position of the Muʿtazilah and the Ashʿariyyah becomes clear.

As for the claim of the Imāmiyyah, they have not produced for it any proof or even a semblance of evidence, nor have they gone beyond the mere circle of claim.

There are also other doctrines,

among them: inheritance—held by those who show allegiance to the Abbasid caliphs; among them as well: the explicit designation (al-naṣṣ al-jalī) in favor of Abū Bakr; and likewise: the implicit designation (al-naṣṣ al-khafī) in favor of Abū Bakr.

The response is that al-ʿAbbās *(May Allah be pleased with him)* did not seek the Caliphate after the death of the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*, nor did his son ʿAbd Allāh. Rather, al-ʿAbbās said on that day to ʿAlī *(Peace be upon Him)*: "Extend your hand so that I may pledge allegiance to you, and it will be said: the uncle of the Messenger of Allah *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* pledged allegiance to ʿAlī; thus no two people will differ concerning you."

And ʿAbd Allāh pledged allegiance to ʿAlī *(Peace be upon Him)*, undertook offices on his behalf, supported him, and so forth.

As for the claim of a designation in favor of Abū Bakr, it is like the claim of the Imāmiyyah.

Claims are not permissible to accept except with strong proofs and clear evidences; otherwise, rejecting them becomes obligatory.

[The Proofs of the Zaydiyyah for Their Position on the Imamate]

Here we set forth the proofs and evidences of the Zaydiyyah for what they claim, and we say:

The first proof is general in nature, namely:

That Allah, *Glorified and Exalted is He*, chose the family of Ibrāhīm, the family of ʿImrān, and the family of Yaʿqūb—who is Isrāʾīl—above all the worlds. Accordingly, based on this divine practice that Allah has established with His previous prophets, it is necessary that the family of our Prophet Muḥammad *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* be the elite of Allah and the object of His choice from this Ummah—this being in continuity with the established practice of Allah with those who passed before: *"And you will never find for the way of Allah any change."* **[al-Aḥzāb: 62]** *"And you will never find for the way of Allah any alteration."* **[Fāṭir: 43]**

Allah *Exalted is He* further reinforced this practice and elevated its rank by obligating the Ummah to invoke blessings upon them in every prayer together with the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*. Thus, the prayer of anyone is not complete unless he says in his prayer: *"O Allah, bless Muḥammad and the family of Muḥammad ..."* and so forth.

And by what He obligated upon every believer of affection for them, by the explicit text of the Noble Book in His saying *Exalted is He*: *"Say: I do not ask of you any reward for it except affection for the near of kin."* **[al-Shūrā: 23]** The Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* clarified who is meant by "the near of kin" in this verse, saying: *"They are ʿAlī, Fāṭimah, and their two sons".* This was narrated by the

authors of the Ṣaḥīḥ collections, including al-Bukhārī[1]

And He, *Glorified is He*, said in further emphasis of this: *"Indeed, Allah only desires to remove impurity from you, O People of the House, and to purify you with a thorough purification."* **[al-Aḥzāb]** Muslim narrated in his *Ṣaḥīḥ*[2] from the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* that he wrapped ʿAlī, Fāṭimah, al-Ḥasan, and al-Ḥusayn in a cloak and said: *"O Allah, these are my Ahl al-Bayt; so remove from them impurity and purify them thoroughly".* Then the verse was revealed: *"Indeed, Allah only desires to remove impurity from you …"*

The Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* did not suffice with these indications alone; rather, he made an explicit designation—around which no doubts can circulate—regarding the Caliphate of his Ahl al-Bayt after him. He said *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* in the well-known, mutawātir ḥadīth of al-Thaqalayn, transmitted by the various groups of Muslims, including the authors of the Ṣaḥīḥ collections: *"Indeed, I am leaving among you two successors …"* the previously mentioned ḥadīth.

And the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* continued throughout his lifetime to emphasize this matter and draw attention to it in narrations too numerous to be counted, transmitted by the authors of the Ṣaḥīḥ collections and others.

In all of this there is evidence for what we state regarding the Imamate of the Imams from the Ahl al-Bayt *(Peace be upon Them)*, and that it is confined to them and does not extend beyond them to others.

[The Evidences for the Imamate of ʿAlī *(Peace be upon Him)*]

The second proof is detailed, and it concerns the Imamate of the Commander of the Faithful *(Peace be upon Him)*, as follows:

1- It has already preceded, in the first proof, the demonstration of the Caliphate of the family of the Messenger of Allah *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* after him. Based on this,

1- Al-Bukhārī cited the interpretation of the verse (4/178), no. (3497), in which Saʿīd ibn Jubayr explained that what is meant by *al-qurbā* is the relatives of Muḥammad *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*. He also recorded therein an objection by Ibn ʿAbbās. However, Aḥmad ibn Ḥanbal reported it in *Faḍāʾil al-Ṣaḥābah* (2/669, no. 1141) from Ibn ʿAbbās himself with the wording: "When the verse was revealed: *'Say: I do not ask of you any reward for it except affection for the near of kin'* **[al-Shūrā: 23]**, they said: O Messenger of Allah, who are these relatives of yours whose affection has been made obligatory upon us? He said: *"ʿAlī, Fāṭimah, and their two sons (Peace be upon Them."* Al-Ṭabarānī also reported it with this wording in *al-Muʿjam al-Kabīr* (11/444, no. 12259), and many others besides. Thus, these narrations from Ibn ʿAbbās contradict what al-Bukhārī and others reported from him.

2- Narrated from ʿĀʾishah, no. (2424) (4/1383).

ʿAlī *(Peace be upon Him)* is the master of the Ahl al-Bayt *(Peace be upon Them)*, their foremost, and their leader. Accordingly, it is necessary that he *(Peace be upon Him)* be the Caliph after the Messenger *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* without any interval. This proof is clear and manifest, not hidden.

2- It has been authentically reported from the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*—as al-Bukhārī narrated it in several places in his *Ṣaḥīḥ*—that he said: *"ʿAlī is to me as Hārūn was to Mūsā, except that there is no prophet after me".*[1] It is well known that the stations of Hārūn with respect to Mūsā were: succession, ministry, brotherhood, and prophethood. The Noble Qur'an explicitly stated these stations.

3- The ḥadīth of Ghadīr has been established by tawātur from the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*. Muslim narrated it in his *Ṣaḥīḥ*[2], and others among the scholars of ḥadīth also transmitted it. Its wording is his saying *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*: "*Am I not more entitled to you than your own selves?*" They said: Yes, O Messenger of Allah. He said: *"Then whoever has me as his master (mawlā), this ʿAlī is his master. O Allah, befriend whoever befriends him, show enmity to whoever shows enmity to him, support whoever supports him, and forsake whoever forsakes him".*[3]

Each of these two reports establishes the Imamate of the Commander of the Faithful *(Peace be upon Him)*.

As for the first report: the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* affirmed for ʿAlī all the stations of Hārūn with respect to Mūsā, excluding only prophethood. Thus, ʿAlī *(Peace be upon Him)* is thereby the Caliph of the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*, his minister, and his brother.

As for the second report: the word *mawlā* in his saying *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*, *"Whoever has me as his*

1- *Faḍā'il al-Ṣaḥābah* by Aḥmad ibn Ḥanbal (2/611), no. (1045); (2/633), nos. (1079, 1091, 1093, 1131, 1137), and in most ḥadīth collections.

2- The authentication of the narration of the ḥadīth of Ghadīr has already been mentioned, and that Muslim narrated its beginning while omitting mention of the rest.

3- *Musnad al-Bazzār* (3/34, no. 786); *al-Sunan al-Kubrā* by al-Nasā'ī (7/444, no. 8429); *Sunan Ibn Mājah* (1/43, no. 116); *al-Mustadrak ʿalā al-Ṣaḥīḥayn* (3/613, no. 6272); *al-Muʿjam al-Kabīr* by al-Ṭabarānī (5/212, no. 5128); *al-Sunan al-Kubrā* by al-Nasā'ī (7/442, no. 8426); *Jāmiʿ al-Masānīd wa al-Sunan* (3/108, no. 3323); *Faḍā'il al-Ṣaḥābah* by Aḥmad ibn Ḥanbal (2/599, no. 1022); and in *al-Musnad* (2/267, nos. 950–951). Some of these narrate the ḥadīth in full, while others mention only its beginning, and sometimes its remainder is mentioned elsewhere.

master, then ʿAlī is his master", carries several meanings by way of shared usage. What is intended here among those meanings is the guardian of authority, which signifies the Caliphate. Authority is firmly established for the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* over his entire Ummah. For this reason, he *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* addressed the gathered multitudes at that solemn scene of Ghadīr Khumm, affirming this meaning to them: "*Am I not more entitled to you than your own selves?*" They said: Yes, O Messenger of Allah. When they acknowledged this against themselves and admitted it, he *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* said: *"Then whoever has me as his master, this ʿAlī is his master..."* and so forth.

Thus, the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* linked his authority with the authority of ʿAlī *(Peace be upon Him)*, making them two inseparable matters, such that neither is complete without the other. This was an indication from him *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* that the authority of ʿAlī *(Peace be upon Him)* is a part of his own authority, and that the faith of no one is complete except by submitting to the authority of ʿAlī *(Peace be upon Him)* and believing in it.

Then the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* concluded his statement with supplication, saying: *"O Allah, befriend whoever befriends him, show enmity to whoever shows enmity to him, support whoever supports him, and forsake whoever forsakes him, ..."*.

In this there is an emphasis and severity that is not hidden. For when a believer hears this prophetic supplication, he knows that it is a supplication that will inevitably be answered. This drives him to take great care in upholding loyalty to ʿAlī *(Peace be upon Him)* and supporting him, and to fear intensely any negligence in that regard—lest the prophetic supplication befall him.

In this supplication there is also a clear proof that one who neglects the authority of the Commander of the Faithful *(Peace be upon Him)* and enters into enmity toward him has departed from the authority of Allah into His enmity, and that he has no share with Allah whatsoever.

This is among the evidences for what our Imams *(Peace be upon Them)* hold: that the designation of faith is not complete for anyone until he submits to the authority of the Commander of the Faithful ʿAlī *(Peace be upon Him)* and believes that he is the one entitled to authority and the Caliphate after the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*.

And there are many other evidences from the Book and the Sunnah

regarding the authority of the Commander of the Faithful *(Peace be upon Him)*.

[The Reason for the Silence of the Commander of the Faithful *(Peace be upon Him)* Regarding the Caliphate After the Death of the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*]

It may be said: Why did the Commander of the Faithful *(Peace be upon Him)* remain silent regarding the Caliphate after the death of the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*, and during the period of the caliphate of the three?

The answer—and Allah is the Granter of success—is:

The Commander of the Faithful *(Peace be upon Him)* preferred silence at that time because the circumstances then did not allow for anything other than that. This is because the Muslims were newly emerged from the Age of Ignorance. Had he appointed himself to the Caliphate, risen, and called to it, disagreement and fighting would have occurred as a result within the capital of Islam. Indeed, after the death of the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*, many Arab tribes had already apostatized.

Had he *(Peace be upon Him)* risen for the Caliphate and called to it while many of the Arabs of the Peninsula were apostatizing—as is well known—it is quite possible that the religion of Islam would have been completely lost. He *(Peace be upon Him)* explicitly stated this when his wife Fāṭimah *(Peace be upon Her)* asked him about his silence regarding the Caliphate and his not rising for it. He *(Peace be upon Him)* said to her, while the caller to prayer was proclaiming and saying: *"I bear witness that there is no god but Allah… I bear witness that Muḥammad is the Messenger of Allah"*: "Do you like this to disappear?" She said: "No." He said: "If I were to do that, this would disappear." This is the meaning of the narration.

For this reason, he *(Peace be upon Him)* preferred silence and refraining from rising, giving precedence to the general interest of Islam over his personal right. Accordingly, the Commander of the Faithful *(Peace be upon Him)* fulfilled what was obligatory in such a grave circumstance. He exercised patience—with a thorn in the eye and a choking pain in the throat. This is in addition to the fact that the circumstances did not allow him *(Peace be upon Him)* to rise.

He *(Peace be upon Him)* portrayed this in his words in the sermon known as *al-Shaqshaqiyyah*, saying: *"By Allah, the son of Abū Quḥāfah clothed himself with it, while he surely knew that my position with respect to it was like the position of the pivot in relation to the millstone. From me the floodwaters descend, and the bird does not soar up to me. So I drew a*

curtain over it and turned away from it, and I began to ponder whether I should assault with a severed hand, or endure patiently a blinding darkness in which the elder grows frail, the young grow grey, and the believer toils until he meets his Lord. I saw that patience upon this was wiser. So I endured, while there was a thorn in the eye and a choking pain in the throat, seeing my inheritance plundered … etc."

By his saying *"with a severed hand"*, he *(Peace be upon Him)* clarified that he found no helpers or supporters were he to rise. The Caliphate cannot be established except with helpers, supporters, and followers. Therefore, he *(Peace be upon Him)* saw that silence and patience were wiser and closer to correctness and right guidance.

He *(Peace be upon Him)* also said in another sermon: *"Then I looked, and I found that I had no helper except my Ahl al-Bayt, so I spared them from death … etc."*

Thus, he *(Peace be upon Him)* clarified that he found no helpers or supporters except his Ahl al-Bayt, despite their small number, and such a group does not suffice nor avail in such a situation.

He *(Peace be upon Him)* mentioned at the end of the *Shaqshaqiyyah* sermon his condition after the killing of ʿUthmān, then his being pledged allegiance for the Caliphate and his rising to undertake it. He said: *"Indeed, by Him Who split the grain and created the soul, had it not been for the presence of those present, the establishment of the proof by the existence of supporters, and what Allah took upon the scholars—that they should not acquiesce to the gluttony of an oppressor nor the hunger of the oppressed—I would have cast the rope of it upon its shoulder, and I would have given its last the same cup as its first. And you would have found this world of yours more insignificant to me than the sneeze of a goat!"*End.

He *(Peace be upon Him)* thus clarified that he only rose at the end when the proof was established against him by the existence of supporters, and that were it not for that, he would have remained silent and stayed in his house, just as he was silent at first.

[The Reason for People's Deviation from ʿAlī *(Peace be upon Him)* After the Death of the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*]

The reason for people's deviation from ʿAlī *(Peace be upon Him)* after the death of the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* is that Quraysh had entered Islam only recently, on the Day of the Conquest of Makkah. They had been the fiercest enemies of Islam and the enemies of the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*. They were the ones who fought him on the Day of Badr and the Day of al-Aḥzāb, and before that they besieged him in the

ravine of Abū Ṭālib together with Banū Hāshim for two or three years, then expelled him from Makkah. Allah *Exalted is He* has related this in His saying: *"And [remember] when those who disbelieved plotted against you to restrain you, or kill you, or expel you; and they plotted, and Allah plotted, and Allah is the Best of plotters."* **[al-Anfāl]**

However, Islam eventually overcame them, and they entered Islam on the Day of the Conquest of Makkah by compulsion, not by conviction or satisfaction. Their hearts remained filled with resentment and hatred toward ʿAlī *(Peace be upon Him)* because of the severe blows he inflicted upon them in the wars that took place between them and the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*.

For this reason, when what occurred at al-Saqīfah occurred, they allowed the pledge of allegiance to Abū Bakr with the utmost ease and supported it with the utmost support. They were the supporters of Abū Bakr and his men, and thereafter they became the men of the state.

They then displayed what was in their hearts of hostility toward the Anṣār, who had fought them alongside the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* at Badr, Uḥud, and al-Aḥzāb, and who had sheltered and supported him.

Thus, the poets of Quraysh increased in satirizing and disparaging the Anṣār. The books of sīrah and history contain extensive details of what occurred in this regard.

They also showed contempt toward the Ahl al-Bayt *(Peace be upon Them)* and intensified their restrictions against them. They seized the property of Fāṭimah *(Peace be upon Her)* which her father *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* had granted to her, and they prevented her inheritance and her share of the fayʾ.

They deprived Banū Hāshim entirely of assuming any role in the affairs of the Caliphate and removed them completely from its sphere. They granted high leadership positions, offices, and governorships especially to men of Quraysh. As for Banū Hāshim, the Anṣār, and other Companions who were not from Quraysh, they expelled them, kept them away, and deprived them of such roles. They gave leadership of the Islamic armies and governorships to Yazīd ibn Abī Sufyān, then to Muʿāwiyah ibn Abī Sufyān after the death of his brother, and to Khālid ibn al-Walīd, ʿAmr ibn al-ʿĀṣ, then to ʿAbd Allāh ibn Saʿd ibn Abī Sarḥ, al-Walīd ibn ʿUqbah ibn Abī Muʿayṭ, Marwān ibn al-Ḥakam, and others like them.

[The Ruling Regarding Those Who Fought ʿAlī *(Peace be upon Him)*]

Those who fought ʿAlī *(Peace be upon Him)* when he assumed the Caliphate were three groups:

1- The first were the Oath-Breakers (al-nākithīn), led by Ṭalḥah, al-Zubayr, and ʿĀ'ishah.
2- The Unjust Ones (al-qāsiṭīn), led by Muʿāwiyah ibn Abī Sufyān.
3- The Renegades (al-māriqīn), namely the Khārijites.

People have differed regarding the ruling on these three groups. The Ahl al-Sunnah show leniency in their ruling concerning the Oath-Breakers and the Unjust Ones, and they are severe in their ruling against the Khārijites, judging them with disbelief and transgression.

Some of their scholars said: Ṭalḥah, al-Zubayr, ʿĀ'ishah, Muʿāwiyah, ʿAmr ibn al-ʿĀṣ, and the killer of ʿAmmār ibn Yāsir are rewarded; because they exercised ijtihād and erred, and the erring mujtahid receives a reward. They also prohibited mentioning any of these individuals except with good, and likewise prohibited delving into what occurred among the Companions, making that one of the foundations of creed.

Our response to them is as follows:

1- The Commander of the Faithful *(Peace be upon Him)* is the legitimate Caliph and the Imam whose obedience is obligatory, by consensus between us and Ahl al-Sunnah. There is no disagreement that rebelling against the Caliph and drawing the sword against him is among the gravest of sins.

Accordingly, it is obligatory to apply the ruling of disobedience to the disobedient, without regard to prior merit or companionship. Companionship and prior merit do not prevent this. The proof is what has been established by consensus: that the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* used to cut off the hand of the thief, execute the murderer, and apply the legal punishment to the adulterer—while they were Companions. It is also well known that he *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* said: *"By Allah, if Fāṭimah the daughter of Muḥammad were to steal, I would cut off her hand".*[1]

Ahl al-Sunnah have said: those who banded together against ʿUthmān, rebelled against his authority, besieged him, then killed him, are disobedient, unjust, accursed, and so forth. Thus, they differentiated in their ruling between those who rebelled against ʿUthmān and those who rebelled against ʿAlī *(Peace be upon Him)*.

The correct approach would have been either to judge those who rebelled against ʿAlī *(Peace be upon Him)* with the same ruling they

1- *Sunan Ibn Mājah* (2/851), no. (2547); *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim* (3/1315), no. (1688).

judged those who rebelled against ʿUthmān, or conversely to judge those who rebelled against ʿUthmān with the same ruling they judged those who rebelled against ʿAlī *(Peace be upon Him)*.

2- There is no doubt that those who rebelled against ʿAlī *(Peace be upon Him)* shed much blood through their rebellion. Ṭalḥah and al-Zubayr treacherously killed supporters of ʿAlī *(Peace be upon Him)* in al-Baṣrah, and thereafter many were killed in the Battle of the Camel. All of this occurred due to the rebellion of the Oath-Breakers and their breach.

Muʿāwiyah killed countless Muslims at Ṣiffīn and thereafter. Allah *Exalted is He* has greatly magnified the crime of killing believers and has made its ruling severe. He *Exalted is He* said in Sūrat al-Nisāʾ: *"And it is not for a believer to kill a believer except by mistake ..."* to His saying, *Mighty and Majestic is He*: *"And whoever kills a believer intentionally—his recompense is Hell, abiding therein; and Allah is angry with him, curses him, and has prepared for him a tremendous punishment."* **[al-Nisāʾ: 92–93]** And He *Glorified is He* said: *"... that whoever kills a soul without [just cause of] a soul or corruption in the land—it is as though he has killed all mankind; and whoever gives it life—it is as though he has given life to all mankind."* **[al-Māʾidah: 32]**

And in the ḥadīth: *"Whoever assists in killing a Muslim—even with half a word—will come on the Day of Resurrection with "Despairing of the mercy of Allah" written between his eyes".*[1] or as he said—among other texts.

If Ahl al-Sunnah wa al-Jamāʿah see no fault upon the Oath-Breakers and the Unjust Ones for what they committed of enormities and bloodshed, then it is all the more fitting that there be no fault upon one who mentions them for their evil deeds. And if that does not harm them, then the speech of one who speaks about them does not harm him.

So why do Ahl al-Sunnah judge one who speaks about Muʿāwiyah for his evil deeds with severe rulings—such as heresy, rejectionism, and immorality—impugn his uprightness, and go to extremes in condemning and denouncing him?

[Conclusion of This Chapter]

After the killing of ʿUthmān, the Companions and the Muslims pledged allegiance to ʿAlī ibn Abī Ṭālib *(Peace be upon Him)* and titled him the Caliph of the Muslims.

The first to rebel against his authority and transgress against him

1- *al-Sunan al-Kubrā* by al-Bayhaqī (8/41), no. (15865); *Jāmiʿ al-Aḥādīth* (19/496), nos. (21322, 21323). Attributed to Abū Dāwūd, al-Bayhaqī, al-Ṭabarānī, Ibn ʿAsākir, and others.

were Ṭalḥah, al-Zubayr, ʿĀʾishah, and a group of Quraysh; the people of al-Baṣrah supported them. The Commander of the Faithful *(Peace be upon Him)* fought them and achieved a decisive victory over them. Then Muʿāwiyah ibn Abī Sufyān and the people of al-Shām refused to submit to his authority, and a prolonged war occurred between them, in which tens of thousands of Muslims were killed. Thereafter, a large faction from among the companions of the Commander of the Faithful *(Peace be upon Him)* rebelled against him, denounced the arbitration, and withdrew obedience from him. The Commander of the Faithful fought them—these are the Khārijites.

As you see, the Muslims then split into three groups:

1- ʿAlī *(Peace be upon Him)* and his supporters.
2- Muʿāwiyah and his supporters.
3- The Khārijites.

This was the first division to appear on the scene.

Each of these three groups developed a distinct doctrine.

These three doctrines have remained alive to this day, and that characteristic—namely, hostility among the three groups—has also remained alive, its intensity not diminished despite the passage of long centuries.

Each of these three groups came to be known by a specific name by which it is recognized and called.

The name *Shīʿah* is specific to the supporters and followers of the Commander of the Faithful *(Peace be upon Him)*.

The name *Khārijites* is specific to those who split from the companions of ʿAlī *(Peace be upon Him)* and fought him.

The name *Ahl al-Sunnah wa al-Jamāʿah* is specific to the supporters of Muʿāwiyah and his adherents.

However, the supporters and followers of Muʿāwiyah came to dominate the Islamic scene after the martyrdom of the Commander of the Faithful *(Peace be upon Him)*. Their influence grew strong, and the tribulation upon the Shīʿah of ʿAlī *(Peace be upon Him)* thereby intensified. Most of them were in Iraq. Muʿāwiyah and his followers pursued them and killed them—except those who disavowed the religion of ʿAlī *(Peace be upon Him)*. Upon this path proceeded the Umayyad kings after Muʿāwiyah, then the Abbasid kings, pursuing the Shīʿah of ʿAlī and killing them under every sky. As a result, the doctrine of Ahl al-Sunnah wa al-Jamāʿah became dominant in the Islamic realm, and it became the sole religion and the official doctrine throughout all Islamic lands, with no other known. When the era of codification arrived, books were

written according to the principles of the doctrine of Ahl al-Sunnah wa al-Jamāʿah.

As for the doctrine of the Shīʿah of ʿAlī *(Peace be upon Him)*, it disappeared entirely from the public scene and no longer had any outward existence—except, perhaps, in the darkness of the hearts of the Shīʿah, or in the depths of prisons.

[Some Principles and Foundations of the Doctrine of Ahl al-Sunnah wa al-Jamāʿah]

Among the principles of Ahl al-Sunnah wa al-Jamāʿah upon which they built their doctrine are:

1- Rejecting the narration of anyone who loves ʿAlī *(Peace be upon Him)*, and rejecting his testimony.
2- Declaring upright anyone who hates ʿAlī *(Peace be upon Him)*; thus his narration and testimony are accepted.
3- Shiʿism with respect to ʿAlī and love for him is a grave crime equal to heresy (*zandaqah*).
4- It is not permissible for a Sunnī to marry a Shīʿī woman, nor vice versa.
5- It is not permissible to mention Muʿāwiyah with regard to his evil deeds, nor Marwān, nor al-Walīd ibn ʿUqbah, and the like of them, because they are Companions; whoever speaks ill of them is regarded as a heretic, whose punishment is death.

They have many rules of this kind, which they regard as foundations of the religion, its principles, and its bases.

As we have said, this doctrine was applied throughout the Islamic lands from the time of Muʿāwiyah. The young grew up upon it, and the old died upon it, knowing no other. Distinguished scholars emerged for it in ḥadīth, jurisprudence, exegesis, fundamentals, and branches. It became the sole doctrine of both the early and later generations. Whoever examines the books of history will know the truth of what we have mentioned.

[The Proof of the Invalidity of This Doctrine]

From this it becomes known that this doctrine is false and has no connection to Islam, because:

1- The Commander of the Faithful ʿAlī *(Peace be upon Him)* was the rightly guided Caliph without any disagreement among the Muslims, and Muʿāwiyah was among his enemies who fought him and rebelled against him.

There is no disagreement among the Muslims that one who rebels against the Imam of truth is a transgressor and invalid, whom it is

obligatory upon the Imam and the Muslims to fight and kill; and whoever supports him in his rebellion and follows him in his actions shares his ruling. So how did the followers and supporters of Muʿāwiyah thereafter become the people of truth and guidance, while the followers and supporters of ʿAlī *(Peace be upon Him)* became the people of misguidance and falsehood?!

2- The Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* said regarding ʿAlī *(Peace be upon Him)*—by consensus of the Shīʿah and Ahl al-Sunnah: *"None loves him except a believer, and none hates him except a hypocrite."* This is among the ḥadīths whose authenticity is not disputed by either Ahl al-Sunnah or the Shīʿah; it is acknowledged as authentic by both parties.

There is no doubt that Ahl al-Sunnah wa al-Jamāʿah impugn anyone who loves ʿAlī *(Peace be upon Him)* and do not accept his narration, counting that among the gravest forms of criticism. They accept the narration of those who hate ʿAlī *(Peace be upon Him)*, and upon this basis their Ṣaḥīḥ collections were compiled.

Yet the Messenger *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* explicitly stated—by a text agreed upon and acknowledged as authentic—the hypocrisy of those who hate ʿAlī *(Peace be upon Him)*. Allah *Exalted is He* has informed about the hypocrites what He has informed, and warned against them with the strongest warnings. Among that is His saying *Exalted is He*: *"And Allah bears witness that the hypocrites are indeed liars."* **[al-Munāfiqūn]** And His saying *Exalted is He*: *"Had they gone forth among you, they would have increased you in nothing but corruption, and they would have hurried among you seeking discord …"* **[al-Tawbah: 47]** And His saying *Exalted is He*: *"The hypocrite men and the hypocrite women are of one another: they enjoin what is wrong and forbid what is right, and they withhold their hands. They have forgotten Allah, so He has forgotten them. Indeed, the hypocrites are the defiantly disobedient."* **[al-Tawbah]** And His saying *Exalted is He*: *"So turn away from them; indeed, they are filth."* **[al-Tawbah: 95]** And His saying *Exalted is He*: *"And among the people are those who say, 'We believe in Allah and the Last Day,' while they are not believers. They seek to deceive Allah and those who believe …"* to His saying *Exalted is He*: *"And when it is said to them, 'Do not cause corruption on the earth,' they say, 'We are only reformers.' Unquestionably, it is they who are the corrupters, but they do not perceive."* **[al-Baqarah]**

Ahl al-Sunnah wa al-Jamāʿah built their religion, in its fundamentals and branches, upon those Ṣaḥīḥ collections whose transmitters are as we have described. They claimed that their religion is the true religion, and that whatever is other than it is misguidance and falsehood. The present

discussion needs nothing more than this for one who wishes to examine his religion.

3- Among their foundational principles are:

a) Whoever says *"There is no god but Allah"* will enter Paradise, even if he steals and even if he commits adultery, and so forth.

b) The intercession of the Messenger *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* is specifically for the people of major sins from among his Ummah.

c) The monotheists from the Ummah of Muḥammad *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* will be brought out of the Fire if they enter it—just as Allah *Exalted is He* related from the Jews: *"And they said: The Fire will never touch us except for a limited number of days."* **[al-Baqarah: 80]**

You, O examiner, if you reflect upon these principles that Ahl al-Sunnah wa al-Jamāʿah mention among the fundamentals of their creed, you will find that in reality they are an invitation to committing crimes, major sins, and offenses, and an invitation to laxity regarding the laws and obligations of Islam. In truth, this is a satanic invitation, for it is Satan who calls to that, adorns it, and makes it seem easy.

If you then look again at the Book of Allah *Exalted is He*, you will find that He calls to the purification of the soul from the filth of sins, to its cleansing, and warns against committing offenses, crimes, major sins, immorality, and disobedience, and He intensifies the threat with the strongest warning.

4- Among their major principles is that Allah *Exalted and Sanctified is He* alone undertakes the creation of the actions of the servants—both sins and acts of obedience. According to them, it is obligatory to believe and affirm that Allah *Exalted is He* is the One who created adultery, sodomy, disbelief, immorality, and so forth, apart from the servant; and that He decreed it, willed it, and desired it. Thus, they exonerated the servant and Satan from committing and intending these acts, and placed responsibility for committing and intending them solely upon the Most Holy King—apart from the disobedient servant and apart from Satan. They called this *the unity of actions*. Accordingly, whoever says that the servant himself undertook the act of sin and brought it into existence is, in their view, a polytheistic Qadarite, whose blood and property are lawful.

5- Among their principles is that all the Companions are upright and righteous, and it is not permissible to mention any of them with regard to evil deeds. Everyone who saw the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his*

family and grant them peace) is, according to them, a Companion.

There is no doubt that companionship of the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* is a virtue. However, Ahl al-Sunnah wa al-Jamāʿah exaggerated this virtue to a great extent. The correct reality is that the Companions—despite being distinguished by the honor of companionship like other Muslims—have what is for them and what is against them: *"Whoever does righteousness, it is for himself; and whoever does evil, it is against it."* **[Fuṣṣilat]** *"Every soul is held in pledge for what it has earned."* **[al-Muddaththir]** *"For it is what it has earned, and against it is what it has acquired."* **[al-Baqarah: 286]**

Among them are believers and among them are hypocrites: *"And among the people of Madīnah are those who persist in hypocrisy."* **[al-Tawbah: 10]** *"Among you are those who desire the world, and among you are those who desire the Hereafter."* **[Āl ʿImrān: 152]**

Ahl al-Sunnah wa al-Jamāʿah thus exceeded all bounds in this virtue, and went to extremes in it until they made it an immunity by which no sin causes harm. This is while they fell into the utmost negligence regarding the right of the kinship of the Messenger *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*. They gave it no consideration, paid it no attention, despite what has come concerning their status in the religion of Islam. Among that is what al-Bukhārī narrated in several places in his *Ṣaḥīḥ*: *"ʿAlī is to me as Hārūn was to Mūsā, except that there is no prophet after me."*

Among that also is what al-Bukhārī [1] and others reported regarding the revelation of the verse of affection: *"Say: I do not ask of you any reward for it except affection for the near of kin."* **[al-Shūrā: 23]** — concerning ʿAlī, Fāṭimah, al-Ḥasan, and al-Ḥusayn *(Peace be upon Them)*—and regarding the command to invoke blessings upon them together with the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*, and the command to love them, and many other matters. Yet Ahl al-Sunnah wa al-Jamāʿah neglected this aspect. The evidence of their negligence is that they did not impugn the integrity of those who harbored hatred toward ʿAlī *(Peace be upon Him)*; rather, they declared them upright, narrated ḥadīths from them, and authenticated those narrations.

6- Among their foundational principles is imitation of the Salaf in all matters of religion, minor and major alike. You see them displaying fanaticism in this regard and showing great rigidity, paying no attention to what contradicts it from the explicit texts of the Book and the Sunnah.

1- Its authentication has already been mentioned.

They give such texts no weight and raise no regard for them.

By *the Salaf* they mean the vast multitude and overwhelming majority that came to dominate the Islamic scene after the treaty of al-Ḥasan ibn ʿAlī in the Year of Unity. This is embodied in Muʿāwiyah ibn Abī Sufyān and his followers and supporters. They were the ones who took control of the Islamic lands, imposed those doctrines and ideas upon them, and compelled people to adopt them by force.

As for the doctrine of ʿAlī *(Peace be upon Him)*, and that of his followers, supporters, and adherents, they swept it out of the lands entirely, pursued it with all the power at their disposal, until it vanished completely from the public scene and disappeared altogether. Likewise, the doctrine of the Khārijites also ceased to have any presence on the scene.

We do not say that the doctrine of ʿAlī *(Peace be upon Him)* and his followers came to an absolute end at that time. Rather, those among the followers of ʿAlī *(Peace be upon Him)* who escaped being killed resorted to dissimulation, maneuvered with the people, and outwardly displayed acceptance of the doctrine of Ahl al-Sunnah wa al-Jamāʿah, while inwardly holding the opposite.

All of this was done in order to escape certain death, torture, and the destruction of livelihoods and families, which the followers of ʿAlī *(Peace be upon Him)*—or even those merely accused of loving ʿAlī *(Peace be upon Him)*—were subjected to, by night and by day.

This type of people has continued to exist in that era and thereafter throughout history, but fear of being killed concealed them and kept them hidden.

Ahl al-Sunnah wa al-Jamāʿah regard this group as Khārijites and deviants; rather, they judge them to be heretics, calling them *Rāfiḍah*, *Shīʿah*, *Qadarites*, and so forth.

From what we have mentioned, it becomes clear to you, O examiner, that the doctrine of Ahl al-Sunnah wa al-Jamāʿah is a doctrine far removed from Islam and beyond its bounds; that the Book of Allah *Exalted is He* disavows it, the Sunnah of the Messenger disavows it as well, and even sound human reason disavows it.

[The Reason for the Spread of the Doctrine of Ahl al-Sunnah]

The reason for its spread, renown, and the large number of its adherents is the support it received from Muʿāwiyah, who imposed it upon the people with all the power of authority at his disposal—through inducement and intimidation. Thereafter came the Umayyad rulers, then the Abbasid rulers, and thus it became the sole doctrine throughout all

Islamic lands.

The reason for Muʿāwiyah's concern in adopting this doctrine—and likewise that of the rulers who came after him—is the political interests it contained that supported and reinforced his authority.

If you examine this doctrine, you will find it to be a fortified stronghold for the authority of Muʿāwiyah first, then for the authority of the Umayyad rulers, and then for those who came after them.

From here you find that the Abbasids—despite the intensity of their enmity toward the Umayyads and their eagerness to erase everything connected to them—were compelled to care for their doctrine and to follow their path.

[The Doctrine of the Shīʿah of ʿAlī *(Peace be upon Him)*]

The doctrine of ʿAlī *(Peace be upon Him)*, his followers, supporters, and adherents is the true doctrine upon which the Messenger *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* and the righteous Companions were. For its sake were martyred the Commander of the Faithful *(Peace be upon Him)*, ʿAmmār ibn Yāsir, Khuzaymah Dhū al-Shahādatayn, Abū Ayyūb al-Anṣārī, and others among the people of Badr and the people of the Pledge of al-Riḍwān.

For its sake were also martyred, patiently, the two noble Companions: Ḥujr ibn ʿAdī al Kindī and ʿAmr ibn al-Ḥamq al-Khuzāʿī. Then, for its sake, al-Ḥusayn ibn ʿAlī ibn Abī Ṭālib *(Peace be upon Him)* was martyred in Karbalāʾ, along with seventeen men from his Household and his sons, and a large group of the righteous. Although this doctrine is the true doctrine, time dealt it a grievous blow and fortune did not favor it, so it was afflicted with paralysis—just as it is stated in the ḥadīth: *"No community differed after its Prophet except that the people of falsehood prevailed over the people of truth".*[1]

It was incumbent that this true doctrine should have been the official doctrine in the Islamic lands and the dominant doctrine on the scene; however, reality unfolded otherwise.

It is said in the transmitted report: *(People follow worldly interests and kings); (and the religion of the subjects follows the religion of the ruler).* Therefore, the doctrine of truth and the sound religion weakened, and its supporters and followers diminished.

The masses of Muslims become partisan to the prevailing reality without examining its correctness; later generations follow earlier ones; and they consider criticism and discussion regarding the credibility of

1- *al-Muʿjam al-Awsaṭ* (no. 7754), *Ḥilyat al-Awliyāʾ* (4/313).

that doctrine to be something enormous, viewing it as a grave crime that nearly expels its proponent from Islam.

Despite the weakening of the doctrine of the Shīʿah due to the strength of its adversary, the power and influence of their authority, their dominance, and the abundance of their supporters and adherents, it nevertheless suffered another internal calamity—namely, disagreement among themselves and division.

The first occurrence of this was at the time of the uprising of Imām Zayd ibn ʿAlī *(Peace be upon Him)*. A group among the Shīʿah refused to wage jihād alongside Zayd ibn ʿAlī *(Peace be upon Him)*, arguing that the Imām was Jaʿfar ibn Muḥammad, not Zayd ibn ʿAlī. Zayd *(Peace be upon Him)* said to them, after discussion and debate: "Go, for you are the Rāfiḍah about whom my grandfather, the Messenger *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*, said: "*At the end of time there will come a people…*"—the ḥadīth.

From that time onward, the Shīʿah divided into two groups: the Zaydiyyah—those who supported Zayd *(Peace be upon Him)* and aided him; and the non-Zaydiyyah—those who refused to support him, excusing themselves with what has been mentioned.

Before that, the Shīʿah had been a single community and one party. Not much time passed after the uprising of Imām Zayd ibn ʿAlī *(Peace be upon Him)* before the establishment of the Abbasid state. At that point, the Abbasid state sought to support the Imāmī doctrine and strengthen it—for political interests and benefits that would accrue to the Abbasid state. By doing so, it weakened the position of the Zaydī Imāms who had followed Zayd *(Peace be upon Him)* in rising against oppressors and openly declaring jihād against them. The Abbasids redirected the Shīʿah toward Jaʿfar al-Ṣādiq and his sons and promoted their Imamate among the people. Thus, the preacher in the time of al-Maʾmūn would deliver the Friday sermon invoking blessings upon ʿAlī ibn Mūsā ibn Jaʿfar and his forefathers, then say:

Six forefathers—they are, who are they?

They are better than those who drink the rainwater from the clouds.

As a result, the Shīʿah were drawn toward this quietist doctrine, which acquired a large presence, many followers, scholars, and students of knowledge—all due to the support of the Abbasid authority.

As for the Zaydī doctrine, the Abbasid rulers directed all their power toward pursuing its adherents and killing them. This became their constant preoccupation and unceasing practice; they found no rest and no peace of mind in pursuing the Zaydiyyah, because of the danger they

perceived in them to their rule.

[Some Principles of the Zaydiyyah]

Here we shall briefly present some of the principles of the Zaydiyyah. Among their principles are:

1- Giving precedence to the Commander of the Faithful ʿAlī ibn Abī Ṭālib *(Peace be upon Him)* after the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* over all the Companions—based on the evidences mentioned previously, and based on what one of the Imāms of Ahl al-Sunnah wa al-Jamāʿah said[1]: "No virtues have been transmitted from the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* concerning anyone as have been transmitted concerning ʿAlī *(Peace be upon Him)*."

2- The Commander of the Faithful ʿAlī *(Peace be upon Him)* is the most entitled of people to the station of the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*, namely the Caliphate, due to his outstanding merit over all the Companions, his precedence in Islam, jihād, knowledge, kinship, and so forth, and due to what has been established of explicit designation regarding this, as has preceded.

3- If the Ummah differs, then the truth is with the Ahl al-Bayt *(Peace be upon Them)*, due to what has preceded of the ḥadīth of al-Thaqalayn, the ḥadīth of the Ark, the Verse of Purification, the verse of affection, and others.

4- Among their principles is the affirmation of *tawḥīd* and *justice*. The criterion of *tawḥīd* is negating anthropomorphism, as the Commander of the Faithful *(Peace be upon Him)* said: *"Tawḥīd is that you do not imagine Him".* Thus, it is obligatory to declare Him transcendent above place, indwelling in a place; He has no face, no hands, no feet, no side, and so forth.

The criterion of justice is what the Commander of the Faithful *(Peace be upon Him)* said: *"And justice is that you do not accuse Him".* Thus, it is obligatory to declare Him transcendent above committing corruption and wronging the servants. He does not will acts of disobedience and sins, nor desire them, nor decree them, nor determine them, nor create them. Allah *Exalted is He* has declared Himself free of that in what He has

1- This statement has been reported from Aḥmad ibn Ḥanbal. It was cited from him in *al-Istīʿāb fī Maʿrifat al-Aṣḥāb* (3/1115), with the wording: "Aḥmad ibn Ḥanbal and Ismāʿīl ibn Isḥāq al-Qāḍī said: No sound chains have been reported concerning the virtues of any of the Companions like those reported concerning the virtues of ʿAlī ibn Abī Ṭālib." The same was stated by Aḥmad ibn Shuʿayb ibn ʿAlī al-Nasāʾī—*may Allah have mercy on him*. It is also found in *al-Riyāḍ al-Naḍirah fī Manāqib al-ʿAsharah* by Muḥibb al-Dīn al-Ṭabarī (3/188).

related and narrated in Sūrat al-Anʿām, in His saying: *"Those who associate others with Allah will say: 'Had Allah willed, we would not have associated others, nor would our fathers, nor would we have forbidden anything.' Thus did those before them deny until they tasted Our punishment. Say: 'Do you have any knowledge that you can bring forth for us? You follow nothing but conjecture, and you are only guessing.'"* **[al-Anʿām]**

And He said in Sūrat al-Naḥl: *"Those who associate others with Allah said: 'Had Allah willed, we would not have worshipped anything besides Him—neither we nor our fathers—nor would we have forbidden anything besides Him.' Thus did those before them do. So is there upon the messengers anything except clear conveyance?"* **[al-Naḥl]** The argument concerning this has already been presented in detail.

5- Among their principles is the obligation of upholding the right of the Caliphate of the Messenger *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*, through commanding what is right and forbidding what is wrong, and so forth, as has preceded.

6- Among their principles is that it is not permissible to establish any foundational principle of creed except by a decisive proof. This is one of three:

a- Rational indication.

b- Qur'anic texts.

c- Prophetic texts upon which there is consensus, or whose authenticity is accepted among the Muslims.

As for anything besides that, it is not permissible to accept it nor to rely upon it. Accordingly, whoever seeks to establish a principle in Islamic creed by other than what we have mentioned, the Zaydiyyah reject it, do not accept it, and give it no weight.

7- The Companions, like other people, have what is for them and what is against them: *"Whoever does righteousness—it is for himself; and whoever does evil—it is against it."* **[Fuṣṣilat: 46]**

And the virtue of companionship does not benefit criminals. Rather, the reality—and the correct view—is that punishment is multiplied for a Companion who commits grave indecencies more than for a non-Companion. This is what sound proof establishes, contrary to what Ahl al-Sunnah wa al-Jamāʿah say. This is evident in the saying of Allah *Exalted is He* regarding the wives of the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*: *"O wives of the Prophet, whoever among you commits a manifest indecency—the punishment for her will be doubled twice …"* **[al-Aḥzāb: 30]**

The secret in this—*Allah knows best*—is that sin becomes graver in proportion to the greatness of the blessing that Allah *Exalted is He* has bestowed upon a person.

The blessing of Allah *Exalted is He* upon the Companions by their seeing the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* and witnessing guidance and light is greater and more complete than His blessing upon those believers who believed in the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* without seeing him. Thus, the virtue of companionship benefits only those believers who remained upright upon faith and guidance—exactly as Allah *Exalted is He* said regarding the wives of the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*: *"And whoever among you is devoutly obedient to Allah and His Messenger and does righteousness—We will give her her reward twice ..."* **[al-Aḥzāb: 31]**

If it is said: what you mentioned applies only to the wives of the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*, not to the Companions; and the discussion concerns the Companions, not the wives of the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*—

We say: the cause and reason by which the wives of the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* deserved the doubling of punishment for committing indecency, or the doubling of reward for uprightness, is their companionship and close association with the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*. If such companionship and association did not benefit the wives of the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* in averting punishment and retribution, then it is more fitting and more appropriate that it not benefit those who were less closely associated, less companioned, and less in constant contact with the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*. There is no doubt that the Companions of the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* were less in contact, companionship, association, and sitting with the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* than his wives.

8- It is obligatory upon the examiner to investigate what occurred among the Companions, to conduct thorough examination and research therein, so that through this he may recognize who among them was in the right and who was in the wrong, who was just and who was unjust. When that becomes clear to him, he should take his religion from those who were in the right—people of justice and uprightness—rather than from the false and the unjust.

The evidence for what we have mentioned is that the Companions eventually differed with a severe disagreement, to the point that some cursed others, some killed others, and some deemed the blood of others lawful. What occurred between them in this regard reached the utmost severity.

They did not prohibit engaging in discussion of this, nor was silence regarding it known among them. Rather, even swords spoke, and spearheads and lances uttered words. Abstaining from discussion of this is not known except in very late times—perhaps during the Abbasid era. Before that, it is not known—evidenced by the fact that the people of the first century, and most of the second century, used to deliver sermons from the pulpits on Fridays and festivals in all Islamic lands and all their mosques, cursing ʿAlī ibn Abī Ṭālib *(Peace be upon Him)*.

Thus, it becomes clear to us that refraining from discussion of what occurred among the Companions is a newly introduced, innovated doctrine.

What appears to me is that the purpose of this innovated doctrine is to preserve the sanctity of Muʿāwiyah, ʿAmr ibn al-ʿĀṣ, al-Walīd ibn ʿUqbah ibn Abī Muʿayṭ, Marwān ibn al-Ḥakam, al-Mughīrah ibn Shuʿbah, and those like them.

They did not intend to preserve the dignity of all the Companions—evidenced by the fact that they paid no heed to the cursing of ʿAlī *(Peace be upon Him)* and his Ahl al-Bayt *(Peace be upon Them)*, nor did they stir in response. Rather, they judged those who did so to be upright by default, scrutinized narration, and carefully transmitted ḥadīth from them. Whoever wishes to verify the correctness of what we have mentioned should look into the introduction of *Fatḥ al-Bārī*, the commentary on *Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī*.

9- Among their principles is that the Caliphate is an exclusive right of the Ahl al-Bayt *(Peace be upon Them)*—those whom the cloak encompassed—and then of those among the progeny of the two grandsons *(Peace be upon Them)* who are qualified for it, subject to conditions that have preceded. They have principles that have already been presented in this book.

[The Soundness of Zaydī Beliefs from Superstitions and from What Contradicts Innate Reason]

What distinguishes the Zaydiyyah from the other sects is the soundness of their beliefs from superstitions and from anything that contradicts the innate disposition of reason. For if you examine what the Zaydiyyah hold in all of this, you will find it consistent with what innate reason recognizes—something with which it is familiar, toward which it

inclines, to which it submits, and which it acknowledges. In this there is an evident proof of the soundness of their religion.

This is because Allah *Exalted is He* brought laws that accord with innate reason and with what the intellect recognizes, inclines toward, and finds congenial. Do you not see His saying *Exalted is He* in describing the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*: *"He enjoins upon them what is right and forbids them what is wrong, and makes lawful for them the good things and forbids for them the impure ..."* **[al-Aʿrāf: 157]** And His saying *Exalted is He*: *"Say: My Lord has only forbidden immoralities—what is apparent of them and what is concealed ..."* **[al-Aʿrāf: 33]**

Allah *Exalted is He* frequently concludes verses with statements such as: *"Will you not then take heed?" "Will you not then reason?" "That perhaps they may take heed," "That perhaps you may reason,"* and the like—indicating thereby that what He has brought of religion and law is already present within the intellect, embedded in it by innate disposition. The rational person needs only to return to his reason and reflection to remember and acknowledge its truth.

As for the other Islamic doctrines, they have become tainted with superstitions and falsehoods that innate disposition rejects, from which it recoils, which the intellect finds objectionable and repugnant, and which it does not acknowledge.

Thus, the saying of Ahl al-Sunnah that Allah *Exalted is He* is the One who created disbelief in the disbeliever, created fornication in the fornicator, and created disobedience in the disobedient—having decreed it, willed it, and desired it—such that the servant has no action therein, no choice, no will, no intention, and no power to escape it, and that Allah *Exalted is He* will then punish him for it: this is a statement rejected by reason, because it contradicts justice and beneficence—attributes by which Allah has praised Himself by negating their opposites—and because it entails injustice, which Allah *Exalted is He* has also negated of Himself.

And the saying of some of them that Allah *Exalted is He* is the One who created the sin in the sinner, brought it into existence, willed it, desired it, and decreed it, yet the sinner nevertheless committed it by his own choice, will, and intention—this is a contradictory statement that reason neither affirms nor accepts. For if the sin occurred by the act, will, desire, decree, and determination of Allah, then where is the act, choice, and will of the sinner? And if it occurred by the act of the sinner, then where is the act of Allah?

Likewise, the saying of Ahl al-Sunnah that Allah *Exalted is He* will be

seen on the Day of Resurrection without how "bilā kayf"—reason cannot affirm this nor accept it. For vision can only occur with respect to something possessing modalities; and by modalities are meant manifest attributes such as length, width, motion, rest, color, and the like.

It is absolutely impossible for the vision of the eye to fall upon something that is neither moving nor at rest, neither long nor short nor wide, not colored with any color, neither above nor below, neither right nor left, neither behind nor in front, neither near nor far, nor in between, and so forth. Such a thing is not accepted by any intellect, nor affirmed by it; it is impossible for a rational person to believe in it.

The intellect is further confounded by the saying of Ahl al-Sunnah that Allah *Exalted is He* is the One who creates the actions of the servants—both acts of obedience and acts of disobedience—and it finds this far-fetched and unacceptable. It then asks: what is the benefit of sending messengers and revealing scriptures if the matter is already determined?

And why reward and punishment in the gardens of bliss and in the torment of Hell, if Allah *Exalted is He* is the One who undertakes acts of obedience and disobedience apart from the servants?!

The intellect further asks: why does Allah *Exalted is He* punish His servants with the severest punishment in the Fire of Hell for something they did not perpetrate? And why punish them for something He Himself undertook to do instead of them?!

Is this not among the injustice that Allah *Exalted is He* has praised Himself by negating from Himself, as in His saying: *"Indeed, Allah does not wrong even the weight of an atom; and if there is a good deed, He multiplies it and gives from Himself a great reward."* **[al-Nisā']**

Nearly all the beliefs of Ahl al-Sunnah, and most of their doctrines, leave the intellect standing perplexed and questioning. If you desire more on this topic, then refer to the book *"Why? And Is It? And How?"* for in it are many questions posed by reason and objections raised by innate disposition against that doctrine.

We have previously mentioned some of the doctrinal superstitions concerning the Imāmī doctrine when discussing them; refer back to that section—by which we mean the Jaʿfarīs.

[Some Falsehoods of the Ismāʿīlī Doctrine]

As for the Imāmī Ismāʿīlīs, the foundations of their beliefs—upon investigation—are not clear at the general level, due to their concealment of their doctrine; thus, they have no book.

The earliest appearance of the Ismāʿīlī doctrine in Yemen came through Abū al-Qāsim ibn Faraj ibn Ḥawshab ibn Zādhān al-Kūfī, and ʿAlī

ibn al-Faḍl al-Khanfarī.

As for Abū al-Qāsim, he ascended Jabal Maswar, conquered it, and built upon it a fortress.

As for ʿAlī ibn al-Faḍl, he took control of the land of Yāfiʿ, then his power intensified until he seized most of the districts of Yemen. He then openly declared disbelief, made all prohibitions lawful, destroyed mosques, and claimed prophethood. One of the poets of his time said about him:

- Take the lute, O woman, and strike it

we shall establish the laws of this prophet.

- Allegiance to the prophet of Banū Hāshim

and this is the prophet of Banū Yaʿrub.

- So abandon prayer, abandon almsgiving,

abandon fasting—and he did not tire.

This was mentioned by Nashwān in his book *al-Ḥūr al-ʿAyn*, p. 252.

It is well known of the Ismāʿīlīs—commonly called the Bāṭiniyyah—that they interpret the words of the Qur'an contrary to their apparent meanings, and likewise the words of the Sunnah. Thus, regarding what Allah *Exalted is He* mentioned of the reward of Paradise and its bliss, they say that what is meant is union with the Beloved; and regarding what Allah *Exalted is He* mentioned of the severe threat in the Fire of Hell, they say that what is meant is separation from the Beloved; and so on. Accordingly, they are not Muslims, because they nullify the laws of Islam, its obligations, its promises and its threats, and so forth.

As for the Zaydī doctrine, you will find it pure of every superstition and far removed from every blemish.

What it lacks is that it was not granted a state or authority. On the contrary, from its very first day it was afflicted by wars waged by states and rulers who seized control of the lands of the Muslims.

[The Foundation of Islam]

It is narrated in the ḥadīth: *"For everything there is a foundation, and the foundation of Islam is love for us, the Ahl al-Bayt"*[1].

Indeed, the pillars of Islam cannot stand unless they are built upon this firm foundation. Whoever builds upon a foundation other than this, his structure collapses, and the roof falls down upon him from above.

1- *Taysīr al-Maṭālib* (p. 512, no. 690); *Mīzān al-Iʿtidāl* (4/35) in the biography of Muḥammad ibn Misʿar.

The clarification of this is that when a person loves someone, he deems all of his movements and stillness commendable; his inclination follows the inclination of his beloved; he becomes displeased with whatever displeases him. Hence, *Exalted is He* said: *"Say: If you love Allah, then follow me ..."* **[Āl ʿImrān: 31]**. Thus, following is consequent upon love, derived from it, and inseparable from it.

By this it becomes clear that love is the foundation of Islam and its root. If love is attained, acting upon the laws of Islam follows; and if love is not attained, the required action does not materialize.

This is something established in the natures of souls and ingrained in their innate disposition upon which Allah *Exalted is He* created them—*there is no alteration in the creation of Allah*. Conversely, hatred: when a person detests someone, he detests his actions and recoils from them, and so on.

It has also come from the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*: *"The firmest bond of Islam is love for the sake of Allah and hatred for the sake of Allah"*—or as he said. And Allah *Exalted is He* said: *"O you who believe, do not take the Jews and the Christians as allies; they are allies of one another; and whoever among you takes them as allies ..."* **[al-Mā'idah: 51]**. And He *Exalted is He* said: *"Do not take the disbelievers as allies instead of the believers."* **[al-Nisā': 144]** *"And whoever does that—he has no connection with Allah whatsoever ..."* **[Āl ʿImrān: 28]**.

If you have known this, then know that it is obligatory upon every legally responsible person to acquire affection for the Ahl al-Bayt, to nurture it within the soul and to cultivate the heart with it, and thereafter to preserve it—blocking the avenues of Satan through which he may slip into the believer's heart to corrupt his love for the Ahl al-Bayt. For if that love becomes corrupted and spoiled, the edifice of Islam collapses and its pillars are left desolate.

The avenues and entrances of Satan in this regard are many. Among them is that Satan approaches a person through the door of *preference*, instilling in him aversion to the increase of the virtue of the Ahl al-Bayt over others; he adorns for him prideful refusal to acknowledge their merit, and beautifies denial of it.

Then Satan follows this by embellishing enmity toward the Ahl al-Bayt, harassing them, and attempting to inflict harm upon them.Thus, whenever a person responds to Satan in a small matter, he drags him into what is greater and casts him into what is more grievous—until he causes him to fall into disbelief, denial of the signs of Allah, and mockery of them—exactly as *Exalted is He* said: *"Then the end of those who committed evil was the worst—because they denied the signs of Allah and*

used to mock them." **[al-Rūm]**. And as *Exalted is He* said: *"Let those beware who oppose his command, lest a trial befall them or a painful punishment strike them."* **[al-Nūr]**.

It is incumbent upon the legally responsible person to fight such satanic whisperings and to repel them. The path to combating them is to seek refuge in Allah *Exalted is He* from the whisperings and incitements of Satan, and to place before oneself the commands of Satan and the commands of Allah *Exalted is He*, bringing them to mind—then to consider which has the better outcome: obedience to Satan, or obedience to the commands of the Most Merciful? The intelligent and discerning person undoubtedly chooses obedience to the Most Merciful and, with conviction, rejects obedience to Satan.

If people were to look in this manner and open the eyes of their hearts to sound choice, they would not turn away from obedience to Allah *Exalted is He*. But most people, as Allah mentioned: *"Deaf, dumb, blind—so they do not reason."* **[al-Baqarah]**. How often has Allah *Exalted is He* repeated, in recounting the condition of the vast majority of people, that they do not reason, do not know, do not see, and the like?

[Arrogant Pride and Self-Exaltation: A Lethal Disease Leading to the Punishment of the Hereafter]

Let a person remember that arrogant pride and self-exaltation are what expelled Satan from Paradise, disgraced and banished, and by which he deserved that the Most Merciful *Exalted is He* say to him: *"He said: Then get out of it, for indeed you are accursed; and indeed upon you is My curse until the Day of Judgment."* **[Ṣād]**. This disease of arrogant pride is the lethal ailment that drove previous nations to deny the messengers—*peace be upon them*—to disbelieve in Allah and His signs; thereafter the calamities of this world and the punishment of the Hereafter befell them.

Allah *Exalted is He* said, relating the words of those who denied the messengers—*peace be upon them*: *"They said: Shall we believe you while the lowest follow you?"* **[al-Shuʿarāʾ]**. And: *"They denied them while their souls were certain of them—out of injustice and arrogance. So see how was the end of the corrupters."* **[al-Naml]**. And: *"We see none following you except the lowest among us at first glance, and we see no merit for you over us; rather, we think you are liars."* **[Hūd]**.

After all this, if a person were to know his true worth, he would turn away from those satanic whisperings and occupy himself with what truly concerns him. Hence it has come in the report: *"Whoever knows his own worth does not perish"*. For the one who has known himself has become firmly settled in the depths of his soul, and knowledge has taken firm

root in his heart: that all authority belongs to Allah—He does whatever He wills and judges whatever He wills— *"He is not questioned about what He does, but they will be questioned."* **[al-Anbiyā']**. *"And your Lord creates whatever He wills and chooses; they have no choice."* **[al-Qaṣaṣ: 68]**. *"And that bounty is in the Hand of Allah; He gives it to whom He wills, and Allah is Possessor of great bounty."* **[al-Ḥadīd]**. *"He specifies by His mercy whom He wills …"* **[al-Baqarah: 105]**.

He does not exceed his station of servitude to Allah—listening and obeying, yielding and submitting. He has donned the garment of humility before Allah *Exalted is He*, wrapped himself in the cloak of abasement to his Lord, and become among those whom Allah *Exalted is He* mentioned in Sūrat al-Furqān and praised when He said: *"And the servants of the Most Merciful are those who walk upon the earth humbly …"* **[al-Furqān: 63]**, to the end of the sūrah.

[The Requirement of Allah's Wisdom in Preference]

The wisdom of Allah *Exalted is He* has required that He give preference to some of His creation over others. Thus, He preferred some angels over others, preferred some messengers over others, preferred some people over others, and preferred some believers over others. Allah *Exalted is He* charged His servants to act in accordance with this and to be content with it. This was among the most severe obligations upon them and among the most difficult. Thus, by it some attained felicity, and by it some perished.

[Those Who Deny Preference and the Response to Them]

Despite this, many people have denied preference, raising great clamor and agitation. Nothing drove them to that except pride and haughty refusal to acknowledge and admit it. Yet Allah *Exalted is He* said: *"Those messengers—We have preferred some of them over others."* **[Al-Baqarah: 253]** And He *Exalted is He* said: *"Indeed, Allah chose Adam, Noah, the family of Abraham, and the family of 'Imrān over the worlds."* **[Āl 'Imrān]** And He *Exalted is He* said: *"O Children of Israel, remember My favor which I bestowed upon you, and that I preferred you over the worlds."* **[Al-Baqarah]**

And He *Exalted is He* said regarding the preference of men over women: *"And for men over them is a degree."* **[Al-Baqarah: 228]** *"Men are maintainers of women by what Allah has preferred some of them over others."* **[Al-Nisā': 34]**

Among the tangible and observable realities is the preference of some people over others in color, beauty, strength, eloquence, lifespans, provisions, and so forth. Allah *Exalted is He* has preferred the believer over the immoral, and the knowledgeable over the ignorant. He *Exalted is*

He said: *"Allah raises those who believe among you and those who have been given knowledge in degrees."* **[Al-Mujādilah: 11]**

"Is then one who is a believer like one who is a transgressor? They are not equal." **[as-Sajdah]** *"Say: Are those who know equal to those who do not know?"* **[az-Zumar: 9]**

Allah *Exalted is He* gave preference to the wives of the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* over other women. He *Exalted is He* said: *"And whoever among you is devoutly obedient to Allah and His Messenger and does righteousness—We shall give her her reward twice …"* to His saying *Exalted is He*: *"O wives of the Prophet, you are not like any other women …"* **[al-Aḥzāb: 31–32]**

Allah *Exalted is He* also preferred Maryam over the women of the worlds. He *Exalted is He* said: *"And when the angels said: O Maryam, indeed Allah has chosen you and purified you and chosen you above the women of the worlds."* **[Āl ʿImrān]**

The Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* preferred his daughter Fāṭimah over the women of the worlds; authentic narrations have established this.

The Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* declared al-Ḥasan and al-Ḥusayn *(Peace be Upon Them)* to be the masters of the youth of Paradise[1], and he *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* said regarding them: *"They are my two sweet-smelling basil plants of this world,"* as narrated by al-Bukhārī[2].

Allah *Exalted is He* preferred the Household of His Prophet and singled them out with His mercy. He *Exalted is He* said: *"Indeed, Allah only intends to remove defilement from you, O People of the House, and to purify you with a thorough purification."*

He *Exalted is He* also made loving them obligatory. He *Exalted is He* said: *"Say: I do not ask of you any reward for it except affection for the near of kin."* **[ash-Shūrā: 23]**

In the Qur'an—and likewise in the Sunnah—there is much of the like of what we have mentioned, from evidences that came in Islam to establish the law of preference.

Preference is divided into two types: acquired and non-acquired

1) *Acquired preference*: This is the preference that a legally

1- Narrated by al-Ḥākim in *al-Mustadrak ʿalā aṣ-Ṣaḥīḥayn* (3/182, no. 4778). He said: "This ḥadīth is authentic through numerous chains, and I am astonished that the two [i.e., al-Bukhārī and Muslim] did not include it."

2- al-Bukhārī, no. 3753 and no. 5994.

responsible person deserves by virtue of an action he performs, such as striving in jihād, precedence in embracing Islam, hastening to righteous deeds, and abandoning evil deeds. Allah *Exalted is He* said: *"Allah has preferred the strivers over those who sit back with a tremendous reward—degrees from Him and forgiveness ..."* **[an-Nisā': 95–96]** *"The foremost—the foremost—those are the ones brought near."* **[al-Wāqi'ah]** *"Allah raises those who believe among you and those who have been given knowledge in degrees, and Allah is Fully Aware of what you do."* **[al-Mujādilah]** ...and so on.

2) *Non-acquired preference*: This is the preference that a person deserves without any action on his part, but merely by Allah's preference—such as the preference of the angels over humans, the preference of men over women, and the preference of some people over others through greater intellect, intelligence and understanding, eloquence, beauty of form, courage, generosity, and the like.

The preference of the Ahl al-Bayt *Peace be Upon Them* is fundamentally of this second type—non-acquired. It came to them solely by Allah's preference. This preference is manifested in the following:

1- Their connection to the Messenger of Allah *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*; their lineage is connected to the lineage of Messenger of Allah *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*, making them the closest of people to him, the most strongly connected to him, and the most beloved to him.
2- Their being singled out for the removal of defilement and for purification, exactly as Allah *Exalted is He* said: *"Indeed, Allah only intends to remove defilement from you, O People of the House, and to purify you with a thorough purification."* **[al-Aḥzāb]**
3- Allah *Exalted is He* singled them out with increased innate preparedness for acquiring knowledge, with greater retention and understanding. It is authentically reported from the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* that he said: *"O Allah, place knowledge in my progeny and the progeny of my progeny, and in my offspring and the offspring of my offspring".* And the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* said regarding them: *"...they were granted my understanding and my knowledge...".*
4- Allah *Exalted is He* singled them out by making it obligatory to invoke blessings upon them together with the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* in the tashahhud of the prayers. The prayer of the worshipper is not complete unless he says in his tashahhud: *"O Allah, bless Muḥammad and the family of*

Muḥammad ..." and so on.

5- Allah *Exalted is He* singled them out by making love for them obligatory upon all Muslims, and He made that the recompense for the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* for conveying the Message. He *Exalted is He* said: *"Say: I do not ask of you any reward for it except affection for the near of kin."* **[ash-Shūrā: 23]**

6- Allah *Exalted is He* made them—apart from all other people—a sign of truth and guidance whenever people differ, until the Day of Resurrection. The Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* said, as in the well-known ḥadīth: *"Indeed, I am leaving among you that which, if you hold fast to it, you will never go astray after me: the Book of Allah and my progeny, the people of my House. The Subtle, the All-Aware informed me that they will never separate until they return to me at the Pond".* And he *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* said: *"My Household is like the Ark of Nūḥ: whoever boards it is saved, and whoever lags behind it is drowned and perishes".*

7- Allah *Exalted is He* singled them out with the succession to prophethood, making them leaders for the people apart from all others. What has preceded in establishing this suffices without repetition. It has also been reported from the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*: *"Do not put yourselves ahead of them lest you perish..."* the ḥadīth, and *"Your war is my war, and your peace is my peace".*

8- Allah *Exalted is He* singled them out by ensuring that the truth does not depart from them until the Day of Resurrection, and that they safeguard it, defend it, proclaim it, and clarify it. In the well-known ḥadīth it is said: *"At every innovation by which Islam is nearly undone, there is a guardian from my Household who proclaims the truth and makes it clear...".*

9- Allah *Exalted is He* singled them out by forbidding zakāh to them, just as He forbade it to the Messenger *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*. There is no disagreement regarding this.

They possess many virtues with which Allah *Exalted is He* has singled them out—more than we can enumerate here. Our aim here is only to mention examples by which their being singled out for preference over the rest of people becomes clear.

They also possess acquired virtues in which no predecessor surpassed them and no successor will ever reach them. Whoever reads their history—from the time of the Commander of the Faithful *(Peace be Upon Him)* until this very day—in commanding what is right, forbidding what

is wrong, striving against oppressors, and what befell them in that path of fear, poverty, displacement, and the like; and in worship, asceticism, piety, seeking knowledge and spreading it, showing affection to people, gentleness, compassion, and sincere counsel—will know the truth of what we have stated: *"That is the bounty of Allah; He gives it to whom He wills, and Allah is Possessor of tremendous bounty."* **[al-Ḥadīd]**

[Allah Gives the One Who Responds More Than He Takes From Him]

If you have known that, then know that Allah *Exalted is He* gives the one who responds to His command more than He takes from him. Let us give an example of that: Allah *Exalted is He* commanded sending blessings upon the family of the Messenger of Allah *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* together with sending blessings upon the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*, as established in the authentic ḥadīth: *"... Say: O Allah, bless Muḥammad and the family of Muḥammad ...".* If the servant responds to the command of Allah *Exalted is He*, Allah *Exalted is He* gives him many times over. In the authentic ḥadīth: *"Whoever sends one prayer upon me, Allah sends ten prayers upon him for it, records for him ten good deeds, erases from him ten evil deeds, and the two angels appointed over him compete as to which of them will convey to my soul his greeting".* or as he *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* said.

So, look at the greatness of the reward and the nobility of the divine bestowal: the Lord of the worlds sends ten prayers upon His servant who responded to His command, erases from him ten evil deeds, and records for him ten good deeds ... and so on.

Likewise, everything that Allah *Exalted is He* has commanded—He gives the one who responds to it and complies with His command such a gift, and multiplies it for him. Allah *Exalted is He* said: *"Whoever comes with a good deed shall have better than it."* **[al-Qaṣaṣ: 84]** And in another verse: *"So he shall have ten times its like."* **[al-Anʿām: 160]**

Allah *Exalted is He* may give for some deeds even more than that, as He *Exalted is He* said regarding spending in His path: *"The example of those who spend their wealth in the way of Allah is like a grain which grows seven ears; in every ear are a hundred grains. And Allah multiplies for whom He wills, and Allah is All-Encompassing, All-Knowing."* **[al-Baqarah]**

He *Exalted is He* also granted virtue to certain times and certain places, by which a good deed is rewarded as a thousand good deeds; spending during ḥajj as a thousand; Laylat al-Qadr as a thousand months; and a good deed in the rest of the month of Ramaḍān as many times multiplied beyond what it is outside Ramaḍān ... and so on.

Among the pillars of love for the Ahl al-Bayt is hating their enemies and opposing them**,** Allah *Exalted is He* said: *"You will not find a people who believe in Allah and the Last Day loving those who oppose Allah and His Messenger, even if they were their fathers, or their sons, or their brothers, or their close kin …"* **[al-Mujādilah: 22]**

This verse establishes that faith in Allah and affection for the enemy of Allah do not coexist.

Likewise, love for the Ahl al-Bayt and love for their enemies do not coexist in the heart of a man. It has been said: Your enemies are three: your enemy, the enemy of your friend, and the friend of your enemy.

One poet said:

You befriend my enemy, then claim that you are my friend

Your foolishness is not hidden from me.

Another said:

If your friend befriends the one you oppose,

Then, he has opposed you and all ties are cut.

Therefore, we say: Those who claim that they love ʿAlī *(Peace be upon Him)* and love Muʿāwiyah are liars in this claim; and those who love ʿAmmār ibn Yāsir and love his killer; and those who love al-Ḥusayn ibn ʿAlī *(Peace be upon Him)* and love his killers— all of these are false claims, refuted by innate reason and by the natural disposition with which Allah has created human beings, due to the impossibility of such things being combined in one person.

[Love]

Love is the inclination of the heart toward the beloved. It is from Allah's creation and innate disposition; the legally responsible person has no power either to bring it about or to repel it.

When love settles in the heart, practical effects necessarily follow. If the beloved is wealth, a person strives to acquire it; if it is a woman, he strives to marry her; if it is a man, he strives to benefit him and praise him … and so on.

Thus, the legal commands that have come regarding affection are intended to refer to the practical effects that relate to the tongue, the hands, the feet, and the like.

As for the love of the heart and its inclination toward the beloved, commands and prohibitions are not directed at it, because human ability does not encompass it.

If you have known that, then know that practical love—which falls

within human capacity—varies according to the motive that calls to it and the incentive that drives it, into several types:

1- Kindness to disbelieving or immoral parents without disobedience to Allah. Such kindness is permissible and not forbidden. This kindness arises from the motive of kinship and blood relation. Likewise, is kindness to all relatives. Allah *Exalted is He* said: *"But if they strive against you to make you associate with Me that of which you have no knowledge, then do not obey them, but accompany them in this world with kindness."* **[Luqmān: 15]**
2- Kindness that arises from the motive of generosity and modesty, such as kindness to a neighbor or a companion, reciprocation, honoring a guest, and kindness to one who has not wronged you, and the like.
3- Kindness motivated by good manners, such as good conduct toward people in general in matters like buying and selling, and speaking kindly to them. Everything that falls under these three types, or is akin to them, is permissible and not forbidden toward the disbeliever, the immoral person, and others.
4- There is another type that is forbidden: to show kindness to a person because he is an enemy of Allah, or an enemy of His Messenger, or an enemy of His Book, or an enemy of the family of the Messenger of Allah *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*, or an enemy of the believers, or because he is an oppressor, or immoral, and so on—except with a valid excuse.
   The valid excuse is fear for one's life; in such a case it is permissible to ward off harm from oneself by some form of kindness that causes no harm to any of the believers.
   Another valid excuse is when kindness serves an interest, such as drawing the immoral person toward repentance, or something similar.
5- Among what is forbidden is kindness to a disbeliever who is at war with Islam, or an immoral person who is at war with the religion, or a religious opponent who is at war with the truth and with those upon the truth. Kindness to such people—and those like them—in a manner that strengthens their side and reinforces them in their war is forbidden. This includes selling them weapons and instruments of war, or aiding them in their enmity and warfare with one's person, wealth, tongue, or even by a gesture—such as pointing with one's finger to the path that leads to harm for the believers and Muslims.

These last two types are strictly forbidden. The evidences for this are many. What has come in the Qur'an regarding the prohibition of loving the enemies of Allah and the prohibition of allying with them refers to

the type of alliance and affection such as what we have mentioned in these last two categories. Among that is the saying of Allah *Exalted is He*: *"You will not find a people who believe in Allah and the Last Day loving those who oppose Allah and His Messenger, even if they were their fathers, or their sons, or their brothers, or their close kin …"* **[al-Mujādilah: 22]** And His saying *Exalted is He*: *"O you who believe, do not take the Jews and the Christians as allies; they are allies of one another. And whoever among you takes them as allies—indeed, he is of them …"* **[al-Mā'idah: 51]**

And the evidences of the Qur'an concerning this are many.

[The Proof for the Imamate of al-Ḥasan and al-Ḥusayn *(Peace be Upon Them)* after ʿAlī *(Peace be Upon Him)*]

1- After the martyrdom of the Commander of the Faithful *(Peace be Upon Him)*, the Muslims pledged allegiance to al-Ḥasan ibn ʿAlī *(Peace be Upon Him)*. By that, he became the caliph of the Muslims after his father, and the legitimate Imam of the Muslims.

2- The text of the well-known ḥadīth of al-Thaqalayn establishes the caliphate of the Household of the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*. Thus, after the death of the Commander of the Faithful, the caliphate necessarily belongs to the two grandsons *(al-Ḥasan and al-Ḥusayn, Peace be Upon Them)*. Accordingly, al-Ḥasan *(Peace be Upon Him)* is the caliph after ʿAlī *(Peace be Upon Him)*, and then al-Ḥusayn after his brother al-Ḥasan. What indicates the precedence of al-Ḥasan over his brother in the caliphate is what occurred of al-Ḥusayn's pledge of allegiance to his brother, his handing over the caliphate to him, his obedience to him, and his submission to his authority.

3- The Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* explicitly stated their Imamate in the well-known ḥadīth, saying: *"Al-Ḥasan and al-Ḥusayn are two Imams, whether they rise or sit, and their father is better than them."* The Ahl al-Bayt *(Peace be Upon Them)* are unanimously agreed upon the authenticity of this ḥadīth, and their consensus is a binding proof, as has preceded. It is well known among all scholars, and thus a report of this status does not require mention of its chain of transmission.

4- The Ahl al-Bayt *(Peace be Upon Them)* are unanimously agreed that the Imamate of al-Ḥasan and al-Ḥusayn *(Peace be Upon Them)* was established by explicit designation from the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*.

Al-Ḥasan ibn Yaḥyā said in *al-Jāmiʿ al-Kāfī* [1]: "The scholars of the family of the Messenger *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* are unanimously agreed that ʿAlī ibn Abī Ṭālib *(Peace be Upon Him)* was the best of people after the Messenger of Allah *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*, and the most entitled to his station.

Then after the Commander of the Faithful, al-Ḥasan and al-Ḥusayn are the most entitled of people to the station of the Commander of the Faithful. After that, the scholars of the family of the Messenger *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*, their God-fearing ones and their righteous ones, are the Imams of the Muslims in their lawful and unlawful matters and in the Sunnah of their Prophet. Whoever among them commands good and forbids evil, it is obligatory upon the Muslims to support him and aid him. The one among them who rises with commanding good and striving is, in their view, superior to the one who remains seated, and each one attains his due measure."

Al-Ḥasan ibn Yaḥyā also said: "The Messenger of Allah *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* indicated the Imamate of ʿAlī, al-Ḥasan, and al-Ḥusayn by their very persons and by their names …" to his saying: "And the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* said regarding al-Ḥasan and al-Ḥusayn: *"'They are the two masters of the youth of Paradise, and their father is better than them.'"* Thus he made them two masters, clarified their virtue, indicated their Imamate, and showed that it is not lawful for anyone to precede those whom the Messenger of Allah has made masters and testified for them with Paradise. And he *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* said: *"'O Allah, love whoever loves them, and hate whoever hates them.'"*[2]

And he *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* said: *"Learn from them and do not teach them, for they are more knowledgeable than you."* And he *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* said to their father and to them: *"I am at peace with whoever makes peace with you, and at war with whoever wars against you."*[3] And

1- *al-Jāmiʿ al-Kāfī fī Jāmiʿ Āl Muḥammad* by the noble Imam Abū ʿAbdullāh Muḥammad ibn ʿAlī al-Ḥasanī al-Kūfī. Al-Ḥasan ibn Yaḥyā is Imam al-Ḥasan ibn Yaḥyā ibn al-Ḥusayn ibn al Imam al-Aʿẓam Zayd ibn ʿAlī. (Quoted from *Lawāmiʿ al-Anwār*: 4/670/1)

2- *Sunan al-Tirmidhī* (5/656) no. (3769) with the wording: *"These two are my sons and the sons of my daughter. O Allah, I love them, so love them and love whoever loves them."* And *Musnad al-Shihāb* by al-Quḍāʿī (1/50) no. (26) with the wording: *"O Allah, I love them, so love them. O people, indeed children are a cause of miserliness, ignorance, and cowardice …"*

3- *Sunan Ibn Mājah* (1/52) no. (145); *al-Muʿjam al-Awsat* (7/197) no. (7259).

he *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* said: *"If they seek your help, then help them; and if they remain seated, then remain seated."* And he *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* said: *"The stars are a safeguard for the people of the heaven, and my Household are a safeguard for my Ummah."* Allah *Exalted is He* singled them out by the fatherhood of the Messenger of Allah *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*, and named them his sons in His Book, saying: *"Then say: Come, let us call our sons and your sons, our women and your women, ourselves and yourselves..."* **[Āl ʿImrān: 61]** And He singled them out with the Verse of Purification: *"Indeed, Allah only intends to remove defilement from you, O People of the House, and to purify you with a thorough purification."* **[al-Aḥzāb]**

When this verse was revealed, the Messenger of Allah *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* placed the cloak over himself, over ʿAlī, Fāṭimah, al-Ḥasan, and al-Ḥusayn, then said: *"O Allah, these are my Household; so remove from them defilement and purify them with a thorough purification."*

He obligated love for them upon every Muslim, and assigned for them the khums as an obligation in the Book of Allah. They have the Verse of Selection (*Ayat al-Safwa*): *"Then We caused those whom We chose to inherit the Book."* **[Fāṭir: 32]** And the Verse of Purification, the Verse of Mutual Imprecation, the Verse of Khums, the Verse of Fayʾ, and the Verse of Affection ... to his saying: And the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* said to their father, to them, and to whoever holds fast to the Book among their progeny: *"Indeed, I am leaving among you that which, if you hold fast to it, you will never go astray after me: the Book of Allah and my progeny, the People of my House."* Thus, they are the fathers of the pure progeny, its two masters, and the locus about which the Messenger of Allah *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* informed that guidance lies in holding fast to it. It is therefore not lawful for any Muslim to precede them, nor to seek guidance in other than them, nor in other than their descendants ... etc. *End of the excerpt from al-Mukhtār.*

[The Imamate of the Imam after the Two Grandsons *(Peace be Upon Them)*]

The proof for the establishment of the Imamate of an Imam from the family of the Messenger of Allah *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* is what has already preceded among the evidences in the first proof of this chapter; therefore, there is no need to repeat it.

For the validity of the Imamate, its conditions must necessarily be fulfilled:

1- That the Imam be fully possessed of its conditions, some of which we have already mentioned earlier.
2- Among them are: calling openly, manifesting oneself, and public proclamation.

The meaning of this is that he appoints himself to fight the oppressors, to command what is right and forbid what is wrong, unsheathes his sword, raises his banner, and dispatches callers among the people to invite them to respond to him and to support him. From this comes what has been narrated from the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*: *"Whoever commands what is right and forbids what is wrong from among my progeny, he is the Caliph of Allah, the Caliph of His Messenger, and the Caliph of His Book."* This was mentioned by al-Hādī *(Peace be Upon Him)* and others.

This can also be inferred from what has been firmly established: that the Messenger of Allah *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* appointed his Household to occupy the station of the caliphate after him until the Day of Resurrection, as stated in the ḥadīth of al-Thaqalayn, upon whose authenticity there is consensus.

No one can truly uphold the rights of the caliphate or proceed according to the way of the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* except the one who most closely resembles the Messenger of Allah *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* in the qualities of knowledge, piety, asceticism, God-consciousness, courage, generosity of character, gentleness of nature, sound administration, and perfection of intellect—along with the rest of the qualities that play a role in administering the affairs of the caliphate. As for one who is deficient in any of these qualities, he is not fit for the caliphate; for one who lacks something cannot give it. The ignorant cannot be expected to guide the people; one who does not know what is right and what is wrong cannot be expected to establish what is right or forbid what is wrong; the treacherous cannot be expected to bear the trust that was offered to the heavens and the earth; and the immoral is not fit to convey the message, in accordance with the saying of Allah *Exalted is He*: *"O you who believe, if a wicked person comes to you with news, verify it, lest you harm people out of ignorance and then become regretful for what you have done."* **[al-Ḥujurāt]** Thus, Allah *Exalted is He* described his report and speech as ignorance that leads to regret. And one of bad character, harsh in temperament, is ominous: *"And if you had been harsh and hard-hearted, they would have dispersed from around you."* **[Āl ʿImrān: 159]**

[The Ruling Concerning Those Who Preceded ʿAlī *(Peace be Upon Him)*]

The circumstances in which our Imams *(Peace be Upon Them)* lived did not allow them to be categorical in issuing judgment; nevertheless, they did not neglect the matter entirely. Rather, they mentioned it in a conditional manner without decisiveness, while leaving room for interpretation— all of this, as appears, in order to promote acceptance, to protect themselves from attack and harm, and to avoid accusations being directed against them, and so forth.

Thus, some of them said: If those who preceded ʿAlī *(Peace be Upon Him)* knew of his entitlement to the caliphate based on what they had heard from the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*, and they were certain of it, yet they still went ahead of him and abandoned him, then they are disobedient sinners, and their disobedience is a major sin. But if they did not know this after investigation, reflection, and exerting effort in seeking the evidences that lead to the truth, then there is no sin upon them even if they erred— based on the saying of Allah *Exalted is He*: *"And there is no blame upon you for what you have erred in, but only for what your hearts deliberately intended."* **[al-Aḥzāb: 5]** And based on the saying of the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*: *"My community has been excused for error and forgetfulness."*

Companionship and the Companions

Faith in the Prophet *(may Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* and accompanying him is a great virtue. However, Ahl al-Sunnah wa'l-Jamāʿah went beyond proper bounds and exaggerated the merit of companionship and the Companions. They made companionship an absolute immunity such that no sin harms it, and they claimed that whoever saw the Prophet *(may Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* even once is a Companion, and that everyone who attained this virtue is upright. Thus they generalized uprightness to everyone who merely saw him and called him a Companion, and they prohibited mentioning any faults of the Companions. All of this consists of false claims imposed by the Umayyad authorities.

In reality, Allah the Exalted explicitly states otherwise in His Book. He says, addressing the Companions of the Messenger of Allah *(may Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*: *"Among you are those who desire this world, and among you are those who desire the Hereafter."* **[Āl ʿImrān: 152]** The Qurʾān also speaks extensively about hypocrites who outwardly displayed Islam deceitfully. Among this is His saying: *"And among the people of Madinah are those who persist in hypocrisy; you do not know them, but We know them."* **[al-Tawbah: 101]** And His saying: *"And among the people are those who say, 'We believe in Allah and the Last Day,' but they are not believers…"* to the end of the verses. **[al-Baqarah]**

And there are many other such passages. If you wish for more, then turn to the chapters revealed in Madinah and examine them carefully.

It is far-fetched to imagine that the death of the Prophet *(may Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* suddenly became the cause of the reform of all hypocrites.

The truth is that the Companions of the Prophet *(may Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*, like others, have rights and obligations: among them are believers, among them hypocrites, among them the pious, among them the wretched, and so on.

Fāṭimah's Dispute with Abū Bakr

Al-Bukhārī narrated from ʿĀ'ishah that Fāṭimah *(peace be upon her)* sent to Abū Bakr asking him for her inheritance from the Messenger of Allah *(may Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*—from what Allah had granted him in Madinah, from Fadak, and from what remained of the khums of Khaybar. Abū Bakr refused to give Fāṭimah anything from it. Consequently, Fāṭimah became displeased with Abū Bakr, abandoned him, and did not speak to him until she passed away. She lived for six months after the Prophet *(may Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*, and when she died, ʿAlī *(peace be upon him)* buried her at night and did not inform Abū Bakr. End.

Ibn Abī al-Ḥadīd said: Fāṭimah disputed with Abū Bakr over three matters: first, inheritance; second, the gift of Fadak; and third, the share of the relatives. Abū Bakr denied her all of these.

Imam Yaḥyā ibn Ḥamzah and Imam Aḥmad ibn Yaḥyā al-Murtaḍā *(peace be upon them)* said: Abū Bakr's ruling concerning Fadak was correct, because he ruled by ijtihād, and it has been established that every mujtahid is correct.

We say: Abū Bakr was the disputing opponent; and any litigant who rules in his own favor—his judgment is invalid by consensus, even if he is a mujtahid.

This account of the dispute is from the book *al-Muḥīṭ bi'l-Imāmah*. The author of this book narrated with his chain to ʿAbdullāh ibn al-Ḥasan that Abū Bakr expelled Fāṭimah's agent from Fadak and demanded proof from her one month after the death of the Messenger of Allah *(may Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*. Her agent came to her and said: "Abū Bakr expelled me."

Fāṭimah went to Abū Bakr accompanied by Umm Ayman and women from her people and said: "Fadak was in my possession; the Messenger of Allah *(may Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* gave it to me." He said: "O daughter of Muḥammad, you are truthful in our sight,

but you must provide proof." She said: "ʿAlī ibn Abī Ṭālib and Umm Ayman will testify for me." He said: "Bring them." They testified, so he wrote her a document and sealed it. Fāṭimah took it. She then encountered ʿUmar, who said: "O daughter of Muḥammad, give me the document." He took it, looked at it, spat on it, tore it apart, and returned it. She then met ʿAlī *(peace be upon him)*, who said: "O daughter of Muḥammad, why are you angry?" She informed him of what ʿUmar had done. He said: "What they committed against your father and against me is greater than this."

He said, she then fell ill. Abū Bakr and ʿUmar came to visit her, but she did not permit them to enter. The following day, the Commander of the Faithful *(peace be upon him)* came to her, and they learned that ʿAlī *(peace be upon him)* was with her. They sought his intercession, and she permitted them. They entered and greeted her; she returned their greeting faintly, then said: "I ask you both by Allah—besides Whom there is no god—did you hear the Messenger of Allah *(may Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* say: '*Whoever harms Fāṭimah has harmed me'?*" They said: "Yes." She said: "Then I testify that you have harmed me."

The Agreement and Division of the Shīʿah

The Shīʿah agreed upon the Imamate of the Commander of the Faithful *(peace be upon him)*, then of his son al-Ḥasan, then al-Ḥusayn *(peace be upon them both)*.

After that, their paths diverged. The Imāmiyyah said: the Imam after al-Ḥusayn *(peace be upon him)* was ʿAlī ibn al-Ḥusayn by explicit designation from the Prophet *(may Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*; then Muḥammad ibn ʿAlī al-Bāqir; then Jaʿfar al-Ṣādiq; then Mūsā ibn Jaʿfar; then ʿAlī ibn Mūsā; then Muḥammad ibn ʿAlī; then ʿAlī ibn Muḥammad; then al-Ḥasan ibn ʿAlī; then Muḥammad ibn al-Ḥasan, whom they claim to be the awaited Mahdī. They said that the Messenger of Allah *(may Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* explicitly designated these individuals by name.

We say: there is no explicit designation of any specific individual after ʿAlī and the two grandsons *(peace be upon them)*. Had there been such a designation for those mentioned, it would have appeared clearly and become widely known.

Since this did not occur and did not become known, we know that it is not correct—because matters of foundational religion of this magnitude must necessarily be widely known, and the Imamate is among the greatest foundational matters of religion. Claims cannot be accepted unless supported by proofs to which all disputants submit and believe, as

Allah the Exalted says: *"Say: Bring your proof, if you are truthful."* **[al-Naḥl]**.

Two Imams at One Time

It has already been stated that it is not permissible for two Imams to exist at the same time, due to the risk of discord, dispute, and corruption—unlike prophethood, where such outcomes are not expected because of infallibility.

Al-Nāṣir *(peace be upon him)*, however, held that this is permissible if they are geographically separate and all follow the command of Allah the Exalted. In *al-Jāmiʿ al-Kāfī*, from al-Ḥasan ibn Yaḥyā ibn al-Ḥusayn ibn Zayd *(peace be upon them)*, it is narrated that the family of the Messenger of Allah *(may Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* agreed that it is permissible for multiple individuals—whether separate or together—to call to his cause. To his saying, When the command of Allah becomes manifest, the pious and learned among the family of the Messenger of Allah *(may Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* are most knowledgeable regarding whom to approve.

The Abdication of an Imam

It is not permissible for an Imam to abdicate so long as he has supporters, because a duty has become attached to him, and it does not fall away except through inability. However, if there exists someone more capable of fulfilling the role and more beneficial to the Muslims, then it becomes obligatory for him to abdicate in favor of that person.

The Imamate of an Imam is nullified if an impediment arises that prevents him from carrying out the functions of the caliphate, such as insanity, leprosy, or the like, and likewise by immorality. If the Imam commits immorality, his Imamate is invalidated. This is exceedingly unlikely in one who fulfills the conditions of the Imamate. Included as well is his failure to carry out his duty of confronting oppressors and administering the affairs of religion. The Imamate is also nullified by hopeless captivity, and the criterion in this matter is the despair of the subjects.

[Preference]

Preference is among the greatest trials by which Allah *Exalted is He* has tested His servants, and among the most severe obligations and heaviest burdens upon those morally accountable. None can bear this heavy obligation or accept it with contentment except the humble.

They are those of whom Allah *Exalted is He* says in Sūrat al-Furqān: *"And the servants of the Most Merciful are those who walk upon the earth gently …"* **[Al-Furqān: 63]**.

And the first level of humility is humility before Allah *Exalted is He*

through hearing and obeying, being content, submitting, and surrendering, whether the obligations be great or small. Exactly as Allah *Exalted is He* relates regarding the faith of the Messenger and the believers in Sūrat al-Baqarah: *"They said: We hear and we obey. Grant us Your forgiveness, our Lord, and to You is the return."* **[Al-Baqarah]**.

If you have understood this, then know that the best of the Ummah after its Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* is ʿAlī *(Peace be Upon Him)*, then al-Ḥasan, then al-Ḥusayn *(Peace be Upon Them)*, then the collective body of the ʿItra is superior to any other group of the Ummah, and the virtuous individuals among the ʿItra are superior to the virtuous individuals among others.

The evidence for this is what has been authentically reported from the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* by consensus, as cited by the scholars of ḥadīth: *"Al-Ḥasan and al-Ḥusayn are the masters of the youth of Paradise, and their father is better than them both."*[1]

The ḥadīth of al-Thaqalayn, the ḥadīth of the Cloak, the verse of affection, the verse of purification, and the obligation of invoking blessings upon them within the prayer have all preceded; all of these testify to what we have stated. The proofs in this chapter are numerous and hardly subject to enumeration. Whoever seeks more should consult *Lawāmiʿ al-Anwār* and *al-Shāfī*.

The majority of the Sunni schools hold that the best of the Ummah after its Prophet is Abū Bakr, then ʿUmar, then ʿUthmān, then ʿAlī, then the rest of the Ten. By "the Ten" they mean the four mentioned above, along with Ṭalḥah, al-Zubayr, Saʿd ibn Abī Waqqāṣ, Abū ʿUbaydah ibn al-Jarrāḥ, ʿAbd al-Raḥmān ibn ʿAwf, and Saʿīd ibn Zayd.

We say: virtue is attained by its possessor through two matters—or through one of them:

1- By consideration of the deeds performed by the morally accountable person.
2- By consideration of Allah's *Exalted is He* own act of preference.

Thus, ʿAlī *(Peace be Upon Him)* was the earliest of the Muslims to embrace Islam; no male accepted Islam before him. Allah *Exalted is He* says: *"The foremost—the foremost—those are the ones brought near."* **[Al-Wāqiʿah]**.

And he *(Peace be Upon Him)* was the most active of the Companions in striving alongside the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and*

1- Its authentication has already been cited.

grant them peace), and the most effective against the enemy. Allah *Exalted is He* says: *"Allah has preferred those who strive over those who sit back with a great reward."* **[Al-Nisāʾ]**.

And he *(Peace be Upon Him)* was the most knowledgeable of them. The Companions used to refer back to him in many religious matters, to the extent that ʿUmar said: "If not for ʿAlī, ʿUmar would have perished," and he also said: "May Allah never keep me alive for a problem for which you are not present, O Abū al-Ḥasan."

Allah *Exalted is He* says: *"Allah raises those who believe among you and those who were given knowledge in ranks."* **[Al-Mujādilah: 11]**, and He *Exalted is He* says: *"Say: Are those who know equal to those who do not know?"* **[Al-Zumar: 9]**.

As for the texts that indicate his preference *(Peace be Upon Him)* over others, they are numerous—so much so that one of the Sunni[1] scholars said: "Nothing has come regarding any of the Companions comparable to what has come regarding ʿAlī."

The hadith scholars of Ahl al-Sunnah have narrated a great deal that indicates what we have mentioned.

Among them is the ḥadīth of ʿĀʾishah, which she narrated from the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* concerning the killing of the Khārijites. Masrūq entered upon ʿĀʾishah, and she said to him: "Who killed the Khārijites?" He replied: "ʿAlī *(Peace be Upon Him)* killed them." She said: "I heard the Messenger of Allah *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* say: *'The best of my Ummah after me will kill them; he is with the truth, and the truth is with him.'"*[2]

[The Best of the Wives of the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*]

The best of the wives of the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* is Khadījah bint Khuwaylid, due to her precedence in Islam; for she was the first of all people to embrace Islam, without any disagreement among the Muslims.

1- This statement has been reported from Aḥmad ibn Ḥanbal and Ismāʿīl ibn Isḥāq al-Qāḍī, as cited by the author of *al-Istīʿāb fī Maʿrifat al-Aṣḥāb* (3/1115). It has already been mentioned previously.

2- Ibn Ḥajar said in *Fatḥ al-Bārī* (12/286): From ʿĀʾishah, who said: The Messenger of Allah *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* mentioned the Khārijites and said: *"They are the worst of my Ummah; the best of my Ummah will kill them."* Its chain is sound. It is also reported by al-Ṭabarānī, Aḥmad, Muslim, Ibn Abī Shaybah, and others.

Al-Bukhārī[1] narrated from the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* that he said: *"The best of its women is Maryam bint ʿImrān, and the best of its women is Khadījah bint Khuwaylid."*

Some people have said that ʿĀ'ishah is superior, arguing that she was the most beloved of the Prophet's wives *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* to him, that he married her as a virgin, that he *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* passed away in her house, that the Qur'ān was revealed declaring her innocence, and that she narrated many reports from the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*.

We reply: when an explicit transmitted report exists, personal reasoning is nullified. The previously mentioned ḥadīth narrated by al-Bukhārī from the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* has been authentically established.

Then the proponents of this view claimed that ʿĀ'ishah is superior to Fāṭimah *(Peace be Upon Her)*.

The response is that it has been authentically reported from the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* that Fāṭimah is a part of the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*, that her pleasure is his pleasure, and her anger is his anger. Al-Bukhārī narrated this. If Fāṭimah is a part of the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*, and the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* is the best of all mankind, then From here it is correct for us to say that Fāṭimah is the best of the women of the worlds.

[The Wilāyah of the Ahl al-Bayt]

The wilāyah (guardianship and allegiance) of the Ahl al-Bayt is a foundation of Islam and a pillar of faith. The Islam and faith of a Muslim are not complete except by fulfilling the right of this wilāyah. Wilāyah is a comprehensive term that encompasses several meanings, the most important of which are:

- Affirming and believing that they are the chosen elite of Allah and His select ones from this Ummah.
- Affirming that they are the best of the people of this Ummah after the Messenger of Allah *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*.
- Supporting them by the tongue according to one's ability, and

1- Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī (4/164, no. 3432), and (5/38, no. 3815).

clarifying their virtue and rank within the Ummah.

- Affirming and believing that they are the people of truth, the companions of the Qurʾān, and those who clarify for people what they differ about.
- Befriending their allies and opposing their enemies.
- Manifesting love and affection for them in word and deed, and showing grief over what befell them.
- Being guided by their guidance, following their exemplars, and affiliating oneself with them.
- Showing kindness to those among them who do good, and pardoning those who err.
- Believing and affirming that they are the most entitled of people to the station of the Messenger of Allah *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* without any interval.
- Believing that they never depart from the truth, nor does the truth depart from them until the end of religious obligation.
- Believing that they are the proofs of Allah over His creation after the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* until the end of obligation.

[Al-Ḥisbah and the Muḥtasib]

Al-ḥisbah is: assuming the position of the Imam, in the absence of an Imam, to carry out his functions—such as commanding what is right, forbidding what is wrong, reforming the lands and the servants of Allah, and the like. The muḥtasib possesses the rights of the Imam and bears his responsibilities, except for what has been excluded.

It is required of the muḥtasib to possess sound intellect, complete piety, sound judgment, good administration, and knowledge—whether through ijtihād or taqlīd.

It is not required that the muḥtasib be from the family of the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*, nor from Quraysh, nor from the Arabs. Rather, what is required is masculinity, freedom, established justice, and the absence of anyone more suitable for the Imamate without impediment.

He is not permitted to seize financial rights by coercion, nor to establish the legal punishments (ḥudūd).

However, it is permissible for him to compel assistance in repelling wrongdoing, to collect wealth for repelling disbelievers and rebels, and to compel—without fighting—the performance of obligations such as

establishing prayer, paying zakāh, and the like. And Allah knows best.

[Commanding What Is Right and Forbidding What Is Wrong]

Commanding what is right and forbidding what is wrong is among the greatest ordinances of Islam and one of its most important obligations, without disagreement among the Muslims. Among its proofs is the saying of Allah *Exalted is He*: *"And let there be from among you a community that calls to goodness, commands what is right, and forbids what is wrong."* **[Āl ʿImrān: 104]** And His saying *Exalted is He*: *"Those who disbelieved among the Children of Israel were cursed by the tongue of David and Jesus son of Mary. That was because they disobeyed and used to transgress. They did not forbid one another from the wrongdoing they committed …"* **[Al-Māʾidah: 78–79]**.

Commanding what is right and forbidding what is wrong becomes obligatory when their conditions are fulfilled, namely:

1- Maturity and sound intellect, for the pen is lifted from the child and the insane.
2- Ability, for *"Allah does not burden a soul except with what it can bear."* **[Al-Baqarah: 286]**.
3- Knowledge on the part of the one who commands and forbids that what he commands is indeed right and what he forbids is indeed wrong; for if he does not know that, he may end up commanding wrong and forbidding right.
4- Expectation of effect; if he does not expect any effect, then—according to those who stipulated this—commanding and forbidding are not obligatory.
   It has also been said that it is obligatory whether effect is expected or not, and this is more appropriate, due to the saying of Allah *Exalted is He*: *"And when a group among them said: Why do you admonish a people whom Allah is going to destroy or punish with a severe punishment? They said: As an excuse before your Lord, and perhaps they may become mindful."* **[Al-Aʿrāf]**, and for the establishment of proof: *"… lest mankind should have any argument against Allah after the messengers."* **[Al-Nisāʾ:165]**.

This obligation continues until two matters are achieved:

1- Until the one who commands and forbids knows that the proof has reached the sinners, that they have become certain of it, and that they are upon clear evidence.
2- Until the one who commands and forbids has employed methods and stratagems, taken all possible avenues, and conveyed exhortations to them.

We say this because of His saying *Exalted is He* at the end of the

previous verse: *"They said: As an excuse before your Lord, and perhaps they may become mindful."* **[Al-Aʿrāf]**. An excuse before Allah is not realized except after full conveyance, and despair of the possibility of effect is not realized except after exhausting all avenues.

If conveyance has been completed and the legally responsible person despairs of the sinner's return after employing all means, then there is no blame upon him if he turns away, provided that nothing appears from him indicating approval of the sinners.

Fear for one's life from killing, beating, imprisonment, or humiliation grants a concession to leave commanding and forbidding, due to the saying of Allah *Exalted is He*: *"Except for one who is compelled while his heart is at rest with faith."* **[Al-Naḥl: 106]**; and His saying *Exalted is He*: *"Except that you take precaution against them."* **[Āl ʿImrān: 28]**; and His saying *Exalted is He*: *"But whoever is compelled by severe hunger ..."* **[Al-Māʾidah: 3]**.

There is no impediment to taking the course of resolve (ʿazīmah), due to the saying of Allah *Exalted is He*: *"And be patient over what befalls you; indeed, that is of the matters requiring resolve."* **[Luqmān]**.

This is the fifth condition for the obligation of commanding what is right and forbidding what is wrong: if doing so would lead to the occurrence of another wrongdoing, and one lacks the ability to remove either the first or the second, then commanding and forbidding are not permissible in that case, because that would amount to inciting wrongdoing, which is reprehensible.

[The Method of Commanding and Forbidding]

Commanding and forbidding must be done with gentleness, leniency, and kindness, for that is closer to acceptance and more likely to bring it about. This is due to the saying of Allah *Exalted is He*: *"So speak to him with gentle speech; perhaps he may be reminded or fear."* **[Ṭā Hā]**; and His saying *Exalted is He*: *"Call to the way of your Lord with wisdom and good exhortation, and argue with them in the best manner."* **[Al-Naḥl: 125]**; and His saying *Exalted is He*: *"Good and evil are not equal; repel with that which is better."* **[Fuṣṣilat: 34]**.

If that does not avail and bring benefit, the matter may be escalated according to the circumstances: beginning with exhortation, then warning, then actions such as breaking instruments of diversion and pouring out wine, then striking with a stick, and then with weapons.

All of this is based on what has been established regarding the obligation to remove wrongdoing.

It is not permissible to resort to harsher measures when milder ones

are effective.

Imam al-Manṣūr bi'Llāh ʿAbd Allāh ibn Ḥamzah *(Peace be Upon Him)* said: "Those who harm Muslims and injure them may be killed, whether during the time of an Imam or outside of it."

The eminent scholar Sayyid Amīr al-Dīn ibn ʿAbd Allāh ibn Nahshal—ancestor of the noble Āl al-Ḥūthī residing in Hijrat Ḍaḥyān, among them the learned Sayyid ʿAbd al-ʿAẓīm ibn Ḥasan al-Ḥūthī and the learned Sayyid Ḥusayn ibn Yaḥyā al-Ḥūthī—said: "If deliberation to the extent deemed sufficient undermines immediate resistance such that the wrongdoing occurs during the time of deliberation, then it becomes obligatory to repel the wrongdoing at that moment without deliberation, even by means that are more harmful." End quote.

As for coercion by fighting to enforce obligatory acts such as prayer and the payment of zakāh, this is not permissible except for the Imam. As for coercion without fighting, it is not far-fetched that it is obligatory upon anyone capable of it. And Allah knows best.

[Migration]

Migration is leaving and moving away from a land whose people openly manifest immorality and disobedience without protection, to a place free of that.

If you have understood the meaning and explanation of migration, then know that its matter is grave and its obligation great. Allah *Exalted is He* has emphasized and stressed it, among that His saying *Exalted is He*: *"And those who believed but did not migrate—you have no guardianship over them in anything until they migrate ..."* **[Al-Anfāl: 72]**; and the saying of the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*: *"It is not lawful for an eye that sees Allah being disobeyed to blink unless it changes that or departs."*

Lands are of three categories:

1- A land of disbelief, such as Mecca before the Conquest.
2- A land of Islam, such as Madinah after migration to it.
3- A land of immorality, which is a land in which the symbols of Islam are manifest, yet along with that some major sins appear without condemnation, such as drinking wine, fornication, oppression, and the like.

Some scholars said: migration is not obligatory after the Conquest of Mecca—neither from a land of disbelief nor from a land of immorality—due to his saying *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*: *"There is no migration after the Conquest, but rather jihad and intention."*

We say: what is meant is that there is no migration from Mecca after the Conquest, because after the Conquest it became a land of Islam; therefore, there was no need for migration at that time.

This is indicated by what has been narrated from the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* that he said: *"Migration will not cease until repentance ceases, and repentance will not cease until the sun rises from the west."* Narrated by Abū Dāwūd.

It is also narrated: *"Migration will not cease as long as the disbelievers are fought."* This was narrated by a number of scholars of ḥadīth, among them Aḥmad and al-Bayhaqī.

And it is narrated: *"Migration will not cease as long as the enemy is fighting."*

And: *"Migration will not cease as long as repentance is accepted."*

And: *"Migration will not cease as long as the enemy is fought."*

The majority of our Imams *(Peace be Upon Them)* ***said***: migration from a land of immorality is obligatory.

Some of our Imams *(Peace be Upon Them)* and the four jurists differed on this point and said: migration from a land of immorality is not obligatory.

The response:

The saying of Allah *Exalted is He*: *"Indeed, those whom the angels take while wronging themselves, they will say: 'In what condition were you?' They will say: 'We were oppressed in the land.' They will say: 'Was not the earth of Allah spacious, so that you could migrate therein?' Those— their abode is Hell, and evil it is as a destination. Except for the oppressed among men, women, and children who cannot devise a plan nor are they guided to a way."* **[Al-Nisāʾ]** Allah *Exalted is He* did not distinguish in this verse between a land of disbelief and a land of immorality.

And the saying of the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*: *"It is not lawful for an eye that sees Allah being disobeyed to blink until it changes it or departs."*

Imam al-Manṣūr biʾLlāh al-Qāsim ibn Muḥammad *(Peace be Upon Him)* expanded greatly upon the argument in this chapter in *Risālat al-Taḥdhīr*.

Detail and clarification

1- If a legally accountable person is compelled to commit a sin and is coerced into it, then migration becomes obligatory upon him without disagreement; this is due to the saying of Allah *Exalted is He*: *"So fear Allah as much as you are able."* **[Al-Taghābun: 16]** If the

legally accountable person is able, by any means whatsoever, to avoid disobeying Allah *Exalted is He*, then it becomes obligatory upon him to do so.

2- If the Imam calls someone to support him, then migration to him becomes obligatory at that time, and it is not permissible to refrain from that except if the Imam grants permission or if ability is lacking.
3- If remaining in a land of immorality strengthens the side of the immoral or weakens the side of the truth and the people of truth, then migration becomes obligatory; because it is obligatory upon the legally accountable person to support the truth and the people of truth, and to forsake falsehood and the people of falsehood.

In the ḥadīth: *"Whoever aids the oppressors is like one who aided Pharaoh against Moses (Peace be Upon Him)."* Narrated by al-Hādī *(Peace be Upon Him)*.

And in another ḥadīth: *"When the Day of Resurrection comes, a caller will call out: 'Where are the oppressors, the helpers of the oppressors, and those who resemble the oppressors—even those who sharpened a pen for them or prepared an inkwell for them?' Then they will be gathered into a coffin of iron and cast into Hell."*[1]

And from the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*: *"O Ibn Masʿūd, the destruction of my Ummah will come only from the jurists and the evil scholars, and through them is the destruction of the religion."*

When al-Zuhrī mixed with the rulers, a brother of his in religion wrote to him: "May Allah protect me and you, O Abū Bakr, from trials. You have come to a state in which whoever knows you should supplicate for you and show you mercy. You have become an elderly man, and the blessings of Allah have weighed heavily upon you in what He made you understand of His Book and what He taught you of the Sunnah of His Prophet. This is not how Allah took the covenant from the scholars. Allah *Exalted is He* said: *'You shall surely make it clear to the people and not conceal it.'* **[Āl ʿImrān: 187]** Know that the least of what you have committed, and the lightest of what you have borne, is that you have comforted the loneliness of the oppressor and made easy the path of error by your closeness to one who neither fulfilled a right nor abandoned a falsehood. When they drew you near, they made you a pivot around which the millstone of their falsehood turns, a bridge over which they cross to their calamities, and a ladder by which they climb to their misguidance. Through you they cast

1- *Al-Firdaws* by al-Daylamī (1/255), no. (988)

doubt among the scholars and lead the hearts of the ignorant. How little they have built through you compared to what they have ruined for you, and how much they have taken from you compared to what they have corrupted of your religion…" and so on.

4 – It is not permissible to attend or remain seated in gatherings of disobedience, due to the saying of Allah *Exalted is He*: *"And it has already been revealed to you in the Book that when you hear the verses of Allah being denied and mocked, do not sit with them until they engage in a discourse other than that…"* **[Al-Nisāʾ: 140]**.

And the saying of the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*: *"It is not lawful for an eye that sees Allah being disobeyed to blink until it changes it or departs."*

There is, however, a situation in which none of the four aforementioned cases apply. In such a case, it is apparently permissible to reside in a land of immorality. That situation is when:

- There is, in that time, no caller to the truth.
- The legally accountable person is not compelled to commit sin.
- He does not assist the oppressors or the immoral in any way, nor provide them comfort or lend them prestige.
- He does not attend gatherings of wrongdoing.

The evidence for this is what is known of the residence of al-Ḥasan and al-Ḥusayn *(Peace be Upon Them)* in Madinah during the reign of Muʿāwiyah.

And before that, what is known of the residence of the Commander of the Faithful *(Peace be Upon Him)* there for three days.

And after that, Zayn al-ʿĀbidīn and the sons of al-Ḥasan *(Peace be Upon Them)* resided in Madinah until the end of the Umayyad period. At that time, Madinah was a land of oppression and injustice due to the domination of the tyrants of Banū Umayyah, their tyranny therein, and their public cursing of ʿAlī *(Peace be Upon Him)* and the cursing of his followers.

This is supported by what al-Nāṣir al-Aṭrūsh narrated with his chain from Zayd ibn ʿAlī, from his forefathers, from ʿAlī *(Peace be Upon Him)*, who said: A man said to him: "O Commander of the Faithful, do you consider our people—meaning the people of the Qiblah—to be polytheists?" He *(Peace be Upon Him)*, replied: "No. Had they been polytheists, it would not have been lawful for us to marry them, nor to eat their slaughtered animals, nor to inherit from them, nor to reside among them, nor would the prescribed punishments have been applied

to them. Rather, they have disbelieved in the rulings, disbelieved in blessings and in deeds; and disbelief in blessings is not disbelief in polytheism."

If it is said: many of the Imams left lands of immorality, which indicates the emphatic nature of migration.

We say: the departure of those who departed from the lands of the oppressors was because the obligation of jihad and fighting the oppressors had become binding upon them due to the presence of supporters and helpers, and thus remaining was no longer possible for them—such as al-Ḥusayn ibn ʿAlī, Zayd ibn ʿAlī, and others, *peace be upon them*.

Or it was due to fear of the oppressors, such as ʿĪsā ibn Zayd and others *(Peace be Upon Them)*.

In conclusion, distancing oneself from lands of immorality and oppression is preferable for a Muslim, safer and more prudent, because of the harm to which one living among the immoral may be exposed, the obligation placed upon him of commanding right and forbidding wrong, the causes of temptation he may face, and the influence that may affect his family and children from some of the morals of the immoral, and so forth.

Traveling to lands of disbelief and immorality

It is permissible to remain in a land of disbelief or immorality due to imprisonment or weakness, as indicated in the aforementioned verse. It is also permissible for a public interest whose benefit returns to the Muslims, whether religious or worldly, with the permission of the Imam.

It is also permissible to remain in lands of disbelief if necessity calls for it, such as a sick person traveling for medical treatment and his companion, due to the saying of Allah *Exalted is He*: *"Except what you are compelled to do."* **[Al-Anʿām: 119]** And likewise for the fearful and displaced person—what is now called a political refugee—due to the same verse. Travel is also permissible for the performance of an obligation or a recommended act; once it is completed, departure becomes obligatory. This is because the Muslims used to perform pilgrimage and ʿumrah during the time of the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* before the Conquest of Mecca, while it was a land of polytheism and disbelief in which idols were worshipped.

As for travel for leisure or for a non-essential need that does not involve obedience to Allah, that is not permissible for a Muslim, nor is it appropriate for him.

The Intermediate Position Between Two Positions

What is meant by the two positions here are the position of faith and the position of disbelief. One who occupies the position of faith is called a believer, and one who occupies the position of disbelief is called a disbeliever.

There is no disagreement within the Ummah regarding these two positions. Allah *Exalted is He* mentioned them at the beginning of Sūrat al-Baqarah, and then mentioned after them a third position, that of the hypocrites.

Allah *Exalted is He* said: *"Alif Lām Mīm. That is the Book in which there is no doubt, a guidance for the God-fearing—those who believe in the unseen, establish prayer, and spend from what We have provided them."* **[Al-Baqarah]** These are the people of the first position.

Then He said: *"Indeed, those who disbelieve—it is the same for them whether you warn them or do not warn them; they will not believe..."* **[Al-Baqarah: 6]** These are the people of the position of disbelief.

Then He said: *"And among the people are those who say: 'We believe in Allah and the Last Day,' but they are not believers."* **[Al-Baqarah]** This position is for the hypocrites.

Disagreement arose concerning the position of the one who commits major sins. The determinists said: he is a believer. The Khārijites said: he is a disbeliever. We say: he is neither a believer nor a disbeliever; rather, he occupies a position between the position of faith and the position of disbelief, and he has a ruling between the two rulings.

Before presenting the evidences for all these views and clarifying which is correct and which is false, we first present a discussion on major and minor sins. We say—by Allah's help:

Minor and Major Sins

Our Imams, peace be upon them, have said that sins are divided into minor and major sins.

Major sins are those for which the perpetrator deserves everlasting punishment if he does not repent. Minor sins are those that are expiated by acts of obedience, whether with them or even without them.

The Khārijites said: all sins are major sins, and none of them is minor.

Our evidence is the saying of Allah, *Exalted is He*: *"If you avoid the major sins which you are forbidden, We will expiate for you your lesser sins."* **[Al-Nisāʾ: 31]** And His saying, *Exalted is He*: *"It does not leave out a small sin nor a great one except that it has enumerated it."* **[Al-Kahf: 49]**

The Nāṣiriyyah—this being the apparent position of al-Hādī and the

explicit position of al-Murtaḍā and the Baghdādīs—said: every intentional act is a major sin.

Accordingly, a minor sin, in their view, is what occurs out of forgetfulness, coercion, interpretation, or the like.

The Baṣrans among the Muʿtazilites—and this was attributed in *al-Fuṣūl* to our Imams, *peace be upon them*—said instead: some intentional acts are not major sins, and minor sins are not specifically defined, because defining them would amount to encouraging their commission, and encouraging what is reprehensible is itself reprehensible.

Those who hold the first view—that every intentional act is a major sin—argue from the saying of Allah, Exalted is He: *"And whoever disobeys Allah and His Messenger, then indeed for him is the Fire of Hell, abiding therein forever."* **[Al-Jinn]** Allah did not distinguish between one act of disobedience and another, but rather generalized the threat of abiding forever in Hell for every disobedient person.

Similar to this is His saying, *Exalted is He*: *"And whoever disobeys Allah and His Messenger and transgresses His limits—He will admit him to a Fire, abiding therein, and for him is a humiliating punishment."* **[Al-Nisāʾ]**

Thus, He, *Exalted is He*, generalized the threat of everlasting punishment for every disobedient person, and did not exclude from this generality except error, forgetfulness, and the like, as in His saying, *Exalted is He*: *"Our Lord, do not take us to task if we forget or err."* **[Al-Baqarah: 286]** And His saying, *Exalted is He*: *"There is no blame upon you for that in which you err, but rather for what your hearts deliberately intend."* **[Al-Aḥzāb: 5]**

And from the Sunnah is the saying of the Prophet *(may Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*: *"My community has been excused for error, forgetfulness, and what they are compelled to do."*

And Allah singled out the one who is compelled by necessity in His saying, *Exalted is He*: *"But whoever is compelled by severe hunger, without inclining to sin—then indeed Allah is Forgiving, Merciful."* **[Al-Māʾidah]**

Those who say that some intentional acts are not major sins argue from the saying of Allah, Exalted is He: *"Indeed, good deeds remove evil deeds."* **[Hūd: 114]** And from His saying, *Exalted is He*: *"If you avoid the major sins which you are forbidden, We will expiate for you your lesser sins."* **[Al-Nisāʾ: 31]**

These two verses indicate that Allah, *Exalted is He*, forgives some intentional sins without repentance—either through good deeds, as in the first verse, or through avoiding major sins, as in the second verse.

I say, what appears to me—*and Allah knows best*—that deliberately

committing any sin, with audacity and knowledge that Allah has forbidden and prohibited it, constitutes a major sin. Its perpetrator is one who has transgressed the limits of Allah and is sinful in defiance of Allah's command. Such a sin is not forgiven except through repentance, remorse, and returning to Allah. This is because sin becomes great and serious due to the greatness and majesty of Allah. Whoever truly knows Allah, *Exalted is He*, considers even minor sins to be great, just as he considers major sins to be great. For this reason, the Commander of the Faithful, *peace be upon him*, said: *"By Allah, if I were given the seven realms with all that is under their skies, on the condition that I disobey Allah by taking the husk*[1] *of a grain of barley from an ant, I would not do it..."* and so on.

If you understand this, then the believer in Allah does not deliberately commit even a minor sin while knowing it to be disobedience to Allah—out of reverence for Allah, *glorification of Him*, fear of Him, and so forth.

As for the one who commits it knowingly, without necessity, merely out of audacity, then by doing so he is arrogant toward Allah, having taken lightly His commands and prohibitions, and having preferred the desire of his own soul over the command and prohibition of Allah. And the one who is arrogant toward Allah is among those threatened with a tremendous punishment: *"Is there not in Hell a dwelling for the arrogant?"* **[Al-Zumar]**

Examples of Sins from Which a Responsible Person Is Not Free, No Matter How Much He Strives

If you have understood what has preceded, then know that a morally responsible person, no matter how much he strives in obeying Allah and seeking His pleasure, will—due to human weakness—not be free from many sins that come to him from before him and from behind him, from his right and from his left. I will give you some examples so that you may recognize the truth of what has been stated:

First example: Prayer was prescribed by Allah, *Exalted is He*, to establish His remembrance, magnify Him, exalt Him, venerate Him, and revive that awareness within hearts. Yet very often distractions and whisperings overcome the person praying, so that he forgets the remembrance of Allah in his heart and does not fully attend to the meanings of the invocations and the pillars of prayer.

It was originally required that his soul be filled with the majesty, greatness, and magnificence of Allah—His glorification, awe, awareness

1- "Jalb al-shaʿīrah"—with the *jīm* pronounced with ḍammah—means its husk (outer skin). This is explained in *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah* by Ibn Abī al-Ḥadīd.

of His blessings, praise, and remembrance—while the tongue merely serves as an interpreter of what is within the soul of the worshipper. This is what was required and intended in prayer.

In reality, however, the worshipper does not fulfill this in most prayers. There is no doubt that this constitutes negligence, heedlessness, and shortcoming regarding what Allah, *Exalted is He*, has made obligatory of His remembrance. Yet it is within the worshipper's capacity and ability to lessen the persistence of such heedlessness and deficiency, which afflict nearly all prayers.

This is in addition to prolonged heedlessness outside of prayer from remembering the blessings of Allah and giving thanks for them—despite the fact that what is required of the believer is as Allah, Exalted is He, has said: *"O you who believe, remember Allah with much remembrance, and glorify Him morning and evening."* **[Al-Aḥzāb]** *"And when the prayer has been concluded, disperse within the land and seek from the bounty of Allah, and remember Allah much that you may succeed."* **[Al-Jumuʿah]** *"O you who believe, when you meet a force, stand firm and remember Allah much."* **[Al-Anfāl: 45]** *"And do not slacken in My remembrance." "And remember your Lord within yourself humbly and in fear, without loudness of speech, in the mornings and the evenings, and do not be among the heedless."* **[Al-Aʿrāf]** — and many other verses besides. Rarely does Allah mention remembrance in His Book except in connection with abundance and frequency.

Second example: A person may perform ḥajj and ʿumrah, and in those places the presence of women is frequent; wherever one looks, one's gaze may fall upon a woman. It is possible for a person in those places not to look at women, by restricting his gaze to the ground at his feet.

Third example: No person, no matter how careful he is in guarding his tongue, is entirely free from slips of the tongue. Yet it is possible for him to speak only with the remembrance of Allah or with what is strictly necessary.

From these three examples, it becomes clear that acts occur from the believer that are not appropriate and not permissible. However, such acts occur without audacity, deliberate intent, resolve, or purposeful determination—nor are they necessarily the result of error or forgetfulness.

It appears to me that such acts fall under minor sins, which Allah, *Exalted is He*, graciously overlooks for His believing servants in consideration of their acts of obedience and their avoidance of major sins.

This may also be classed alongside error and forgetfulness—*and Allah*

knows best. Something close to this was related by al-Bustī[1] (may Allah have mercy on him) from al-Nāṣir, peace be upon him, who said: "Everyone who commits what Allah has forbidden, while knowing that Allah has forbidden it—and likewise what the Messenger of Allah (may Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace) has forbidden, and likewise what the community has agreed upon as forbidden—if he commits it knowingly and deliberately, then he has committed a major sin. Whatever is besides that is minor, such as following one glance with another, lying without causing harm, a light shove, or someone saying to his brother, 'May Allah disgrace him,' or saying, 'O liar,' without deliberate intent— and the like. To enumerate all of these would be extensive." End quote.

I say: it should be understood that al-Nāṣir, peace be upon him, when listing some examples, meant sins that occur due to heedlessness and lack of vigilance, without intention or determination to commit sin

Such as insults that are uttered by many common people without intending thereby to demean, stigmatize, or revile the one addressed.

Rather, such expressions arise from habitual speech embedded in the language of the society in which the person was raised.

The Sins of the Prophets, Peace Be Upon Them

As for the sins of the Prophets, peace be upon them, there is no deliberate intent in them, due to their state of infallibility, purity, and divine refinement. Whatever occurred from them was only by way of error or forgetfulness, as Allah, Exalted is He, related regarding Adam: *"And We had already taken a covenant from Adam before, but he forgot, and We found not in him firm resolve."* **[Taha]** Al-Hādī, peace be upon him, said: "That is, no resolve to commit sin; rather, he committed it out of forgetfulness." End quote.

And Allah *Exalted is He* has related in **[Surat al-Aʿrāf]** that Adam and Eve did not realize that they had disobeyed Allah *Exalted is He* except after they had eaten from the tree, as stated in His saying *Exalted is He*: *"So when they tasted of the tree, their private parts became apparent to them ..."* **[al-Aʿrāf: 22]**.

That was because they ate from the tree only out of a desire to draw nearer to Allah and to attain closeness to Him; for they were deceived by the statement of Satan: *"Your Lord did not forbid you this tree except that you become angels or become of the immortal." And he swore to them,*

1- Ismāʿīl ibn Aḥmad al-Bustī (may Allah have mercy on him) was from Bust, a town in Sijistān, the region adjacent to the lands of India. He was among the jurists of the Nāṣiriyyah and authored works according to their school. (Summarized from the marginal notes of *ʿUddat al-Akhyās*, vol. 2.)

"Indeed, I am to you from among the sincere advisers." **[al-Aʿrāf].**

And Allah *Exalted is He* related the disobedience of Jonah *(Peace be Upon Him)*, as He *Exalted is He* said: *"And [mention] Dhū al-Nūn, when he went off in anger and thought that We would not restrict him ..."* **[al-Anbiyāʾ: 87]** — meaning, he thought that We would not constrain him, that is, hold him accountable. He *(Peace be Upon Him)* did not commit the act of disobedience except while assuming that Allah *Exalted is He* would not take him to account for it.

And the sin of David *(Peace be Upon Him)* concerning the wife of Uriah was nothing more than an inner thought; it was not followed by intention, resolve, or action. That was because when he saw her, he wished in his heart that she might be among his wives, and nothing beyond that occurred from him, as al-Hādī *(Peace be Upon Him)* and others have related. And David *(Peace be Upon Him)* believed that Allah would not hold him accountable for that.

A group of theologians said: The sins of the prophets were deliberate, but they were judged to be minor due to the abundance of their rewards.

We say: The abundance of reward has no effect in rendering a sin minor; this is proven by the saying of Allah *Exalted is He* regarding our Prophet Muhammad *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*: *"You were almost inclined to them a little, and then We would have made you taste double [punishment] in life and double [punishment] after death; then you would not find for yourself against Us any helper."* **[al-Isrāʾ]**.

Thus, this verse indicates that even slight inclination toward the polytheists would nullify abundant reward and render it void.

As for the brothers of Joseph, their sin was clearly deliberate; however, they were not prophets, and there is no evidence for their prophethood.

As for His saying *Exalted is He*: *"and the tribes (al-Asbāṭ)"*—the intended meaning is the descendants of the sons of Jacob, because a *sibṭ* is a grandson, the child of one's child.

There have appeared in the books of exegesis many narrations and stories attributed to the prophets—*may the blessings of Allah be upon them*—in this matter, which should neither be reported nor narrated without clarifying their falsehood, due to what they contain of disparagement of the prophets—*may the blessings of Allah be upon them*—belittlement of their rank, and violation of their sanctity.

It is well known that these stories are from the Isrāʾīliyyāt taken from the People of the Book.

[Faith]

Faith, in the language of the Arabs, means affirmation, as in His saying *Exalted is He*: *"And you will not be a believer to us, even if we were truthful."* **[Yūsuf]**.

The meaning of faith in the Sharīʿah has been differed upon, with many views:

The first is the view of our Imams *(Peace be Upon Them)* and others: that it is utterance by the tongue, belief by the heart, and action by the limbs—meaning, performing the obligations and avoiding the prohibitions.

If you wish, you may say: faith in Allah and His Messenger and what has been revealed to us; faith in the angels of Allah, His messengers, His books, and the Last Day; then hearing and obedience to Allah *Exalted is He* in what He commands and forbids.

Allah *Exalted is He* described the faith of the Messenger and the believers at the end of Surat al-Baqarah, saying: *"The Messenger has believed in what was revealed to him from his Lord, and [so have] the believers. All of them have believed in Allah and His angels and His books and His messengers, [saying], 'We make no distinction between any of His messengers.' And they say, 'We hear and we obey. [We seek] Your forgiveness, our Lord, and to You is the return.'"* **[al-Baqarah]**.

Whoever fails in utterance is a disbeliever; whoever fails in belief is a hypocrite; and whoever fails in action by the limbs is a transgressor.

The Ashʿarites said: Faith is only affirmation of Allah *Exalted is He*; thus, according to them, it remains upon its linguistic meaning.

The Karrāmiyyah, among the determinists, said: It is merely verbal acknowledgment.

The Jahmiyyah, among the determinists, said: It is knowledge alone—thus it has been reported—along with other statements, which he enumerated in *Sharḥ al-Asās* as ten views.

The evidence for the correctness of what we have adopted, and the invalidity of what is besides it, is His saying *Exalted is He*: *"The believers are only those who, when Allah is mentioned, their hearts tremble, and when His verses are recited to them, it increases them in faith; and upon their Lord they rely—those who establish prayer and spend from what We have provided them. Those are the believers, truly ..."* **[al-Anfāl]**.

And from the Sunnah is his saying *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*: *"Faith has over seventy branches. Modesty is a branch of faith. The best of it is the statement 'There is no deity but Allah,'*

and the least of it is removing harm from the path."

And in the Ṣaḥīfah of ʿAlī ibn Mūsā al-Riḍā *(Peace be Upon Him)*, from the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*, that he said: *"Faith is acknowledgment by the tongue, knowledge by the heart, and action by the limbs."*[1]

And al-Nāṣir al-Aṭrūsh *(Peace be Upon Him)* narrated from the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* that he said: *"Whoever perfects his ablution, improves his prayer, gives the zakāt of his wealth, restrains his tongue, suppresses his anger, and offers sincere counsel to the Household of his Prophet, has completed the realities of faith, and the gates of Paradise are opened for him."*

And al-Bukhārī narrated from the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*: *"The adulterer does not commit adultery while he is a believer; the drinker does not drink wine while he is a believer; the thief does not steal while he is a believer; and one does not plunder openly, raising people's eyes to him while he plunders, while he is a believer."*

All that we have mentioned indicates that performing the obligations and avoiding the prohibitions are included within the concept of faith.

[Islam]

Islam, in the language of the Arabs, means submission and surrender; accordingly, is His saying *Exalted is He*: *"The Bedouins say, 'We have believed.' Say, 'You have not believed; rather say, "We have submitted," for faith has not yet entered your hearts.'"* **[al-Ḥujurāt: 14]**.

And the Lawgiver has transferred the term *Islam* from its linguistic meaning to two religious meanings:

The first: in the sense of *faith*, which is performing the obligations and avoiding the prohibitions.

The second: affirmation of everything that must be affirmed in the religion of Islam, while not committing an act of disbelief.

Thus, the one who commits a major sin is a Muslim transgressor (*fāsiq*). This second meaning is not disputed except by the Khārijites, and it is indicated by what has been established regarding the continuation of the marriage of a transgressor, the persistence of inheritance, burial in the cemeteries of the Muslims, and the like.

1- *Musnad al-Imām Zayd*, *Ṣaḥīfat ʿAlī ibn Mūsā al-Riḍā*, *al-Amālī al-Shajarīyyah* (1/13), *Nahj al-Balāghah* attributed to Imām ʿAlī *(Peace be Upon Him)*, *al-Muʿjam al-Awsat* by al-Ṭabarānī, *al-Kāmil* by Ibn ʿAdī, *Shuʿab al-Īmān* by al-Bayhaqī, and something close to it in *Ṣaḥīḥ Ibn Ḥibbān* (1/442) and *Kanz al-ʿUmmāl*, and others.

The evidence for the first meaning is His saying *Exalted is He*: *"So We brought out whoever was in it of the believers. And We found not within it except a single house of the Muslims."* **[al-Dhāriyāt]** By both passages He intended Lot *(Peace be Upon Him)* and his family, which indicates that Islam is faith.

Our Imams (Peace be Upon Them) have said that major sins nullify faith; thus, whoever commits a major sin does not remain a believer—contrary to the determinists (*al-mujabbirah*), who said that faith is merely affirmation.

The response is what has already preceded of the proofs, among them what al-Bukhārī narrated from the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*: *"The adulterer does not commit adultery while he is a believer..."*—and this is an explicit text in the very point of dispute, and it is evidence that binds the opponent.

[Disbelief, Transgression, and Hypocrisy]

Disbelief (*kufr*), in the language of the Arabs, is used with the meaning of covering; hence the farmer is called a disbeliever (*kāfir*) because he covers the seed, and the night is called disbelieving because it covers everything with its darkness.

In common linguistic usage, disbelief is applied to mean failure to show gratitude to the Benefactor, as in the saying of ʿAntarah:

"I was informed that ʿAmr is ungrateful for my favor,

And disbelief is a corruption for the soul of the beneficiary."

The Law has transferred the word *disbelief* to a religious meaning, which is—as stated by Imām al-Mahdī *(Peace be Upon Him)*—being devoid of knowledge of Allah *Exalted is He* and the prophethood of His Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*, or belittling Allah or His Prophet, or anything that he brought, or denying him in anything that is necessarily known to have come from him by word or deed, or venerating other than Allah *Exalted is He* as one venerates Him, or entering into a symbol exclusively associated with the disbelievers out of audacity and rebellion.

Included in this is allegiance to the disbelievers, based on His saying *Exalted is He*: *"Then indeed he is of them."* **[al-Māʾidah: 51]**

Hypocrisy (*nifāq*) linguistically means showing off; and showing off is to perform an action so that others may see it, seeking praise and the like. Its essence is manifesting good while concealing evil.

The reality of hypocrisy in religion, by the transfer of the Law, is manifesting Islam while concealing disbelief.

Imām al-Qāsim said instead: hypocrisy is manifesting good and concealing evil; thus, according to him, it remains upon its linguistic meaning, and the Law did not transfer it to the specific meaning we mentioned.

What Imām al-Qāsim *(Peace be Upon Him)* mentioned was likewise stated by Zayd ibn ʿAlī and al-Nāṣir li-l-Ḥaqq *(Peace be Upon Him)*.

The stronger view is the first opinion, because we have not found the Lawgiver using the term hypocrisy except for one who manifests Islam and conceals disbelief.

Transgression (*fisq*) in the language of the Arabs means departure; from it is His saying *Exalted is He*: *"So he departed from the command of his Lord."* **[al-Kahf: 50]**—that is, he went out from the command of his Lord.

The Law has transferred transgression to a religious meaning, which is: deliberately committing a major sin other than disbelief, such as adultery, drinking wine, and killing without deeming it lawful. As for one who deems such acts lawful, he is a disbeliever. The evidence for this is His saying *Exalted is He* following the mention of slandering a chaste woman: *"And those are the transgressors."* **[al-Nūr]**

There is no dispute that the disbeliever is a transgressor, and no dispute that the righteous, Allah-fearing person is not called a disbeliever nor a transgressor. The disagreement concerns whether the transgressor is to be called a disbeliever or not.

What appears to me—*and Allah knows best*—is that disbelief, transgression, and hypocrisy are terms of censure to which different and overlapping rulings attach. Thus, the transgressor and the hypocrite are treated as Muslims with respect to marriage, inheritance, and burial in Muslim cemeteries; they are not judged to be killed or enslaved, and their wealth is not taken as booty. The disbeliever, however, is treated otherwise: he is not married into, nor inherited from, nor buried in Muslim cemeteries; he is judged liable to killing and enslavement, and his wealth is taken as booty.

In what do the disbeliever, the transgressor, and the hypocrite agree, and in what do they differ?

They all agree in entering under the wrath and anger of Allah, and in the ruling of abiding eternally in the Fire if they do not repent and return to Allah—though the Fire has differing levels and varying ranks.

They differ in that the sin of the transgressor is a bodily sin, whereas the sin of the hypocrite is a sin of the heart.

The difference between the hypocrite and the disbeliever is that the

sin of the hypocrite is inward, which he conceals by manifesting Islam, whereas the sin of the disbeliever is outward, having no concealment.

For this reason, each of the disbeliever, the transgressor, and the hypocrite was designated by a specific name, so that the name indicates the type of his sin and the worldly and otherworldly rulings that follow from it.

Despite this, there is no impediment to applying the term *disbelief* to all of them where there is no confusion. Confusion may occur in some circumstances—namely, that a listener may hear it and then apply to him the rulings of the disbeliever, such as deeming his blood and wealth lawful, dissolving his marriage, and cutting off inheritance.

Among that is what has been narrated from ʿĀʾishah, that she objected to al-Ashtar for his killing and fighting of some of the companions of the Camel, citing the saying of the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*: *(("It is not lawful to kill a Muslim except for one of three: disbelief after Islam, or adultery after marriage, or ..."))*— the ḥadīth. Al-Ashtar—*may Allah be pleased with him*—said: "On some of that we killed them, O Mother of the Believers," or as he said.

This is also indicated by the fact that if the transgressor were certain of the truthfulness of the promise and the threat, and of Paradise and Hell, he would not commit the major sin that necessitates destruction.

Accordingly is the ḥadīth narrated by al-Bukhārī: *"The adulterer does not commit adultery while he is a believer."*—the ḥadīth[1].

Among what is used as evidence is His saying *Exalted is He*: *"Had they believed in Allah ... they would not have taken them as allies."* **[al-Māʾidah: 81]** And it is narrated that the Commander of the Faithful *(Peace be Upon Him)* was asked about the Khārijites: "Are they disbelievers?" He said *(Peace be Upon Him)*: *"From disbelief they fled, and into it they fell."* — while he *(Peace be Upon Him)* used to treat them as Muslims.

And what we have mentioned may also be supported by the ḥadīth: *"Three traits—whoever possesses them is a hypocrite, even if he prays, fasts, performs ḥajj and ʿumrah, and claims that he is a Muslim: when he speaks, he lies; when he is entrusted, he betrays; and when he promises, he breaks his promise."* ... the ḥadīth. And the hypocrite is a disbeliever.

And among what strengthens what we have mentioned is what is found in *al-Asās* from the narration of Ibn ʿAbbās, Jaʿfar al-Ṣādiq, al-Qāsim, al-Hādī, al-Nāṣir al-Aṭrūsh, and Imām Aḥmad ibn Sulaymān. It has been reported that it is the consensus of the early members of the ʿItra

1- *Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī* (3/136), no. (2475).

(Peace be Upon Them) and the Shīʿah that whoever deliberately commits a major sin is a *disbeliever in blessing* (*kāfir niʿmah*). That is because acts of obedience constitute gratitude for blessings, and abandoning them is ingratitude for blessings; thus, whoever abandons them, or some of them, has shown ingratitude for the blessings of Allah.

This view is indicated by His saying *Exalted is He*: *"And [remember] when your Lord proclaimed: 'If you are grateful, I will surely increase you; but if you are ungrateful, indeed My punishment is severe.'"* **[Ibrāhīm]**

And Allah *Exalted is He* described the Jews fighting one another and expelling one another from their homes as disbelief, and described ransoming them as faith, saying: *"... you ransom them, while their expulsion was forbidden to you. So do you believe in part of the Book and disbelieve in part?"* **[al-Baqarah: 85]** Thus, He *Exalted is He* named the doing of what Allah had forbidden them as disbelief.

And He *Exalted is He* said: *"And to Allah belongs the pilgrimage to the House for whoever is able to find a way thereto; and whoever disbelieves—then indeed Allah is Free of need of the worlds."* **[Āl ʿImrān]** And al-Nāṣir li-l-Ḥaqq *(Peace be Upon Him)* narrated with his chain of transmission from Zayd ibn ʿAlī, from his forefathers, from ʿAlī *(Peace be Upon Him)*, that a man said to him: "O Commander of the Faithful, what do you think of our people—are they polytheists?" meaning the People of the Qiblah. He said *(Peace be Upon Him)*: "No. Had they been polytheists, their women would not have been lawful for us in marriage, nor their slaughtered animals, nor their inheritance; nor would residence among them have been permitted, nor would the legal penalties have been applied to them. Rather, they disbelieved in the rulings, they disbelieved in the blessings and the deeds—and ingratitude for blessings is not the same as the disbelief of polytheism."

And al-Nāṣir also narrated with his chain: a man said, "O Messenger of Allah, must I perform ḥajj every year?" He *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* said: *"If I were to say 'yes,' it would become obligatory; and if it became obligatory, you would not be able to perform it; and if you were to abandon it, you would disbelieve."*

And it is also narrated from the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*: *"Whichever man declares another man a disbeliever, then one of the two is a disbeliever."*

And it is also narrated from ʿAlī *(Peace be Upon Him)*: *"Deceit is treachery, and treachery is disbelief."*

[Declaring Disbelief and Declaring Transgression]

It is not permissible to declare anyone a disbeliever or a transgressor

except with definitive, categorical legal proof; because such a judgment entails censure, enmity, and a decisive ruling of eternal abiding in the Fire if repentance does not occur. All of this is not permissible except with categorical proof, by consensus among the Muslims.

The causes of disbelief that necessitate it are four:

1. ***Acts of the heart***: such as believing in the negation of the Creator, or that He has a partner, or that He is incapable or ignorant, or that He resembles created beings; or believing that the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* or the Qur'an is false; or denying the messengers; or believing that there is no resurrection, no gathering, no Paradise, and no Fire; or the like. Resolving upon any of that is disbelief.
2. ***Acts of the limbs***: such as worshipping idols, killing the prophets, belittling them, or belittling the Qur'an, or the like.
3. ***Statements***: such as openly uttering a word of disbelief, for example saying that Allah is the third of three, or reviling Allah *Exalted is He*, or reviling the prophets, or the like.
4. **Omissions**: such as abandoning knowledge of Allah *Exalted is He*, or failing to affirm with the tongue, or the like.

[Categories of Disbelief]

Disbelief is divided into two categories:

The first category: Explicit disbelief, which is that which occurs by way of rebellion and obstinate defiance, such as the disbelief of the polytheists, the People of the Book, the Magians, and others from the followers of creeds opposed to the creed of Islam. Included in this is that which occurs from its perpetrator not by way of rebellion and obstinacy, but rather by way of ignorance and error.

The evidence for this is that the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* did not excuse any of the disbelievers on account of ignorance or error; rather, he applied to all of them the rulings of disbelief without distinction between the obstinate and the non-obstinate—despite the fact that among the polytheists and others there were the ignorant, women, the deceived, and others.

The second category: Disbelief by interpretation, which is committing something that resembles one of those four matters we mentioned, while the perpetrator denies the resemblance due to a doubt he claims.

An example of this is the statement of the anthropomorphists, who say that Allah is a body possessing parts and limbs, while denying that this

constitutes likening Allah to His creation. They claim that their statement is not the likeness whose negation came in the Book and the Sunnah, and they allege doubts for the correctness of their view—namely, apparent meanings from the Book and the Sunnah.

Another example is the statement of the determinists, who say that Allah *Exalted is He* is the doer of injustice, falsehood, adultery, and all sins and indecencies.

This is alongside their claim that it is not permissible to describe Allah *Exalted is He* as unjust or as a liar, and that whoever describes Him as such is a disbeliever.

Thus, they differentiated between saying "Allah commits injustice" and saying "Allah is unjust," even though the two are equivalent. They claimed that describing Him with the first is faith, and with the second is disbelief—due to doubts that led them to this. *Exalted is Allah far above what they say, in lofty exaltation.*

When you have understood this, then know that the ʿItra, the elite of the Shīʿah, the Muʿtazilah, and others have said: whoever likens Allah *Exalted is He* to His creation, such as the anthropomorphists, or assigns to Him *Exalted is He* a place, or attributes to Him—Majestic and Exalted— the sins of the servants, then he becomes a disbeliever thereby, due to his ignorance of Allah *Exalted is He*, his lack of knowledge of his Lord, and his reviling of Him *Glorified and Exalted is He*.

Whoever is ignorant of his Lord *Exalted is He*, or reviles Him, has disbelieved without any disagreement.

Likewise, is the ruling concerning one who says: that Allah indwells in beautiful maidens and in those like them among beardless youths; and likewise, those who say: that people's wealth is lawful, that forbidden private parts are lawful, and that what is meant by Paradise is nothing but union with the beloved, and what is meant by the Fire is nothing but separation from him. Such people are disbelievers, due to their denial of what is necessarily known from the religion of the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*.

Included with those is whoever shows allegiance to the disbelievers, due to His saying *Exalted is He*: *"O you who have believed, do not take the Jews and the Christians as allies; they are allies of one another. And whoever among you takes them as allies—then indeed he is of them."* **[al-Mā'idah: 51]**—that is, a disbeliever like them.

The reality of allegiance is that you love for him what you love for yourself, and you dislike for him what you dislike for yourself, as stated in the saying of the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant*

them peace): *"A believer does not truly believe until he desires for his believing brother what he desires for himself, and dislikes for him what he dislikes for himself."*

And the reality of enmity is that you intend to inflict harm upon another and to divert benefits from him, if you are able to do so and no deterrent prevents you.

Imām al-Qāsim said in *Kitāb al-Hijrah*: Whoever turns toward an enemy of Allah *Exalted is He* with love, allegiance, conciliation, appeasement, companionship, affection, intimacy, compliance, sitting with, neighboring, or drawing near—let alone mutual affection or mutual love—has returned humiliated and abased by Allah, *Glorious is His praise*, with His wrath; he has perished therein with the destruction of the enemy of Allah, fallen into his abyss of ruin, become like him in wrongdoing and crime, and Allah has placed him in the same position of enmity toward him … and so on.

This meaning is conveyed by His saying *Exalted is He*: *"And there has appeared between us and you enmity and hatred forever..."* **[al-Mumtaḥanah:4]**. And in the ḥadīth: *"Whoever associates closely with a polytheist or resides with him is like him."*

Moreover, included among those mentioned is the one who justifies the sinner in his sin, for by doing so he becomes a disbeliever, due to rejecting what is necessarily known from the religion of Islam. Likewise is one who sits with a disbeliever while he is committing an act of disbelief, due to His saying *Exalted is He*: *"Indeed, then you would be like them."* **[al-Nisāʾ: 140]**.

Imām al-Manṣūr bi-llāh *(Peace be Upon Him)* said in *al-Muhadhdhab*: If the land is predominantly disbelief—whether through false doctrine, determinism, or anthropomorphism—and they possess the sword and the pulpit, then the ruling of one who resides among them, while able to depart and emigrate, is their ruling in disbelief. If, however, it is predominantly transgression, then his ruling during the time of the Imām is the ruling of the transgressors, and outside of his time the ruling of the righteous … and so on.

[The Ruling of the Disbeliever by Interpretation]

Those who declare the deterministS and the anthropomorphists to be disbelievers have differed regarding their worldly ruling and how they are to be treated.

Some of our Imams *(Peace be Upon Them)*—and this is the apparent import of the statements of the early ones among them *(Peace be Upon Them)*—held that the ruling concerning the deterministS and the

anthropomorphists, and those like them such as the Murjiʾah and the Muṭarrifiyyah, is the ruling of the polytheists in all matters; thus, enslaving them is permissible, marrying them is forbidden, and so on.

Others said: rather, they have the ruling of apostates.

We say: Their outward declaration of the two testimonies is not Islam, because they testify only to the divinity of one who commits vile acts, who resembles bodies, and who loves beautiful women; they do not testify to the divinity of Allah who is exalted far above that—*exalted and transcendent in the highest degree*.

Some of the Muʿtazilah said: rather, they have the ruling of protected non-Muslims (*dhimmīs*), because they uttered the two testimonies, yet lied about Allah and denied the truth; and due to the saying of the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* regarding the Magians: *"Apply to them the practice applied to the People of the Book."*—and they are like the Magians; and due to his saying *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*: *"The Qadariyyah are the Magians of this Ummah."*

We say: the covenant of protection (*dhimmah*) was only established for the followers of the revealed scriptures sent down to previous prophets, and these people have no option except acceptance of Islam or the sword.

Abū al-Qāsim al-Balkhī said: rather, they have in this world the ruling of the transgressor with respect to marriage, inheritance, and so on, and in the Hereafter the ruling of the disbelievers in punishment.

We say: the evidence indicating their disbelief has been established; therefore, the rulings of disbelief apply to them, and there is no proof for what Abū al-Qāsim mentioned.

Many of the Muʿtazilah said: whoever doubts the disbelief of the determinists and the anthropomorphists is himself a disbeliever.

The Muʿtazilah of Baṣrah said: declaring them correct is disbelief, but declaring them mistaken does not constitute disbelief nor error; for what is obligatory upon the legally responsible person is only to believe in the truth and to deem the mistaken. As for whether he is a disbeliever or not, this is not obligatory, because the proof that a sin constitutes disbelief is transmitted revelation, and not everyone is obligated to know it. Rather, knowledge of it is obligatory upon scholars, imams, and those in similar positions, due to the responsibilities connected to them.

I say: It is possible to judge them in this world—although they are disbelievers—with the ruling of the hypocrites. This applies if they conceal their doctrines and do not call to them except in secret; but if

they manifest them openly and call to them publicly, then they are judged according to the rulings applied to the Khārijites and to Muʿāwiyah and his companions. And the Commander of the Faithful *(Peace be Upon Him)*—although they were, in his view, disbelievers—did not treat them as he treated the polytheists.

[The Muṭarrifiyyah]

Many among the Ahl al-Bayt *(Peace be Upon Them)* declared the Muṭarrifiyyah to be disbelievers, among them Imām Aḥmad ibn Sulaymān and Imām al-Manṣūr bi-llāh ʿAbd Allāh ibn Ḥamzah *(Peace be Upon Them)*, as well as others among the Shīʿah—*may Allah be pleased with them*. This was due to their statement that Allah *Exalted is He* did not intend nor will the creation of the branches, but rather intended and willed the creation of the roots—namely air, water, earth, and fire—and that the branches only came into being by transformation. Likewise, they denied that Allah *Glorified and Exalted is He* causes to die anyone who has not reached the age of one hundred and twenty years.

[On Declaring Transgression]

Transgression (*fisq*) is divided into: explicit transgression and transgression by interpretation.

Explicit transgression is that which is necessarily known from the religion to be transgression, such as adultery, drinking wine, fleeing from battle, and the like.

Transgression by interpretation is that which is not necessarily known to be transgression, but is known through proof—such as rebellion against the rightful Imām while the rebel outwardly claims to be upon the truth due to a doubt that supports him in that.

Likewise, is one who deliberately opposes the entire Ummah or the entire ʿItra in something from the laws of the religion, due to His saying *Exalted is He*: *"... and follows other than the way of the believers—We will turn him to what he has turned to and burn him in Hell, and evil is it as a destination."* **[al-Nisāʾ]**

Most of the determinists and the people of ḥadīth have said: The issue of the Imamate is a matter of independent reasoning (*ijtihād*), so the one who errs in it is excused like one who errs in other matters of *ijtihād*. For this reason, they ruled concerning the wars among the Companions that both the killer and the one killed are in Paradise.

We say: The Companions did not excuse anyone for rebelling against the Imām. ʿAlī *(Peace be Upon Him)* and a group of the Companions fought Muʿāwiyah due to his rebellion and transgression; they fought the people of the Camel; and they fought the Khārijites. Whoever reads the

histories knows that they regarded departing from the community as a most grave matter. If the situation were as the determinists and the people of ḥadīth claim, there would not have occurred among the Companions what occurred of killing, fighting, cursing, and so forth.

This is despite the fact that the determinists and the people of ḥadīth declare misguided whoever gives precedence to ʿAlī *(Peace be Upon Him)* over the three, or says that he was the caliph after the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* rather than Abū Bakr, and that Abū Bakr took what was not his.

Moreover, they said concerning those who rose against ʿUthmān and killed him that they are accursed, and so forth; they declared the Khārijites misguided and disbelievers, and said that they are the dogs of the Fire.

Yet we have not seen them adhere to this doctrine—that the Imamate is a matter of *ijtihād*—except in the case of the Imamate of the Commander of the Faithful *(Peace be Upon Him)*, and not concerning those who preceded him or came after him. They did not consider blameworthy one who rebelled against him and fought him, such as the people of the Camel and the people of Ṣiffīn, nor one who killed him *(Peace be Upon Him)*, nor the killer of ʿAmmār, and so forth.

As for those who rose against ʿUthmān and killed him, they judged them to be disbelievers and cursed them, and did not leave any name of misguidance except that they attached it to them. Concerning the like of this conduct, He *Exalted is He* said: *"Woe to those who give less [than due], who when they take a measure from people take in full, but when they give by measure or by weight to them, they cause loss. Do they not think that they will be resurrected for a tremendous Day?"* **[al-Muṭaffifīn]**

[Repentance]

Repentance is among the immediate obligations upon one who commits a sin. Reason and revelation both establish this. Reason dictates the obligation of repelling harm from oneself, and the proofs from revelation are too many to enumerate.

The proof that it is an immediate obligation is that delaying repentance constitutes persistence, and persistence in sin is itself a sin and an act of disobedience. Accordingly, sin multiplies with the passage of time. Moreover, the sinner is addressed with repentance at every moment; thus, abandoning repentance becomes another sin.

Repentance is valid and accepted by Allah *Exalted is He* throughout one's lifetime, until a person begins to gurgle at death—namely at the time when the angels come to seize the soul—due to His saying *Exalted is*

He: *"But repentance is not for those who continue doing evil deeds until, when death comes to one of them, he says, 'Indeed, I repent now.'"* **[al-Nisāʾ: 18]**

Some of the Muʿtazilah said: Repentance is also obligatory from minor sins.

I say: This is not far-fetched, due to His saying to His Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*: *"And seek forgiveness for your sin and for the believing men and believing women ..."* **[Muḥammad: 19]**, and His saying *Exalted is He*: *"And say, 'My Lord, forgive and have mercy, and You are the Best of the merciful.'"* **[al-Muʾminūn]**, and His saying *Exalted is He*: *"So glorify with praise of your Lord and seek His forgiveness; indeed, He is ever Accepting of repentance."* **[al-Naṣr]**.

Allah has also commanded the believers to repent unconditionally in His saying *Exalted is He*: *"O you who have believed, repent to Allah with sincere repentance."* **[al-Taḥrīm: 8]**— and other such verses, and they are many in the Qur'an.

And in the ḥadīth: *"Enter the evening repentant and enter the morning repentant."*

Allah described His believing servants, saying: *"Indeed, there was a group of My servants who would say, 'Our Lord, we have believed, so forgive us and have mercy upon us, and You are the Best of the merciful.'"* **[al-Muʾminūn]**

And He described the faith of the Messenger and the believers at the end of Surat al-Baqarah, saying at its conclusion: *"... Pardon us, forgive us, and have mercy upon us ..."* **[al-Baqarah: 286]**, and other such passages; and this is abundant in the Qur'an.

Repentance is regret over what one has committed of sins and the firm resolve not to return to them, and it is accepted from every sin.

Some have disagreed concerning the acceptance of repentance from one who kills a believer, but this view is false, for it is accepted from one who killed him, due to His saying *Exalted is He*: *"And those who do not invoke with Allah another deity, nor kill the soul which Allah has forbidden except by right, nor commit adultery—and whoever does that shall meet a penalty. The punishment will be multiplied for him on the Day of Resurrection, and he will abide therein humiliated, except for one who repents, believes, and does righteous deeds—for them Allah will replace their evil deeds with good. And Allah is Ever-Forgiving, Most Merciful."* **[al-Furqān]**.

[What Is Required for the Validity of Repentance]

Two matters are required for the validity of repentance:

1. Restoring rights to their rightful owners and surrendering oneself—if the sin was intentional killing—and paying the prescribed compensations (*arūsh*) and similar rights; or resolving firmly to do so if one is unable at the present time.
2. That the regret and repentance be for the reason of having committed the crime of disobeying Allah *Exalted is He* and neglecting obedience to Him.

   As for when one abandons the sin due to fear of scandal, or because of losing some worldly matter, or the like, then he is not thereby considered repentant.

If repentance is valid, it expiates the sin in itself, due to His saying *Exalted is He*: *"And indeed, I am surely Most Forgiving to whoever repents, believes, and does righteousness, then remains rightly guided."* **[Taha:82]**

And by it Allah replaces evil deeds with good deeds, due to His saying *Exalted is He*: *"For them Allah will replace their evil deeds with good."* **[al-Furqān:70]**

Imām al-Nāṣir said in *Kitāb al-Bisāṭ*: Allah *Exalted is He* has informed us that when the servant repents, Allah restores to him what had been nullified of his deeds and makes in place of his evil deeds good deeds. End of statement.

There has been disagreement concerning the interpretation of the verse, with several views: *The first* is this one.

The second: that Allah *Exalted is He* erases the evil deeds from their records and writes in their place the good deeds of repentance and whatever good they acquire thereafter.

The third: that Allah replaces for them disobedience with obedience, forgetfulness with remembrance, evil with good, and so forth.

All of these interpretations are possible, and there is no way to decisively affirm one of them with certainty. The first view is preferable, due to the vastness of Allah's mercy and grace, and it is supported by apparent meanings from the Qur'an, such as His saying *Exalted is He*: *"So whoever does an atom's weight of good will see it, and whoever does an atom's weight of evil will see it."* **[al-Zalzalah]** And His saying *Exalted is He*: *"Indeed, I do not allow the work of any worker among you to be lost, whether male or female."* **[Āl ʿImrān: 195]**—and similar verses. And in the ḥadīth: *"You have embraced Islam upon whatever good you had previously done."*—or as he said *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*.

From rational consideration as well, if we did not say this, it would follow that the one who disobeyed Allah throughout his lifetime and then

repented would be equal to one who obeyed Allah throughout his life, then committed a major sin and repented from it.

Furthermore, pardon and forgiveness necessitate non-accountability for the sin; and the erasure of good deeds without restoring them conflicts with that in some respect.

[Repentance from One Sin but Not Another]

Repentance is neither valid nor does salvation become complete by it unless it is general for all sins. If the sinner repents from a specific sin but not from others, then the correct view is that its punishment does not fall from him, nor is his repentance from it accepted.

Some theologians have said that repentance from one sin apart from another is valid.

The response is that repentance is regret for having committed the crime of disobeying Allah *Exalted is He*. Thus, repentance from one sin while persisting in another indicates indifference toward disobedience to Allah, by remaining in persistence upon some sins.

Accordingly, repentance is not complete due to the absence of one of its conditions.

Moreover, we observe in ordinary matters that apologizing for one offense while persisting in another is not accepted; its doer is blamed and not excused, and in ruling he is like one who did not apologize at all. Allah *Exalted is He* has said: *"Indeed, Allah only accepts from the righteous."* **[al-Mā'idah]**

The one who persists in some major sins is not among the righteous; therefore, his repentance from some is not accepted. The apparent meanings of the verses revealed regarding repentance indicate, by their outward wording, the generality of repentance, such as His saying *Exalted is He*: *"And indeed, I am surely Most Forgiving to whoever repents, believes, and does righteousness, then remains rightly guided."* **[Taha:82]**

[On Nullification (al-Iḥbāṭ)]

It is not required of the repentant person to make up the acts of obedience he performed while in a state of disobedience. There is no disagreement regarding this. That is not because those acts were accepted from him; rather, because repentance has lifted the obligation of making them up, by analogy with the repentance of the disbeliever and the apostate. As al-Nāṣir *(Peace be Upon Him)* said: Whoever abandons the prayer deliberately has committed transgression, and upon him is repentance without repeating the prayer—that is, without making it up.

Imām al-Qāsim ibn Ibrāhīm was asked about a man who abandoned prayer in his youth for ten years and was a drinker of intoxicants, then repented: Should he repeat the prayers, or what should he do?

He *(Peace be Upon Him)* replied: Whoever abandoned his prayer for ten years, whether little or much, then repents to Allah regarding what lies ahead of abandoning his prayer—just as he repents to Him from other evil deeds—if his repentance occurs during the day, he should pray the equivalent of what he left of the day's prayer; and if it occurs at night, he should pray the equivalent of what he left of his night's prayer. End of statement.

Know that the nullification of good deeds by committing major sins, and the expiation of evil deeds through repentance and good deeds, is not disputed. The disagreement concerns only the manner in which this occurs.

According to some of the Muʿtazilah, this takes place by balancing. Thus, if a person has eleven portions of reward and commits what necessitates ten portions of punishment, then ten fall in exchange for ten, and one portion of good deeds remains by which he enters Paradise.

Others said: The lesser number of portions falls, and nothing falls from the greater. In the example mentioned, the ten portions would fall, and the eleven portions would remain complete.

What the early members of the Ahl al-Bayt *(Peace be Upon Them)* held is that the portions of reward and punishment do not coexist, and that deeds are judged according to their endings. Whoever's death coincides with a righteous deed has succeeded and attained victory; and whoever's death coincides with an evil deed is among the losers.

The proponents of balancing cite His saying *Exalted is He*: *"So whoever does an atom's weight of good will see it, and whoever does an atom's weight of evil will see it."* **[al-Zalzalah]**

They said: This is general regarding all that the legally responsible person does of good or evil; thus, he must see its recompense. Yet it is impossible that both the recompense of good and the recompense of evil be combined upon the servant in the Hereafter. Therefore, there remains only that he see in place of that a substitute—and that substitute can only be the balancing between good deeds and evil deeds, nullifying some in exchange for others.

Its meaning, according to them, is that a person takes fully what he has of good deeds, then from them pays off what he owes of evil deeds. If his good deeds suffice to cover his evil deeds and something remains, he enters Paradise; if his good deeds do not cover what he owes of evil

deeds, he enters the Fire.

We say: The preferable interpretation of the verse is other than what you have mentioned of balancing and mutual cancellation. Rather, every legally responsible person will see what he has put forth recorded in the registers of deeds; however, the believing repentant person will see his evil deeds expiated, and by that the grace of Allah upon him and the vastness of His mercy and forgiveness will become manifest.

The proof of this interpretation is His saying *Exalted is He*: *"Then as for one who is given his record in his right hand, he will be judged with an easy account and return to his family joyful."* **[al-Inshiqāq]** If the matter were as the proponents of balancing claim, the reckoning would be difficult for both groups.

As for the criminal, he will see in his record everything he did of good or evil; however, he will see the good—though written in the record—as nullified, invalidated, having no weight, no value, and no benefit. He *Exalted is He* said: *"And We will turn to what they did of deeds and make them as scattered dust."* **[al-Furqān]**

What we have mentioned is supported by His saying *Exalted is He*: *"Do not nullify your deeds."* And His saying *Exalted is He*: *"O you who have believed, do not nullify your charities with reminders [of your generosity] or injury, like one who spends his wealth to be seen by the people and does not believe in Allah and the Last Day. His example is like that of a smooth stone upon which is dust; then a heavy rain falls upon it and leaves it bare—they are not able to keep anything of what they earned ..."* **[al-Baqarah: 264]**

And His saying *Exalted is He*: *"... Do not raise your voices above the voice of the Prophet nor speak loudly to him as you speak loudly to one another, lest your deeds become nullified while you do not perceive."* **[al-Ḥujurāt]**

Moreover, there is agreement that there is no balancing in the case of the disbeliever, and that his good deeds are nullified, due to His saying *Exalted is He*: *"Those are the ones who disbelieved in the signs of their Lord and in the meeting with Him; so their deeds have become null, and We will not assign to them on the Day of Resurrection any weight."* **[al-Kahf]**

[Expiation of Sins]

The believers' earning of good deeds, and the afflictions that befall them—such as illnesses, worries, and sorrows—expiate sins, due to His saying *Exalted is He*: *"Indeed, good deeds remove evil deeds."* **[Hūd: 114]** And His saying *Exalted is He*: *"If you avoid the major sins which you are forbidden, We will remove from you your minor sins."* **[al-Nisāʾ: 31]**

And in the ḥadīth: *"Among the causes of forgiveness is bringing joy to*

your believing brother." And in another ḥadīth: *"Whoever washes his brother, cleans him without harming him, does not look at his nakedness, emerges from his sins stripped of them."*—or as he said *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*.[1]

It has also been reported in the ḥadīth that "*the five daily prayers expiate what occurs between them of sins; likewise Friday prayer, fasting, ḥajj*", and other such acts.

And from him *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*: *"Whoever is afflicted with fever for one night, Allah expiates from him the sins of a year."* The ḥadīths in this chapter are numerous.

When you have understood this, then know that nothing of the reward of good deeds is diminished in proportion to the sins that are expiated; rather, the reward of good deeds remains complete. Likewise, repentance does not have its reward diminished in proportion to the sins it removes—contrary to some of the proponents of balancing; and the response to them has already preceded.

Expiation of sins by good deeds and afflictions occurs in two forms:

1. They expiate minor sins in themselves, without the mediation of repentance.
2. Good deeds and afflictions serve as a cause that calls to repentance; thus expiation extends to both major and minor sins through repentance.

The proofs have indicated both forms. What has preceded supports the first form. As for the proof of the second, it is His saying *Exalted is He*: *"... And We tested them with good [times] and bad that perhaps they would return."* **[al-Aʿrāf]** And His saying *Exalted is He*: *"Then why, when Our punishment came to them, did they not humble themselves?"* **[al-Anʿām: 43]** And His saying *Exalted is He*: *"Do they not see that they are tried every year once or twice, yet they do not repent nor do they remember?"* **[al-Tawbah]**

1- This ḥadīth was reported in *Musnad al-Imām Zayd ibn ʿAlī (Peace be Upon Him)* in the Book of Funerals, chapter on washing the deceased, with the wording: Zayd ibn ʿAlī narrated to me from his father, from his grandfather, from ʿAlī *(Peace be Upon Them)* who said: The Messenger of Allah *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* said: *"Whoever washes a Muslim brother, cleans him without harming him, does not look at his nakedness, and does not mention any evil about him, then escorts him, prays over him, and remains until he is placed in his grave, his sins depart stripped away."*

[The Book of Promise and Threat]

Belief in the Last Day is among the pillars of faith without which faith is not complete. Promise (*waʿd*) and threat (*waʿīd*) are the ultimate purpose of the Last Day; whatever is besides them is like a prelude.

By promise is meant what Allah *Exalted is He* has informed of the obedient deserving everlasting reward in the Gardens of Bliss.

By threat is meant what Allah *Exalted is He* has informed of the disobedient deserving everlasting punishment in the torment of Hellfire.

The Qur'an is filled with mention of that, and that it is recompense for deeds. The Commander of the Faithful *(Peace be Upon Him)* mentioned the wisdom in that, saying: *"Indeed, Allah has placed reward upon obedience to Him and punishment upon disobedience to Him, to keep His servants away from His vengeance and to drive them toward His Paradise."*

Its meaning is that promise and threat serve as a deterrent from committing sins and enormities, from entering into injustice and transgression, and from engaging in any impurity of disobedience; and as a motive toward performing good deeds, purifying the soul, cultivating noble character, beautifying actions, and giving thanks for blessings. That is a cause for the pleasure of Allah *Exalted is He*, entry into His mercy, and safety from His punishment.

[Failure to Fulfill the Promise and the Threat]

The ʿAdliyyah said: It is not permissible for Allah *Exalted is He* to fail in fulfilling the promise and the threat, because that is a quality of deficiency, and Allah is exalted above every deficiency. He *Exalted is He* has said: *"The word will not be changed with Me, and I am not unjust to the servants."* **[Qāf]** And He *Exalted is He* said: *"Indeed, Allah does not fail in His promise."* **[Āl ʿImrān]**

The determinists said: Rather, it is permissible for Allah to fail in that.

The response is that Allah *Exalted is He* says: *"That is the Book in which there is no doubt, a guidance for the righteous."* **[al-Baqarah]** If we were to allow the possibility of Allah failing in the promise and the threat, doubt would enter into the verses we have mentioned, and doubting any part of the verses is disbelief.

[The Disagreement Concerning the Non-Occurrence of the Threat for the People of Prayer]

There is disagreement regarding the non-fulfillment of the threat with respect to the people of prayer.

The ʿAdliyyah said: It is not permissible that it fail.

Some of the determinists said: Allah's threat is definitively known to fail with respect to the people of major sins among the people of prayer only.

Others said: Rather, punishment will cease for the transgressor but not for the disbeliever.

Others said: It is permissible for the threat to fail with respect to the people of prayer.

Al-Rāzī reported the agreement of Ahl al-Sunnah upon two matters:

1. That the major sins which will be pardoned are not known at present.
2. That no one from among the transgressors of this Ummah will abide eternally in the Fire.

[Proofs for the Eternity of the Transgressors of This Ummah in the Fire]

The proof for what we have stated, and the invalidation of other views, is His saying *Exalted is He* concerning the generality of the disobedient: *"And whoever disobeys Allah and His Messenger and transgresses His limits—He will admit him into a Fire, abiding therein…"* **[al-Nisāʾ: 14]**

This verse came after the mention of inheritance in Sūrat al-Nisāʾ, and the discourse is directed to the believers. He *Exalted is He* said at the beginning of the verses: *"Allah instructs you concerning your children…"* Then He said at the end of that: *"These are the limits of Allah. And whoever obeys Allah…"* until His saying: *"And whoever disobeys Allah…"* **[al-Nisāʾ: 11–14]**

And He *Exalted is He* said in Sūrat al-Nisāʾ—which is Medinan and whose addresses are to the Muslims: *"And it is not for a believer to kill a believer except by mistake…"* until His saying *Exalted is He*: *"And whoever kills a believer intentionally—his recompense is Hell, abiding therein; and Allah has become angry with him and cursed him and prepared for him a tremendous punishment."* **[al-Nisāʾ]**

And He *Exalted is He* said in refutation of the wishes of those who wished among the Jews and others: *"And they say, 'The Fire will not touch us except for a few days.' Say, 'Have you taken a covenant with Allah—for Allah will never break His covenant—or do you say about Allah what you do not know?' Rather, whoever earns an evil deed and his sin encompasses him—those are the companions of the Fire; they will abide therein eternally."* **[al-Baqarah]**

And He *Exalted is He* said to the believers: *"O you who have believed, fear Allah and give up what remains of usury, if you are [truly] believers …"*

until His saying *Exalted is He*: *"... and whoever returns—then those are the companions of the Fire; they will abide therein eternally."* **[al-Baqarah]**

Allah *Exalted is He* addressed the Companions of the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* when they disputed with the Jews regarding coming out of the Fire: *"It will not be according to your wishes nor the wishes of the People of the Book. Whoever does evil will be recompensed for it, and he will not find for himself besides Allah any protector or helper."* **[al-Nisāʾ]**

And there are other verses in which Allah decisively cut off the hopes of those who entertain vain wishes. There are many proofs for what we have stated. Among them is what has been reported in the authentic collections: *"Whoever drinks poison will continue drinking it in the Fire of Hell, abiding therein eternally; whoever throws himself down from a mountain will continue falling in the Fire, abiding therein eternally; and whoever stabs himself with an iron blade, his blade will be in his hand, stabbing his abdomen in the Fire, abiding therein eternally."*[1]

Al-Bukhārī also narrated: *"Whoever kills a person under covenant will not smell the fragrance of Paradise, though its fragrance is perceived from a distance of forty years."*

[Objections and Responses]

They said: Allah *Exalted is He* said: *"Say, 'O My servants who have transgressed against themselves, do not despair of the mercy of Allah. Indeed, Allah forgives all sins. Indeed, He is the Most Forgiving, the Most Merciful ...'"* **[al-Zumar]** And He *Exalted is He* said: *"And indeed, your Lord is full of forgiveness for the people despite their wrongdoing ..."* **[al-Raʿd: 6]** And He *Exalted is He* said: *"Indeed, Allah does not forgive that partners be associated with Him, but He forgives what is less than that for whom He wills."* **[al-Nisāʾ: 48]**

We say: These verses and others like them are unrestricted and are qualified by other verses, such as His saying *Exalted is He*: *"And indeed, I am surely Most Forgiving to whoever repents, believes, and does righteous deeds, then remains rightly guided."* **[Taha]**This is the required approach with verses of this kind; thus, forgiveness is specific to those who repent.

What confirms the correctness of what we have said is His saying *Exalted is He*: *"Inform My servants that I am indeed the Most Forgiving, the Most Merciful,and that My punishment is the painful punishment."* **[al-Ḥijr]**

1- This wording appears in *ʿUddat al-Akyās* (p. 383, vol. 2), where it is cited in the margin. It was also reported by many scholars of ḥadīth, among them al-Bukhārī (14/439, no. 5778), and Muslim (1/103, no. 109) with slight rearrangement, and it is found in *Musnad Aḥmad* (16/152, no. 10195) with variation in order and with the addition of the word "forever."

If it is said: If Allah, *Blessed and Exalted*, does not forgive sins except through repentance, then what is the meaning of His distinguishing between associating partners with Him and what is less than that in His saying: *"Indeed, Allah does not forgive that partners be associated with Him, but He forgives what is less than that for whom He wills."* **[al-Nisāʾ: 48]**

We say: Associating partners with Allah is an immense sin distinguished from all other major sins in that Allah *Exalted is He* does not forgive it when it occurs by way of error or ignorance except through pure repentance and returning to Allah.

This is unlike other major sins that are not shirk or disbelief; Allah *Exalted is He* may forgive them if they occur from the legally responsible person by way of mistake, forgetfulness, or ignorance, due to His saying *Exalted is He*: *"And there is no blame upon you for what you err in, but only for what your hearts intend."* **[al-Aḥzāb: 5]**

And in the ḥadīth: *"My community has been relieved of error, forgetfulness, and what they are compelled to do."*

For further clarification, we say: Allah *Exalted is He* commanded the killing and fighting of the polytheists altogether; accordingly, the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* and the Muslims fought and killed them without distinguishing between one who was deliberate, forgetful, mistaken, or ignorant. It is known from the biography and Sunnah of the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* that when an adulterer or a thief was brought to him, he would question him repeatedly and press him: "Do you know what adultery is?"—and continue asking about the circumstances under which the adultery or theft occurred. This indicates the clear distinction between shirk and other major sins.

They said: The Qur'an is filled with statements such as His saying *Exalted is He*: *"And He is the Most Merciful of the merciful,"* and *"Indeed, your Lord is vast in forgiveness."*

We say: These must be understood in light of the qualifying verses, such as His saying *Exalted is He*: *"And My mercy encompasses all things, but I will decree it for those who are mindful [of Me] …"* **[al-Aʿrāf: 156]**

And His saying *Exalted is He*: *"And indeed, I am surely Most Forgiving to whoever repents, believes, and does righteous deeds, then remains rightly guided."* **[Ṭā Hā]**

Furthermore, the promise of bliss and beautiful reward in the Gardens of Eternity mentioned by Allah *Exalted is He* in His Book is for the God-fearing who obey Allah *Exalted is He*, repent to Him, and are not persistent in sin.

Among that is His saying *Exalted is He* in Sūrat al-Furqān: *"And the servants of the Most Merciful are those who walk upon the earth humbly, and when the ignorant address them, they say 'Peace'..."* until His saying *Exalted is He*: *"Those will be rewarded with the highest place because of their patience ..."* **[al-Furqān: 75]** And He *Exalted is He* said: *"Certainly will the believers have succeeded—those who are humble in their prayer ..."* until His saying *Exalted is He*: *"... and those who guard their prayers—those are the inheritors, who will inherit al-Firdaws; they will abide therein eternally."* **[al-Muʾminūn]** And He *Exalted is He* said: *"Race toward forgiveness from your Lord and a Garden whose width is like the heavens and the earth, prepared for the God-fearing ..."* until His saying *Exalted is He*: *"... and those who, when they commit an immorality or wrong themselves, remember Allah and seek forgiveness for their sins—and who can forgive sins except Allah?—and they do not persist in what they have done while they know. Those—their reward is forgiveness from their Lord and Gardens ..."* **[Āl ʿImrān: 135–136]** And He *Exalted is He* said: *"And My mercy encompasses all things, but I will decree it for those who are mindful [of Me] ..."* **[al-Aʿrāf: 156]** And He *Exalted is He* said: *"These are the limits of Allah, and whoever obeys Allah and His Messenger—He will admit him into Gardens beneath which rivers flow ..."* **[al-Nisāʾ: 13]** And He *Exalted is He* said: *"And if you believe and are mindful, you will have a great reward."* **[Āl ʿImrān]** And He *Exalted is He* said: *"But those who feared their Lord—for them are Gardens ..."* **[Āl ʿImrān: 198]** And He *Exalted is He* said: *"By time, indeed mankind is in loss, except for those who have believed and done righteous deeds and advised one another to truth and advised one another to patience."* **[al-Assr: 13]**

And in the authentic ḥadīth: *"All of my community will enter Paradise except those who refuse." It was said, "And who refuses, O Messenger of Allah?" He said: "Whoever obeys me enters Paradise, and whoever disobeys me has refused."*

[On the Eternity of the Transgressors in the Fire of Hell]

It may be said: How do you judge that the transgressors of this Ummah will abide eternally in the Fire of Hell, while Allah *Exalted is He* says: *"And the recompense of an evil deed is an evil like it."* **[al-Shūrā: 40]** and His saying: *"And you will not be recompensed except for what you used to do."* **[al-Ṣāffāt]**

The implication of this would be that the transgressor is punished in proportion to his sin, then exits the Fire, as Ahl al-Sunnah maintain. As for his eternal abiding in painful punishment, reason may perceive in that something distant from the Divine justice with which Allah *Exalted is He* has described Himself, as in His saying: *"Indeed, Allah does not wrong [even] as much as an atom's weight; and if it is a good deed, He multiplies it*

and gives from Himself a great reward." **[al-Nisāʾ]**

We reply: The transgressor who persists in his transgression and does not repent to his Lord until he dies deserves eternal abiding in the Fire as a matter of justice. His eternal punishment is manifestly just, and its justice is indicated by several proofs:

1. One who persists in killing children after committing the abomination of sodomy, or who lies in wait on the roads of the Muslims to seize their wealth and shed their blood, or who spreads corruption among harmonious believers until many men, women, and children are killed and ruin and devastation occur—and then takes comfort in that, persists in it, and when reminded of Allah does not remember, when warned does not fear, and when admonished does not take heed, but increases only in transgression and disobedience, then dies upon that—

Such a crime is not erased by tens or hundreds of years in the Fire of Hell. Reason does not remove him from the circle of criminality; he remains the same criminal transgressor even if years pass over him in Hell.

2. Allah *Exalted is He* has informed in His Noble Book of the extent of their persistence in transgression, sin, and destructive crimes and indecencies. He says: *"And if they were returned, they would return to that which they were forbidden; and indeed, they are liars."* **[al-Anʿām]** This indicates that one in such a state deserves perpetual confinement in the Divine prison. Reason, without hesitation, judges likewise, and worldly courts of justice follow this principle.

3. It is not rationally permissible that Allah *Exalted is He* remove the transgressor from the Fire and then admit him into Paradise. The transgressor openly challenges Allah with acts of disobedience; thus, he does not deserve honor and exaltation in Paradise.

Consider: if a man killed another man's son, did not apologize, persisted in killing his remaining sons, then was imprisoned for twenty years or more while still persisting in refusing apology and intending further killing—would it not be blameworthy for the father of the slain to pardon him and honor him in any manner?

4. Allah *Exalted is He* has conveyed the message fully, warned thoroughly, and informed the wrongdoers and transgressors of the everlasting punishment prepared for them. He confirmed this emphatically and warned them severely.

Whoever chooses disobedience to Allah over obedience, and the path of punishment over the path of reward, has only himself to blame,

deserving everlasting punishment by his evil choice— *"So that mankind would have no argument against Allah after the messengers."* **[al-Nisā': 165]** *"And there is nothing upon the Messenger except clear conveyance."* **[al-Nūr]** *"Did there not come to you messengers from among yourselves reciting to you the verses of your Lord and warning you of the meeting of this Day of yours?" They will say, "Yes." But the word of punishment has come into effect upon the disbelievers.* **[al-Zumar]**

And in the Arabic proverb: "*Whoever has excused has warned*."

5. Ahl al-Sunnah agree that the disbeliever abides eternally in Hell's punishment, whether his disbelief was little or great. If a Muslim were to end his life with disbelief for only an hour and die persisting in it, he would be among those who abide eternally. We agree with them in this and do not differ. We may object to them in the same manner they object to us regarding the transgressor; and whatever answer they give us, we give them in return.

As for His saying: *"And the recompense of an evil deed is an evil like it."* **[al-Shūrā:40]** and similar verses—know that the major sins and indecencies forbidden by Allah are of such magnitude and enormity beyond human perception. Allah has illustrated the gravity of some major sins, saying: *"That whoever kills a soul unless for a soul or for corruption in the land—it is as if he had killed all mankind; and whoever saves one—it is as if he had saved all mankind."* **[al-Mā'idah: 32]** And He says regarding some sins: *"And you think it insignificant while it is, in the sight of Allah, tremendous."* **[al-Nūr]** A single wicked word may spread immense corruption and destroy crops and progeny.

Adultery leads to harms whose extent only Allah knows; the child born of adultery may incline toward evil, hardness, and severity, and so may his descendants. Whatever corruption arises from that progeny is rooted in that original sin—likewise with other major sins.

Accordingly, the recompense for one who commits such acts and dies persisting in his major sin is eternal abiding in the Fire—an appropriate and just recompense.

6. The morally responsible people are divided into two categories: pure and impure.

The pure will have forgiveness and noble provision in the Gardens of Bliss.

The impure—Allah will gather them together and heap them all into Hell, as stated in the Qur'an.

The Hereafter is the abode of recompense; the impure cannot purify himself there, nor rectify himself by repentance or righteous deeds

therein. *"And how could they attain it from a distant place?"* **[Sabaʾ]**

The punishment of Hell does not purify the soul or cleanse it, nor does it transform it from impure to pure. This is indicated by His saying: *"And if they were returned, they would return to that which they were forbidden."* **[al-Anʿām: 28]** And His saying, narrating the words of the people of the Fire: *"They will say, 'Our Lord, our wretchedness overcame us, and we were a misguided people. Our Lord, remove us from it, and if we return [to evil], then indeed we would be wrongdoers.' He will say, 'Remain despised therein and do not speak to Me.'"* **[al-Muʾminūn]** And His saying *Exalted is He*: *"So taste [the punishment]; and never will We increase you except in torment."* **[al-Nabaʾ]** And His saying *Exalted is He*, in narration: *"... Did We not give you long lives enough for whoever would remember therein to remember, and the warner had come to you? So taste, for there is no helper for the wrongdoers."* **[Fāṭir]** —and many other verses in this chapter.

What clarifies what we have mentioned is that the punishment of Hell is a punishment of wrath and vengeance; and what is of that nature is not intended for the purification and refinement of souls. This is unlike the punishment of this world, which is, in most cases, a punishment of mercy intended for the purification and refinement of souls—just as He *Exalted is He* said: *"And We will surely make them taste the nearer punishment before the greater punishment that perhaps they will return."* **[al-Sajdah]** And He *Exalted is He* said: *"Do they not see that they are tested every year once or twice, yet they do not repent nor do they remember?"* **[al-Tawbah]** And He *Exalted is He* said: *"And We tested them with good [times] and bad that perhaps they would return."* **[al-Aʿrāf]** And He *Exalted is He* said: *"And We certainly sent [messengers] to nations before you; then We seized them with hardship and adversity that perhaps they would humble themselves. Then why, when Our punishment came to them, did they not humble themselves? But their hearts hardened, and Satan made attractive to them what they used to do ..."* **[al-Anʿām]**

Furthermore, Allah may also punish in this world with a punishment of wrath and vengeance, when His anger intensifies and His abhorrence becomes severe. In such a case, faith does not benefit a soul that had not believed before or had not earned good in its faith. Of this type is what Allah *Exalted is He* mentioned in His saying: *"And how many a town have We destroyed that was unjust, and We produced after it another people. And when they sensed Our might, at once they fled from it. [They were told], 'Do not flee, but return to where you were given luxury and to your dwellings—perhaps you will be questioned.' They said, 'Woe to us! Indeed, we were wrongdoers.' And that cry of theirs did not cease until We made them like a harvested field, extinguished."* **[al-Anbiyāʾ]**

When this kind of punishment descends upon a people, repentance and faith do not avail them—just as Allah narrated concerning Pharaoh: *"Until, when drowning overtook him, he said, 'I believe that there is no deity except that in whom the Children of Israel believe, and I am of the Muslims.' Now?—while you had disobeyed before and were among the corrupters."* **[Yūnus]**

7. The verses of the Qur'an have cut off ambitions and severed hopes. There is no verse in the Qur'an stating that anyone will exit the Fire, nor even an indication of that.

Rather, what appears in the Qur'an is censure of the Jews for their claim of exiting the Fire. He *Exalted is He* said: *"And they say, 'The Fire will not touch us except for a few days.' Say, 'Have you taken a covenant with Allah—for Allah will never break His covenant—or do you say about Allah what you do not know?' Rather, whoever earns an evil deed and his sin encompasses him—those are the companions of the Fire; they will abide therein eternally."* **[al-Baqarah]**

Thus, Allah refuted in this verse the Jews and everyone who speaks as they do with a decisive refutation. He declared their statement false, then followed it with affirmation of eternal abiding in the Fire for whoever earns an evil deed and whose sin encompasses him—whether from the Jews, the polytheists, or others.

[The Encompassing of Sin]

The encompassing of sin means that the legally responsible person commits the evil deed deliberately, knowing its ugliness and that Allah *Exalted is He* has forbidden it, and then does not rid himself of that sin through repentance and seeking forgiveness until he dies upon it. This is the meaning of sin encompassing its possessor—namely, that sin overtakes him until death.

There is no way to escape that except through repentance. If one does not repent before death, then his sin has encompassed and overtaken him. But whoever repents before death from his sin, seeks Allah's forgiveness, and then dies, his sin has not encompassed him, and there is no liability upon him.

8. The ḥadīths that are narrated concerning exiting the Fire are solitary reports (*āḥād*). Even if authentic, they produce only conjecture, whereas what is required here is certainty; therefore, they are not accepted. Moreover, they contradict the clear and explicit texts of the Qur'an.

Furthermore, Ahl al-Sunnah wa al-Jamāʿah cannot definitively establish the authenticity of those ḥadīths. At most, they say in support

of their authenticity: "It was narrated by Muslim," or "by al-Bukhārī," or "by so-and-so," and "declared authentic by so-and-so."

If they say that, we respond: The authentication of a ḥadīth by al-Bukhārī, Muslim, Abū Dāwūd, or others is not proof of its authenticity; rather, it is merely a claim requiring evidence.

There is no proof establishing that the statement of any of those scholars is a binding proof that must be acted upon. Rather, Ahl al-Sunnah wa al-Jamāʿah have agreed among themselves to consider the statements of those imams as proof and binding authority that must be followed—but their agreement upon that is not itself a proof or evidence in Islam.

The legal proofs, as you know, are the Book, the Sunnah, consensus, and analogy. The convention of Ahl al-Sunnah is not one of those proofs; therefore, it is not permissible to rely upon it or give it consideration. Rather, it must be rejected, for it is among the innovated matters not sanctioned by Allah *Exalted is He*.

[An Objection and Its Response]

If it is said: Allah *Exalted is He* has permitted reliance upon and acceptance of the statement of a trustworthy believer in the laws of Islam, as clarified in the books of legal theory.

We say: That is correct in principle; however, Ahl al-Sunnah wa al-Jamāʿah have gone to excess in this matter and exaggerated in it. They have judged what is in the two Ṣaḥīḥs, and what was authenticated by certain imams, as definitively authentic, and obligated every Muslim to act upon it.

They have made the authentication of those imams equivalent to a proof that cannot be debated, and to which no objection or criticism may be directed—neither regarding its text nor its chain of transmission.

They have statements in this regard mentioned in the introduction of *Fatḥ al-Bārī* and in works on the methodology of ḥadīth. What drove them to this was preservation and protection of their doctrine; otherwise it would have disintegrated and been scattered by the winds, for it is a false, innovated doctrine outside the religion of Islam. Therefore, they needed to fortify it with strong fortresses. They erected barriers before the innate judgment of reason and blocked it from reaching their superstitions and innovations by saying that the judgment of reason carries no weight and may not be relied upon in distinguishing truth from falsehood, good from evil, guidance from misguidance, and justice from injustice and so on.

Thus, they completely neglected reason and made its neglect a

foundational principle of their doctrine. They prohibited discussion of the narrators of the two Ṣaḥīḥs, saying that the narrators of the two Ṣaḥīḥs have "crossed the bridge"—so no criticism may be heard concerning them, nor any disparagement accepted. They likewise prohibited criticism of any ḥadīth from the two Ṣaḥīḥs, saying that they are the most authentic books after the Book of Allah *Exalted is He*. They also forbade mention of the disputes that occurred among the Companions and declared them all trustworthy and upright.

All of this was done in order to close the doors and avenues of critique that would uproot their doctrine from its foundations.

[Our Position Regarding the Ḥadīths Narrated by Ahl al-Sunnah]

Our position regarding the ḥadīths narrated by al-Bukhārī, Muslim, and other imams of Ahl al-Sunnah wa al-Jamāʿah is that they should neither be accepted wholesale, as Ahl al-Sunnah say, nor rejected entirely. Rather, it is necessary to examine and exercise independent reasoning concerning each ḥadīth. There are criteria for recognizing what is sound and distinguishing it:

1. Presenting it before the Book of Allah *Exalted is He*. Whatever accords with the Book of Allah is sound; whatever does not accord with it is not sound.
2. Presenting it to the scale of innate reason. Whatever the natural intellect rejects is not sound. This criterion applies particularly to identifying fantastical reports.
3. If the chains of transmission are numerous and widespread, the soul finds reassurance that the ḥadīth has an original basis, producing conjecture of its authenticity. It may even reach the level of mass transmission (*tawātur*), producing certainty of its authenticity and truthfulness.
4. The practice of the scholars of the Ummah upon a ḥadīth—even if solitary—is evidence of its authenticity.
5. If the ḥadīth contradicts what is held by the Ahl al-Bayt *(Peace be Upon Them)*, it must be rejected, due to what has come from Allah *Exalted is He* and from His Messenger *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* regarding their commendation and purification.

[Intercession]

There is no disagreement among the Muslims regarding the affirmation of the intercession of the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* on the Day of Resurrection, and that what is meant by the Praised Station which Allah promised His Prophet

(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace) is the accepted intercession. The disagreement concerns those who deserve it.

Our Imams *(Peace be Upon Them)* and the majority of the Muʿtazilah said: It is specific to the believing penitents. Through it, Allah *Exalted is He* raises them from one rank to a higher rank, and from one bliss to a more exalted bliss.

As for those who deserve the Fire, they have no share or portion in intercession; they abide eternally in the Fire with those who abide, and are punished with those who are punished.

[Response to Those Who Say: Intercession Is for the People of Major Sins]

The Jabriyyah said: Intercession is only for the people of major sins, so that they may be pardoned and admitted into Paradise by way of grace.

Some of them said: The intercession of the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* for the people of major sins from his Ummah will cause Allah *Exalted is He* to bring them out from the Fire into Paradise.

The response to them is in His saying *Exalted is He*: *"And those who have earned evil deeds—the recompense of an evil deed is the like thereof, and humiliation will cover them. They will have from Allah no protector. It will be as if their faces are covered with pieces of the night, dark. Those are the companions of the Fire; they will abide therein eternally."* **[Yūnus]**

His saying *Exalted is He*: *"They will have from Allah no protector"* is an explicit text negating any intercessor or other than him.

And in His saying *Exalted is He*: *"It will not be according to your wishes nor the wishes of the People of the Book. Whoever does evil will be recompensed for it and will not find for himself besides Allah any protector or helper."* **[al-Nisāʾ]**

This verse is an explicit text negating any defender, supporter, or intercessor for the people of evil deeds from the Ummah of Muḥammad *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*, for the address is directed to the Companions, the Muslims, and the People of the Book.

And His saying *Exalted is He*: *"The wrongdoers will have no devoted friend nor any intercessor to be obeyed."* **[Ghāfir]** and *"And the wrongdoers will have no helpers."* **[al-Baqarah]**

The Jabriyyah may seek proof from the exception in His saying *Exalted is He*: *"As for those who were wretched, they will be in the Fire; for them therein is exhaling and inhaling. Abiding therein as long as the*

heavens and the earth endure, except what your Lord wills. Indeed, your Lord is Doer of what He wills." **[Hūd]** They said: "Except what your Lord wills"—meaning the removal of the people of major sins from the Fire through intercession.

We say: The exception has also occurred regarding those who were blessed: *"As for those who were blessed, they will be in Paradise, abiding therein as long as the heavens and the earth endure, except what your Lord wills—a gift uninterrupted."* **[Hūd]** There is agreement that the people of Paradise will abide therein forever and ever, and that the exception regarding them refers to the period before entering Paradise—namely, the time of their standing in the gathering place.

Accordingly, the exception regarding the wretched must be interpreted similarly to the exception regarding the people of Paradise. Differentiating between the two interpretations is arbitrary.

[Discussion of the Ḥadīth: "*My Intercession Is for the People of Major Sins from My Ummah*"]

They said: Ḥadīths have come from the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* such as the ḥadīth: *"My intercession is for the people of major sins from my Ummah."*

We say: When a ḥadīth comes contrary to what the Qur'an has established, it must be set aside; it is not permissible to give it consideration or to act upon it.

From the Sunnah have also come many ḥadīths that oppose this report, including his saying *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*: *"The collector of unlawful tax will not enter Paradise, nor the habitual drinker of wine, nor one who believes in sorcery, nor one who severs ties of kinship, nor the one who reminds others of his favors."*[1] and his saying *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*: *"The miser will not enter Paradise."*[2] The ḥadīths in this chapter are numerous.

They said: Numerous ḥadīths have come from the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* stating that whoever says, "There is no deity but Allah" will enter Paradise.

We say: "There is no deity but Allah" is the word of sincerity and the banner of righteous deeds. If it is not followed by righteous deeds and accompanied by them, then it is mere mockery and hypocrisy.

The proof of that is His saying *Exalted is He*: *"And if they had believed in Allah and the Prophet and what was revealed to him, they would not have*

1- *Jāmiʿ al-Aḥādīth* (17/99), no. 17666, with addition.
2- *Jāmiʿ al-Aḥādīth* (17/96), no. 17658, with addition.

taken them as allies …" **[al-Mā'idah: 81]** And He *Exalted is He* said: *"When the hypocrites come to you, they say, 'We testify that you are indeed the Messenger of Allah.' And Allah knows that you are indeed His Messenger, and Allah testifies that the hypocrites are liars."* **[al-Munāfiqūn]**

As for the ḥadīth: *"Whoever says 'There is no deity but Allah' will enter Paradise, even if he commits adultery and even if he steals …"* it should not be given consideration because it contradicts the Qur'an. He *Exalted is He* said: *"And those who do not invoke with Allah another deity, nor kill the soul which Allah has forbidden except by right, nor commit adultery—and whoever does that will meet a penalty. The punishment will be multiplied for him on the Day of Resurrection, and he will abide therein humiliated—except for one who repents and believes and does righteous deeds …"* **[al-Furqān]**

And it also contradicts what is in the authentic collections: *"The adulterer does not commit adultery while he is a believer …"*[1]

Furthermore, the word of sincerity—"*There is no deity but Allah*"—when it proceeds from a heart filled with awe of Allah and fear of Him, affirming His promise and His threat, and certain that there is no refuge from Allah except with Him—then in such a state it constitutes entry into the fortress of Allah and the stronghold of His security, and a return from disobedience to obedience. Accordingly, are interpreted the ḥadīths narrated in this chapter, such as his saying *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*: *"There is no deity but Allah is My fortress; whoever enters My fortress is safe from My punishment."* and the ḥadīth: *"Whoever's last words are 'There is no deity but Allah' will enter Paradise."* and similar reports.

Thus, "*There is no deity but Allah*" is an expression of repentance and its translation.

It is necessary that what we have mentioned be realized; otherwise, "*There is no deity but Allah*" will neither benefit nor be accepted. Hence, Allah *Exalted is He* rejected the testimony of the hypocrites uttered by their tongues, as you have heard in the previous verse, and said concerning them: *"They say with their tongues what is not in their hearts."* **[al-Fatḥ: 11]**

If you say: Why has the phrase "*There is no deity but Allah*" been singled out with this distinction rather than other remembrances?

I say: Because of what it indicated, at the advent of Islam, of abandoning polytheism and entering the religion of Islam and monotheism. When a man uttered it, his saying it indicated clearly and

1- *Sahih Muslim* (76/1) No. (57), *Sahih al-Bukhari* (136/3) No. (2475).

explicitly his return from the religion of the polytheists and his entrance into the religion of the Muslims. The Muslims, when they saw one entering Islam by testifying that *there is no deity but Allah*, if they observed uprightness in him, knew that he was truthful in his entry into Islam. But if they saw negligence in obedience to Allah and His Messenger *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*, they suspected hypocrisy in him. Thus, Allah *Exalted is He* said regarding the Bedouins: *"The Bedouins say, 'We have believed.' Say, 'You have not believed; rather say, "We have submitted," for faith has not yet entered your hearts. But if you obey Allah and His Messenger, He will not deprive you of anything from your deeds. Indeed, Allah is Forgiving and Merciful. The believers are only those who have believed in Allah and His Messenger and then have not doubted, and have striven with their wealth and their lives in the way of Allah. Those they are the truthful.'"* **[al-Ḥujurāt]** And He *Exalted is He* said: *"And obey Allah and His Messenger, if you are believers."* **[al-Anfāl]**

[The Punishment of the Children of the Polytheists]

The Jabriyyah said: Allah, *Exalted is He*, will punish the children of the polytheists on the Day of Resurrection in the Fire of Hell for the sins of their fathers.

They cite for that certain ambiguities mentioned by Ibn Kathīr in his tafsīr, among them his saying *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* to Khadījah: *"If you wished, I would let you hear their cries in the Fire."*

The response—and Allah is the One who grants success and aid—is that Allah *Exalted is He* said: *"And no bearer of burdens will bear the burden of another; and We would never punish until We have sent a messenger."* **[al-Isrā']** And He *Exalted is He* said: *"Every soul is held in pledge for what it has earned."* And He said: *"And your Lord does not wrong anyone."* **[al-Kahf]** And in the well-known ḥadīth: *"The pen has been lifted from three: from the child until he reaches puberty ..."*the ḥadīth [1]

As for the ḥadīths they have cited, even if authentic, they are solitary reports (*āḥād*) and do not suffice in this matter, for what is required here is certainty.

Furthermore, all Muslims agree that Allah *Exalted is He* is Just and Wise, that He does not wrong even the weight of an atom, and if it is a good deed, He multiplies it and grants from Himself a great reward. This is clear evidence that Allah *Exalted is He* does not act in a manner that

1- *Musnad Aḥmad* (23/41), no. 34703: "*The pen has been lifted from three: from the child until he reaches puberty, from the sleeper until he awakens, and from the mentally incapacitated until he regains reason*."

contradicts this. It is not justice to punish children without sin, or to punish them for the sins of their fathers. If that were permissible for Allah, then His self-praise for justice, wisdom, and that He wrongs no one would be praise devoid of meaning—that is, false praise and deceptive proclamation. *Our Lord is far exalted and sanctified above that in lofty transcendence*. *"And who is more truthful than Allah in statement?"* **[al-Nisāʾ]** *"And who is more truthful than Allah in speech?"* **[al-Nisāʾ]**

However, the Jabriyyah have been blinded by blind imitation, so they do not heed the cry and thunder of the verses: *"Indeed, it is not the eyes that grow blind, but it is the hearts within the chests that grow blind."*

[Concerning the Punishment of the Grave]

Our Imams (Peace be Upon Them), the Muʿtazilah, and others said: The punishment of the grave is established for the people of the Fire. This is confirmed from the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*. Among that is his saying *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*: *"The grave is either a garden from the gardens of Paradise or a pit from the pits of Hell."*[1]

And the ḥadīth: *"... Indeed, they are being punished, and they are not being punished for something considered great: one of them used to go about spreading slander, and the other did not protect himself from urine."*[2]

And among the words of ʿAlī *(Peace be Upon Him)*: "... he is made to sit in his pit, privately confronted with the shock of questioning and the stumbling of trial."

Among what is well known from the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* is that he used to seek refuge from the punishment of the grave. In *al-Majmūʿ*, with its chain from ʿAlī *(Peace be Upon Him)*: "*Punishment of the grave is from three: urine, debt, and slander*." It is also in the *Amālī* of Aḥmad ibn ʿĪsā with an authentic chain. And in the *Amālī* of al-Murshid bi-llāh with an authentic chain from the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* regarding His saying *Exalted is He*: *"Allah keeps firm those who believe, with the firm word ..."* **[Ibrāhīm: 27]** He said: *"At the questioning of Munkar and Nakīr in the grave."*

Similar reports were narrated from ʿAlī ibn al-Ḥusayn, Abū Jaʿfar, and Zayd ibn ʿAlī *(Peace be Upon Them)*. It is also narrated from Imām Zayd ibn ʿAlī in explanation of His saying: *"... the double punishment of life and*

1- *Taysīr al-Maṭālib* (p. 264), *al-Iʿtibār wa Sulwat al-ʿĀrifīn* (p. 357), *al-Amālī al-Shajariyyah* (2/428), *Taḥkīm al-ʿUqūl* by al-Ḥākim al-Jashmī, *Sunan al-Tirmidhī*, *al-Muʿjam al-Awsaṭ*, *Shuʿab al-Īmān*, *Ḥilyat al-Awliyāʾ*, and others.

2- *Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī* (1/53), no. 218; *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim* (1/240), no. 292.

the double punishment of death …" **[al-Isrāʾ: 75]** He said: "the punishment of the grave." It is also narrated from Abū Jaʿfar and Zayd ibn ʿAlī *(Peace be Upon Them)* that "the nearer punishment" refers to the punishment of the grave and the Beast, and so forth.

It is also narrated from them *(Peace be Upon Them)* regarding His saying: *"Our Lord, You made us die twice and gave us life twice …"* **[Ghāfir: 11]** They said: "Their revival in the graves …" and so forth.

It is also narrated with an authentic chain from the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*: *"Were it not that you would cease burying one another, I would supplicate Allah to let you hear of the punishment of the grave what He has let me hear."*[1]

And it is also narrated with an authentic chain that he said: The Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* entered one of the gardens of Madīnah and heard the voices of Jews being punished near sunset. He said: *"These are the voices of Jews being punished in their graves."*

Al-Qāḍī ʿAbd al-Jabbār al-Muʿtazilī said in *Sharḥ al-Uṣūl*: "In summary, there is no disagreement in this matter within the Ummah except for something attributed to Ḍirār ibn ʿAmr—who was originally among the Muʿtazilah, then joined the Jabriyyah. For this reason, Ibn al-Rāwandī attacks us and says: 'The Muʿtazilah deny the punishment of the grave and do not affirm it.'" End of his statement.

It may be said: We observe a crucified person remaining in the same state without change, and the bodies of the dead in graves decay and disintegrate; no trace of the punishment of fire is observed there.

We say: Punishment in this worldly life pertains to the souls. As for punishment of both bodies and souls, that is in the Hereafter. Likewise, the bliss of the believers in this stage pertains to the souls. Concerning that is what came from the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* that the souls of the believers are in the crops of green birds, and so forth.

As for the bliss of food, marital enjoyment, and the pleasure thereof, that is in the Hereafter in the Gardens of Bliss. Evidence for what we have said is His saying *Exalted is He* regarding the martyrs: *"They rejoice in bounty from Allah and favor …"* **[Āl ʿImrān: 171]**

What further supports what we have mentioned is that we observe bodies in graves lifeless and inert, without life.

1- *Al-Mukhtar Min Sahih al-Ahadith wa al-Athar* (685), quoted from *Amali al-Murshid bi-Allah* [2:304], and mentioned in *Kanz al-Ummal* (15/740) under number (42943).

Since our last interaction with the deceased was when he was buried in his grave, the punishment is attributed to the grave, and likewise the bliss. In reality, however, the punishment and bliss are for the souls—either in Sijjīn or in ʿIlliyyīn.

How Do Souls Experience Punishment and Bliss?

If it is said: How can souls experience punishment or bliss, when punishment properly applies to bodies—since they are the ones that feel pain or pleasure—whereas souls have no sensation?

We say: It is possible that the punishment affecting the souls is of the nature of fear, terror, distress, and similar states. Just as a soul in a dream may experience such things. Accordingly, the souls of the criminals are presented before the Fire of Hell and witness what is there of severe torment, horrors of the Inferno, and the punishment of the criminals. They see what Allah has prepared for the criminals and the wrongdoers, and at that moment fear, terror, grief, anguish, and constriction enter them—such as none knows except Allah.

This may be understood from His saying *Exalted is He* concerning the people of Pharaoh: *"The Fire—they are exposed to it morning and evening; and on the Day the Hour is established, [it will be said], 'Admit the people of Pharaoh to the severest punishment.'"* **[Ghāfir]**

There is no impediment to the soul's returning to the grave to be punished therein.

Many trustworthy people have witnessed and reported to us what they observed of the effects of punishment descending upon graves, and of hearing the cries of those being punished.

In summary, the punishment of the grave is something about which there is no doubt and no disagreement among our Imams *(Peace be Upon Them)*, nor among others—as you have heard from the words of al-Qāḍī ʿAbd al-Jabbār. The only disagreement concerns its manner and its timing.

It is not befitting for a Muslim to cast doubt upon its occurrence in light of these clear proofs: the agreement of the Ummah, the consensus of our Imams *(Peace be Upon Them)*, and the authentic reports established in the Ṣaḥīḥ collections of Ahl al-Sunnah and in the authentic works of our Imams *(Peace be Upon Them)*—all of which have been received with acceptance and submission, without objection, throughout history until today.

With such evidence, the proof is established for the obligation of believing in it and affirming it; indeed, the proof would stand even with less than this.

In my view, whoever denies the punishment of the grave in this age has not encountered the evidences we have mentioned; had he encountered them, he would not dare to deny it.

[Concerning the Ṣūr]

The *ṣūr* mentioned in His saying *Exalted is He*: *"And the Day the ṣūr is blown ..."* **[al-Naml: 87]** and similar verses—what is meant by it are the forms (*ṣuwar*) of the dead. Allah breathes the soul into them and revives them for reckoning and recompense on the Day of Resurrection.

This was stated by Imām al-Hādī ilā al-Ḥaqq Yaḥyā ibn al-Ḥusayn ibn al-Qāsim *(Peace be Upon Them)*, and it is what is derived from the statements of the Qāsimiyyah. Imām al-Mahdī also reported the same from Qatādah and Abū ʿUbaydah.

Al-Hādī said in a lengthy discussion: The word *ṣūr* is the plural of *ṣūrah* (form). The Arabs say: *ṣūrah*, *ṣūratān*, and *ṣuwar*; then they pluralize *ṣuwar* as *ṣūran*. This is the meaning of *ṣūr*.

The blowing into the ṣūr consists of two blowings:

- *The first*: Allah blows for their annihilation.
- *The second*: Allah blows for their revival for reckoning and recompense.

The author of *al-Asās (Peace be Upon Him)* said: This pattern of pluralization has parallels in Arabic, such as: *nuqab* (plural of *nuqbah*), *ṣūf* (plural of *ṣūfah*), *ʿaṭab* (plural of *ʿaṭbah*), *quṭn* (plural of *quṭnah*), *busr* (plural of *busrāh*), and similar forms in which the singular is marked by a tāʾ. In summary, the verified scholars of Arabic have agreed that this is a valid analogical form, except in cases of human craftsmanship ... and so forth.

It has also been said that the *ṣūr* mentioned is a metaphor for a sound that Allah creates to terrify the creatures and to cause their death and revival. This was mentioned by Imām Aḥmad ibn Sulaymān *(Peace be Upon Him)*.

He cited as evidence His saying *Exalted is He*: *"On that Day they will follow the caller without deviation ..."* **[Ṭā Hā:108]** and His saying: *"The Day the caller calls to something terrible."* **[al-Qamar:6]** and His saying: *"And listen on the Day when the caller will call"* **[Qāf:41]** and similar verses.

The commentator on *al-Asās* said: What Imām Aḥmad ibn Sulaymān held is plausible ... and so forth.

The Ḥashwiyyah said instead: The *ṣūr* is a horn like a trumpet, which Isrāfīl *(Peace be Upon Him)* has taken into his mouth, ready to blow into it when commanded.

We say: There is no reliability in the reports of the Ḥashwiyyah, as none but they have narrated this.

As for the *nāqūr* mentioned in His saying *Exalted is He*: *"So when the nāqūr is sounded, that Day will be a difficult Day."* **[al-Muddaththir]** it is a figurative expression. Its meaning is: when the time of resurrection and revival arrives, and the promise becomes due—then that Day … and so forth.

Thus, the sounding (*naqr*) signifies the arrival of the appointed time.

According to this interpretation, the previously mentioned *ṣūr* may likewise be interpreted.

What indicates that this is figurative usage is that Allah *Exalted is He* expressed the same event in other verses with different terms, such as: *"When the Inevitable occurs,"* **[al-Waaqia]** *"When the Overwhelming Calamity comes,"* **[al-Nāziʿāt]** *"When the Deafening Blast comes,"* **[ʿAbasa]** *"The Striking Calamity—what is the Striking Calamity?"* **[al-Qaari'a]** and so forth.

Thus, the sounding of the nāqūr is the occurrence of the Event, the Resurrection, the Overwhelming Calamity, and so on.

Similarly, is His saying *Exalted is He*: *"So when the ṣūr is blown, there will be no kinship among them that Day, nor will they ask one another."* **[al-Muʾminūn]**

The meaning here corresponds to His saying: *"So when the Great Overwhelming Calamity comes—the Day when man will remember what he strove for …"* **[al-Nāziʿāt]** and: *"So, when the Deafening Blast comes—the Day a man will flee from his brother …"* **[ʿAbasa]**

It is also possible that the first blowing means that Allah creates and brings about a tremendous sound by which all in whom the soul has been breathed will die; and that the second blowing refers to the resurrection and revival we mentioned—without any sound.

We have said this in accordance with Allah's customary practice, for when He wills to annihilate a nation by death, He causes them to perish by thunderbolts and cries. Allah has mentioned this in many verses.

As for revival, it is not Allah's established practice to revive souls through thunderbolts, mighty blasts, or shattering sounds.

[The Resurrection]

The Resurrection (*al-Qiyāmah*) is the name for the time of raising and reviving people and bringing them out of their graves; it is also the name for the time of reckoning and recompense for deeds. Thus, the Day of Resurrection is the name for the time when these events occur.

Allah has named it in the Qur'an by many names, including: al-Ḥāqqah (the Inevitable), al-Ṭāmmah (the Overwhelming Calamity), al-Wāqiʿah (the Event), al-Qāriʿah (the Striking Calamity), and al-Ṣākhkhah (the Deafening Blast).

The wisdom in these names is the attainment of decisive knowledge and certainty, without doubt, concerning the truthfulness of Allah's promise and threat, His Paradise and His Fire—just as He *Exalted is He* said: *"And they swear by Allah their strongest oaths that Allah will not resurrect one who dies. Rather, it is a true promise binding upon Him, but most of the people do not know—in order that He may make clear to them that over which they differed and that those who disbelieved may know that they were liars."* **[al-Naḥl]** Thus, on the Day of Resurrection it will become clear to the disbelievers that the messengers were truthful in what they brought, and the justice of Allah *Exalted is He* will appear in what He decrees of punishment for the wrongdoers and the arrogant, and reward for the Allah-fearing. There, the delight and joy of the obedient will be complete, and the regret of the criminals will be immense.

[Resurrection]

Allah, *Exalted is He*, argued against the polytheists who denied the Resurrection with evidences:

1 - by analogy of the effective cause.

2 - by a fortiori analogy.

And the mention of these two arguments has come in His, *Exalted is He*, saying: *"And he presents for Us an example and forgets his [own] creation. He says, 'Who will give life to bones while they are disintegrated?' Say, 'He will give them life who produced them the first time; and He is, of all creation, Knowing'— '[He] who made for you from the green tree, fire, and then from it you ignite.' 'Is not He who created the heavens and the earth Able to create the like of them? Yes, and He is the Knowing Creator.'"* **[Yā Sīn]** to the end of the sura.

So, the analogy of the effective cause is in His saying: *"He will give them life who produced them the first time"*, and the a fortiori analogy is in His, *Exalted is He*, saying: *"Is not He who created the heavens and the earth..."* the verse.

And this verse included another proof in His, *Exalted is He*, saying: *"[He] who made for you from the green tree, fire, and then from it you ignite."* So, He who is able to do that is able to place life in decayed bones.

And Allah, *Exalted is He*, has filled His Noble Book with argumentation for the Resurrection and the reviving of the dead by analogy with

reviving the earth by rain—especially in the sūrahs that were revealed in Mecca.

So, if you say: that is evidence for its possibility, and there is no evidence in it for the certainty of its occurrence.

We say: what we mentioned is evidence for the possibility of its occurrence, and in it is the refutation of the polytheists in their deeming its occurrence far-fetched, and that it is not far from the power of Allah, *Exalted is He*.

As for the evidence for the certainty of its occurrence, that is the truthful report that came in the Qur'an, and which the Messenger *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* reported.

And decisive proof has indicated that the Qur'an is truth, and that the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* is truthful in what he reported from his Lord, and that is the appearance of the miracles that confirm the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*.

This—and some sound minds may be able to reach, on their own, faith in the Last Day. And it has been narrated about some of the Arabs that they used to say:

Indeed, there must be an abode after this abode, in which the doer of good is recompensed for his goodness, and the evildoer for his evil—among them Quss ibn Sāʿidah, and among them al-Zubayr ibn al-Muṭṭalib, and many others.

And to proceed: reason obliges its possessor to avert a possible harm. So, when the report of the Last Day has become widespread from the prophets and messengers, and the books have brought it, and nations after nations have professed it—then the likelihood of its occurrence, in the view of reason, will increase and strengthen without doubt; and at that time, reason will oblige its possessor to avert the possible harm that the Last Day will bring.

And this is a rational proof that reason perceives; and Allah, *Exalted is He*, has argued with a similar one against the polytheists in His saying: *"Say, 'Have you considered: if it is from Allah and you disbelieved in it while a witness from the Children of Israel has testified to something like it and believed, while you were arrogant...?'"* **[al-Aḥqāf: 10]**

And about the like of this proof the wise poet says:

The teacher and the physician—both of them— said

do not resurrect the dead; I said to you both:

If your saying is true, it will not harm me;

and if my saying is true, then the burden is upon you both.

A subtle benefit regarding expressing the occurrence of the Resurrection with "assumption"

This—and perhaps the secret—*and Allah knows best*—in expressing with assumption in His, *Exalted is He*, saying: *"Indeed, I was certain that I would be meeting my account. So he is in a pleasant life."* **[al-Ḥāqqah]**

And in His, *Exalted is He*, saying: *"Who are certain that they will meet their Lord and that they will return to Him."* **[al-Baqarah]** and what resembles that— is that the assumption of the Day of Reckoning, let alone knowledge, calls for every attention and preparedness to avert its tremendous terrors.

And Allah, *Exalted is He*, has reasoned for the certainty of the Day of Reckoning by stating that wisdom necessitates that: *"Did you think that We created you uselessly and that to Us you would not be returned? So exalted is Allah, the Sovereign, the Truth..."* **[al-Mu'minūn]**

And the detail of that is that Allah, *Exalted is He*, created the creatures in this worldly life according to wisdom, with the utmost perfection and creativity—from the heavens and the earth and what is in them.

And man is the noblest of Allah's, *Exalted is He*, creatures on earth and the most honored among them; He, *Exalted is He*, favored him with intellect, discernment, speech, understanding, and knowledge—just as He, *Exalted is He*, said: *"And We have certainly honored the children of Adam and carried them on the land and sea and provided for them of the good things and preferred them over much of what We have created, with [definite] preference."* **[al-Isrā']**

Then He, *Exalted is He*, left His servants and the doing of what they will, so they wrong one another and fight one another, and so on; then He, *Exalted is He*, causes them to die after lifespans that He has measured among them, not long.

And upon this is built the affair of the servants: a generation dies, then another generation comes; they reproduce and increase, and so on. And it has been established by what we see of the wonders of the creatures and their marvels, and the great wisdom within them, that Allah, *Exalted is He*, is Knowing, Wise; there is nothing like unto Him; and so on.

So, it is necessary—by the consistent requirement of wisdom—that it be for a wisdom and a tremendous purpose; otherwise, it would be play and futility, and the wisdom of the Knowing Wise would be invalidated. And Allah, *Exalted is He*, mentioned this proof and repeated it in His Noble Book; among that is His, *Exalted is He*, saying: *"Does man think that he will be left neglected? Had he not been a sperm from semen emitted?*

Then he was a clinging clot, and [Allah] created [his form] and proportioned [him] And made of him two mates, the male and the female. Is not that [Creator] Able to give life to the dead?" **[al-Qiyāmah]** And His, *Exalted is He*, saying: *"And We did not create the heavens and earth and that between them as players. We did not create them except in truth..."* **[al-Dukhān]** And His, *Exalted is He*, saying: *"And We did not create the heaven and the earth and what is between them aimlessly. That is the assumption of those who disbelieve; so woe to those who disbelieve from the Fire."* **[Ṣād]** And His, *Exalted is He*, saying: *"About what are they asking one another? About the great news That they are in disagreement about. No! They are going to know. Then, no! They are going to know. Have We not made the earth a resting place? And the mountains as stakes? And We created you in pairs And made your sleep [a means for] rest And made the night as clothing And made the day for livelihood And built above you seven strong [heavens] And made [therein] a burning lamp And sent down, from the rain clouds, pouring water That We may bring forth thereby grain and vegetation And gardens of entwined growth."* **[al-Naba']** Then He, *Exalted is He*, said after that: *"Indeed, the Day of Judgement is an appointed time— The Day the Horn is blown and you will come forth in crowds."*

So, He, *Exalted is He*, made what preceded of His saying: *"Have We not made the earth..."* and so on, as evidence for the Day of Judgement— and that is only for what we mentioned of the consistent requirement of wisdom which necessitates the certainty of Resurrection and separation. And in the Noble Qur'an there are many examples like that; and the aim here is indication.

[The Resurrection of People Bare]

It is said: people will be resurrected and gathered barefoot and naked. This statement is not correct. The correct view is that they will be resurrected in their shrouds. This was mentioned by Imam al-Murtaḍā ibn al-Hādī *(Peace be Upon Him)*, Imam al-Qāsim ibn ʿAlī al-ʿAyyānī *(Peace be Upon Him)*, and others of our Imams. Among what they used as evidence is what was narrated from the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*: "Indeed, the dead person will be resurrected in the clothes in which he dies".[1]

And Imam al-Hādī *(Peace be Upon Him)* has a lengthy statement in which he denounced those who say: people will be gathered barefoot and naked. In it, he said: that is among the vile things that Allah, *Exalted is He*, is not permitted to do. This is the meaning of his words *(Peace be Upon Him)*.

1- *al-Mustadrak ʿalā al-Ṣaḥīḥayn* (1/490) no. (1260), *Rijāl al-Kashshī* (1/205).

[The Resurrection of Every Living Soul]

And Allah, *Exalted is He*, will resurrect everyone into whom the soul has been breathed, from all animals, due to His, *Exalted is He*, saying: *"And there is no creature on the earth nor a bird that flies with its wings except [that they are] communities like you. We have not neglected in the Register a thing. Then to their Lord they will be gathered."* **[al-Anʿām]**

And the parts of the living being will be restored complete, without anything of it being missing. Al-Murtaḍā ibn al-Hādī narrated [with his chain] from his father, from his forefathers, from ʿAlī *(Peace be Upon Him)* that he said: "Allah will gather His allies on the Day of Resurrection in the most complete state they were upon in their worldly life, and at the age of forty years; then Allah, *Glorified is He*, will bring them to what He has prepared for them of His reward and the abundance of His bounty".

And there is no proof for the restoration of the excess remnants, such as fat beyond the measure of need, and such as an extra hand, an extra finger, the remnants of nails, and the remnants of hair.

And the wisdom in resurrecting those who are not morally accountable among those into whom the soul has been breathed is that Allah, *Exalted is He*, will fulfill for them the compensations that they deserved for what befell them of pains in the world—either from some of them against others, or from human beings, such as slaughtering, carrying burdens upon them, plowing, and the like; or from Allah, *Exalted is He*—so He, *Glorified is He*, will fulfill the compensations for that in the Abode of the Hereafter.

And it has been said: Allah, *Exalted is He*, will cause equity between them, even between the horned and the hornless. This statement is among those to which one should not pay attention; that is because they are not among the people of intellects, nor among the people of moral obligation. Do you not see that Allah, *Exalted is He*, has lifted the pen from the child and the insane due to the absence of intellect? And the meaning of lifting the pen is lifting accountability.

[The Reckoning]

The Reckoning is among the states of the Day of Resurrection, and Allah, *Exalted is He*, has mentioned it in many verses, such as His saying regarding the believer: *"So he will be judged with an easy account."* **[al-Inshiqāq]**

However, Allah's, *Exalted is He*, reckoning of the creation on that day will not be like the reckoning of one of us with his companion in the world. The proof of that is His, *Exalted is He*, saying: *"Indeed, Allah is swift in account."* **[Āl ʿImrān: 199]** and the like of it. And it has been narrated that the Commander of the Faithful *(Peace be Upon Him)* was asked: how does

Allah, *Exalted is He*, reckon with the creation at one time? So, he *(Peace be Upon Him)* said: "just as He provides for them at one time".

So, if you say: what is the benefit of the reckoning, while it is known that the angels give the believer glad tidings at death of Paradise and of salvation from the Fire, and reassure him so that he neither fears nor grieves; and that the angels give the criminal glad tidings at death of his ill-fated end in Allah's wrath and His punishment?

We say: the benefit of the reckoning—along with each accountable person's knowledge of what he will end up in, of bliss or painful punishment— is the manifestation of justice regarding the criminals, and the manifestation of Allah's favor and the vastness of His mercy regarding the believers; along with what follows that of scandals before the eyes of all witnesses, and an increase in regret, grief, regret, disgrace, and the like regarding the wrongdoers—until the wrongdoer then says: "Give me relief, my Lord, even to the Fire" due to the immense of the scandals.

And among the increase of delight and joy regarding the believers is when they see what befalls the criminals of disgrace, regret, and scandals, and what they see of the truthfulness of Allah's, *Glorified is He*, promise, His justice in His judgment, and His fairness between His servants, and the like of that.

[The Scale]

What is meant by the scale mentioned in the like of His, *Exalted is He*, saying: *"Then as for one whose scales are heavy"* **[Al-Qāriʿah: 6]** is that the matter of reckoning is founded upon the utmost justice and fairness—not that there is a scale in which deeds are weighed.

And some theologians said: rather what is meant is the known scale in its literal reality, and it has a pillar, a tongue, and two pans.

We say: deeds are not weighed; for they are accidents that are non-existent, not subsisting by themselves. And He, *Exalted is He*, has said: *"And the weighing that Day is the truth"* **[Al-Aʿrāf: 8]**—so Allah, *Exalted is He*, informed that the weighing is the truth, meaning: the establishment of justice and fairness. And He, *Exalted is He*, said: *"And We place the scales of justice for the Day of Resurrection"* **[Al-Anbiyāʾ:47]** so He informed that the scales are justice, and justice is fairness.

I say: it is possible that Allah, *Exalted is He*, may set on the Day of Resurrection— for the reckoning of the morally accountable, in order to manifest His justice—something from His power upon which the measures of deeds and the measures of intentions, sincerity, and piety appear— in a clear, tangible form—so that it becomes evident to every

morally accountable person, from the criminals and others, that what befalls them of measures of punishment is of the utmost justice. And upon that it is possible to interpret His, *Exalted is He*, saying: *"So whoever does an atom's weight of good will see it, and whoever does an atom's weight of evil will see it"* **[Al-Zalzalah: 7–8]**; and His, *Exalted is He*, saying: *"The Day when secrets will be put to the test"* **[Al-Ṭāriq: 9]**; and the like of that in the Qur'an, of what Allah, *Exalted is He*, informed that will be manifested and uncovered on the Day of Reckoning.

As for the scale which they narrate from Ibn ʿAbbās—that he said in describing it: beneath the pillar is [a span] between the east and the west, and the pan of the scale is like the plates of the world—then its soundness is far-fetched. That is because the land of gathering is this very earth upon which we live today; so if the pan of the scale is like it, then where will the creatures be gathered? And this is along with it being an unreliable narration, and along with its contradicting what Allah's wisdom and His Sunnah require. For Allah, *Exalted is He*, said in mentioning His wisdom and His Sunnah in creating His creatures: *"Indeed, We have created all things with measure"* **[Al-Qamar: 49]**; and *"And He who destined and [then] guided"* **[Al-Aʿlā:3]**; and *"And created everything and determined it with [precise] determination"* **[Al-Furqān: 2]**; and *"And We caused to grow therein of every thing in [due] balance"* **[Al-Ḥijr:19]**; and *"And We do not send it down except in a known measure"* **[Al-Ḥijr:21]**; and *"So We determined, and excellent are We to determine"* **[Al-Mursalāt:23]**—and other verses that speak of Allah's Sunnah and His wisdom in creating what He creates.

[The Records]

He, *Exalted is He*, said: *"And when the pages are laid open"* **[Al-Takwīr: 10]**. This may be interpreted with two interpretations:

1- That it is from the category of metonymies; and upon that, it is an expression for the morally accountable person's knowledge of all that he did, small and great. And it is possible to argue for that by saying: recording is only needed for one who forgets, and that is the creature; as for the Creator, *Glorified is He*, He neither goes astray nor forgets.

So, if it is said: the morally accountable person may forget, and the records remind him.

We say: Allah, *Exalted is He*, creates for him remembrance, so he remembers everything he did; then if he denies—just as he used to in the world—his hearing, his sight, his skin, and his hands and his feet will testify against him.

2- That the laying-open of the records is literal, and there is no impediment to carrying it upon its literal reality. And those who hold this

view can say: there is no reason to depart from the apparent meaning while it is possible.

And the aspect of wisdom in that is: luṭf for the morally accountable in the world; for if they know that over them are guardians from the noble angels, writing against them every small thing and every great thing, and that speech and deeds are in records, and that they will be laid open on the Day of Resurrection, and Allah, *Exalted is He*, will reckon them upon them—then that will call them to leave the small sins and the great ones, and will call them to acquire righteous deeds, their small ones and their great ones.

[The Ṣirāṭ]

The ṣirāṭ is mentioned in several places in the Noble Qur'an, such as His, *Exalted is He*, saying: *"Guide us to the straight path"* **[Al-Fātiḥah: 6]**, and *"And indeed, this is My path, straight, so follow it..."* **[Al-Anʿām: 153]**, and *"Say, 'Indeed, my Lord has guided me to a straight path'"* **[Al-Anʿām: 161]**—and the like of that. What is meant by it is the religion of truth which the Messenger *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* came with, and there is no disagreement regarding that.

Some theologians said: and the ṣirāṭ in the Hereafter is a bridge over Hell, upon which the people of Paradise and the people of the Fire pass; so the people of Paradise are saved, and the people of the Fire fall down into the Fire; and it is thinner than a hair and sharper than a sword. And they narrated regarding that a ḥadīth from Abū Hurayrah, in which: upon it are hooks and thorns, and the people pass upon it—among them like lightning, and [like] wind... and so on.

We say: what has come in the states of reckoning and the manner of entering Paradise and the Fire in Allah's Mighty Book is other than what you have mentioned.

He, *Exalted is He*, said regarding the people of the Fire: *"The Day they are thrust to the Fire of Hell with [a] thrust"* **[Al-Ṭūr: 13]**.

And the thrust is the violent pushing—so the keepers of the Fire push them into the Fire with a violent push upon their faces, and drive them from behind, without a bridge from above which they tumble down.

And He, *Exalted is He*, said: *"And those who disbelieved will be driven to Hell in groups..."* until His saying, *Exalted is He*: *"It will be said, 'Enter the gates of Hell, abiding therein'"* **[Al-Zumar: 71–72]**.

And He, *Exalted is He*, said: *"The Day We will gather the righteous to the Most Merciful as a delegation, and We will drive the criminals to Hell as a thirsty herd"* **[Maryam: 85–86]**. And this is an explicit text that they did not walk upon a bridge above it.

Therefore, the narration of Abū Hurayrah must be rejected, due to its opposing the texts of the Qur'an—*"And who is more truthful than Allah in statement?"* **[Al-Nisā': 87]**.

And this is along with it being a solitary narration which—if the conditions of authenticity are completed—does not yield except assumption, whereas the Qur'an yields knowledge and certainty.

And He, *Exalted is He*, said: *"So give glad tidings to My servants—those who listen to speech and follow the best of it"* **[Al-Zumar: 17–18]**.

They said: Allah, *Exalted is He*, said: *"And there is none of you except that he will come to it..."* **[Maryam: 71]**, and its coming is only the passing upon the mentioned bridge.

We say: coming (al-wurūd) is presence and nearness, like His, *Exalted is He*, saying: *"And when he came to the water of Madyan"* **[Al-Qaṣaṣ: 23]**—meaning: he came to, and was present at, the water of Madyan. And the presence of the believers and their nearness to it will be without fear and without grief, due to His, *Exalted is He*, saying: *"The greatest terror will not grieve them"* **[Al-Anbiyā': 103]**, and *"And they will be, from the terror of that Day, safe"* **[Al-Naml: 89]**.

[The Speaking of the Limbs]

And also among the states of the Resurrection is: the speaking of the limbs. He, *Exalted is He*, said: *"Until, when they reach it, their hearing will testify against them and their sights and their skins..."* **[Fuṣṣilat: 20]**.

That may be literal, and there is no impediment to it; for Allah is powerful over all things. And it may be by presenting the image that was in the world, just as images are presented today upon a television screen.

[The Creation of Paradise and the Fire]

Imam al-Hādī *(Peace be Upon Him)*, Abū Hāshim, and most of the Muʿtazilah said: Allah, *Exalted is He*, has not created Paradise and the Fire; rather Allah, *Exalted is He*, will create them on the Day of Resurrection. And they argued by His, *Exalted is He*, saying: *"Its food is lasting and its shade"* **[al-Raʿd: 35]**—and everything must perish; so if they had been created, it would have been necessary for them to perish, and then their creation and their annihilation would be futility.

And Imam Aḥmad ibn Sulaymān *(Peace be Upon Him)* mentioned the like of that; for he said: because no one prepares a thing and stores it until a long time except one who is unable to bring it forth at the time of need—and Allah, *Exalted is He*, nothing renders Him incapable.

He said: and if they had been created, they would only be either in the heaven or in the earth; and if they had been created in the heaven, then

how will the heaven be changed while the Paradise that is in it remains, and what is in it of the ḥūr and the youths remains? End.

This—and among the theologians are those who say: Paradise has been created.

Imam al-Qāsim ibn Ibrāhīm was asked about Adam—when Allah caused him to dwell in Paradise—was Paradise created or not? So he *(Peace be Upon Him)* said: Paradise is created in neither heaven nor earth. And Allah caused Adam and his wife to dwell in Paradise and brought them out of it due to their disobedience. End.

And what the Imam al-Qāsim said is supported by His, *Exalted is He*, saying: *"And indeed he saw him another time, at the Lote Tree of the utmost boundary. Near it is the Garden of Refuge."* **[al-Najm: 13–15]**

And it is possible to answer them by saying: that Paradise is a garden to which the souls of the prophets *(May Allah's Blessings be Upon Them All)*, and the martyrs, and the believers take refuge during the remaining days of the worldly life—not the everlasting Paradise that the Godfearing were promised. And we only said that in order to reconcile between the evidences that affirm and those that negate.

And al-Murtaḍā ibn al-Hādī and others said: there is no decisive proof that it has been created, nor that it has not been created. Imam al-Qāsim ibn Muḥammad *(Peace be Upon Him)* said: I said—and it is the truth... and so on.

[The Basin]

Many reports have come speaking about the Basin of the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*. Among that is: "*My basin is between Mecca and Īlah; it has two spouts from Paradise*..." until his saying: "*its drink is whiter than milk, sweeter than honey, and more fragrant than musk*... the ḥadīth".

And among that is: "*My basin is like what is between al-Madīnah and Ṣanʿā'*". And among that is the ḥadīth of the three banners, and at its end: "*Then I will give them drink from my basin, and they will depart fully quenched*".

[al-Kawthar]

Al-Kawthar is a name for abundant good; it was only called kawthar from abundance, just as it was said *ghufrān* from *maghfirah*. Upon that, His, *Exalted is He*, saying: *"Indeed, We have given you al-Kawthar"*—its explanation is: Indeed, We have given you abundant good of good remembrance, tremendous honor, blessed progeny, and the rest of the good of this world; and We have given you abundant good in the Hereafter of al-Wasīlah, al-Maqām al-Maḥmūd, and the tremendous

elevation above all the prophets and messengers, and so on.

And al-Kawthar is also used for a river in Paradise, which Allah, *Exalted is He*, singled out for our Prophet Muḥammad *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*. Imam al-Ḥusayn ibn al-Qāsim al-ʿAyyānī *(Peace be Upon Him)* mentioned that.

[The Wife]

The believing wife will be, in the Hereafter, for her believing husband, due to what was narrated from the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*: that a man asked him about the believing man's wife—will she be his wife in Paradise if she is a believer? So, he *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* said: "*Yes. Allah will gather the members of the household together if they are believers, in the abode of the reward of the Allahfearing*".

Imam al-Hādī *(Peace be Upon Him)* mentioned it.

And it is narrated from the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* that he said: "*The woman is for her last of her husbands*".

And Imam al-Qāsim ibn ʿAlī al-ʿAyyānī *(Peace be Upon Him)* said, in answer to a question about that: Know that Allah, *Blessed and Exalted is He*, did not detail that for us. Rather, Allah promised the Allahfearing Paradise, and His promise is true. Except that I say: the choice in that is for men and women after they are in the Abode of Eternity; so whoever chooses something, Allah will deliver it to him, and bestow it upon him, as He promised—since He, *Mighty and Majestic is He*, says: *"And therein is whatever the souls desire and [what] delights the eyes..."* **[al-Zukhruf: 71]** ... and so on.

[The Garden of Adam]

Imam al-Hādī *(Peace be Upon Him)* said: and the Garden of Adam *(Peace be Upon Him)*, from which Allah brought him out, was on the earth—due to His, *Exalted is He*, saying: *"Indeed, I will make upon the earth a khalifa"* **[al-Baqarah: 30]**.

And there is no proof that He raised him up to the heaven.

And it was said: rather, it was in the heaven—due to His, *Exalted is He*, saying: *"Go down"* **[al-Baqarah: 36]** after the two of them ate from the tree.

We say: there is no proof in that, because it is like His, *Exalted is He*, saying to the Children of Israel: *"Go down to a town, for indeed you will have what you asked for."* **[al-Baqarah: 61]**.

And it is said: we went down to Yemen, and we went down to al-Ḥijāz.

[Faith in al-Qadar]

The determinists (al-Mujabbirah), despite the differences of their schools, are agreed that Allah, *Exalted is He*, alone is the One who undertook the creation of the actions of the servants—its acts of obedience and its acts of disobedience. So there is no movement nor stillness, no obedience nor sin, no injustice nor tyranny, no corruption nor aggression except that Allah, *Exalted is He*, is the One who created it, brought it into existence, wanted it, and willed it; and that the servant is free of that—he has no act, no will, and no choice in its occurrence and its creation. And upon that they interpreted His, *Exalted is He*, saying: *"Indeed, We have created all things with measure"* **[al-Qamar]** ... and what has come in the ḥadīth: "... *that he believes in Allah, His angels, His books, His messengers, and the Last Day; and that he believes in al-qadar—its good and its evil—from Allah*...". So they made the qadar that they interpreted with what we mentioned one of the fundamentals of faith and one of its pillars; and whoever does not hold that belief is not a believer with them, and his recompense is killing like the apostate. And among the well-known people who were killed upon that in history is al-Jaʿd ibn Dirham: one of the Umayyad governors over Iraq killed him on the Day of ʿĪd al-Aḍḥā, after the ʿĪd sermon. That governor said at the end of the sermon: whoever has sacrificial favor, let him sacrifice; for indeed I am sacrificing al-Jaʿd ibn Dirham. Then he descended and slaughtered him beneath the pulpit.

And the determinists call whoever does not hold their belief "qadarī".

And we say: faith in al-qadar is obligatory, because it came in the Qur'an, and believing in everything that came in it is obligatory; and likewise, it is obligatory to believe in what is sound and established from the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*. Allah, *Exalted is He*, said: *"And He who destined and then guided"* **[al-Aʿlā]**, *"Indeed, We have created all things with measure"* **[al-Qamar]**, *"And He created everything and determined it with [precise] determination"* **[al-Furqān]**, *"And We sent down from the sky water with measure"* **[al-Muʾminūn: 18]**, *"...to a known measure—so We determined, and excellent are We to determine"* **[al-Mursalāt]**, *"That is the determination of the Mighty, the Knowing"* **[al-Anʿām]**, and other verses in which the mention of al-qadar, al-taqdīr, and their derivatives has come.

However, the determinists went far astray in interpreting al-qadar. And the clear interpretation of al-qadar in His, *Exalted is He*, saying: *"And He created everything and determined it with [precise] determination"* **[al-Furqān]** is that Allah, *Exalted is He*, measured the creation of the creatures with a measuring according to what wisdom and benefit require: so He measured the measures of the organs in the human being in terms of

largeness and smallness, hardness and moisture, and number, and the place of each organ—according to what benefit and need call for.

And whoever looks with the eye of insight into the verses in which the mention of al-qadar, al-taqdīr, and their derivatives has come will know the correctness of what we mentioned.

[The Variety of al-Qadar and al-Taqdīr]

That is divided into two sections:

An apparent determination: and that is in what we witness of the creation of the human being, the animal, and the sun— in determining its size, its nearness and distance from the earth, its heat, its stations, its rising, its setting, and so on; and in what resembles that.

A hidden determination: and that is in what strikes the human being in his body, his wealth, his family, and his child—of diseases, disabilities, and loss.

So, the determination of provisions among the people was for what Allah, *Exalted is He*, mentioned of wisdom and benefit in His, *Exalted is He*, saying: *"And if Allah were to expand the provision for His servants, they would have committed tyranny upon the earth; but He sends down with measure what He wills. Indeed, He is, of His servants, Acquainted and Seeing."* **[al-Shūrā]**

And in what Allah, *Blessed and Exalted is He*, related of the story of the boy whom al-Khiḍr killed, in His, *Exalted is He*, saying: *"So they went on until, when they met a boy, he killed him. [Moses] said, 'Have you killed a pure soul for other than a soul? You have certainly done a dreadful thing.'"* **[al-Kahf]**

And in the saying of al-Khiḍr after that to Mūsā *(Peace be Upon Them All)*, as Allah, *Exalted is He*, related it: *"And as for the boy, his parents were believers, so we feared that he would burden them with transgression and disbelief. So we intended that their Lord should replace him for them with one better than him in purity and nearer in mercy."* **[al-Kahf]**

And in that are wisdoms:

1. The parents of the boy will be exposed to the tremendous reward which Allah, *Exalted is He*, promised the patient ones for their losing their son and the piece of their hearts; and the grief over them will be multiplied by his being killed and because of not knowing his killer; and by patience over this tremendous affliction they will attain what cannot be estimated in its measure—exactly as He, *Exalted is He*, said: *"Indeed, the patient will be given their reward without account."* **[al-Zumar: 10]** And He, *Exalted is He*, said: *"...and give glad tidings to the patient—those who, when a calamity*

strikes them, say, 'Indeed we belong to Allah, and indeed to Him we will return.' Those—upon them are blessings from their Lord and mercy, and those are the rightly guided." **[al-Baqarah]**

2. In the killing of the boy is what Allah, *Exalted is He*, related of the safety of the two parents from entering into disbelief and tyranny.
3. In that is the safety of the child from entering into disbelief and tyranny, by his dying young.
4. By the patience of the two parents over what struck them of the killing of their child, they deserve the immediate reward and their compensation with a substitute that is better than him, in purity, and nearer in kinship.

[The obligation of faith and affirmation of Allah's wisdom in the decrees]

When you have known that, then know that it is obligatory to have faith and to affirm that Allah, *Exalted is He*, has profound wisdoms and tremendous interests in everything that the decrees bring about of good—such as the expansion of provisions, the abundance of rains, the cheapness of prices, the soundness of bodies, and the abundance of children, and what resembles that; and everything that the decrees bring about of what is called evil—such as diseases and illnesses, death, poverty, drought, and so on.

Yes, the name "evil" here is only according to the outward appearance; otherwise, the reality is that it is good, and wisdoms, and interests returning to the people—except that they are hidden, as previously in the story of the boy.

So, what we mentioned and explained is the decree (al-qadar) that Allah, *Exalted is He*, and His Messenger *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* intended—not what the determinists (al-mujabbirah) who are called "qadarīs" mention.

And among what supports what we mentioned and refutes the saying of the determinist qadarīs is that Allah, *Exalted is He*, praised Himself by mentioning power and commended Himself by that; and He, *Exalted is He*, is Wise, Knowing—He does not praise Himself except by what contains praise, commendation, and goodness. And doing vile acts is among what a doer is blamed for, and it is not sound to praise oneself by it.

And to proceed: Allah, *Exalted is He*, said: *"And He created everything and determined it with [precise] determination."* **[al-Furqān]** So He conjoined the determining (with the letter "fa") to the creating; and in that is evidence for the correctness of what we say and the invalidity of the saying of the determinists—because the verse indicates that

determining occurred after creating, whereas the determinists say: decree (al-qadar) precedes creation. And they have no way out from this clear evidence, nor an answer to it—except fanaticism and imitation of the predecessors.

And also, we debate them regarding His, *Exalted is He*, saying: *"Indeed, We have created all things with measure"* **[al-Qamar: 49]**—the letter bā' (the preposition "bi-") in His saying "with measure"

Either it is for instrumentality, like the bā' in "I wrote with the pen" and "I cut the branch with the axe"; and upon that, decree (*al-qadar*) would be an instrument by which the Creator, *Majestic and Exalted is He*, seeks help in creating what He wills.

And this meaning is not said by any of the scholars of the Muslims, as far as we know. *"His command, when He intends a thing, is only that He says to it, 'Be,' and it is."* **[Yā Sīn]** And the word "Be" in this verse is only a metaphor for the speed of bringing-into-being; otherwise there is no literal utterance and no literal command. And some theologians said: Allah, *Exalted is He*, creates the creatures by the uttered word "Be"; and this doctrine results from severe ignorance of the secrets of the Arabic language.

Or the bā' is for accompaniment, like the bā' in His, *Exalted is He*, saying: *"It grows with oil"* **[al-Mu'minūn: 20]**, meaning: accompanied by oil. And this meaning is what we say and claim: that Allah, *Exalted is He*, created everything according to what wisdom, benefit, and need require.

And the bā' does not bear, among the meanings of the bā' in the language, anything besides these two possibilities which we mentioned in this verse.

[Conclusion]

[The occurrence of disagreement in religion]

Know that disagreement in religion has increased, and the schools have become divided; and not all are correct. That is because what is known is that the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* did not come except with one law, and one religion, and one creed. And there is no safety from destruction and loss except for the one who attains the truth which the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* came with, and follows the straight path.

And the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* said in the well-known ḥadīth: "My Ummah will split into seventy-three sects, all of them destroyed except one sect...". And every sect among all the sects of the Ummah claims that it is the saved one, and that what is besides it from the sects is astray and destroyed.

[The correctness of any school is not established by mere claim]

When you have known this, then know that the correctness of any school from the schools of those differing sects is not established by claims; rather, a decisive evidence and a shining proof are necessary, indicating the correctness of the claim. And He, *Exalted is He*, said: *"Say, 'Bring your proof, if you are truthful.'"* **[al-Baqarah: 111]**

And the accepted proof in this (chapter/field) is nothing except a decisive verse, clear in meaning, or a ḥadīth from the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* upon whose authenticity the Ummah agrees. And what is not like that is not accepted in this chapter/field, and no proof is established by it.

And we have clarified previously the evidences for the correctness of the madhhab (school/doctrine) of the Ahl al-Bayt *(Peace be Upon Them)*, which is represented by the madhhab (school) of the Zaydiyyah, in detail— for each issue, issue by issue— a logical clarification to which the innate dispositions of minds submit and yield, such that after consideration there remains for them no doubt nor suspicion. And we mean by that: the sound innate dispositions whose sights have not been blinded by the darknesses of imitation and desires, and the veils of misery. As for the one who is like that, they do not believe even if every sign comes to them until they see the painful punishment: *"Only those respond who hear; and the dead—Allah will raise them..."* **[al-Anʿām: 36]** And: *"Indeed, you do not make the dead hear, nor do you make the deaf hear the call when they turn their backs, retreating."* **[al-Naml]** And: *"For indeed it is not the eyes that become blind, but blind are the hearts within the chests."* **[al-Ḥajj]**

And in this conclusion, we mention the evidences, in a general manner, for the correctness of the madhhab (school) of the Ahl al-Bayt *(Peace be Upon Them)*—and that they are the saved sect, and that what is beside them from the sects is astray and destroyed—***so we say, and by Allah is success:***

[Testing the Morally Accountable Is Allah's Sunnah in His Creation]

Know that Allah, *Glorified is He*, His wisdom has required—and His Sunnah has proceeded—that He tests His servants, and tries them with kinds of obligations that are hard upon the soul/self, and in which—over and above other obligations—there is a kind of severity and something of heaviness. Among that is what Allah, *Exalted is He*, mentioned of His commanding the angels to prostrate to Adam, so they prostrated, except Iblīs—he refused and was arrogant.

And among that is what Allah, *Exalted is He*, mentioned about the army of Ṭālūt in His, *Exalted is He*, saying: *"He said, 'Indeed, Allah will test you with a river. So whoever drinks from it is not of me, and whoever does not taste it is of me—except one who takes a scoop with his hand.' So they drank from it except a few of them..."* **[al-Baqarah: 249]**

And among that is what Allah, *Exalted is He*, mentioned about the companions of the town: *"When their fish came to them on their Sabbath, openly, and the day they did not observe the Sabbath, they did not come to them. Thus We test them..."* **[al-Aʿrāf: 163]**

And examples like that in the Qur'an are many...

[Testing the Ummah of Muḥammad by the Household of its Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*]

And Allah, *Exalted is He*, tried the Ummah of Muḥammad *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* and tested them by the Household of His Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*. So He commanded them to love them, and to send prayers upon them in every prayer; and Allah, *Exalted is He*, favored them above the rest of the people, and honored them, and raised their rank and their mention, and coupled their mention with the mention of His Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*, and with the Qur'an; and He made them the successors of His Messenger, and the conveyers after him; and He made them the people of truth and guidance; and He removed from them impurity and purified them with a thorough purification... and to the rest of what the verses of the Qur'an and the Sunnah of the Messenger *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* overflowed with. So this obligation became severe, and by it the trial became tremendous, and it became heavy upon the souls;

so most of the Ummah perished because of it, except the one whose heart Allah tested for faith.

And there occurred what occurred from what the Messenger *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* informed of in the ḥadīth of the two Ṣaḥīḥs, in which he says: "*So they will be taken to the left, and I will say: my companions, my companions. Then it will be said: you do not know what they innovated after you; they turned back upon their heels, backwards. So I will say: away, away*".[1]

And in another [report] in the two Ṣaḥīḥs: "*So I do not think that any of them will be saved except like the stray camels*".[2]

[The Repetition of the Messenger in Clarifying the Right of His Household *(Peace be Upon Them)* so that the proof may be completed]

And the Messenger *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* did, indeed, repeatedly clarify what Allah, *Exalted is He*, obligated the Ummah with regarding his Household, and he directed the evidences to them and repeated them *"so that he who perishes may perish upon clear proof, and he who lives may live upon clear proof; and indeed Allah is Hearing, Knowing."* **[al-Anfāl]**

And by that the proof was established against the creation, and it spread among the people, and became widespread and well-known and clear—until the opponents of the Ahl al-Bayt and their enemies were compelled to narrate it and to judge it authentic. So the Ahl al-Sunnah wa'l-Jamāʿah—who are the historical enemy and the fiercest opponent of the Ahl al-Bayt *(Peace be Upon Them)*, and the original great enemy that has a tremendous entity and many followers—indeed, they narrated the ḥadīth of al-Thaqalayn with different chains and many routes that reached the level of tawātur (*mass transmission*), such that a book from their reliable ḥadīth books is hardly free of mentioning it.

And they narrated the ḥadīth of al-Manzilah, and the ḥadīth of al-Ghadīr, and the ḥadīth of the banner on the Day of Khaybar, and the ḥadīth of al-Kisāʾ, and the ḥadīth of the verse of purification, and the ḥadīth of the verse of love, and the ḥadīth of the ship, and the ḥadīth of the stars, and the ḥadīth "*Put them forward*," and the ḥadīth "*Your love is faith,*" and the ḥadīth "*Love of the Ahl al-Bayt*"... and other than that of what can hardly be counted, of what the Ahl al-Sunnah wa'l-Jamāʿah narrated and judged authentic. Therefore, what the Ummah lacks is not ignorance and lack of evidences; rather, what it lacks is humility before

1- Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī from no. (6582) to no. (6585), Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim no. (247, 249).
2- Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī (5/2407) no. (6215).

the commands of Allah, *Exalted is He*, and submission to His command, and abasement and yielding— for that is indispensable until obedience to Allah and response are achieved. And for a reason—and what a reason—Allah, *Majestic is His mention*, began with humility when He mentioned the qualities of the servants of the Most Merciful in Sūrat al-Furqān; for He, *Exalted is He*, opened their qualities with humility, then after that He mentioned prayer, and leaving shirk (associating partners), killing, fornication, and so on.

So, He, *Exalted is He*, said: *"And the servants of the Most Merciful are those who walk upon the earth gently, and when the ignorant address them, they say, 'Peace'..."* **[al-Furqān]**—to the end of the sūrah. So, the servants of the Most Merciful—who are truly the servants of the Most Merciful—walk upon the earth with the walk of humility: they have cast off from themselves the cloaks of the arrogant, and purified themselves from the filth of arrogance. Thus, they say regarding everything that comes to them from the Most Merciful: "We hear and we obey." They receive all of that with contentment and submission, with humility, yielding, surrender, and response—with all hearing and obedience. Neither a big matter nor a small matter is too burdensome for them in that, because they have devoted their selves to Allah, and purified them from arrogance.

[The Danger of Arrogance and Warning Against It]

And the Messenger *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* was aware of the danger of arrogance and of its role in taking lightly the obedience of Allah, *Exalted is He*, and His Messenger; so he *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* said, warning against that blameworthy trait: "*He will not enter Paradise—whoever has in his heart the weight of a mustard seed of arrogance*".

From here we know that arrogance is the vile disease that calls its possessor to exalt himself above responding to the commands of Allah, *Exalted is He*, and to reject them. Allah, *Exalted is He*, said: *"And they rejected them, while their souls were certain of them, out of injustice and haughtiness."* **[al-Naml: 14]**—meaning: out of injustice and arrogance.

And He, *Exalted is He*, said: *"There is nothing in their breasts except arrogance..."* **[Ghāfir: 56]**. And He, *Exalted is He*, said: *"I will turn away from My signs those who act arrogantly upon the earth without any right, and if they see every sign, they will not believe in it; and if they see the path of right guidance, they will not take it as a path..."* **[al-Aʿrāf: 146]**. And He, *Exalted is He*, said: *"Is there not in Hell an abode for the arrogant?"* **[al-Zumar]**.

So everyone who enters the Fire is arrogant—because he did not

humble himself to Allah, *Exalted is He*; rather, he magnified himself against Allah and acted arrogantly, until he preferred the desire of his self over the commands of his Lord; thus he became among those arrogant toward Allah—even if, among the people, he is counted among the humble; rather, even if he were to walk upon his face on the earth due to the severity of humility. That is because the first of humility is humility to Allah, *Exalted is He*, and complying with His command, and hearing and obeying, and yielding to Him, *Exalted is He*... and so on.

And the major madhāhib (schools) today, widespread in the lands of Islam, are two madhāhib regarding creed: the madhhab of Ahl al-Sunnah wa'l-Jamāʿah and the madhhab of the Shīʿah.

And Ahl al-Sunnah wa'l-Jamāʿah are divided within themselves into madhāhib, and likewise the Shīʿah. So each group from Ahl al-Sunnah wa'l-Jamāʿah argues that it is the saved group with evidences for the correctness of what it says, and for declaring astray whatever is besides it.

[The Doubts of Ahl al-Sunnah that They Are the Saved Group, and the Answer]

First: that they are the manifest group which the Messenger *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* mentioned in his saying: "*A group of my Ummah will not cease to be manifest upon the truth*..." the ḥadīth.

And they were indeed like that; for they are the vast majority, and they have the overwhelming majority within the Muslim lands throughout history until today. Therefore, they are the people of truth and they are the saved group by the testimony of the ḥadīth.

Second: that they are upon what the Messenger *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* was upon; and the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* said, in clarifying the saved group: "*Whoever is upon the like of what I and my companions are upon*".

Third: that they are upon what the multitude of the Companions and the Tābiʿīn and those who followed them were upon, and they proceed upon their path. And in the ḥadīth: "*The best of generations is my generation, then those who follow them, then those who follow them*". And Allah, *Exalted is He*, praised the Companions and the Tābiʿīn and commended them in the Qur'an, and the Messenger *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* praised them and commended them.

These are the most prominent doubts of Ahl al-Sunnah wa'l-Jamāʿah

which they cling to and by which they create confusion—upon themselves and upon others.

And we say in clarifying the answer to them:

The answer to the first doubt: the ḥadīth by which they argue is authentic, with no doubt in it; however, they erred in their interpretation of it. The correct interpretation is: a group from my Ummah will not cease to be manifest upon the truth—by proof, clear arguments, and evidences. It is not meant—as Ahl al-Sunnah wa'l-Jamāʿah imagined—that what is meant is the manifestness of dominance, and the great number of followers, supporters, and authority. Rather, what is meant is what we mentioned. And the evidence for what we say is what was narrated from the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* that he said: "No Ummah differed after its prophet except that the people of its falsehood became dominant over the people of its truth".

And He, *Exalted is He*, said: *"And if you obey most of those on the earth, they will mislead you from the path of Allah."* **[al-Anʿām: 116]** And: *"But most of the people, even though you strive, are not believers."* **[Yūsuf: 103]** And: *"And few of My servants are grateful."* **[Saba': 13]**

And at that point, reasoning by mere numbers for the truth is not correct—because you see the censure of the majority and the praise of the few in the Book of Allah, *Exalted is He*.

And from here, the Commander of the Faithful *(Peace be Upon Him)* said—when a questioner asked him, saying: Do you see, O Commander of the Faithful, that the people of al-Shām, despite their great number, are upon falsehood, and we, despite our fewness, are upon truth?

So, the Commander of the Faithful *(Peace be Upon Him)* said: "*Woe to you! Indeed, the truth is not known by men; rather men are known by the truth. So, know the truth and you will know its people—whether they are few or many; and know falsehood and you will know its people—whether they are few or many*... and so on".

And the answer to the second doubt: by their arguing with that, they have not left the sphere of mere claim. So, their doubt is a claim devoid of evidence, and it is possible for every group to say the like of their statement.

Rather, every group says: it is upon what the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* and the believers with him were upon; they do not go beyond that. And we do not find anyone from the groups of the Muslims who says: he is upon other than what the Messenger *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* and

his Companions were upon.

And the answer to the third doubt: the evidence that is truly evidence is the Book, the Sunnah, and consensus. As for kathrah (*numerical majority*), it is not evidence—due to what we mentioned of proofs in the answer to the first doubt.

Discussing the ḥadīth: "The best of generations is my generation." and so on

As for the ḥadīth: "The best of generations is my generation, then those who follow them, then those who follow them", it is a solitary report (ḥadīth āḥād) whose narration was confined to Ahl al-Sunnah wa'l-Jamāʿah; and proof is only established by what all the differing groups have agreed upon as authentic, and this ḥadīth is not like that. Therefore, it is not valid to argue with it against the Shīʿah.

Moreover, the historical reality belies its purport/content. For the catastrophe of the killing of al-Ḥusayn and his Household—who are the Household of the Messenger of Allah *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*—occurred in the first century. And the catastrophe of al-Ḥarrah, in which the city of the Messenger *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* was violated; and the children of the Muhājirīn and the Anṣār were killed therein; and their women were violated until their women came with a thousand newborns not from their fathers; and it was stamped upon the necks of those men of the people of al-Madīnah who remained that they were slaves and servants to the Commander of the Faithful Yazīd—

All of that occurred in the first century. And the Kaʿbah was demolished by catapults, and the sanctity of Mecca was violated; and Ibn al-Zubayr and his companions were killed in the courtyard of al-Masjid al-Ḥarām in the first century. And the first time the women of the Muslims were taken captive—in the first century—Busr ibn Arṭāʾah took them captive from Yemen by the command of Muʿāwiyah, and sold them the selling of slaves.

And in the first century, Muʿāwiyah ibn Abī Sufyān ordered—after his truce with al-Ḥasan ibn ʿAlī *(Peace be Upon Him)*—the cursing of the Commander of the Faithful ʿAlī ibn Abī Ṭālib *(Peace be Upon Him)* in the sermons of Fridays and the festivals. So he was cursed, by his command, from the pulpits of the mosques of the Muslims—and there were at that time eighty thousand pulpits. And it continued from then until ʿUmar ibn ʿAbd al-ʿAzīz assumed rule, so he removed that tremendous sin and replaced it with: *"Indeed, Allah commands justice and excellence..."* **[al-Naḥl: 90]**.

And in the first century as well, Muʿāwiyah ordered disavowal of the

religion of ʿAlī ibn Abī Ṭālib; and whoever refused that, his neck was struck. Among those whose neck was struck for that were the famous Companion Ḥujr ibn ʿAdī and ʿAmr ibn al-Ḥamq al-Khuzāʿī. And in the first century, many of the Companions of the Messenger of Allah *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* were killed: the Khārijites killed the Commander of the Faithful *(Peace be Upon Him)*, Muʿāwiyah poisoned al-Ḥasan ibn ʿAlī *(Peace be Upon Him)*, and Muʿāwiyah, in the battle of Ṣiffīn, killed ʿAmmār ibn Yāsir, and Khuzaymah ibn Thābit—Dhu al-Shahādatayn—and many others. And before all of that was the declaration of war, with no leniency, against the Commander of the Faithful when he assumed the caliphate: so one group broke their pledge to him, another acted unjustly, and others rebelled; and all these three groups drew the sword against him and fought him with the fiercest fighting, and showed him the fiercest enmity.

And in the authentic ḥadīth from the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* which Ahl al-Sunnah wa'l-Jamāʿah narrated: "*O Allah, be the enemy of whoever is his enemy, grant victory to whoever supports him, and forsake whoever forsakes him*". And in the ḥadīth also: "*Your war is my war, and your peace is my peace*".[1]

And al-Bukhārī narrated in his Ṣaḥīḥ[2], in several places, from the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* that he said to ʿAlī *(Peace be Upon Him)*: "*You are to me in the position of Hārūn to Mūsā, except that there is no prophet after me*".

And he *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* said—as in *Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī*[3]—regarding ʿAlī *(Peace be Upon Him)* on the Day of Khaybar: "*I will surely give the banner tomorrow to a man who loves Allah and His Messenger, and Allah and His Messenger love him; one who repeatedly attacks, not one who flees; Allah will grant victory at his hands*". So he gave it to ʿAlī *(Peace be Upon Him)*. And Muslim narrated in his *Ṣaḥīḥ* from Saʿd ibn Abī Waqqāṣ: when Muʿāwiyah asked him about what it was that prevented him from cursing Abū Turāb—meaning ʿAlī *(Peace be Upon Him)*—Saʿd answered that what prevented him was that he had heard from the Messenger of Allah *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* three traits which he said about ʿAlī *(Peace be Upon Him)*; for Saʿd to have one of them would have been more beloved to him than red camels. So Saʿd mentioned: his marrying him to Fāṭimah, and the ḥadīth of the Day of Khaybar, and the ḥadīth of al-Ghadīr.

1- *Manāqib ʿAlī* by Ibn al-Maghāzilī (1/305) no. (285).
2- *Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī* (5/19) no. (3706), (6/3) no. (4416).
3- *Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī* (4/60) no. (3009), (5/18) no. (3701, 3702), (5/134) no. (4209, 4210).

And other than that of the issues that occurred in the first century; and whoever examines the history of that century will see the confirmation of what we said.

[Their arguing by Allah's praise of the Companions and the Followers, and the reply to them]

As for what they argued with of Allah's, *Exalted is He*, praising the Companions and the Tābiʿīn (Followers), what is meant by that are those among them who were people of uprightness, who maintained the quality of excellence by which their Lord, *Exalted is He*, praised them in the Qur'an, in His, *Exalted is He*, saying—addressing them: *"You are the best nation brought forth for the people: you command the right and forbid the wrong and believe in Allah."* **[Āl ʿImrān: 110]**

So Allah, *Exalted is He*, clarified that they deserved excellence because of their commanding the right, forbidding the wrong, and their believing in Allah. So whoever remained upright upon that is worthy of praise and approval; and whoever abandoned that quality has no share in any of the praise, and has no portion—exactly as He, *Exalted is He*, said, addressing the Companions first and specifically: *"So whoever breaks [his pledge] only breaks against himself; and whoever fulfills what he has covenanted with Allah—He will grant him a tremendous reward."* **[al-Fatḥ]**

And there is no doubt that the Companions after the death of the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* turned away from the Household of the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* with the most severe turning-away, and diminished their rights, and belittled them.

Among that is what occurred to Fāṭimah, the daughter of the Messenger of Allah *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*: that they took from her what was in her possession of the gift (al-niḥlah) which her father *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* had given to her, and they deprived her of her inheritance and her share of the fay'. So she abandoned Abū Bakr and ʿUmar, and she died out of grief, angry with them, displeased with them. And the Messenger *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* said: "*Indeed, Allah is angered for the anger of Fāṭimah, and is pleased for her pleasure*".[1] ... and so on.

And the harm toward the Ahl al-Bayt *(Peace be Upon Them)* continued to increase from that time, and to multiply as time passed until it reached the end: so they killed the Commander of the Faithful, and poisoned al-

1- *Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī* (3/1374) no. (3556), and (3/1361) no. (3510), with the wording: ((Fāṭimah is a part of me, so whoever angers her angers me)).

Ḥasan, and killed al-Ḥusayn and seventeen men from his Household in Karbalāʾ. Then the Ummah instituted their cursing by the order of Muʿāwiyah, and [instituted] disavowal of their religion—until loving ʿAlī *(Peace be Upon Him)* specifically, or loving the Ahl al-Bayt *(Peace be Upon Them)* became a sin that is not forgiven, by which testimony and narration are rejected... and so on.

And this madhhab has remained among the foundations of Ahl al-Sunnah and their bases upon which they build the laws and rulings until today.

And generations grew up upon that, and grew old upon it; and years passed, and centuries followed one another, and people came to know nothing except that, and to profess nothing except it. And the sultans of Banū Umayyah—from the era of Muʿāwiyah—and then the sultans of Banū al-ʿAbbās continued to sponsor this principle with the utmost sponsorship and to care for it with the severest care.

And this madhhab became well-known by the name "al-Sunnah wa'l-Jamāʿah," and its followers by "Ahl al-Sunnah wa'l-Jamāʿah." And they said: it is the madhhab of the salaf and the khalaf, and the madhhab of the best generations, then the one after it, then the one after it. And we do not dispute them in that: indeed, this madhhab arose in the first century, and Muʿāwiyah finally imposed it upon the Ummah as an imposition, and punished with the harshest punishment whoever was not upon it. Thus, this madhhab became the official madhhab in the Muslim lands in the first century, and then in the centuries after it. And we also do not deny that they call it al-Sunnah wa'l-Jamāʿah, and its followers Ahl al-Sunnah wa'l-Jamāʿah, and that it is the madhhab of the salaf and the khalaf, and the madhhab of the Tābiʿīn and those who followed them.

[The Evidences That the Ahl al-Bayt *(Peace be Upon Them)* and Those Who Followed Them Are the Saved Sect]

If you have known that, then we say: the evidences that the Ahl al-Bayt *(Peace be Upon Them)* and those who followed them are the saved sect are many—from the Book and the Sunnah—so we suffice here by citing some of them:

1- Muslim narrated in his *Ṣaḥīḥ*[1] the ḥadīth of the cloak (Ḥadīth al-Kisāʾ), and it is his *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* saying regarding ʿAlī, Fāṭimah, al-Ḥasan, and al-Ḥusayn —when he wrapped a cloak over them: "*O Allah, these are my Household; so remove impurity from them and purify them with a thorough purification*".

1- *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim* (4/1883) no. (2424), from ʿĀ'ishah.

And it was also narrated in this ḥadīth that the verse of purification was revealed regarding them, and it is His, *Exalted is He*, saying: *"Allah only intends to remove impurity from you, O People of the Household, and to purify you with a thorough purification."* **[al-Aḥzāb]**

2- Muslim also narrated the ḥadīth of the two weighty things (Ḥadīth al-Thaqalayn), and others from the people of ḥadīth also narrated it; and it is his *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* saying: "*Indeed, I am leaving among you that which, if you hold fast to it, you will never go astray after me—ever: the Book of Allah and my progeny, my Household. Indeed, the Subtle, the Aware informed me that the two of them will not separate until they return to me at the Basin*".[1]

So the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* specified for the Ummah his Household and identified them for them—by word and deed—in the ḥadīth of the cloak, so that no one after that would have any proof or excuse.

Then he *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* informed his Ummah that he had left among them and bequeathed after his death two things to which the Ummah would return—standing in his place, taking his position, and filling the void after his loss—and they are: the Book of Allah, *Exalted is He*, and his progeny, his Household. And he informed that if they hold fast to them, they will be guided and will be safe from misguidance.

Then the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* reinforced that—completing the proof and cutting off excuse—by what he made obligatory of sending prayers upon them in the prayer. That is in the ḥadīth of Kaʿb ibn ʿUjrah which the authors of the Ṣiḥāḥ narrated: "How do we send prayers upon you when we send prayers upon you in our prayer?" He *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* said: "*Say: O Allah, send prayers upon Muḥammad and upon the family of Muḥammad*..."—the ḥadīth.[2]

And by what al-Bukhārī narrated regarding the revelation of the verse of love (Āyat al-Mawaddah): *"Say: I do not ask you for it any reward except love for the near kin."* **[al-Shūrā: 23]**—regarding the five who are: ʿAlī, Fāṭimah, and their two sons.

He said regarding al-Ghadīr: al-Tirmidhī, Aḥmad, al-Ḥākim, al-Nasāʾī,

1- *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim* (4/1873) no. (2408), with a close wording without mentioning its end; its documentation has preceded, along with mentioning those who cited the end of the ḥadīth.
2- *Musnad al-Shāfiʿī* (1/97) no. (278), *Musnad Aḥmad* (28/299) no. (17067), *al-Sunan al-Kubrā* by al-Nasāʾī (9/25) no. (9792).

Ibn Abī Shaybah, al-Ṭabarī, and many others among the ḥuffāẓ [masters preservers of ḥadīth], through sound routes, narrated his *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* saying: "*Indeed, ʿAlī and I are from one another, and he is the walī of every believer after me*".

And Abū Nuʿaym in *al-Ḥilyah* and others, with an authentic chain, narrated: "*Whoever would be pleased to live my life, and die my death, and dwell in the Garden of ʿAdn which my Lord has planted, then let him take ʿAlī as walī after me, and let him follow the Imams after me, for indeed they are my progeny (ʿitrati), created from my clay*... and so on".

And al-Bukhārī narrated in the *Ṣaḥīḥ*: "*ʿAlī is to me in the position of Hārūn to Mūsā, except that there is no prophet after me*".

And Muslim narrated in the *Ṣaḥīḥ*[1]: "*Love of ʿAlī is faith, and hatred of him is hypocrisy*".

And in the books of ḥadīth: "*al-Ḥasan and al-Ḥusayn are the masters of the youth of the people of Paradise, and their father is better than them*".

And our book does not have space to cite what is in the two Ṣaḥīḥs—let alone what is in other than them—of what has come from the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* regarding his Household. And the little suffices, and the aim is indication. As for the obstinate one for whom the truth does not matter, nothing is expected from him except denial and stubborn opposition—even if every sign were to come to him.

[The Sunnah of Divine Choosing]

And to proceed: indeed, the Sunnah of Allah, *Exalted is He*, has proceeded, and His wisdom has decreed choosing (al-iṣṭifāʾ) for the children of the prophets. Allah, *Exalted is He*, said regarding that: *"And We certainly sent Nūḥ and Ibrāhīm, and We placed in their progeny prophethood and the Book..."* **[al-Ḥadīd: 26]** And He, *Exalted is He*, said: *"Indeed, Allah chose Ādam and Nūḥ and the family of Ibrāhīm and the family of ʿImrān over the worlds—descendants, some of them from others; and Allah is Hearing, Knowing."* **[Āl ʿImrān]**

And He, *Exalted is He*, said regarding the children of the prophet Isrāʾīl *(Peace be Upon Him)*—and he is Yaʿqūb: *"And We certainly chose them, with knowledge, over the worlds."* **[al-Dukhān: 32]** And: *"O Children of Israel, remember My favor which I bestowed upon you, and that I preferred you*

1- *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim* (1/86) no. (78), with the wording: ʿAlī said: "By Him who split the seed and created the soul, indeed it is a covenant of the unlettered Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* to me that none loves me except a believer, and none hates me except a hypocrite."

over the worlds." **[al-Baqarah: 47]**

And our Prophet Muḥammad *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* is the best of the prophets. So—by the consistent requirement of wisdom, and by what Allah's Sunnah has decreed—it is necessary that his family *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* be the best family and more excellent than the rest of the chosen offspring, and that his progeny (ʿitrah) be the best progeny.

And Allah, *Exalted is He*, has completed the blessing upon our Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* and bestowed upon him the favor: so He made him the best of the prophets; and He made his Book the best of the books; and He made his Ummah the best of the nations; and He made his offspring the best offspring—by what He singled them out with of virtues, choosing, purification, and so on.

[The Division of the Shīʿah into Zaydiyyah and Imāmiyyah]

If you have known that, then know that all the factions of the Shīʿah claim that they follow the Ahl al-Bayt *(Peace be Upon Them)*, proceed upon their path, and adopt their methods. And the largest groups of the Shīʿah today are the Jaʿfariyyah, and they are those who say the imamate of twelve Imams named by their names, the last of them being al-Mahdī al-Muntaẓar Muḥammad ibn al-Ḥasan al-ʿAskarī, born in the third century—as the Imāmiyyah claim—and who disappeared after his birth, and has remained hidden until today.

And we, the Zaydiyyah, differ with the Imāmiyyah regarding what they claim.

This—and know that we do not accept, in the evidences of this chapter, except what yields knowledge and certainty: either a decisive verse, or a Sunnah agreed upon. Therefore, we have stopped where the evidences stopped us: we will neither advance nor lag behind. And the evidences at which we have stopped are what we and the Imāmiyyah and Ahl al-Sunnah wa'l-Jamāʿah have all agreed upon—namely: the ḥadīth of al-Thaqalayn and al-Kisāʾ, and the verse of purification and of love, and to the rest of what we have presented.

Then the Imāmiyyah claimed claims and argued with what neither we nor others from Ahl al-Sunnah wa'l-Jamāʿah know, so it was not possible for us to accept them, nor did we deem it permissible to act upon them or to rely upon them.

That is because what we are in is from the foundations of the Sharīʿah, for whose establishment knowledge and certainty are indispensable—such as prayer, zakāh, ḥajj, and so on. And mere claims devoid of decisive proofs and clear evidences are not accepted in them. Thus, the aḥādīth of

the Imāmiyyah—which they alone narrate—are not accepted to establish a tremendous foundation from the foundations of the Sharīʿah, while other factions of Islam do not know those narrations and do not see any trace of them in the ḥadīths of the factions. Therefore, the Zaydiyyah do not give weight to what the Imāmiyyah go to, nor do they pay attention to it.

And among what confirms what we mentioned is that the Imams of the Zaydiyyah are those who stood with the right of the caliphate of the Messenger *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*: so they commanded the right and forbade the wrong, and they strove against the wrongdoers with their wealth and their selves, and they proclaimed the truth, and fought for it, and were killed in its path—exactly as the Messenger *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* was.

And they have remained like that from the time of Imam Zayd ibn ʿAlī *(Peace be Upon Him)* to this time. As for the Imāmī Shīʿah, their path diverged from the time of Imam Zayd ibn ʿAlī *(Peace be Upon Him)*; for they refused jihād with him, and they have continued since then to refuse jihād with the callers from the Ahl al-Bayt *(Peace be Upon Them)*.

[Clarifying the Invalidity of the Imāmiyyah School Regarding the Caliphate]

And for more clarification of the correctness of the Zaydiyyah school and the invalidity of the Imāmiyyah school regarding the caliphate, we say: the functions of the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* which he carried out by virtue of prophethood are:

1- Conveying the rulings of Islam and its laws.
2- Calling to Islam, disseminating it, and spreading it.
3- Leading armies against the enemies of Islam, raiding, and declaring war against the wrongdoers.
4- Taking the financial dues and distributing them to those entitled to them.
5- Establishing the prescribed punishments, and establishing the rites of Islam.
6- Judging between people with truth, establishing justice, and so on.

So whoever proclaims these slogans, calls to them, is from the Household of the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*, fulfilling the conditions of the caliphate that we previously mentioned, and declares revolt against injustice and the wrongdoers—he is the one truly deserving to be called an Imam and a caliph of the Messenger *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*.

And this proof is an apparent, practical, tangible proof in the arena; it

corresponds to the saying of the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*: "*Indeed, they are the two caliphs after me*". So that is the report, and this is the direct observation.

And to proceed: Allah's proof against the servants is not completed except by proclaiming the call and showing the principles we mentioned. It is not a condition that what the Imam calls to be achieved; rather, what is conditioned is what we mentioned—whether response occurs or does not occur—exactly as the prophets of Allah were: they used to proclaim the call to Allah, and proclaim the revolt against corruption. Among them were those who came to have followers and authority; among them were those for whom nothing of that occurred; and among them were those between that and that. And in what Allah, *Exalted is He*, narrated of His prophets and messengers, it did not come that any one of them kept silent and closed his door. Rather, every prophet called to the fear of Allah, obedience to Him, and leaving corruption and injustice, and they went to the utmost extreme in that.

And the Imamate is the caliphate of prophethood. Therefore, the caliphate is not realized except if, from the Imam, the actions of the prophets *(Peace be Upon Them All)* are realized. And nothing of that was realized in the Imams of the Imāmiyyah—while they, *may Allah's prayers be upon them*, are people deserving of every goodness and virtue.

And among what makes clear the corruption of the Imāmiyyah school, in general, is that their school in the Imamate contains many claims of superstitions which minds deem far-fetched and deny—among them:

1. Their saying: the Imams know much of the unseen, and that Allah gives them knowledge without learning.
2. Their saying: the Mahdī Muḥammad ibn al-Ḥasan al-ʿAskarī was born, then disappeared after his birth, and he has remained hidden until today; and that he is alive, roaming the lands; and that he was born in the middle of the third Hijrī century; and that he has four deputies who convey knowledge from him.
3. Their claiming infallibility for the Imams in a manner greater than the infallibility of the Messenger *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*—arguing for that by saying: the Prophet used to be alerted by revelation if he erred, unlike the Imams, for revelation has ceased; so they needed a greater infallibility to protect them from falling into error, forgetfulness, and the like.

As for the Zaydiyyah, you will not find in their school anything of superstitions—because their school is founded upon the agreed-upon evidences from the Book and the Sunnah, and upon what the innate dispositions of minds require.

[Seeking Means of Nearness (al-Tawassul)]

Seeking means (al-wasāʾil) to Allah is legislated; due to His, *Exalted is He*, saying: *"And seek to Him the means."* **[al-Māʾidah: 35]**

And the means that bring one near to Allah, Exalted is He, are of types:

Among them: performing acts of obedience, such as the prayers, ḥajj, and the recitation of the Qur'an; increasing in repentance to Allah and returning to Him; regret over negligence; and much seeking forgiveness.

Among them: leaving the prohibited matters and the doubtful matters, and having waraʿ (*scrupulousness*) and zuhd (*asceticism*). For all of that brings the servant near to Allah and increases him in nearness with Him.

And among that: supplication, and showing tadar'u (*humble imploring*), tadhallul (*humbling oneself*), and iftiqār (*neediness*) before Allah, *Exalted is He*.

And among that: visiting the sick; visiting brothers for Allah's sake; looking into the muṣḥaf (*the Qur'anic codex*); looking at the face of the scholar; and looking at the faces of the parents—and many aḥādīth have come regarding that.

And in sum: everything Allah, *Exalted is He*, has encouraged doing is a means that brings one near to Allah.

Some of Ahl al-Sunnah objected to visiting graves and seeking closeness to Allah, *Exalted is He*, by the blessing of visiting them—and they exaggerated in the objection and went to the utmost excess, until they made that among shirk and among the worship of idols. They said: wiping the grave for blessing is shirk; rubbing oneself with the soil of the grave for blessing is shirk; seeking healing by it is shirk. And they branched out in this chapter, saying: building on graves is shirk; writing marble plaques over graves is shirk; lighting the domes is shirk; and so on—while all of that has no problem in it and no harm, if only they understood.

And the evidence for what we say is that visiting graves is among the legislated acts of obedience which Allah, *Exalted is He*, legislated. For in the well-known ḥadīth which Muslim and others narrated: "*I had forbidden you from visiting graves; indeed, visit them, for they remind of the Hereafter*".

And the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* used to visit the people of al-Baqīʿ, and likewise ʿĀʾishah; and Fāṭimah *(Peace be Upon Her)* used to visit the grave of her uncle Ḥamzah and the martyrs of Uḥud every Friday—authentic aḥādīth have established that.

And acts of obedience—as we mentioned—are means that bring one near to Allah, *Exalted is He*; so there is no ground for objecting to visiting graves. As for seeking blessing (*tabarruk*) and seeking healing (istishfāʾ), narrations have been authentic that the Companions used to seek blessing by the saliva of the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*, and by the water of his wuḍūʾ (*ablution*), and by his hair. And Abū Bakr advised that he be buried beside the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*, seeking the blessing of nearness to the grave of the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*; and likewise, ʿUmar advised [that]. And the Companions executed the bequest of Abū Bakr first, then executed the bequest of ʿUmar, and no objection occurred.

And likewise al-Ḥasan ibn ʿAlī *(Peace be Upon Him)* advised that he be buried by the grave of his grandfather *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*; and if he were prevented from that, then let him be buried by the grave of his mother Fāṭimah—riḍwān Allāh ʿalayhima (Allah's good pleasure be upon them).

And to proceed: there is no impediment for the soil of the graves of some of the righteous to be a cause for healing and well-being—like the rest of the causes by which one seeks healing from manufactured medical drugs or natural plants. And there is no impediment in believing that soil is a cause for healing, just as there is no impediment in believing that aspirin tablets are a cause for healing, and so on.

They said: magnifying graves by building upon them, lighting them, and furnishing them is shirk.

We say: magnifying the graves of the righteous is legislated; the Qur'an brought it in what Allah, *Exalted is He*, related about the Companions of the Cave: *"When they disputed among themselves about their affair, they said, 'Build over them a structure; their Lord knows best about them.' Those who prevailed in their matter said, 'We will surely take over them a mosque.'"* **[al-Kahf: 21]**

And ʿĀ'ishah, the wife of the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)*, used to light [a lamp] at the grave of the Prophet and to furnish [the place]

And magnifying the grave of the Prophet *(May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)* and magnifying the graves of the righteous was something established among the Muslims from the era of the Companions and after them from the Tābiʿīn and those who followed them—until Ibn Taymiyyah came in the seventh century, and he manifested his innovated view regarding graves; then, after him by a long time, Muḥammad ibn ʿAbd al-Wahhāb came and supported his school,

and obtained a state and authority, which helped in establishing that school and strengthening it.

Completed, by the praise of Allah.

[Table of Contents]

Foreword of the Ahl al-Bayt Library (A.S.)	3
[Foreword]	13
[Introduction]	14
[Definition of This Science]	14
[The Intellect]	14
[The Judgment of the Intellect Regarding Good and Evil]	16
[Inquiry and Reflection]	17
[Evidence]	18
[Causal Factors]	19
[Refutation of the Claim of the Efficacy of These Factors]	20
[The Book of Divine Unity (Al-Tawhid)]	22
[The Origination of the World]	22
[Methods of Reasoning for the Origination of the World]	23
[The Proof of Contingency]	23
[The Proof of Difference]	23
[The Proof of Analogy]	24
[The Proof of the Four Claims]	24
[Qur'anic Evidence for the Existence of the Creator, His Greatness, and His Power]	25
[The Bahshamiyyah Philosophy Regarding the Origination of the World]	27
[Names and Attributes]	29
The Attributes of the Agent in the Origination of the World and What It Contains	30
Section: The Disagreement Concerning the Interpretation of Affirming Allah's Attributes	31
The View of the Majority of Our Imams (Peace be Upon Them) and Some of the Muʿtazilites	31
[The Saying of the Amūriyyah]	32
[The Saying of the People of Distinctions]	33
[The Saying of the Jahmiyyah]	33
[The Saying of the Ashʿariyyah]	34
And Allah is All-Hearing, All-Seeing (samīʿ baṣīr)	35
[Allah is Hearing and Seeing (sāmiʿ mubṣir)]	36
[On Declaring Allah, Exalted is He, Transcendent above Need]	37
[On Declaring Allah, Exalted is He, Transcendent above Resemblance to Created Beings]	38
[Negation of Place]	38
[The Meaning of the Saying of the Muslims: "Allah Is in Every Place"]	39
[The Consensus of the Muslims that Allah Is the Creator of All Places and That He Was When There Was No Place]	39
[The Worshippers of the Winds and the Response to Them]	40
[The Throne (Al-'Arsh) and the Footstool (Al-Kursiyy)]	41
[The Footstool]	42
[Allah, Exalted is He, Is Not a Part of His Creation]	43
[Allah, Exalted is He, Is Not Subject to Accidents]	44
[The Tablet (Al-Lawh)]	44
[Allah, Exalted is He, Is Not Perceived by Sight]	45

[Some of the Doubts of Those Who Affirm Vision—and the Response to Them]	46
[The Verses Indicating the Negation of Vision]	48
[The Response to the Claim of Specifying This Verse]	49
[The Response to the Claim of Abrogation of This Verse]	49
[Why Did Moses Request the Vision?]	51
[Further Elaboration on What the Verses Contain of Proofs for the Negation of Vision]	52
[Allah, Exalted is He, Neither Begets Nor Is Begotten]	53
[Allah, Exalted is He, Is Not Subject to Annihilation]	54
[Allah, Exalted is He, Has No Deity Other Than Him]	54
[The Invalidity of the Divinity of Other Than Allah]	55
[Reflecting on Created Beings Leads to the Negation of the Divinity of Other Than Allah, Exalted is He]	55
[There Is No Pre-Eternal Being Other Than Allah]	57
[What Allah Has Obligated His Servants to Know About Him]	58
[The Name and the Attribute]	59
[The Name]	59
[The Attribute]	60
[Literal Meaning and Figurative Expression]	61
[Literal Meaning and Its Categories]	61
[The Dispute Concerning the Occurrence of Legal and Religious Literal Meaning]	62
[Figurative Expression and the Response to Those Who Deny Its Occurrence]	63
Interpretation of the Verses That May Give the Impression of Anthropomorphism	64
The All-Merciful, the Ever-Merciful	66
[What May and May Not Be Attributed to Allah, Exalted is He, from Names]	67
[al-Jalālah]	68
[One (Wāḥid) and One (Aḥad)]	68
[The Difference Between Attributes of Essence and Attributes of Action]	68
[Owner, Lord, Forbearing, Forgiving]	69
[The Active Participle]	70
[Those Names Which Are Exclusive to Allah, Exalted is He]	70
[The Book of Justice]	72
[Definition of Justice]	72
[A Section on the Reality of the Good and the Reprehensible]	72
[The Cause of the Reprehensibility of an Act According to Our Imams and Those Who Agree with Them]	73
[Those Who Say That an Act Is Reprehensible in and of Itself]	73
[The Ashʿarī Justification for the Reprehensibility of an Act]	74
[The Saying of Some of the Determinists Regarding the Cause of the Reprehensibility of an Act]	74
[Legally Reprehensible Acts and the Cause of Their Reprehensibility]	75
[Legal Goodness]	76
[The View of the Muʿtazilah Regarding the Cause of the Reprehensibility of the Legally Reprehensible, and the Cause of the Goodness of the Legal Good and the Recommended]	76
[Compulsion and Choice]	78
[The Ashʿarī View of Concomitant Power and Acquisition]	78
[The Response to the Factions of the Determinists]	79

[A Doubt and Its Answer]	81
[The Actions of the Servant: Generated Actions]	81
[The Acts of Allah, Exalted is He]	82
[The Difference Between the Acts of the Servants and the Acts of Allah, Exalted is He]	82
[Ability]	83
[The Confusions of the Ashʿarites and the Determinists Regarding Ability, and the Response to Them]	84
[An Act Within the Power of Two Agents]	85
[The Impossibility of Bringing About Two Contradictories]	86
[The Impossibility of Bringing About Two Contraries]	86
[Will]	87
[The Meaning of Allah's Will and His Dislike]	87
[False Statements in Interpreting Will]	88
[Will with Respect to the Servant]	89
[Allah's Satisfaction and His Love]	90
[The Attachment of Will]	91
[Some of Al-Mujbara's doubts to Prove that Allah Wills Disobedience and Disbelief]	92
[Their Inference from the Verse: "And if your Lord had willed, those on earth would have believed…" and the Response]	93
[Invoking Supplication for Divine Enablement, Rectitude, and the Like as Evidence]	94
[Allah's Facilitation of the Paths of Obedience and Averting the Paths of Disobedience]	95
[Explanation of "There is no power nor strength except with Allah"]	97
[Explanation of His Saying, Exalted is He: "And we would not have been guided had Allah not guided us"]	98
[Explanation of His Saying, Exalted is He: "And you do not will unless Allah wills…"]	99
[Explanation of His Saying, Exalted is He: "He leads astray whom He wills and guides whom He wills"]	99
[Explanation of His Saying, Exalted is He: "And if We had willed, We would have given every soul its guidance, but the word from Me has come to pass: I shall surely fill Hell with jinn and humans all together"]	100
[An Overview of the Doctrine of Al-Mujbara]	100
[The Determinists and Their Stance toward the True Religion]	101
[Some of the Determinists' doubts and the Response to Them, with Clarifying the Meanings of Guidance]	102
[The Meanings of Misguidance]	103
[The Meanings of Deviation]	105
[The Meanings of Fitnah]	105
[Testing and Trial]	106
[Stamping and Sealing]	107
[Why Were Sealing and Stamping Ascribed to Allah?]	109
[Adorning]	110
[Interpreting the Verses of Adorning]	111
[The Meanings of Qaḍāʾ]	113
[The Meanings of Qadar]	114
[The Ḥadīth of Jābir Regarding Qadar]	115

[The Qadariyyah and Who They Are]	116
[Section: On Indicating that Allah is Just and Wise]	118
[The Wisdom in Creating the Morally Responsible]	120
[Pain and What Is Related to It]	121
[Inflicting Pain upon Children]	122
[Inflicting Pain upon Animals]	122
[Inflicting Pain upon the Believer]	123
[Inflicting Pain upon the People of Disobedience]	123
[The Aggression of Some Created Beings against Others]	124
[The Continuance of Compensations]	126
[The Appointed Term (al-Ajal)]	127
[Evidence from the Qur'an and the Sunnah that Killing Interrupts the Appointed Term]	127
[Doubts of the Determinists and the Response to Them]	128
[The Statement of the Muṭrafiyyah Regarding the Appointed Term]	129
[The Soul (al-Rūḥ)]	130
[The Annihilation of the World]	131
[The Wisdom in the Annihilation of the World]	132
[On the Mention of Provision]	133
[Causes of Ownership]	134
[The Provider]	134
[Low Prices and High Prices]	135
[On Obligation (Taklīf)]	135
[Obligating What Is Beyond One's Capacity]	136
[al-Alṭāf (Divine Subtleties / Gracious Aids)]	138
[Abandonment (al-Khidhlān)]	139
[Infallibility (al-ʿIṣmah)]	139
[Allah's Favor upon His Servants in the Hereafter]	140
[The Book of Prophethood]	142
[The Superiority of the Angels over the Prophets]	142
[The Superiority of Our Prophet Muhammad May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace]	143
[The Miracle]	144
[Forms of the Qur'an's Inimitability Other than What Has Preceded]	146
[Muhammad (May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace), the Seal of the Prophets and Messengers]	148
[The Sharīʿah]	149
[The Qur'an]	151
[The Readings (al-Qirāʾāt)]	152
[Facilitating the Recitation]	153
[The Clear (al-Muḥkam) and the Ambiguous (al-Mutashābih)]	153
[Refuting the Claim that None Knows the Ambiguous Except Allah]	154
[The Opening Letters of the Sūrahs]	156
[The Qur'an Is the Speech of Allah Exalted is He by Consensus]	156
[What Led the Ashʿarīs to Affirm Inner Speech, and the Response to Them]	157
[The Sunnah]	159
[The Mass-Transmitted Report (al-Khabar al-Mutawātir)]	160
[The Report Accepted by the Ummah]	160

[Acting Devotionally upon a Solitary Report]	161
[The Elaboration of the Commander of the Faithful (Peace be Upon Him) on the States of Narrators]	162
[The Path to Knowing an Authentic Narration]	163
[The Infallibility of the Prophets from Whim and Error]	164
[Analogy (Qiyās)]	165
[Consensus (al-Ijmāʿ)]	165
[The Consensus of the Family of the Messenger (May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)]	166
Division and Disagreement	166
Types of Disagreement	168
Disagreement in Foundational Matters	168
Disagreement in Subsidiary Matters	168
The Unity of Truth in Foundational Matters	169
[The Ruling Concerning One Who Opposes the Truth in This Chapter]	169
[Disagreement in Speculative Ijtihād Issues]	170
[The Proofs of Those Who Say That Every Mujtahid in Speculative Subsidiary Issues Is Correct, and the Response to Them]	172
[The Ruling Concerning One Who Errs in Matters of Ijtihād]	172
[Abrogation]	173
[The Book of Imamate]	174
[No Era Is Devoid of One Fit for the Caliphate]	175
[The Most Important Conditions of the Imamate]	176
[The Path to the Imamate]	179
[The Proofs of the Zaydiyyah for Their Position on the Imamate]	181
[The Evidences for the Imamate of ʿAlī (Peace be upon Him)]	182
[The Reason for the Silence of the Commander of the Faithful (Peace be upon Him) Regarding the Caliphate After the Death of the Prophet (May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)]	185
[The Reason for People's Deviation from ʿAlī After the Death of the Prophet (May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)]	186
[The Ruling Regarding Those Who Fought ʿAlī (Peace be upon Him)]	187
[Conclusion of This Chapter]	189
[Some Principles and Foundations of the Doctrine of Ahl al-Sunnah wa al-Jamāʿah]	191
[The Proof of the Invalidity of This Doctrine]	191
[The Reason for the Spread of the Doctrine of Ahl al-Sunnah]	195
[The Doctrine of the Shīʿah of ʿAlī (Peace be upon Him)]	196
[Some Principles of the Zaydiyyah]	198
[The Soundness of Zaydī Beliefs from Superstitions and from What Contradicts Innate Reason]	201
[Some Falsehoods of the Ismāʿīlī Doctrine]	203
[The Foundation of Islam]	204
[Arrogant Pride and Self-Exaltation: A Lethal Disease Leading to the Punishment of the Hereafter]	206
[The Requirement of Allah's Wisdom in Preference]	207
[Those Who Deny Preference and the Response to Them]	207
[Allah Gives the One Who Responds More Than He Takes From Him]	211
[Love]	212

[The Proof for the Imamate of al-Ḥasan and al-Ḥusayn (Peace be Upon Them) after ʿAlī (Peace be Upon Him)]	214
[The Imamate of the Imam after the Two Grandsons (Peace be Upon Them)]	216
[The Ruling Concerning Those Who Preceded ʿAlī (Peace be Upon Him)]	217
Companionship and the Companions	218
Fāṭimah's Dispute with Abū Bakr	219
The Agreement and Division of the Shīʿah	220
Two Imams at One Time	221
The Abdication of an Imam	221
[Preference]	221
[The Best of the Wives of the Prophet (May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)]	223
[The Wilāyah of the Ahl al-Bayt]	224
[Al-Ḥisbah and the Muḥtasib]	225
[Commanding What Is Right and Forbidding What Is Wrong]	226
[The Method of Commanding and Forbidding]	227
[Migration]	228
Traveling to lands of disbelief and immorality	232
The Intermediate Position Between Two Positions	233
Minor and Major Sins	233
Examples of Sins from Which a Responsible Person Is Not Free, No Matter How Much He Strives	235
The Sins of the Prophets, Peace Be Upon Them	237
[Faith]	239
[Islam]	240
[Disbelief, Transgression, and Hypocrisy]	241
In what do the disbeliever, the transgressor, and the hypocrite agree, and in what do they differ?	242
[Declaring Disbelief and Declaring Transgression]	244
[Categories of Disbelief]	245
[The Ruling of the Disbeliever by Interpretation]	247
[The Muṭarrifiyyah]	249
[On Declaring Transgression]	249
[Repentance]	250
[What Is Required for the Validity of Repentance]	251
[Repentance from One Sin but Not Another]	253
[On Nullification (al-Iḥbāṭ)]	253
[Expiation of Sins]	255
[The Book of Promise and Threat]	257
[Failure to Fulfill the Promise and the Threat]	257
[The Disagreement Concerning the Non-Occurrence of the Threat for the People of Prayer]	257
[Proofs for the Eternity of the Transgressors of This Ummah in the Fire]	258
[Objections and Responses]	259
[On the Eternity of the Transgressors in the Fire of Hell]	261
[The Encompassing of Sin]	265
[An Objection and Its Response]	266
[Our Position Regarding the Ḥadīths Narrated by Ahl al-Sunnah]	267

[Intercession]	267
[Response to Those Who Say: Intercession Is for the People of Major Sins]	268
[Discussion of the Ḥadīth: “My Intercession Is for the People of Major Sins from My Ummah”]	269
[The Punishment of the Children of the Polytheists]	271
[Concerning the Punishment of the Grave]	272
How Do Souls Experience Punishment and Bliss?	274
[Concerning the Ṣūr]	275
[The Resurrection]	276
[Resurrection]	277
A subtle benefit regarding expressing the occurrence of the Resurrection with “assumption”	279
[The Resurrection of People Bare]	280
[The Resurrection of Every Living Soul]	281
[The Reckoning]	281
[The Scale]	282
[The Records]	283
[The Ṣirāṭ]	284
[The Speaking of the Limbs]	285
[The Creation of Paradise and the Fire]	285
[The Basin]	286
[al-Kawthar]	286
[The Wife]	287
[The Garden of Adam]	287
[Faith in al-Qadar]	288
[The Variety of al-Qadar and al-Taqdīr]	289
[The obligation of faith and affirmation of Allah’s wisdom in the decrees]	290
[Conclusion]	292
[The occurrence of disagreement in religion]	292
[The correctness of any school is not established by mere claim]	292
[Testing the Morally Accountable Is Allah’s Sunnah in His Creation]	293
[Testing the Ummah of Muḥammad by the Household of its Prophet (May Allah bless him and his family and grant them peace)]	293
[The Repetition of the Messenger in Clarifying the Right of His Household (Peace be Upon Them) so that the proof may be completed]	294
[The Danger of Arrogance and Warning Against It]	295
[The Doubts of Ahl al-Sunnah that They Are the Saved Group, and the Answer]	296
Discussing the ḥadīth: “The best of generations is my generation.” and so on	298
[Their arguing by Allah’s praise of the Companions and the Followers, and the reply to them]	300
[The Evidences That the Ahl al-Bayt (Peace be Upon Them) and Those Who Followed Them Are the Saved Sect]	301
[The Sunnah of Divine Choosing]	303
[The Division of the Shīʿah into Zaydiyyah and Imāmiyyah]	304
[Clarifying the Invalidity of the Imāmiyyah School Regarding the Caliphate]	305
[Seeking Means of Nearness (al-Tawassul)]	307
[Table of Contents]	310